

M 192

A STUDY OF MOTION SONGS USED WITH CHILDREN
IN RELATION TO
THE PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

By
RUTH McKAY
B.S., Greenville College



A Thesis
Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION
in
The Biblical Seminary in New York

New York, N.Y.
May 1946

BIBLICAL SCHOOL OF
THEOLOGY LIBRARY
HATFIELD, PA.

18364

Gift of the author

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
INTRODUCTION.	1
A. Statement of the Problem.	2
B. Delimitation of the Problem	3
C. Procedure	4
 CHAPTER I: THE CHRISTIAN NURTURE OF CHILDREN.	6
A. Introduction.	7
B. Music and Basic Needs of Children	8
1. Music and Physical Needs	8
2. Music and Mental Needs	11
3. Music and Social Needs	16
4. Music and Emotional Needs.	18
5. Music and Spiritual Needs.	20
C. Summary	23
 CHAPTER II: THE DETERMINING OF CRITERIA FOR JUDGING MOTION SONGS.	26
A. Introduction.	27
B. Criteria for Judging Motion Songs	27
1. With Respect to Word Content and Language.	27
2. With Respect to Ideas.	32
a. Ideas about God	34
b. Ideas about Jesus	34
c. Ideas about Redemptive Power.	35
d. Ideas about the Future Life	35
3. With Respect to Music.	36
a. Melody from the Standpoint of Quality	37
b. Melody in Relation to Words	37
c. Melody in Relation to the Range of Children's Voices	38
d. Melody in Relation to Harmony	40
4. With Respect to Motions.	41
C. Summary	45
 CHAPTER III: AN ANALYSIS AND EVALUATION OF MOTION SONGS USED WITH CHILDREN IN SELECTED SONG BOOKS.	49
A. Introduction.	50
B. Analysis of Selected Motion Songs on Basis of Criteria for Evaluation (Chart)	52
C. Extent to Which Motion Songs Are Used	54
D. Analysis of Motion Songs.	54
1. With Respect to Word Content and Language.	54
a. Literature.	54
b. Religious Value	55

24995

September 15, 1946

	Page
c. Familiar Experience	56
d. Concreteness and Sincerity.	57
2. With Respect to Ideas.	58
a. Ideas about God	59
b. Ideas about Jesus	60
c. Ideas about Redemptive Power.	60
d. Ideas about Future Life	61
3. With Respect to Music.	62
a. Music in Relation to Quality.	63
b. Melody in Relation to Words	63
c. Melody in Relation to Range	64
d. Music in Relation to Harmony.	65
4. With Respect to Motions.	65
E. Evaluation.	67
1. Of Selected Songs.	67
2. Of Selected Song Books	87
 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION	 89
 BIBLIOGRAPHY.	 96
A. Primary Sources	97
B. Secondary Sources	98

INTRODUCTION

INTRODUCTION

A. Statement of the Problem

It cannot be denied that music is a basic need of every child in the development of a well-rounded and integrated personality. One of the earliest responses children make is to music, and the richness of their later lives will depend upon the background and the appreciation of music they receive as children.¹ One has written:

"The growing generation need music just because they are growing. Wondering 'what on earth this world can be,' they find much help from many quarters to answer their questions about when this or that world event happened, but little help in interpreting some of the strange feelings and longings inside themselves. The life of the spirit of youth is a much more weighty affair than most adults realize. Every boy and girl has more or less of the artist in him, which means that each one reaches out for some manifestation of beauty. As this feeling for beauty is nourished, it grows; neglected, it sickens and, eventually, dies. Children who are to become well-rounded, happy men and women must be nurtured with art in their early environment. All progressive schools recognize this fact by according music an important place in the curriculum from the beginning."²

Childhood is a happy time and those experiencing it express themselves in spontaneous joyful songs as well as in songs learned at home or in the church school. Frances

.

1. Cf. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: When the Little Child Wants to Sing, p. v.
2. Mary Elizabeth Cromer: A Comparative Study of Representative Song Books for use in the Christian Education of the Pre-School and Primary Child, quoting Peter W. Dykema: Radio Music for Boys and Girls, p. 1.

Danielson and Grace Conant have suggested that the heart of childhood is reached through melody and rhythm because they are gifts to children. Children's feelings and understanding can be appealed to more readily through music because they are quick to respond to its suggestiveness.¹

Because of the child's ready response, music is used to a great extent in the training of children. One form much used by certain groups, while other groups decry it, is that of motion songs. Because of this extensive usage and this difference of opinion, it is the purpose of this thesis to evaluate motion songs in relation to their underlying philosophy of religious education.

B. Delimitation of the Problem

This study will be confined to religious motion songs as used with children, primarily those found in the following: Salvation Songs for Children, Numbers One and Two;² Action Songs for Boys and Girls;³ Singspiration Gospel Songs and Choruses, Numbers Two and Three;⁴ When the Little Child Wants to Sing;⁵ Primary Music and Worship;⁶ and Songs for

.

1. Frances W. Danielson and Grace W. Conant: Songs for Little People, Introduction.
2. Ruth P. Overholtzer: Salvation Songs for Children, Numbers One and Two.
3. Alfred B. Smith: Action Songs for Boys and Girls.
4. Alfred B. Smith: Singspiration Gospel Songs and Choruses, Numbers Two and Three.
5. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: op. cit.
6. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: Primary Music and Worship.

Little People.¹

The age range will include the nursery, kindergarten, and primary groups, that is, children from three through eight years old. For the most part the different age groups will not be considered separately.

C. Procedure

As already indicated, music in the Christian nurture of children is as important as any other contributing factor. As a basis for this study it will first be necessary to study the psychology of children to crystallize their needs--physically, mentally, socially, emotionally, and spiritually--and to see how these needs are met by music.

Music is not only an essential but it is important that a meaningful appreciation for the best kind of music be cultivated during childhood. In order to have a standard for measuring motion songs certain accepted criteria will be set forth as found in the writings of authorities in the field of religious education. Outstanding among these are Edna Dean Baker, Clara B. Blashfield, Frances W. Danielson, Hazel Lewis, Alberta Munkres, Elizabeth Shields, and Ethel Smither.

.

1. Frances W. Danielson and Grace W. Conant: op. cit.

Then will follow on the basis of the criteria set up an actual analysis and evaluation of the motion songs contained in the above mentioned sources. Out of this study certain conclusions will be reached regarding the underlying philosophy of religious education involved in the use of such songs.

CHAPTER I
THE CHRISTIAN NURTURE OF CHILDREN

CHAPTER I
THE CHRISTIAN NURTURE OF CHILDREN

A. Introduction

Before an actual survey of motion songs can be made it is of primary importance to know something about the nature and needs of the children and how these are met by music. Contrary to an old misconception that a child was a miniature adult, he " . . . is not the man writ small,"¹ either physically, mentally, socially, emotionally, or spiritually. Childhood is a period of adjustment and out of all his confusion the child must have support in finding himself. Each child is a distinct personality and his various developments will be individual and according to his own particular rhythm of growth. Not only do children differ from adults but they differ quite obviously from one another.² However, along with these differences children share certain common general needs.

It is therefore the purpose of this chapter to discover the part music may play in meeting those general needs.

.

1. Naomi Norsworthy and Mary Theodora Whitley: The Psychology of Childhood, p. 62.
2. Cf. ibid., p. 263; and Mary Edna Lloyd: Religious Nurture in Nursery Class and Home, p. 139.

B. Music and Basic Needs of Children

1. Music and Physical Needs

Childhood is the time for building healthy bodies. Probably more physical development will take place during this period than during any other time of life. Their bodies are changing at an uneven tenor; there are periods of rapid growth and periods of slower growth. Each muscle, bone, and nerve has its own rhythmic growth. Consequently, activity is a marked characteristic of children and to thwart their freedom during these early years is to run the risk of " . . . stunting them both physically and mentally."¹ Sitting quietly for a long period of time is therefore an impossibility because it violates the laws governing their physical mechanism. If space and circumstances prohibit the movement of their whole bodies they will demonstrate the urge to stir by swinging their legs, twisting their fingers, turning the pages of a book, or playing with any available object.² As Whitley states it:

"Even an effort to keep still brings symptoms of nervous irritation and their movements are only partly suppressed."³

Their constant twisting and squirming are only normal behavior patterns that seem to flow from an exhaustless

.

1. Mary Theodora Whitley: A Study of the Little Child, p. 53.
2. Cf. *ibid.*, pp. 55,56.
3. *Ibid.*, p. 54.

source of energy.¹

"When not restricted in any way children do not remain seated, or in any position for long, but climb about, walk around, run, crouch, squat, move in all possible ways."²

Parents and teachers are often well meaning when they insist that children be quiet, but these small organisms are geared to an active tempo which conflicts with such demands. However, it is possible for children to become physically over-fatigued and then the only means of restoration are sleep or a change in activity. Since children are actively engaged in incessant running, jumping, and other strenuous exercise, whether it is work or play, a constant demand is being made upon their supply of energy until finally their reserve becomes depleted. This calls for replenishment through rest and relaxation.

Play is an essential requisite to the growth of the body, mind, and spirit. It becomes more purposeful when music enters in, and shortly after birth music does become a part of the child's life. Mothers sing soft low lullabies to their babies and after a few months babies try to sing too.³

"The first response of the little child to music is the rhythmic one. Mere babes in arms clap the hands, move the limbs or the whole body in pleasure when listening to music, often with a rude attempt at following the

.

1. Ibid., p. 35.

2. Ibid.

3. Cf. Robert Edwin Gaines: Guiding a Growing Life, p. 33.

musical beat."¹

As the child grows older, increasingly music is used in his play life. Some of his earliest play experiences will be in the form of musical games. Such songs as "The Farmer in the Dell," "Looby Loo," and "London Bridge" are all played while the children sing and try to keep time to music. Simple dramatic play may also be accompanied by suggestive music which may invite them to become birds, flowers, fairies, or whatever they hear in the rhythm of the music. Just as the soft hum of the mother is suggestive of rest to the baby, so does the stirring march suggest action to the growing child.

"To appropriate music, children will take delight in pantomimic dancing, expressive of growth and change in animals and plants, in rivers and seasons."²

Even during the nursery age children will sing an entire story that is the outgrowth of a vital experience. The words will be simple and perhaps repetitious attached to an irregular tune all of which are sung in a sing-song voice. These songs may be only a few words but they will sing them over and over with a great deal of satisfaction.

Music speaks a child's own language which brings a message in terms of his own understanding. Since it has the capacity of meeting childish needs, interest and activities, it thus provides another channel of expressing themselves.

.

1. Edna Dean Baker: The Worship of the Little Child, p. 90.
2. Elizabeth M. Manwell and Sophia L. Fahs: Consider the Children How They Grow, p. 77.

Just as children are urged to be original in building blocks, using crayons, paint and modeling clay, so does music provoke their creative abilities in experimenting with it to bring joy into their every day play.¹

Thus in music children have the fusion of two important requisites leading into a happy normal life: the development of a healthy body through exercise, accompanied by an esthetic habit that will enrich the rest of their lives.

2. Music and Mental Needs

Just as the child has a physical life in which he expresses his play through action which is essential to his growth, so has he a mental life that also craves exercise. When only a few months old he will show an interest in a bright light, a loud noise, and a moving object, all of which have aroused an interest in his young mind. It is not long until he tries to talk back to his mother as she plays and works with him, thus indicating an innate tendency to communicate.

The child is endowed with certain traits over which he has no control.

"In all traits, characteristics, features, powers both physical and mental, and to some extent moral also, children's original nature, their stock in trade, is

.

1. Cf. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: Primary Music and Worship, p. 152.

determined by their immediate ancestry."¹

Mental capacities are thus gifts of inheritance. Children may be the same chronological age, yet differ widely in their mental age. Irrespective of the ability they possess, childhood is the time for building healthy minds and making the most of what they do have. Encouragement is given to them by parents and teachers to play creatively, so it is equally important that they be taught to use their minds independently.²

"The healthy child is full of physical energy seeking an outlet. Many of the difficulties in home and school arise from a failure to provide sufficient outlets for this remarkable energy. Mental energy is just as natural and seeks its own outlets."³

Adults feel it is their responsibility to meet the physical needs of children, but an even greater service they may render is to enrich their intellectual nature. If the germ for the accumulation of knowledge is planted during childhood while they are increasingly eager to learn, their lives will be a constant source of usefulness to themselves as well as to others.⁴

"What children take in does not rest a passive, inactive part of them; rather it is so digested that it forms part of a living mental stuff which reaches out and gathers in newer material."⁵

.

1. Norsworthy and Whitley: op. cit., p. 2.
2. Cf. Whitley: op. cit., pp. 14-15;
Frederick Pierce: Understanding Our Children, p. 36.
3. L. A. Pechstein and Frances Jenkins: Psychology of the Kindergarten-Primary Child, p. 208.
4. Cf. Gaines: op. cit., p. 22.
5. Whitley: op. cit., p. 65.

By nature, children are curious. Their vocabularies and conversations reveal how full of questions they are; many times a day they use the words, "who," "what," "why," "when," "where," and "how." This is their method of becoming at home in the universe and they want to know how it operates along with the hundreds of things in it. With everything strangely new and bewildering they are trying to bring it all into their small grasp. As far as is possible children should be allowed to handle objects that would contribute in satisfying their curiosities. Objects that they are allowed to handle become more meaningful to them. In response to their questions the answers must be simple. Even though they require elementary explanations to their questions they often ask profound theological and philosophical questions that even the wisest ponder over. Here, too, music may play a real part, for music may be used as a means of answering their persistent, pertinent questions. One author states that a musical imagination can be inherited and that this gives the teacher something on which to build. For instance, some common childish questions are, "Who made the night?" "How is rain made?" "Who made the stars and the moon?" These, as well as many other questions may be answered clearly, intelligently, and satisfactorily in songs.¹

.

1. Cf. Norsworthy and Whitley: op. cit., p. 1.

"Do you know who made the night,
 Made the stars and moon so bright?
God our Father made the night,
 Made the stars and moon so bright,
Our Father made the night.

"Do you know who made the day,
 Made the glad and happy day?
God our Father made the day,
 Made the glad and happy day,
Our Father made the day."¹

A song is often a better answer than any other type of explanation, because the song can be learned and the child will repeat the words as well as sing them many times until he feels familiar with the subject.

Imitation is another predominant characteristic of children. They become miniature replicas of what they see and an echo of what they hear.

Children think in concrete terms only; anything bordering on the abstract or symbolic is beyond their mental reach. This is evident in the fact that their vocabularies consist largely in nouns and verbs. But this age is a period of mental growth when children are reaching out, investigating, and inquiring about a great many things. The development of intelligence results from the presence of new things or the discovery of relationships among old ones. The knowledge they acquire is exposed in the language they use. Their conversations show that their vocabularies are increasing, though still limited to the concrete. There

.

1. Elizabeth Shields: Guiding the Little Child in Sunday School, p. 46; Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: When the Little Child Wants to Sing, #22.

is no better way to help them enlarge their vocabularies than through the use of songs. If the words of a song are carefully explained, there will usually be a carry-over from the new words learned in the songs to their vocabularies. They sing the songs over and over until they become so fixed and familiar in their minds, so much a part of them, that it is only natural for their words to be used on occasions other than singing.¹

As children become physically tired and in need of a change in activity or rest, so do they become mentally weary. At this point also, music may make a real contribution, for music has a restful quality; even though fatigued they respond to it. Music is then an open gate through which children pass to receive mental poise and balance. They are receptive and respond willingly to its suggestiveness. They enjoy listening, although, because they are active, music becomes more vital to them when they can participate in it.

Thus, on the one hand, music, particularly in the form of songs, meets a definite intellectual need of children by appealing to their curiosity, their imagination, and by satisfying their desire for knowledge. On the other hand, music meets the need for mental rest and relaxation.

.

1. Cf. Whitley: op. cit., p. 163.

3. Music and Social Needs

Children are by nature social beings and early respond to people. In their first school experiences, as well as adjusting to a new environment, they are adjusting to other children who are receiving equally as much attention. The other children have the ability of bringing approval and desired responses, too. Emotional reactions, such as anger or jealousy, often set in later but it is an essential requisite that these little children learn to get along with other people if they are to become happy, well-adjusted individuals.

The nursery child's play is for the most part individual, yet in no sense anti-social. He enjoys free activity divorced and free from rules or competition. Most of his play is actually individual and self-centered, but nevertheless he likes to feel the companionship of other little friends around him, even though they are not playing directly with him. It takes these children some time before they can play fairly, recognize the rights of others, and share. Their social activities amount to simple group play, such as ballrolling, "Looby Loo," "The Farmer in the Dell," "London Bridge," and "Ring Around the Rosy." These games are evidence that music is a socializing element during this pre-school age.

The primary child prefers playing with some one rather than alone, for he is gradually learning the spirit

of cooperation. He takes pride in identifying himself with a group and by this time he may belong to a number of them: the family, the school, the church, the neighborhood, the play group, a children's club, a library story hour, and special groups meeting for parties and seasonal celebrations. Each member of the group makes suggestions and is influenced by what the others do. They all exchange ideas for a common undertaking, experiencing joy for having contributed to the group. Like the younger children they too are appreciative of approval.¹

"They bring out new ability in one another. Because of this, even children who disagree constantly would rather play together than alone."²

Teachers have capitalized on music as a means of socializing groups of children, thus welding them together. Music and especially singing fosters the idea of sharing and of being friendly, helpful children. Individuals of a scattered group can be joined into unity in thought and purpose by singing or listening.³

"Music is also a means of welding individuals together through a common emotional experience. The socializing value in appreciating a thing of beauty with others is great, and greater still when that beauty is produced by the group. An atmosphere of happiness, a feeling of unity, pervade the room of singing worshipers. Children like to sing together, and they specially enjoy singing, each one for the others. It is a delightful way of

.

1. Cf. Hazel A. Lewis: The Primary Child, p. 5.
2. Ibid.
3. Cf. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: Primary Music and Worship, p. 152.

sharing experience and of giving pleasure. Many little children who have never sung at home burst into song a few Sundays after entering the beginner's department. They cannot resist the social stimulus."¹

It has been the writer's privilege to work in a beginner's department for two years and to see how responsive the children are to music. During the activity period the children go from one interest to another but never do they all participate simultaneously in a single activity until the pianist starts to play the piano. The music, though simple, is suggestive to them and they leave their activities to take their places in front of the worship center. Their diversified interests become united in listening as well as in singing together.

4. Music and Emotional Needs

The emotions play no small part in the life of the child. Many of the feelings which all children experience are the basic ones such as anger, fear, jealousy, love, sympathy, joy, and disgust.² As Thom says:

"Mothers, fathers, and teachers must bear in mind that the child has an emotional life--a fact all too frequently ignored. We are apt to forget that just as the child has ears and eyes, he also has instincts and emotions."³

The emotions need to be controlled but not eliminated; gradually they should be raised to spiritual and

.

1. Baker: The Worship of the Little Child, p. 92.

2. Norsworthy and Whitley: op. cit., p. 91.

3. Douglas A. Thom: Everyday Problems of the Everyday Child, p.38.

intellectual levels from the physical and material levels on which they are inclined to rest.

The younger the child the more limited his experiences have been and the more violent and unchecked his emotional responses. They are more intense but more short-lived than are those of older children and adults. These immature individuals have an innate desire for self-expression which is always infringing upon a code of laws of which they have no understanding. Limitations and inhibitions set up by their environment are factors creating struggles within. Conduct is the reaction of children to their environments. And in normal growth the emotional control of children parallels their physical, mental, and social development.¹

In this process music may make a definite contribution, for music is a natural accompaniment of emotional expression. Of this Baker says:

"Whatever arouses a strong emotion is apt to be expressed in the singing refrain; even the child who has cried hard may get a rhythm into his noise and end his weeping in a little wailing chant."²

Music is then a natural medium for the expression of thought and emotion. A child will spontaneously sing a whole story that is the outgrowth of a meaningful experience.

.

1. Cf. Thom: op. cit., p. 39;
Norsworthy and Whitley: op. cit., p. 91;
Mary Edna Lloyd: Religious Nurture, p. 14.
2. Baker: op. cit., p. 90.

Many childish emotions are embraced in song--joy, grief, sympathy, and love. Music lends itself to a worshipful atmosphere, but the emotional content of the child's worship depends upon his concept of God and the surroundings. The child who sings songs about and to a loving heavenly Father experiences different emotions than does the one who kneels before a God of wrath. "The emotions which control the individual at the moment of worship demand an outlet in some form of expression . . ."¹ and this outlet is often provided in song. It is the language of children's emotions and is being capitalized on more for teaching and preserving truth, its effectiveness being all the greater because it involves the related elements of rhythm, words, time, and melody. The adaptation of music to the emotions, moods, and attitudes characterizing childhood is an important factor. However, on the other hand, music may also be used to create desired moods. Its power to quiet and relax is of inestimable value in the development of emotional control in children.²

5. Music and Spiritual Needs

By nature, children have a religious impulse, and
" . . . to ignore it is to deprive them of some of their in-

.

1. Baker: op. cit., p. 16.
2. Cf. *ibid.*, pp. 91, 16; Elizabeth Shields: Guiding Kindergarten Children in the Church, p. 155; Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: Primary Music and Worship, p. 154.

heritance,--after all, the most important part."¹ Just because they do have a religious leaning does not insure that they will grow into religious adults, for this tendency needs careful training and nurturing. The physical, mental, social, and emotional needs of the child cannot be neglected or ignored but the religious needs are of chief concern. The center of religious nurture is doing those services for a child which he is unable to do for himself and allowing him to do for himself in the areas within his grasp.²

"What is there inherent in the nature of the child, which makes him capable of responding to religious influence and atmosphere? The child's interest in nature, his keen hungry senses, his curiosity, his personifying imagination, his love of stories of mystery and wonder all throw his mind and heart open to the conception of God."³

Thus the avenues of approach are abundant through which children can be moved to love and learn of the heavenly Father. Since the heart of religion is love, the home paves the normal way to the love of God. They love easily and respond quickly to affection; since most children create imaginary companions their credulity and suggestibility make the nearness and omnipresence of a loving heavenly Father real to them.⁴ To quote Baker:

"The impulse to worship is native, not acquired The character of the one who is worshiped and the content of the worship experience, the emotions aroused, and the ideals inspired may be the result of education, but worship itself is an 'inward compulsion' an inner urge toward the divine."⁵

.

1. Norsworthy and Whitley: op. cit., pp. 135-136.
2. Cf. ibid.; Manwell and Fahs: op. cit., p. 114.
3. Gaines: op. cit., p. 71.
4. Cf. ibid., p. 43; Whitley: op. cit., p. 99.
5. Baker: op. cit., p. 14.

A child's interpretation thus depends either upon his teaching or mere hearsay; because there is no instinctive idea of the Godhead. His feeling toward the higher power will depend upon his evaluation of that notion in relation to what he sees others around him expressing in their attitude towards the Supreme Being. The small child may address prayers to God, but they are only words with little if any meaning.¹

"As the parents, the nursery leaders, and other persons with whom he associates interpret Christian living throughout their close attention with him, the little child learns Christian ways of living. He can learn only what he sees exemplified by those whose lives touch his."²

The home and the nursery class are the normal avenues through which Christian living is caught. Children gradually sense God as the Creator; there is a reaching out towards God, but there is no understanding of Him. They attempt to identify themselves with this Source of all things and begin to express love, faith, and reverence towards Him.³

All children are lovers of nature; they like to play out-of-doors where they can be next to living, growing things. Nature is an open door through which teachers and parents can lead children to thinking about the Creator who made the sun, the moon, the stars, the birds, the flowers,

.

1. Cf. Whitley: op. cit., pp. 101-102.

2. Lloyd: op. cit., p. 143.

3. Cf. ibid., p. 142; Baker: op. cit., p. 13.

the trees, and animals. The child will come to feel that just as the heavenly Father cares for all of nature so does He care for each child.

As before stated, whatever children feel deeply about they reveal in their spontaneous songs. These often center around nature; sometimes they deal with sharing and helping. Since "music is important in the spiritual nurture of children--a teaching opportunity with unquestioned appeal and possibilities,"¹ these little melodies can be captured as a means of directing the children towards God. Through music it is possible to make ideas become alive and concrete. Furthermore, an atmosphere is created by music which both uplifts and stimulates the children to sing. So the experience of worship is deepened and the spiritual life of the child is nurtured.²

C. Summary

In the light of the foregoing study it has been seen that just as there are no adults alike, so there are no two children alike. Yet it was found that they all share a common, a rhythmic response to music. It was pointed out that music early begins to meet the needs of children; a

.

1. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: Primary Music and Worship, p. 152.
2. Cf. ibid., p. 157.

cry may be hushed while the mother sings a lullaby and later on rhythmic clapping of the hands and swaying of the whole body take place in response to music.

Furthermore, it was discovered, music has the capacity not only of meeting children's needs but of satisfying their demand for activity and their interests as well. Music creates an atmosphere which is readily interpreted by children since it speaks their language.

As was found, there is a definite overlapping of the needs of children, yet the major areas of those needs may be desirably expressed in terms of music. Activity is a marked characteristic which growing bodies demand; and since children readily respond to music, whether it be the simple game, "Here We Go Round the Mulberry Bush," or a stirring march, they are moved to interpret it through bodily activity.

Music has been found to be a means of satisfying the mental needs of children too. Songs, in particular, may answer many of the questions puzzling their young minds as well as adequately meeting the development of their curiosity and imagination. Moreover, music brings a message in terms of the child's understanding, suitable to his state of development.

Studies have shown that children do not like to be left alone. Even though their play is quite largely individual they like to feel the close companionship of other little children around them. It was pointed out that

there may be several activities within a single classroom but when music begins it serves as a unifying element in binding the group together. Music lifts a strained or unfamiliar atmosphere and encourages the children to feel friendly towards each other.

Neither individually nor as a group can children be expected to be emotionally stable; nevertheless it was evident that music is the language of emotions and is a normal outlet for emotional expression.

As a crystallization of children's spiritual impulses, music is of inestimable value. Through songs, more than through any other form of teaching, children can learn to love the heavenly Father who cares for all nature and cares for them too. Authorities have agreed that their spiritual growth will be gradual and that their songs should convey true, simple, and concrete ideas, out of which deeper spiritual ideas will be formed.

Music, then, is a language for children. It not only is cultivating an esthetic habit which will enrich their whole lives, but is meeting their growing needs as well.

CHAPTER II

THE DETERMINING OF CRITERIA FOR JUDGING MOTION SONGS

CHAPTER II

THE DETERMINING OF CRITERIA FOR JUDGING MOTION SONGS

A. Introduction

Music's only excuse for being is to bring satisfaction; there are many types of music capable of doing just this but of primary concern in the program of Christian Education are those songs which encourage children to learn of a heavenly Father. The spiritual nature of a child can be neglected not only by the lack of music but also by the lack of good music. It is unfair to supply their physical needs with the best possible care and then to be lax in giving them the best in music to meet their spiritual needs. Just as standards are set up by which all forms of fine arts are judged, so there are certain criteria by which music for children is measured. Therefore, in order to evaluate motion songs used with children, it will be necessary to discover these criteria. To do so is the purpose of this chapter. Preliminary investigation revealed that writers in the field of Christian Education are agreed in emphasizing word content, ideas, music, and motions.

B. Criteria for Judging Motion Songs

1. With Respect to Word Content and Language

For too long, children have had no alternative but to learn songs embracing words and ideas foreign to their

experience. Teachers have excused the use of mature songs on the ground that the children will grow in understanding and that later the songs will mean a great deal to them. Again, one often hears a teacher exclaim, "But the children love to sing them!" By nature, children like to sing the familiar songs but they cannot "love" to sing songs they do not understand. While it is encouraging to know that the songs will be understood later on, it is a disadvantage to the children to keep from them songs that would fulfil an immediate purpose.

Authorities are therefore agreed that above all the song must be meaningful to the child. This involves several requirements. In the first place, the words must be good; a good song should be a good poem. Songs, then, must adhere to certain literary characteristics, which does not imply complex features but rather a simple and direct style. Unless the songs are good from a literary standpoint, they fall below the standards which should be used in selecting songs.¹ Ethel Smither insists that the church leaders do the child a real violence if they let him " . . . sing silly songs like 'G-o-o-d, G-o-o-d,' or 'Jesus Wants me for a Sunbeam,' when in school he is singing Shakespeare's lovely poem, 'Hark, Hark, the Lark'," that in

.

1. Cf. Shields: op. cit., p. 90.

Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, p. 31.
Ethel Smither: Teaching Primaries, p. 190.

the child's opinion religion and the church will be cheapened.¹

Songs meeting the literary qualifications are plentiful, and they should be an indispensable gift to childhood in supplying their repertoire with the best.

In the second place, the words must have religious value.

"In selecting music to be used in worship, the first test is whether or not it has real religious value. Will it create the worshipful mood, will it stimulate the emotions that will send the child to God in prayer? Does it express ideas and emotions in connection with the child's sense of human and divine relationships? Will it suggest right action?"²

The emphasis should be wholesome and positive, rather than negative. Right attitudes will be established more effectively through songs suggesting the higher values of life than through songs warning against undesirable attitudes. A significant religious relationship should bind the church school activities and the songs used. There is a unifying harmony between the child's music and his worship experience. Worship music should encourage the children to feel that they have a vital relationship with God through which they express themselves in praise and prayer to their loving heavenly Father.³

.

1. Smither: op. cit., pp.190-191.

2. Baker: op. cit., p. 93.

3. Cf. Shields: Guiding the Little Child, p. 93;
Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, p. 61;
Alberta Munkres: Primary Method in the Church School,
p. 99.

In the third place, the words must incorporate experiences familiar to the child and within his understanding. Songs that go beyond this will have neither meaning nor interest. This demands careful selection, for as Miss Munkres puts it:

"Relatively few of the great hymn writers have felt the interests and needs of the little children. For the most part, they have given expression to adult sentiments."¹

A study of children's songs reveals that adult images and concepts have stolen into their songs along with symbolic ideas that they are not capable of comprehending. Children are literalists, and they are too immature to interpret songs figuratively. Shields declares:

"Today, symbolism is taboo in our work with little children, for we have found more direct ways of helping them to be joyous than by calling them 'little lights,' and more sincere ways of recognizing goodness than by putting 'jewels' in their 'crowns.'"²

The words of the songs, then, should be concrete and related to the child's own experiences. Children cannot sing sincerely those songs that are only a meaningless jingle of words. If the songs they are taught are far removed from their experiences, the habit may easily be formed of singing sacred songs with little thought as to their meaning. Not only will one of the most important expressions of worship thus be lost; but, more than this, unconscious hypocrisy may be fostered

.

1. Munkres: op. cit., p. 91.

2. Shields: Guiding the Little Child, p. 91.

through singing vague words. For this reason, any songs which embrace symbolic, mystical, or mature religious experiences do not help primary or pre-school children. Hence, the words must convey thoughts that children can not only enjoy but comprehend, because they correspond to their actual experiences. There is no value in singing songs that are not understood.¹

"The use of symbolic language presents one of the greatest difficulties to a little child, but many adults make the mistake of choosing songs with such language for children . . . Children differ so much in regard to their understanding of symbolic language that I do not believe anyone can name an age at which a knowledge begins, but it is safe not to expect this understanding in Beginners and Primary children."²

The very purpose which songs are to fulfill is defeated if the child does not comprehend the meaning of the words he is singing. The desirable worshipful atmosphere will be lacking because in using strange unfamiliar words he cannot feel close to God. He is concrete-minded, and cannot appreciate anything but the literal.³

In general, songs centering around nature will bring desirable responses, since this, in some form or other, is within the experience and interest of every child. Nature songs can be worship songs inviting the child to feel close to the One who made the flowers, the birds, the

.

1. Cf. Shields: op. cit., p. 90; Clara Blashfield: Worship Training for Primary Children, p. 117; Munkres: op. cit., p. 190.
2. Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, pp. 29-30.
3. Cf. Blashfield: op. cit., p. 117.

trees, the sky, or anything else included in the vast realm of nature which offers a wealth of material to be set to music.

In the fourth place, the words must carry a message of sincerity and not sentimentality. The songs used with children will be largely responsible for the concepts children hold for worship. If the songs appeal to a superficial element instead of adhering to truth and sincerity, an artificial form of reverence may develop. One has expressed it thus:

"Nor can a third-grade husky eight-year-old boy have a very keen sense of reverence while singing about 'his little hands and his little feet,' even though those same hands and feet, according to the song, may be doing kind deeds for the Father."¹

Songs, then, are not chosen because they are pretty or because the children like them, but because they meet a real need, and are within their experiences, as well as a means of enriching them. They can learn to sing by rote any song that a teacher persists in teaching, but unless the words are familiar it will remain distant instead of becoming a part of them.²

2. With Respect to Ideas

One cannot listen to a child's conversation without detecting the simplicity in which he clothes his ideas.

.

1. Blashfield: op. cit., p. 117.

2. Cf. Shields: Guiding the Kindergarten Child, p. 166.

He has not acquired any clever rhetorical devices in which to expose or conceal the message he is trying to relate; quite to the contrary, he expresses in plain, easy words the many thoughts crowding his unpretentious mind. Therefore, he should be approached on his level of thinking and understanding. Secular schools approach the children's plane by contracting them at their point of need. It is likewise important that the church school follow the same procedure.

The short, spontaneous, original songs children often sing in their play reveal ideas that are simple, yet meaningful and intelligible to them. They are concrete and clear, each little melody embracing only one idea. Church school teachers should capture this simplicity, and give back to the children intelligible, uninvolved songs.

If the ideas of the songs are outside the range and understanding of the children for whom they are intended, they fall short of their purpose. Just as the individual words must be single in meaning, so must the ideas. It is essential, if the songs are to stir the emotions towards desirable action, that they portray religious ideas sincerely and correctly.¹ Outstanding among these are ideas about God, about Jesus, ideas about redemptive power, and ideas about the future life. These will now be considered in turn:

.

1. Cf. Baker: op. cit., p. 93;
Shields: Guiding the Little Child in the Sunday School, p. 91.

a. Ideas about God

A great deal of the child's information concerning God will be through songs. These songs should actually and truthfully say just what He is, a loving, gentle heavenly Father, who is ever-present, and who loves and cares tenderly for little children. Never should the emphasis imply that God is far away and is always keeping watch over little boys and girls to see when they are bad. They will readily assume that He is a spy and will resent His omnipresence.¹

b. Ideas about Jesus

No teacher will expect her children to understand fully the meaning of the Trinity. Little children use "God" and "Jesus" interchangeably, and do not readily understand their separate personalities. Even so, knowledge of this will be encouraged by learning songs about Jesus, the children's friend. The use of stories and pictures will aid them invaluablely while learning songs of Jesus who was sent from heaven to be a friend to all the children and to tell them of God's love. The songs must be clear-cut and uninvolved, leading the child to feel a genuine friendship between Jesus and himself.

.

1. Cf. Shields: Guiding the Little Child in the Sunday School, p. 91.

c. Ideas about Redemptive Power

"Hymns stressing sin and the redemptive power of the blood or death . . . have no meaning for the little child . . . who as a rule does wrong impulsively and not deliberately. If he possessed the guilty consciousness of wrongdoing which connotes with sin, he still could not comprehend the symbolism of the blood."¹

They can understand God as their Creator but not as the Messiah-sender or sin-forgiver. They can comprehend the Christmas story of the Christ-Child and the fact that the baby Jesus grew up to be a man who went about doing good, but they cannot grasp the why and how of this same Jesus becoming a propitiation for their sins. Even during the primary period, the main emphasis should be on Jesus and His helpful deeds and teachings.

d. Ideas about the Future Life

"Children live in the present, not the future. They have no background for thinking of death and the future life."² Children live in the here and now; they are satisfied with this beautiful world and are not longing for a heavenly home just yet. Songs suggesting the hereafter seldom have any meaning for them. Nevertheless, children will not escape hearing about death, and some will possibly see evidences of it within their own families. They should be taught not to fear death, because it is then that their

.

1. Baker: op. cit., pp. 93-94.
2. Munkres: op. cit., p. 192.

friends go to their heavenly home to be with God. However, songs should for the most part be used that would encourage the children to feel that the Father is not One who is in a far off world and is found only after death, but One who is caring for all His children now.¹

The ideas of the song should not only carry understanding, but should unfold the right ideas of God, Jesus, and human relationships. Often teachers will realize that an idea is so beyond the children's comprehension that it cannot be satisfactorily explained. In that case, it is better to keep strictly within the range of what the child can understand, since there is plenty of material that can be satisfactorily explained; thus gradually the way will be prepared for the unknown which may follow later.²

3. With Respect to Music

The music of a song is of as much significance as the words and ideas it carries. Just because there are accompanying notes does not imply that the music is good or should be used. When precaution has been taken to select a meaningful message, wrapped in suitable and expressive words, the music to which it is set must not detract from or hinder the intended purpose; on the contrary, it should enrich and enliven the thought. Music is not a blanket

.

1. Cf. Munkres: op. cit., p. 192; Baker: op. cit., p. 94.
2. Cf. Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, pp. 29-30.

which spreads itself over words to conceal imperfections, but it brings to light what is already there. Miss Shields says of this point:

"It is a joy, indeed, to find a beautiful song-poem in a beautiful musical setting, that gives it double value--value in ideas and words beautifully phrased, enhanced by melody and harmony that seem a part of the message."¹

a. Melody from the Standpoint of Quality

During these early years, children are having their introduction to music and it is the responsibility of the church to create an appreciation for the best in music as in other things. Children should have the best music used for their worship, for what they hear during these formative years will set the precedent by which they select their own music later on. Those whose task it is to select music for children should be careful to harmonize their taste with standards already set by composers.² Edna Baker states:

"In selecting both songs and instrumental music, the standard for the music should be high. Popular tunes, jazzy airs, are not conducive to developing appreciation of really beautiful music or to inspiring the emotions connected with worship."³

b. Melody in Relation to Words

The music should blend with the spirit of the words; joyful, bright music suggests cheerful, happy words:

.

1. Shields: Guiding the Little Child, p. 34.
2. Cf. Shields: Guiding Kindergarten Children, p. 159.
3. Baker: op. cit., p. 95.

while meditative music indicates thoughtful words. The music serves as an interpretive aid, and enriches the words.¹

If the words and music do not correspond, it makes no difference how suited to the child either the words or the melody may be. Often, teachers try to fit the words of a poem into a musical composition for which it has not been intended; this may occasionally work, but all fine poetry does not automatically lend itself to the interpretation of even the finest musical compositions. It takes careful judgment on the part of those trying to put the two together.

c. Melody in Relation to the Range of Children's Voices

"Melody is the rhythmical succession of single notes."² Thus the melody is what the children actually sing, one note after another, and the notes must be within comfortable reach of their voices. No matter how good a song may be, if it is beyond the range of childish voices it is unsuitable. Music that is at all complex must wait a few years, because the ear and voice of childhood are untrained. It is only through the practical use and understanding of the simplest form of music that a basis is laid on which the heavier music can be built later. The child's

.

1. Cf. Blashfield: op. cit., p. 114; Shields: op. cit., p. 160.
2. Roget's Thesaurus Dictionary, p. 305.

capacity for vocal expression varies with his rate of development. Many children are singing against a handicap, for it is not until about nine years of age that the child reaches the range of adults. There is a range at which teachers should aim in selecting the songs to be used within their group.¹ Blashfield suggests:

"One of the simplest and easiest ways of testing music is to notice if it is all written on the lines and space of the staff, that is, from E to upper F. This is considered by many authorities the range of the primary child's voice, high, light tones being easiest and best . . . "²

And Elizabeth Shields expresses it thus:

"The Beginner's best notes are likely to be g, a, b, c, d, and e or e-flat on the staff. But most of them enjoy singing any note on the staff. A Primary child does not increase the upward range so much as the lower. Songs as low as middle c are enjoyed, provided there are not a great many notes in this lower register."³

This elevated range which is characteristic of children can quite clearly be expected, since their natural speaking voices are high-pitched. The same vocal register is used for singing as well as talking. Occasionally, or even more often, some child may have a voice that is on a lower level or husky; and special attention should be given him. On the whole, however, the voices tend to be high, and successful teachers will ever be mindful of this.

.

1. Cf. Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, p. 37; Blashfield: op. cit., p. 114; Edith Lovell Thomas: A First Book in Hymn and Worship, p. xi.
2. Blashfield: op. cit., p. 114.
3. Shields: op. cit., p. 37.

A song may meet the desirable range requirements, but that in itself does not insure its proper use. If it is accompanied by an off-key piano or is pitched by a teacher who does it improperly, the whole range may be shifted too much one way or the other and may produce a strain on the children's voices.

Music is such a vital part of children's lives that they will participate in song wherever it is pitched. They are not aware of their voice-placement, and there is no need of making them conscious of it. The one whose responsibility and privilege it is to teach music may well keep in mind that hers is an important task in helping the children to cultivate well-rounded and pleasing voices. She will be as considerate in guarding against a vocal strain as she would a physical strain.

d. Melody in Relation to Harmony

What could be delightful children's music is often crushed under the heavy accompanying harmony. Neither their appreciative nor interpretive powers are capable of grasping its purpose. If the singing is done without the aid of an instrument, there will be no need of competing with harmony. When harmony accompanies the melody, its intended purpose is to blend into and accent the melody; yet if it is too prominent the melody will be drowned and the children will be unable to distinguish the part they are to follow. Shields

advises:

"The harmony in songs used with Nursery children and Beginners should be very simple. It should not overshadow the melody, for very little children are sometimes confused by what we might call 'heavy harmony.' As they grow in experience with musical sounds and their ears become more alert and their sense of harmonic beauty more developed, the harmony may have a more prominent place."¹

The melody should therefore be given dominance over the harmony. Encouraging children to sing without the help of a piano will keep them from becoming dependent upon a leading instrument. However, there is less danger in using the piano or any other accompaniment if it is kept simple, allowing the melody to be emphasized.² Folk music is a good example of children's music; " . . . it is pure music, simple, and filled with real feeling of childlike character."³

The children will enjoy variations in their music unless it becomes so heavy that they cannot hear the melody for the sound of the harmony.

4. With Respect to Motions

Within the scope of music, every type of mood can be expressed. Moreover, through the power of music, certain moods may be induced; music may also become the stimulus to bodily movement. Because teachers have seen how well chil-

.

1. Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, p. 36.
2. Cf. Baker: op. cit., pp. 95-96.
3. Ibid., p. 96.

dren respond to music that is interpreted through action, many of them use this type almost exclusively. However, while music suggesting action has a real and definite place in child life, it should be used with discretion.

Previously, it has been pointed out that children's first response to music is a rhythmical one: clapping of hands, swaying of the whole body, and tapping of feet; also that their earliest group games are a rude attempt to keep time, illustrated in "London Bridge," "Looby Loo," and "Ring Around the Rosy." Some teachers have utilized such motion songs not only in the play life of children, but also in their worship experiences. In the light of the criteria considered thus far for judging songs, it is apparent that motions hardly lend themselves to the creating of an atmosphere for worshiping the heavenly Father.

The words of the song may be correct and the accompanying melody, range, and harmony corresponding perfectly, but if the rhythm does not blend in and contribute towards the unity of thought, the song is unsuitable.¹

"In most cases the response of swaying, clapping the hands, or tapping a palm with one finger should be to music without words, for it often happens that when children are encouraged in a rhythmic response to the song that is sung, the result is artificial--the old type of motion song. Occasionally, however, we may find a song where the rhythm may fit into the words without taking the minds of the children from the word picture. Such is the case with the song, 'The Trees

.

1. Cf. Baker: op. cit., p. 95.

are Gently Swaying'--

'The trees are gently swaying,
Swaying, swaying;
The trees are gently swaying,
Swaying in the breeze.'"

The motions suggested by the song above do not detract from the meaning of the words; rather, the motions and the words complement each other. A further example of emphasizing the meaning of a song might be to pretend they are ringing a church bell; and again the whole thought of a song may be clinched by a simple motion of pointing to themselves or to some concrete object within the active range of their experiences. Such meaningful motions which occasionally give life to a song are used legitimately.

After planting tiny seeds down in some soft warm earth and discussing how the heavenly Father sends the sunshine and rain to help them grow until they become tall, beautiful flowers, the writer has experienced with a group of nursery-age children that they like to squat on the floor and, to the accompaniment of appropriate music, rise slowly until they are tall again, pretending they have been the little seeds and now are the full grown flowers. This type of motion, however, should be kept within the confines of the pre-school class and should be used only after a meaningful group experience.

.

1. Shields: Guiding the Little Child in the Sunday School, p. 87.

"Although some of us feel that response to rhythm can be overdone, we recognize its value in co-ordinating a group. Little Nursery children, and occasionally Beginners, do not feel themselves to be a part of a group, and often need something to weld them together."¹

If motion songs are introduced, the motions and words must together be a unit of thought and not opposed to each other. Otherwise the words may have one meaning and the motions another. This may produce a state of bewilderment and confusion in the mind of the child who is entirely unable to grasp anything suggesting double meaning. For example, the following song may help to illustrate this:

"(1) When my cup (2) runneth over with joy,
 (1) When my cup (2) runneth over with joy,
(3) I find it easy (4) to pray and (5) to sing all the day
 (1) When my cup (2) runneth over with joy."

"(1) Form hand in shape of cup. (2) Rotate hands over each other in circular motion. (3) Clap hands three times. (4) Fold hands in prayer. (5) Bring hands together to form song book."²

It has been previously pointed out that children are literalists, and when singing the above song perhaps the only other connotation they have for "cup" is the one from which they drink. They cannot conceive of it running over with anything but milk or water and never with joy. In their minds, the problem of how it would be easier to pray and sing because your cup is running over may easily be created. In this song, of only nine measures, the motions change

.

1. Shields: Guiding the Little Child in the Sunday School, pp. 87, 88.
2. Overholtzer: Salvation Songs for Children, Number Two, p. 44.

eight times, and it is obvious that these motions neither clarify nor interpret the words to which they are set. The words and motions are not in harmony with each other, and it would be asking a good deal from most children to expect them to keep the words and motions both in mind while singing this song.

If motion songs are used to an excess in the worship services of children, they may assume that worship must be accompanied by action and that it is something in which they participate, yet do not understand. There also is the danger of their singing the songs mechanically, with more thought on the action that is to come than on the words which they are singing.

Motion songs, then, should not be used primarily, and never unless they accent or clarify the idea in a more meaningful way. The fact that children "like to sing motion songs," or that they look "so cute doing them," is not a valid reason for using such songs.

"Perhaps some of the worthy songs of our choice may not be liked at first, but the right methods of introducing and using the songs will bring happy results."¹

C. Summary

A study of the criteria by which songs are selected reveals that no longer will just any songs do for the

.

1. Shields: Music in the Religious Growth of Children, p. 28.

child to sing; but they must be selected according to certain accepted standards. Just as food and clothes are changed, adjusted, and altered to meet the growing needs of childhood, so must music correspond to these same needs. Music not only must, but can, meet their needs if the teachers are concerned that they shall meet this period of transition with desirable songs. It has been pointed out that children of the pre-school and primary age are not capable of digesting adult music because most hymn writers have not had children in mind when composing the majestic hymns of the church. Authorities in the field of religious education agree that the words, ideas, and music of the songs must be good, and must also be within the experiences of the children with whom they are used.

From the foregoing study, it was found that the words must be good from a literary standpoint, for the words of a good song should be a good poem. Also, it was found necessary that the words must have religious value, or else the children cannot feel that they have a vital relationship with their loving heavenly Father. Further, it was shown that the songs have to be within range of their childish experiences, and expressed in simple, concrete, and sincere words. If the words suggest symbolic or adult concepts, the message of the song is beyond the range of children, and they are singing only mechanically and not meaningfully.

With respect to ideas of God, Jesus, redemptive

power, and the future life, it was discovered that the limitations of children must be kept in mind. Therefore, it is better to lay a simple basic foundation on which to build, rather than to introduce mature songs which are meaningless to them. There is a goodly number of available songs, simple as well as truthful, beautiful and on the child's level of understanding, too.

With respect to children's music, it was evident that the quality should be of the best, for what they are hearing now becomes the standard by which they select their own music later on. The melody should enrich the words it serves and should correspond with them. Also, the melody must be within easy reach of their voices. The song may meet every other requirement for children's music, but if it is not in keeping with their natural high range it should not be used. When harmony accompanies the melody, it should be light enough so it does not drown the melody. Children's ears have not yet been trained to distinguish the two. The melody should stand out and be recognized above the blending harmony.

With respect to motions, it has been shown that the first response children make to music is a rhythmical one, and there is a definite place for this in the child's life. However, the use of motion songs in the worship experience of children is questionable, for, as it was pointed out, motion songs rarely create an atmosphere for worship.

If the motions are used to interpret symbolic songs, neither the songs nor the motions will have any value. However, a simple and occasional motion that does not detract from the words that are being sung, and that further clarifies the meaning, may legitimately be used.

CHAPTER III

AN ANALYSIS AND EVALUATION OF MOTION SONGS
USED WITH CHILDREN
IN SELECTED SONG BOOKS

CHAPTER III
AN ANALYSIS AND EVALUATION OF MOTION SONGS
USED WITH CHILDREN
IN SELECTED SONG BOOKS

A. Introduction

Using the criteria set up in Chapter II, this study will now proceed to analyze and evaluate motion songs as found in the selected song books: Salvation Songs for Children, Numbers One and Two; Singspiration Gospel Songs, Numbers Two and Three; Action Songs for Boys and Girls; When the Little Child Wants to Sing; Primary Music and Worship; and Songs for Little People. In order to discover the relation between motion songs and the underlying philosophy of Christian Education, two types of song books have been chosen, namely, those based on the evangelistic approach and those representing the emphasis on Christian nurture. From these books, forty motion songs have been selected, which will serve as the basis for this study and will be analyzed on the accompanying chart. In this selection, the aim was to include at least one song representing each general type of motions and to avoid duplication in general content. No songs without words were included, and only those songs with specifically religious content were chosen.

Some form of dramatic action has accompanied mu-

sic down through the years. The records reveal it goes back at least to the original performances of the Shakespearean plays, but no date has been found when the Church incorporated motions into its music. However, according to Miss Shields, to whom previous reference has been made concerning motions, they have been used for a long time. In fact, she speaks of them as "the old type of motion song."¹

In setting up the criteria for children's worship songs, it was discovered that authorities had comparatively little to say in regard to motions as an accompaniment of songs. By the omission it is indicated that they are agreed that religious motion songs have no great place in the spiritual nurturing of the child. In spite of this, as before stated, such songs are being used extensively by some groups. It is therefore the purpose of this chapter to study the motion songs that are now being used primarily in children's worship, in order to estimate their value in the light of accepted criteria and to determine the philosophy of religious education underlying their use. The procedure followed in this process will be to chart the motion songs selected and to analyze each in terms of word content and language, ideas, music, and motions.

.

1. Ante, p. 42.

B. Analysis of Selected Motion Songs
on Basis of Criteria for Evaluation

Abbreviations

Literature--L.; Religious Value--R.V.; Familiar Experience--F.E.;
Concrete--C.; Sincere--S.; God--G.; Jesus--J.; Redemptive Power--R.P.;
Future Life--F.L.; Quality--Q.; Melody--M.; Harmony--H.;
Pre-School Child--P.S.C.; Primary Child--P.C.

SONGS STUDIED	PAGE #	CONTENT		
		L.	R.V.	F.
Overholtzer: <u>Salvation Songs for Children</u> , Number One				
1. "My Burdens Went Rolling Away"	10	-	-	
2. "Building Every Day"	27	-	-	
3. "The Five-Finger Exercise"	33	-	-	
4. "Two Little Hands to Work for Jesus"	36	x	x	
5. "Climb, Climb Up Sunshine Mountain"	38	-	-	
6. "In the Sweet By and By"	45	-	-	
7. "Joy! Joy! Joy!"	56	-	-	
8. "The Light of the World Is Jesus"	99	/	-	
Overholtzer: <u>Salvation Songs for Children</u> , Number Two				
9. "My Father Is A Billionaire"	3	-	-	
10. "Draw the Bolt"	5	-	-	
11. "Wordless Book Chorus"	10	-	-	
12. "Happy All the Time"	12	-	-	
13. "Christ Is So High"	14	-	-	
14. "This Little Light of Mine"	17	-	-	
15. "Behold, Behold!"	25	-	-	
16. "The Church"	33	x	x	
17. "Exercise Hymn"	37	-	-	

Key

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Good
<input type="checkbox"/> Fair
<input type="checkbox"/> Bad
<input type="checkbox"/> No Reference Made

ience--F.E.;
 mptive Power--R.P.;
 -H.;

		CONTENT		AND LANGUAGE			IDEAS				MUSIC						MO- TIONS
PAGE #	L.	R.V.	F.E.	C.	S.	G.	J.	R.P.	F.L.	Q.	M.	H.	RANGE				
													R.S.C.	P.C.			
10	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	X	-	-	X	-		
27	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-		
33	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	X	X	-		
36	X	X	X	X	X		X	/	/	X	X	-	-	X	X		
38	-	-	-	-	-	-		-		-	-	-	-	X	-		
45	-	-	-	-	-				-	-	X	-	-	X	-		
56	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	X	-	-	X	-		
99	/	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	X	-	-	X	-		
3	-	-	-	-	-	-		-		-	-	-	-	-	-		
5	-	-	-	-	-		-	-		-	-	-	X	X	-		
10	-	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	X	-	-	X	-		
12	-	-	-	-	-		-	-		-	-	-	X	X	-		
14	-	-	-	-	-		-			-	-	-	X	X	-		
17	-	-	-	-	-					-	-	-	-	X	-		
25	-	-	-	-	-			-		-	X	X	-	-	-		
33	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			X	X	/	-	X	X		
37	-	-	-	-	-		-			-	-	-	-	X	-		

SONGS STUDIED	PAGE #	CONTENT	
		L.	R.V.
18. "When Your Cup Runneth Over"	44	-	-
19. "Yesterday, Today, Forever"	46	-	/
20. "The Bible Gold Mine"	69	-	-
21. "I'm Going Up, Up, Up"	81	-	-
22. "We're Sailing Home"	85	-	-
23. "The Faith Line"	86	-	-
24. "I'm His Child"	90	-	-
Smith: <u>Singspiration</u> , Number Two			
25. "Wide As the Ocean"	101	/	x
26. "My Sins Rose High"	105	-	-
27. "The 'Happy Day' Express"	106	-	-
Smith: <u>Singspiration</u> , Number Three			
28. "Writing All the Time"	105	-	-
Smith: <u>Action Songs For Boys and Girls</u>			
29. "Jesus Can Keep"	6	/	x
30. "I'll Be A Sunbeam"	11	-	-
31. "God Has Blotted Them Out"	52	-	-
32. "Oh, Be Careful"	58	-	-
33. "Fishers of Men"	75	-	-
Presby. Bd. of C. E.: <u>When the Little Child Wants To Sing</u>			
34. "A Song of Church Bells"	3	x	x
35. "Ring, Ring, Ring"	4	x	x
36. "A Seed Song"	132	x	x
Presby. Bd. of C. E.: <u>Primary Music and Worship</u>			
37. "Sabbath Bells Are Pealing"	170	x	x
38. "Up and Down the Farmer Goes"	172	x	x
Danielson and Conant: <u>Songs For Little People</u>			
39. "Oh, What Can Little Hands Do?"	111	x	x
40. "The Waking of the Flowers"	118	/	x

PAGE #	CONTENT		AND LANGUAGE			IDEAS				MUSIC					MO-TIONS
	L.	R.V.	F.E.	C.	S.	G.	J.	R.P.	F.L.	Q.	M.	H.	RANGE		
													P.S.C.	P.C.	
44	-	-	-	-	-					-	-	-	x	x	-
46	-	/	-	/	/		/	-	-	-	-	-	x	x	-
69	-	-	-	-	-					-	x	/	-	-	-
81	-	-	-	-	-		-		-	-	x	-	-	-	-
85	-	-	-	-	-		-		-	-	x	-	x	x	-
86	-	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	x	-	x	x	-
90	-	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	x	-	x	x	-
101	/	x	-	-	x		x			/	x	-	x	x	/
105	-	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	x	x	x	x	-
106	-	-	-	-	-		-		-	-	x	-	-	x	-
105	-	-	-	-	-	-				-	x	x	-	x	-
6	/	x	x	x	x		x			/	/	x	-	x	x
11	-	-	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	x	-	-	-	-
52	-	-	-	-	-	-		-		/	x	-	x	x	-
58	-	-	x	/	-	-				/	x	x	-	x	x
75	-	-	-	-	-		-	-		-	x	-	-	x	-
3	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	x	x	x	x
4	x	x	x	x	x					x	x	x	x	x	x
132	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	-	x	x	x
170	x	x	x	x	x		x			x	x	x	-	x	x
172	x	x	x	x	x	x				x.	x	x	x	x	/
111	x	x	x	x	x	-	/			x	x	x	-	x	x
118	/	x	x	x	x	x				x	x	-	-	x	x

C. Extent to Which Motion Songs Are Used

In the song books carrying the evangelistic approach, twenty-five motion songs were included in Salvation Songs for Children, Number Two, and twelve in Number One; in Singspiration Gospel Songs, Number Two, there are eleven motion songs, and nine in Number Three; in Action Songs for Boys and Girls, there are fourteen motion songs.

In the three song books emphasizing Christian nurture, seven motion songs were included: When the Little Child Wants to Sing had four; Primary Music and Worship had two; and Songs for Little People also included two.

D. Analysis of Motion Songs

1. With Respect to Word Content and Language

In setting up criteria for judging motion songs, it will be recalled that the first requirement was in relation to word content and language, with the following standards for testing:

a. Literature

Of the forty motion songs selected, eight would meet the requirements for good literature. Of these, eight songs, six are from the books compiled by outstanding religious educators, and are: "Ring, Ring, Ring,"¹ "A Seed

.

1. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #4. (Because of frequency of repetition, the above abbreviation will be used hereafter in this thesis.)

Song,"¹ "A Song of Church Bells,"² "Up and Down the Farmer Goes,"³ "Sabbath Bells Are Pealing,"⁴ and "Oh What Can Little Hands Do?"⁵ There are three more songs that would not pass as the best in children's literature; yet they surpass the literary features of the remaining motion songs. These are: "The Waking of the Flowers,"⁶ "The Light of the World,"⁷ and "Wide as the Ocean."⁸

b. Religious Value

Besides failing to meet the literary qualifications set up, the words of the forty motion songs also fail, on the whole, to carry much religious significance for the children. Eleven of the songs would have bearing on their spiritual development. For example, the song, "Jesus Can Keep Little Children,"⁹ helps them realize that Jesus is close to them, and encourages the expression of prayer; in "The Waking of the Flowers,"¹⁰ children acknowledge the loving care of the heavenly Father; and in "Up and Down the Farmer Goes,"¹¹ the child is reminded that it is God who sends the rain and sunshine to help the little seeds grow.

.

1. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #132.
2. Ibid., #3.
3. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #172.
4. Ibid., #170.
5. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #111.
6. Ibid., #118.
7. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #99.
8. Smith: Singspiration, Number Two, #101.
9. Smith: Action Songs, #6.
10. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #118.
11. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #172.

The word content of the remaining twenty-nine songs is outside the realm of the children's religious range. Instead of centering in simple concepts, they tend to be organized around religious doctrines that are too advanced and have no basic foundation for the understanding of a child. This can be illustrated in the song, "My Father is a Billionaire."¹ God is suggested as being a billionaire because He owns everything, and when children are born again they are made His heirs by adoption and the billions are shared together. Further examples are:

"No darkness have we who in Jesus abide,
The Light of the world is Jesus;
We walk in the light when we follow our Guide,
The Light of the world is Jesus."²

* * *

"Christ is so high you can't get over Him,
So deep you can't get under Him,
So wide you can't get around Him,
So you'd better come in at the door."³

c. Familiar Experience

Of the selected motion songs, ten were found to be within the common experiences of children. Four of these are related to the church: "The Church,"⁴ "Ring, Ring, Ring,"⁵ "A Song of Church Bells,"⁶ and "Sabbath Bells are Pealing"⁷; three are related to nature: "The Waking of the

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #3.
2. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #99.
3. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #14.
4. Ibid., #33.
5. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #4.
6. Ibid., #3.
7. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #170.

Flowers,"¹ "A Seed Song,"² and "Up and Down the Farmer Goes"³; and three to little eyes, hands and feet of the children: "Oh What Can Little Hands Do?"⁴ "Be Careful,"⁵ and "Two Little Hands."⁶ The remaining songs are built around religious concepts that are still unfamiliar. Such subjects as sin, salvation, new birth, and heaven are dealt with extensively. To quote two outstanding songs in this group:

"My heart was black with sin,
Until the Saviour came in;
His precious blood, I know,
Has washed it white as snow.
And in His Word I'm told
I'll walk the streets of gold;
Oh, wonderful wonderful day,
He washed my sins away!"⁷

* * *

"My sins rose as high as the mountain;
They all disappeared in the fountain;
He wrote my name down To a palace and crown;
O bless His dear name, I am free."⁸

d. Concreteness and Sincerity

It has been shown that children cannot sing sincerely what they do not understand. A basic requirement is that the songs must convey concrete words, or else the child sings the words mechanically with no knowledge of what he is singing. Ten songs were found to have concrete words. These same ten songs, with the addition of one more, also

.

1. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #118.
2. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #132.
3. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #172.
4. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #111.
5. Smith: Action Songs, #58.
6. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #36.
7. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #10.
8. Smith: Singspiration, Number Two, #105.

embraced sincerity. Again, they were songs pertaining mostly to the church and nature, such as "A Song of Church Bells,"¹ "The Church,"² "Sabbath Bells are Pealing,"³ and "A Seed Song."⁴ The remaining songs tend toward the symbolical, and use figurative language. In expressions like, "He is the only Cornerstone,"⁵ "I will make you fishers of men,"⁶ and "This little light of mine, I'm going to let it shine,"⁷ the meaning is barred from the child, and he may learn to sing in an artificial, half-hearted, insincere way as a result of singing these songs.

2. With Respect to Ideas

In setting the criteria for children's worship songs in relation to ideas, religious educators were found to agree that the ideas must be kept simple. Children will understand God to be a loving heavenly Father, and Jesus, the little children's Friend; but they are not ready to grasp the meaning of redemptive power. Neither must the songs center around a future life or in a God who is away up in heaven.⁸

.

1. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #3.
2. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #33.
3. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #170.
4. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #132.
5. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #27.
6. Smith: Action Songs, #75.
7. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #17.
8. Ante, pp. 32-35.

a. Ideas about God

Through the use of music, a desirable atmosphere may be created which will encourage the children to feel close to God, but if songs are chosen which carry ideas foreign to them, the objective for worship is lost. Of the forty motion songs studied, twenty-eight make no reference to God at all, and in only five of the twelve songs that do include God are correct ideas and relationships given that children are able to comprehend: "The Church"¹ expresses the idea that the church bells are inviting people to come and worship God; "A Song of Church Bells"² and "Ring, Ring, Ring"³ carry the idea of God's love and goodness, and how to be happy; "A Seed Song"⁴ deals with the God of nature who makes things grow; "The Waking of the Flowers"⁵ suggests thankfulness to God for His loving care. In the remaining seven songs, ideas are embodied which could be interpreted falsely, such as that God is a spy, or a Person in a far-off place watching for children to do something wrong. For example:

"He sees all you do, He hears all you say,
My Lord is writing all the time, time, time . . . "6

* * *

"Oh, be careful, little eyes, what you see . . .
Oh, be careful, little ears, what you hear . . .
For the Father up above is looking down in love,
So be careful . . . "7

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #33.
2. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #3.
3. Ibid., #4.
4. Ibid., #132.
5. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #118.
6. Smith: Singspiration, Number Three, #105.
7. Smith: Action Songs, #58.

b. Ideas about Jesus

Songs can be a rich source of supplying the children with information concerning their ever-present Friend, Jesus. They love to sing songs related to His birth, as well as stories about His later life and His love for children.

Five motion songs--"Two Little Hands,"¹ "The Church,"² "Wide as the Ocean,"³ "Jesus Can Keep Little Children,"⁴ and "Sabbath Bells are Pealing"⁵--carry the association which children should have for Jesus, that He loves little children and that He hears them when they pray. In no song, aside from these five, was the implication given that Jesus is the children's Friend. Four times He is referred to as King, twice as Christ, twice simply as "His," thirteen times as Saviour--ranging from the coming Saviour to the Saviour of our black sins. In seven songs He is used as a figure, while in fifteen of the forty songs no reference is made at all to Jesus.

c. Ideas about Redemptive Power

For children up through the primary period, ideas dealing with the redemptive power of Christ were held, in general, to be too advanced. To illustrate: singing about

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #36.
2. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #33.
3. Smith: Singspiration, Number Two, #101.
4. Smith: Action Songs, #6.
5. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #170.

" . . . when I was born again . . . "1 is out of the natural realm of their experiences. In spite of the theological nature of the terms, sixteen of the motion songs pertain to grace, forgiveness, sins, and cleansing the heart. An eight-year-old child could hardly be expected to grasp the meaning of the following:

"God has blotted them out, I'm happy and glad and free;
God has blotted them out, I'll turn to Isaiah and see;
Chapter forty-four, twenty-two and three;
He's blotted them out and now I can shout,
For that means me."2

* * *

"At the heart's door the Saviour's waiting,
At the heart's door fast closed by sin,
Don't you hear Him gently knocking?
Draw the bolt and let Him in."3

* * *

"All of my burdens went rolling away, rolling away,
rolling away . . .
Peace like a river came into my heart, into my heart,
into my heart . . .
Joy like a fountain sprang up in my heart, up in my
heart, up in my heart,
Down at the Saviour's cross."4

* * *

"For I'm S-A-V-E-D, I'm S-A-V-E-D,
By my Saviour's blood, His precious blood,
I'm S-A-V-E-D."5

d. Ideas about Future Life

For childhood, the emphasis should be on the present life.⁶ Even though children may be taught not to

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #3.
2. Smith: Action Songs, #52.
3. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #5.
4. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #10.
5. Ibid., #33.
6. Ante, p. 35.

fear death, there are more desirable experiences around which their singing may be centered. Yet fifteen of the songs examined revealed ideas of a future life. It is expressed in such terms as "Building for Eternity,"¹ "When my word is done, He'll take me home,"² "the heavenly courts above,"³ "I'll walk the streets of gold,"⁴ and "I'm going up, up, up, (going up) Bless the Lord, when Jesus comes, I'm going up . . . "⁵ Most little children do not reveal in their conversation that they are eager to get to their heavenly mansion, and with all the rich available material, teachers could advantageously let them enjoy singing about some of the beautiful and lovely things that the Creator has given for them to enjoy now.

3. With Respect to Music

The criteria regarding the musical features for children's worship songs are equally significant. The quality, though simple, must be of the best; the melody and the words must suggest each other; the melody must be kept within the comfortable range of the children's high-pitched voices, and the melody must stand out above the accompanying harmony.⁶

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #27.
2. Ibid., #33.
3. Ibid., #36.
4. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #10.
5. Ibid., #81.
6. Ante, pp. 36-40.

a. Music in Relation to Quality

Nine of the songs studied have a good quality of music, namely, "Two Little Hands,"¹ "The Church,"² "Ring, Ring, Ring,"³ "A Seed Song,"⁴ "A Song of Church Bells,"⁵ "Up and Down the Farmer Goes,"⁶ "Sabbath Bells are Pealing,"⁷ "Oh, What Can Little Hands Do?"⁸ and "The Waking of the Flowers."⁹ Four other songs were of an inferior quality, yet better than the remaining twenty-seven. These are: "Wide as the Ocean,"¹⁰ "Jesus Can Keep Little Children,"¹¹ "God Has Blotted Them Out,"¹² and "Oh Be Careful."¹³ A common characteristic of most of the remaining songs is that they are catchy, fast, and consist of swiny little melodies.

b. Melody in Relation to Words

To meet the standards, the melody and words of a song must be suited to each other. Of the forty songs pertaining to this study, twenty-eight were found to have music and words which harmonize. At first, this may appear to be

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #36.
2. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #33.
3. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #4.
4. Ibid., #132.
5. Ibid., #3.
6. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #172.
7. Ibid., #170.
8. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #111.
9. Ibid., #118.
10. Smith: Singspiration, Number Two, #101.
11. Smith: Action Songs, #6.
12. Ibid., #52.
13. Ibid., #58.

a better percentage in relation to what has gone before, but the fact that the words and music of these twenty-eight songs conform to each other does not indicate that they are good songs. Only eight of these songs had a good quality of music to begin with; only seven of these would pass as good literature. The other twenty songs, of the twenty-eight in which the melodies and words were related, suggested a type of music that is not in keeping with, nor conducive to, a worshipful atmosphere. Neither would they succeed in giving the children a sense of God's presence. The melodies and the words of the remaining eighteen songs have no seeming relation to each other. Some of these songs include two- and three-syllable words, and, not only because they are longer but because of the meaning attached to them, they should be accompanied by a moderate tempo. Instead, they are set to lively tempos. Again, in one song, the words and notes are uneven, so that six times one word has to carry over, in order to have the words and music end at the same time.

c. Melody in Relation to Range

Because children's voices are, on the whole, high-pitched, it was found, their songs should accommodate and be within easy range of their voices. While the primary child's voice is beginning to lower, and he can comfortably reach notes as low as middle c if there are not too many, the pre-school age child is limited to notes within the staff. On

the basis of these standards, fourteen of the selected songs meet the nursery child's range, while thirty-five are within the primary's. In every instance where the range is not suited to the child's voice, it is because all of the notes tend to be too low. Studies have shown that the best children's songs make use of few notes; but, on the whole, the motion songs make use of many notes.

d. Music in Relation to Harmony

If the melody is overshadowed with heavy harmony, the children are at a loss to know what part they are to follow. Of the motion songs studied, ten were found to have simple harmony which did not drown the melody but accented and blended with the melody. The remaining thirty songs have harmony too heavy for the children's appreciation and interpretation. By nature, these songs lend themselves to embellishments and additional flourishes, which would be a further burden to the melody. Even if the pianist plays only the written music, with no additional notes, the melody is still lost to the untrained ear of children.

4. With Respect to Motions

One criterion applies to the actions accompanying any song: they must have meaning for the child--a meaning that is based upon their relation to experience. In the realm of motions too, symbolism has no part. Using this as a basis for studying the motion songs in relation to the

words, it was found that ten of the selected songs had motions that in no way conflicted, interfered, or were forced to interpret the message given. Of these ten songs, four included the simple motion of ringing the church bell: "The Church,"¹ "Ring, Ring, Ring,"² "A Song of Church Bells,"³ and "Sabbath Bells are Pealing."⁴ Three songs included pointing to concrete objects, such as the hands, the feet, and the eyes, these songs being: "Two Little Hands,"⁵ "Oh Be Careful,"⁶ and "Oh, What Can Little Hands Do?"⁷ In one song, "A Seed Song,"⁸ the children spontaneously add the motions while the teacher is singing; in another, "The Waking of the Flowers,"⁹ the motions are done between the singing; and in the last, "Jesus Can Keep Little Children,"¹⁰ the hands are folded and the head bowed while the song is being sung. Of the remaining thirty songs, one, "Up and Down the Farmer Goes,"¹¹ has three verses and fifteen motions. Some of these motions are concrete and others vague, and since no indication is given but that it be sung and acted at the same time, it could

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #33.
2. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #4.
3. Ibid., #3.
4. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #170.
5. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #36.
6. Smith: Action Songs, #58.
7. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #111.
8. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants to Sing, #132.
9. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #118.
10. Smith: op. cit., #6.
11. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #172.

hardly be included as a worthy motion song. The motions of the last twenty-nine songs range from waving flashlights, turning the colored pages of The Wordless Book, kneeling on the floor, shaking heads, stamping feet, clapping hands, climbing mountains, and winking eyes, to puffing like Satan. The language of these songs centers around symbolical, figurative, and theological concepts, and the motions are included as a means to explain these words. However, if the words are strange and unknown, the motions do not have the capacity for defining them, and in most cases they themselves serve as an additional perplexing feature.

E. Evaluation

1. Of Selected Songs

Each of the forty selected motion songs will now be evaluated in terms of the accepted criteria.

"My Burdens Went Rolling Away"¹ does not meet the standards because its content and language are not of good literary quality and because the religious value is lost for the child, since the song refers to the rolling away of burdens down at the cross and the peace and joy which come as a result, both adult experiences with little or no meaning. The language, using adult comparisons, can hardly allow for sincere singing. The ideas of Jesus and of redemptive power are combined, but with no reference to the future life.

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #10.

The music is of an inferior quality; yet the words and melody do suggest each other. The harmony is too heavy and is within the range of only the primary child. The motions are an attempt to illustrate the unfamiliar figures and comparisons of the song.

"Building Every Day"¹ could not stand alone as a poem because of its poor literary arrangement. The religious value, the experience, and the language are based on a mature level expressed in figurative words which do not lend themselves to sincerity. The ideas of God as an architect and Jesus as a cornerstone are not true childish concepts. The quality of music is inferior because of its irregularity; the melody and words neither suggest nor fit each other; and the range is not in conformity with that of even an eight-year-old's voice. The twelve changing motions do not bring clarity to the figurative words of the song, because they are contrary to the words they enact.

Because eighteen of the words are spelled out, and three of the stanzas are not complete thoughts, "The Five-Finger Exercise"² is poor literature. Children could not be expected to sing this song sincerely, since ideas of redemption and the future life have not only borrowed theological terms but have spelled them as well. The music and words

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #27.

2. Ibid., #33.

do not complement each other, since some of the words must be held over to make both the music and the words end together. However, the song is within the voice range of both the pre-school and the primary child.

"Two Little Hands to Work for Jesus"¹ is a motion song that has been found eligible to stand in the light of recognized criteria, except for the harmony and the voice range, which goes too low for nursery children. This song briefly touches upon the power of redemption and the future life, but if an accompanying and simple explanation has preceded the singing, they can both be included with meaning and appreciation. The song, written in concrete words, portrays a sincere message of giving little hands, little eyes, and little ears to Jesus. The melody is good and is suited to the words, and the range is within comfortable reach of the primary child; but the harmony is heavy. The motions are concrete, pointing to definite objects.

"Climb, Climb Up Sunshine Mountain"² is an invitation to turn from sin and climb an imaginary sunshine mountain and to look up to the sky. The thoughts are conflicting, because even if the child were acquainted with the meaning of sin, the climbing of a mountain and the looking up to the sky do not eliminate sin. There is nothing in the

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #36.
2. Ibid., #38.

content of the words that would encourage the child to feel close to God. The only desirable feature of the music is that it is within the range of the primary child's voice. Again, the motions are an endeavor to dramatize figurative expressions such as climbing a mountain, heavenly breezes, and turning from sin. This song therefore fails to meet the qualifications on almost every point.

"In the Sweet By and By"¹ and "Joy! Joy! Joy!"² are similar in several respects. Neither of them expresses in concrete childish words experiences that are familiar, because they reveal in an artificial manner the idea of a future life. In "In the Sweet By and By," a bright and fair mansion is promised after the battle and victory have been won; and in "Joy! Joy! Joy!," because "His" love is known and the sins have all been forgiven they are on their way to heaven. In both, the quality of music is poor, although the melody suggests the type of words being sung, and the voice range conforms to the primary child. Again, the motions fail to make the figurative subjects meaningful.

"The Light of the World Is Jesus"³ is a song that has been successfully used with older groups, but because of its mature theme development and the use of adult figures and symbolism, it cannot be counted as a valid song for

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number One, #45.
2. Ibid., #56.
3. Ibid., #99.

children. As pointed out, children are literalists, and could hardly sing truthfully, "Once I was blind but now I can see; The Light of the world is Jesus." Jesus is not only referred to as the "Light of the world," but also as a "Lamb of light in the City of Gold," a thought which does not make for a close relationship to Him. Further confusion might easily arise since a candle is used to illustrate the "Light." However, the melody is in keeping with the words, but the harmony is again too heavy and does not suit the nursery child's voice. The motions change twenty-four times and do not add meaning to the words.

"My Father Is A Billionaire"¹ tells in an uneven and irregular literary meter of the Father as being a Billionaire, and of how, when one is born again, one is adopted by God as an heir, and sharing the billions together takes place. It is evident that such a symbolic song is outside the religious realm of experiences for children, and in its imagery tends to instil wrong ideas of God and of our relation to Him. The quality of music and of musical arrangement is poor, and the melody does not suggest the words. The range is within that of the primary child. The motions fail to contribute meaning to the words.

"Draw the Bolt"² pictures the Saviour waiting at

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #3.

2. Ibid., #5.

the heart's door that is closed by sin. The question is asked if His knocking cannot be heard, and then the exhortation is extended to "Draw the bolt and let Him in." It cannot be counted worthy of having religious value, because children like to think of Jesus being near to them, and this song implies the contrary. It centers in the power of redemption and uses figures that are unfamiliar. The catchy music is of a decided inferior quality, and is hardly suited to the words. However, because the melody is not drowned by heavy harmony, in this respect this song is better than most of the others. The suggested motions are a vain attempt to interpret the symbolical language.

In a poor style of language, the "Wordless Book Chorus"¹ has been revealed to be inadequate in meeting the needs of children, because it too is outside the realm of their experiences, for the words are symbolical, and unfamiliar comparisons are resorted to. The song centers around mature redemption, indicating that the black sins have been washed white by the Saviour's red blood, and that as a result children will walk the streets of gold. The music is poor; the harmony is too heavy; and the range conforms only to the primary child's voice. The words and music suggest each other, and the motions are as symbolic as the words they attempt to interpret.

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #10.

"Happy All the Time"¹ also falls below the accepted standards for children's songs. In literary quality, it is uneven and jerky. The religious value is lost because the idea again centers in the blackness of sins until Jesus cleansed them. It is not concretely expressed, and therefore cannot be sung sincerely. The music too is swingy; the harmony is too heavy; and the words and music are not suggestive of each other. The motions, which change rapidly six times, are, at best, poor gestures without any meaning.

"Christ Is So High"² was found to be a song that might lead children to feel that it is very difficult to know where He is. The language which unfolds the song shows that the religious value is empty and figurative and outside the familiar range of experiences of children. The music is neither good nor suited to the words, but is within comfortable reach of both pre-school and primary children's voices. Again, the motions are a futile attempt to dramatize the symbolical words.

"This Little Light of Mine"³ embraces symbolical concepts vaguely stated. For instance, part of the song reads: "This little light of mine, I'm going to let it shine; This little light of mine, I'm going to let it

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #12.
2. Ibid., #14.
3. Ibid., #17.

shine . . . "; but even if the children knew what the light had reference to, nowhere in the song is it stated for what purpose the light is shining. The language lacks specific words and specific ideas. Out of such, sincerity cannot come. The music suggests jazz; the words are not fitted to the music; and the voice range is not within that of the pre-school child. The motions call for the children to serve as candles, bushels, and the breath of Satan.

"Behold, Behold!"¹ is an adaptation of a Bible verse, but has been revised in such a way that it cannot be said to have good literary characteristics. The pronoun, "I," is used of the One who is doing the knocking at the door, and the children knock on their hands. This makes for confusion as to who the "I" is. Besides, the knocking takes place on the hands when a door has been referred to. Consequently, this song would have no religious value, and the only familiar experience is the knocking that takes place on an actual, concrete door. The music tends to be of a jerky nature, but the melody does suggest the words. The accompanying harmony is light enough for the melody to stand out, but the range is not in conformity with either pre-school or primary children's voices.

"The Church"² is a song that meets the literary

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #25.
2. Ibid., #33.

qualification so well that it could be used as a poem without music. The religious value is evident throughout the entire song, because it refers to a normal and familiar experience; the language is concrete and the whole message is sincere. The idea of the bells inviting people to come and to worship God is on the level of child comprehension. The quality of the music is good and the words and melody relate to each other. The harmony, however, might be too heavy for the nursery-age children. The simple motions of ringing the church bell and of bowing the head are concrete actions in response to concrete words. On almost every score, then, this song meets the standards.

The "Exercise Hymn,"¹ from the literary standpoint, is a rhyme. There is nothing in it that is worshipful or of religious value. It merely states the actions that take place during worship, such as standing, sitting, bowing, and kneeling; and as these various words are sung the motions are to be enacted. The quality of music is poor; the melody and words are not related; the harmony is too heavy for the melody; and the range is comparable to that of a primary child's voice.

"When Your Cup Runneth Over"² would be able to pass the test of accepted criterion in one respect, namely, that

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #37.
2. Ibid., #44.

it is within the voice range of both the pre-school and the primary child. Other than that, it fails to meet the requirements of literary value and of religious value; it is beyond the border of familiar experiences, and it is not expressive of a sincere, childish nature. There is no reference made to God, to Jesus, nor to anything that is suggestive of worship. It includes far-fetched and symbolical ideas, none of which encourage a worshipful attitude.

"Yesterday, Today, Forever"¹ is a modified jingle. Its religious value is not so evident as has been noticed in other songs, yet it surpasses most of the studied songs. In its effort to portray Jesus as One who never changes, the language could not be called entirely concrete, but it does attempt to give the right idea of Him. However, the quality of the music falls very low. The words are not suggested by the melody, but are forced to conform to it. The harmony over-shadows the melody, but the range is within the criteria set for both the pre-school and the primary child. The motions tend to be more symbolical than the words they interpret, and could be wisely omitted.

"The Bible Gold Mine,"² in literary structure, is faulty and uneven. The religious value is entirely missing; it contains comparisons foreign to the experience of chil-

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #46.
2. Ibid., #69.

dren; and the language is figurative and artificial. The music is poor also, but the words do suggest the music to which they are set, and the harmony could not be struck out as entirely too heavy, though in certain spots it is. The motions, such as wielding a pick, digging, and bringing the hands up to store up wealth, are far-fetched, and obviously do not lend themselves to clarifying the words.

"I'm Going Up, Up, Up"¹ makes use of poor literary devices, and since it is out of the range of experiences of the children, it has no religious value for them. Adult language and expressions have been incorporated, with reference to the second coming of Christ. This would not encourage sincere singing on the part of the child. The quality of the music is bad, but the music and the words are suggestive of each other. The harmony is not appropriate, and the range is not suited to children's voices. The motions, such as pointing the finger towards the sky and pointing higher on each "up," playing an imaginary trumpet, and winking the eye, are not in keeping with the thought of the song and refer to symbolical words and expressions.

"We're Sailing Home"² is not good either as literature or as music. The language is figurative, and adult

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #81.
2. Ibid., #85.

concepts are included. The song is based on the idea of "sailing home," Jesus being referred to as the "Pilot" and the invitation being extended to "come on board." The music is as poor as the words it accompanies; the harmony is too heavy; yet the range is within the children's voices. Though the song is a short one of only two lines, the motions change six times, and represent the ocean wave, an invitation, a pilot's wheel, and pointing up "to the land of endless day."

"The Faith Line"¹ is a song of three lines which contains two definite mature thoughts, neither one being within the child's experiences. They do not know what "faith" is, and its being on a "line" is not comprehensible to them. Even if the idea could be called meaningful, the accompanying motion of swinging their arms suggests no clear relationship. The second thought is that of telling " . . . the story from here to glory, How the Saviour saves and keeps and satisfies." This is hardly the normal way a child thinks about Jesus. The motions accompanying this thought are putting the hand to the mouth as though calling and lifting up the head. Both of these are more distracting than helpful. The rhythmic music suggests the words; the harmony is too dominant; but the range is suited to the children's voices. Thus, the song falls far short of

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #86.

meeting the requirements needed for training children in Christian nurture.

"I'm His Child"¹ and "My Sins Rose High"² are examples of what children's songs should not be. In the first place, in the former there is no unity of thought between the name of the song and the song itself. Secondly, in each song there are four separate ideas that to a child would have no correlation, two of which are symbolical comparisons about "grace" and "sin"; one, "bound for a palace and crown"; and the other, "is free." Thirdly, the music, which is the same for both songs, is catchy and swingy, and the harmony is too heavy; though the melody does suggest the words, and the voice range is suited to children's voices. Lastly, the motions are almost sacrilegious, not only because they add no meaning to the words, but also because they attempt what cannot be done adequately through motions, such as acting out Christ's grace, sins, heaven, and worship.

"Wide As the Ocean"³ has certain literary irregularities which hinder it from meeting the standard required; yet it is better than most of the songs studied. It has religious value for the child because it is a sincere attempt to tell him of the great love and care that Jesus

.

1. Overholtzer: op. cit., Number Two, #90.
2. Smith: Singspiration, Number Two, #105.
3. Ibid., #101.

gives His children. However, Jesus is referred to as "my Saviour," which might not be too meaningful, and the comparisons, though simple, would be advanced for pre-school children. The music again could not be called the best, but is superior to the motion songs taken from the Child Evangelism books in general. The melody and words are suited to each other; the voice range is good, but the harmony is too heavy. The motions are a fair interpretation of the words, but if there is no way of telling how great and wonderful the love of Jesus is, motions cannot meet that inadequacy. Therefore, it would seem that this song would be more meaningful and worshipful if all motions were omitted, save the one of pointing to themselves when they are referred to as "I."

"The 'Happy Day' Express"¹ employs poor literary devices, such as spelling and the use of imagery which is not only misleading but untruthful. There could be no feeling of worship or love during the singing of this song, because the thought of going to a mansion "on the 'Happy Day' Express," in which Jesus is called "the guard" and the engine is "J-E-S-U-S," could hardly be sung sincerely. The music is jazzy, and the swingy melody is in keeping with the words. The harmony is too heavy, but the voice range conforms to that of the child. The motions are ridiculous,

.

1. Smith: Singspiration, Number Two, #106.

and are an insult to any child's intelligence.

"Writing All the Time"¹ and "Oh, Be Careful"² suggest to the child that God sees and hears all that you do, so be careful, because He is writing all of these things down. Even though in "Oh, Be Careful" it says that "the Father up above is looking down in love," it still exhorts children to be careful, and they might easily come to resent the ever-present and tender love. Both of the songs have faulty literary features. The music is not commendable in either one, but in "Oh, Be Careful" the quality is better. Both have harmony that does not drown the melody; both songs have the voice range suited to the primary child; and in both the words and music suggest each other. The motions in "Writing All the Time" are not made clear, because "My Lord" is the One who does the seeing, hearing, and writing, but it is the children's eyes, ears, and writing-pad hands that are used; while in "Oh, Be Careful," since the song is sung to the "little eyes" and "little ears," the motions are concrete.

"Jesus Can Keep"³ meets the standard for content and language, with the exception of one minor literary irregularity. Other than that, it is a simple, sincere, concrete childish thought, encouraging children to pray, and

.

1. Smith: Singspiration, Number Three, #105.
2. Smith: Action Songs, #58.
3. Ibid., #6.

assuring them that Jesus will help them. The quality of music is not the best for children, but it is much better than that of most of the songs. The words and melody are fairly suggestive of each other and the harmony is kept simple, allowing the melody to stand out. The range is suited to the voice of the primary child. The single and simple motion of clasping the hands in prayer make meaningful and purposeful the words, and could well be said to meet the accepted criterion at this point.

"I'll Be A Sunbeam"¹ has borrowed abstract language in which to express its artificial message. This song encourages children to become little sunbeams or lighthouses and to shine for Jesus, thus permitting them to "live with Him on high." Since they are literalists and know only what sunbeams and lighthouses really are, a conflict may arise as to how they might assume these characteristics. Therefore, it could not be counted as having any religious value, because it would be neither a familiar experience nor a sincere one. The music is catchy; the words do not suit the music; and the range is too low for children's voices. The motions are only a contributing factor in misinterpretation, with different colored flashlights used to represent the light. This song, then, could not be said to meet the standards for children's songs.

.

1. Smith: Action Songs, #11.

"God Has Blotted Them Out,"¹ in poor literary style, centers around God as blotter-out of sins, confirmation being given in the reference to Isaiah forty-four twenty-two. Verification such as this tends to induce shouting. This song has no religious value, because children as yet do not think of God as blotting out sins, because turning to a specific Bible verse is unfamiliar, and because the suggestion of shouting is not conducive to a worshipful atmosphere or attitude. The quality of music is not an example of the best, but is fairly good. The melody and words agree, but the harmony drowns out the melody. The voice range is suited to pre-school and primary children's voices. The motions used with this song, such as clapping the hands and turning the leaves of an imaginary Bible, attract more attention than do the words, and yet bring no meaning to them.

"Fishers of Men"² meets only one criterion, that of being written within range of the primary child's voice. The thought in the first stanza is an adult and symbolical invitation to become "fishers of men." In a child's thinking, this cannot be easily comprehended. The imagery is contrary to the type of fishing with which they are familiar, and the motion of throwing out a fishing line does not suggest anything but fishing for fish. The second stanza is

.

1. Smith: Action Songs, #52.
2. Ibid., #75.

not a development of the same thought, but is a call to come unto Christ, and rest will be given. Christ is doing the calling, yet the children use the beckoning motion when the words, "Come unto Me," are sung, which is contrary to the words and their meaning. The music is not smooth, and is suggestive of the uneven flow of the words, and the melody is lost by the harmony.

"A Song of Church Bells,"¹ "Ring, Ring, Ring,"² and "Sabbath Bells Are Pealing"³ are songs that meet the criteria for children's music. In good but simple and concrete words, a thought is unfolded that is within the familiar experiences of most children, namely, that of going to church and thinking about the love of God and Jesus. The quality of music is good in each of the songs; the melody and words are suggestive of each other; the harmony allows the melody to be accented; and the range, with one exception, is suited to the children's voices. "Sabbath Bells Are Pealing" goes too low for the pre-school child. The motions in each one consist of ringing a church bell. They bring clarity to the words; yet in no way do they take attention from them.

"A Seed Song"⁴ and "Up and Down the Farmer Goes"⁵

.

1. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants To Sing, #3.
2. Ibid., #4.
3. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #170.
4. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: When Little Child Wants To Sing, #132.
5. Presby. Bd. of C. E.: Primary Music and Worship, #172.

are songs that are within the familiar experiences of children, because they are about nature. The literature is excellent for children, and both songs could be used as poems as well. The words are simple, and embrace a message about God sending rain and sunshine to help little seeds grow. The music is good in both songs; the words and music are suggested by each other; the range suits the children's voices; and in "Up and Down the Farmer Goes," the harmony is light enough for the melody, although in "A Seed Song," it is overly heavy. A suggestion accompanies the latter that the children may either pretend that they are the farmers throwing the seed or that they are the growing corn, while the song is being sung to them. Thus, the children are not required to do the motions and the singing at once. In "Up and Down the Farmer Goes," the motions change fifteen times. Some of them are concrete, while others are vague, such as pointing to imaginary blades and binding sheaves. For the most part, the motions are concrete; but because of the use of these few abstract ones the song would not pass the criteria test unless the same procedure is followed as in "A Seed Song": that the children dramatize while the song is being sung. Moreover, it would be better to omit all but the concrete motions.

"Oh, What Can Little Hands Do?"¹ is written in

.

1. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #111.

simple literary style, and is based on concrete, childlike thoughts. However, God is referred to as the "King of Heaven," which might not be too meaningful to a child, and the refrain, "Such grace to mine be given," would not be clear unless careful explanation preceded the singing. The music is expressive and suggests the words; the harmony blends with the melody; and the range is for a primary child's voice. The motions are concrete, such as holding out their hands when the word "hands" is sung, or pointing to their eyes when "eyes" is sung. The words and motions are not divorced, nor do they detract from a worshipful atmosphere.

"The Waking of the Flowers"¹ is a nature song about flowers and thanking the "Father" for His loving care. This content is on the child's level of thinking, and would be helpful in creating a worshipful atmosphere. The music is of a good quality and suggests the words; but the harmony is overdone, and the range is limited to the primary child's voice. The simple motions which add meaning to the song are done in response to the accompaniment of music without words; that is, the action takes place between the two stanzas of the song, so that no motion takes place during the singing. This song could thus adequately meet the requirements for a child's worship song.

.

1. Danielson and Conant: op. cit., #118.

2. Of Selected Song Books

In the light of the foregoing study and evaluation, it was found that in Ruth Overholtzer's Salvation Songs For Children, Number One, "Two Little Hands to Work for Jesus" was the only song of the eight selected that meets the necessary requirements for children's songs. The remaining seven songs center either around redemptive power or the future life, and in four songs both ideas are included.

In Overholtzer's Salvation Songs For Children, Number Two, "The Church" is the only song able to meet the recognized criteria. Of the sixteen songs taken from this book, six are based on redemption, and five on the future life, three of which share both ideas. The remaining songs are built mainly around Jesus as the Saviour of sins and other symbolical conceptions too advanced for children. Only one of these songs refers to God, and in this instance He is a "Billionaire."

Of the four songs taken from Alfred Smith's Singspiration Gospel Songs, Numbers Two and Three, none were found worthy of being taught to children. One song gave the wrong conception of God; two were not within a child's experience of Jesus; and one fell short in its attempt to portray Jesus' love.

"Jesus Can Keep Little Children" is the only song of the five selected from Smith's Action Songs For Boys and Girls capable of meeting the criteria. Two songs were mis-

leading in their thought of Jesus, and two were not in keeping with a child's idea of a loving Father.

Of the seven songs selected from the two books by the Presbyterian Board of Christian Education--When the Little Child Wants To Sing and Primary Music and Worship--and Songs For Little People by Frances Danielson and Grace Conant, each was found desirable as a means of furthering Christian nurture and of laying foundations for more advanced teaching later.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

One form of music used by certain groups in the training of children is that of motion songs, while other groups discourage their usage. Because of the widespread employment and the conflicting opinion of these two groups, it has been the purpose of this thesis to evaluate motion songs used with pre-school and primary children, in relation to their underlying philosophy of religious education.

Music has been captured as a valuable means of meeting and promoting the changing needs of growing children. It has also been found a successful channel through which the Christian nurturing of children may be guided and furthered. Songs, particularly, furnish a normal outlet for the expression of their emotions and moods. Most of all, however, they serve as the outstanding means of learning about God, the Father Creator of all things, and about Jesus, the children's Friend.

If the songs are to meet the changing needs of the child and to lay the basic foundation upon which Christian ideals may be cultivated, they will have to measure up to certain accepted criteria defined by authorities in the field of Christian Education. It was evident that authorities in this field agreed that children's songs must meet certain definite standards. In conforming with these, it was shown, songs above all must be meaningful, thus in-

volving a number of requirements. Unless the song is good from a literary standpoint, it is not worthy of being used with children. The words must be good, must have religious value, must incorporate children's familiar experiences, must be concrete, and must carry a message of sincerity. It was further revealed that the ideas pertaining to God, Jesus, redemptive power, and the future life must be kept within children's understanding and limitations. The music of the songs must of necessity be the best, for the tastes and standards of the children are being determined by what they sing now. The melody must enrich the words, conform to the range of children's voices, and be accented above the harmony. It was shown, finally, that if motions are to be used in the worship of children, they must be such that they do not detract from the words being sung. They should not be an attempt to interpret symbols, but must be purposeful and meaningful, because in themselves they express concrete and familiar childhood experiences.

As a basis for evaluating motion songs, forty of them were chosen from eight selected books, representing two distinct approaches: that of child evangelism on the one hand, and of Christian nurture on the other. Only motion songs with a religious emphasis were considered.

Five Child Evangelism books were used, and the number of motion songs in relation to the total number of

songs in each was found to be the following: Twelve of the one hundred songs in Ruth Overholtzer's Salvation Songs For Children, Number One, are motion songs; and twenty-five of the one hundred six songs in her Salvation Songs For Children, Number Two, are motion songs. Eleven of the one hundred twelve songs in Alfred Smith's Singspiration Gospel Songs, Number Two; nine of the one hundred six songs in his Singspiration Gospel Songs, Number Three; and fourteen of the eighty-one songs in his Action Songs For Boys and Girls are motion songs. Three of these books include a statement that motions could be worked out to fit other songs not including motions. Of the seventy-one motion songs, thirty-three were selected for evaluation.

Three Christian Nurture books were used, and the number of religious motion songs in relation to the total number of songs in each was found to be the following: When the Little Child Wants To Sing includes four motion songs within its total of one hundred thirty-four, and Primary Music and Worship has two motion songs out of one hundred eighty-five songs, these two books being from the Presbyterian Board of Christian Education. Of the one hundred eighteen songs in Songs For Little People by Frances Danielson and Grace Conant, two are motion songs. Seven of these eight songs were included for this study.

The group of forty songs were then analyzed in the light of the criteria previously set up, and, for

clarification, the findings were recorded in chart form. These then formed the basis for evaluation of each song in turn.

It was evident that motion songs taken from the Christian Nurture books are on the whole songs that meet the requirements for children's songs. They were seen to be simple, direct, meaningful, worshipful, concrete, sincere, and accompanied by good music. These songs were found, also, not to be dependent upon the motions, with the motions for the most part free and spontaneous.

A study of the chart revealed that only three of the thirty-three songs taken from the evangelistic song books measure up to the required standards of children's music. The motions themselves, it was discovered, are not the only undesirable feature of the songs, for their content and language, their ideas, and their music are also of an inferior quality. The songs were seen to center around the abstract, the theological, and the symbolical, embodying adult concepts rather than those adapted to the child mind. The motions are not capable of interpreting these foreign ideas. They merely seem to increase the meaningless mystery.

These songs were found lacking in the qualities which create a worshipful atmosphere and help the child feel close to God. The purpose of teaching children through song in the church is to train them to express

praise and prayer to the Supreme Being and to suggest right conduct and attitudes towards others. These songs, on the whole, fail to meet this basic need of children, and are giving an inferior, shallow, and artificial suggestion of the Christian life.

This study has conclusively revealed a close correlation between both the type of motion songs used and the extent of their use and the underlying philosophy of Christian Education. It is apparent that the Child Evangelism songs swing to the extreme in their philosophy of an accelerated attempt to bring the children to an immediate commitment to Christ; but their purpose is defeated by supplying them with songs that are taken from the heart of the gospel, without first laying the basic foundation. As has been revealed, the songs consist largely of adult, symbolical, and theological terms which make it difficult, if at all possible, for the children to grasp the meaning, and in return to give the desired response. While the writer would by no means bar all songs suggesting evangelism, in this study the songs relate definitely to children through eight years of age, and few of these songs have been found eligible as teaching material for children this young. It was pointed out that the chief purpose of including music in the religious education of children was to meet their growing needs. The simple and elementary truths must thus be taught first in order to pave the way for facts which will

come later. The outstanding fault of the evangelistic motion songs is that they do not prepare the children for these mature ideas, nor do they allow for age differences. Moreover, the motions in no way contribute toward interpreting the abstract ideas of the songs.

It will be recalled that it is the purpose of Christian nurture to meet the child at his point of need and to supply that need with the material that will not only support him but encourage him to make spiritual progress. A desirable philosophy of religious education in relation to motion songs of children would be a combination of the evangelistic and educational emphases, namely, educational evangelism, which provides for a period of natural child response and normal growth. This would equip children for the present and pave the way for what is to follow, thus assuring genuine Christian experiences at each age level.

In the light of the foregoing study, it is evident that motion songs may have a real place in the Christian education of children, if they are selected with care on the basis of real meaning and potential value as a medium for enriching the child's experience and strengthening his relation to God and to Jesus.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Primary Sources

- Baker, Edna Dean: The Worship of the Little Child. The Cokesbury Press, Nashville, Tennessee, 1928.
- Blashfield, Clara Beers: Worship Training for Primary Children. The Methodist Book Concern, New York, 1929.
- Danielson, Frances W., and Conant, Grace W.: Songs for Little People. The Pilgrim Press, Boston, 1905.
- Gaines, Robert Edwin: Guiding a Growing Life. Sunday School Board of the Southern Baptist Convention, 1927.
- Lewis, Hazel A.: The Primary Church School. The Bethany Press, St. Louis, Missouri, 1932.
- Lloyd, Mary Edna: Religious Nurture in the Nursery Class and Home. The Graded Press, Nashville, Tennessee, 1942.
- Munkres, Alberta: Primary Method in the Church School. The Abingdon Press, New York, 1921.
- Norsworthy, Naomi, and Whitley, Theodora: The Psychology of Childhood. The Macmillan Company, New York, 1926.
- Overholtzer, Ruth: Salvation Songs for Children, Number One. Christian Publications, Inc., Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, 1943.
- Overholtzer, Ruth: Salvation Songs for Children, Number Two. Christian Publications, Inc., Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, 1943.
- Pechstein, L. A., and Jenkins, Frances: Psychology of the Kindergarten-Primary Child. Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston, 1927.
- Pierce, Frederick: Understanding Our Children. E. P. Dutton and Company, New York, 1926.
- Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: Primary Music and Worship. Presbyterian Board of Christian Education, Philadelphia, 1930.

Presbyterian Board of Christian Education: When the Little Child Wants to Sing. The Presbyterian Board of Christian Education, 1940.

Shields, Elizabeth: Guiding the Little Child in the Sunday School. Boardman Press, Nashville, Tennessee, 1936.

Shields, Elizabeth: Music in the Religious Growth of Children. Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, New York, 1943.

Shields, Elizabeth: Guiding Kindergarten Children in the Church School. The Onward Press, Richmond, Virginia, 1931.

Smith, Alfred: Action Songs for Boys and Girls. Zondervan Publishing House, Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1944.

Smith, Alfred: Singspiration, Gospel Songs, Number Two. Zondervan Publishing House, Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1942.

Smith, Alfred: Singspiration, Gospel Songs, Number Three. Zondervan Publishing House, Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1943.

Thom, Douglas: Everyday Problems of the Everyday Child. D. Appleton-Century Company, New York, 1935.

Whitley, Mary Theodora: A Study of the Little Child. The Westminster Press, Philadelphia, 1931.

B. Secondary Sources

Boville, Amy Hope, and Boville, G. Robert: Manual of Hymns, Songs and Marches with Music Interpretation for use in Daily Vacation Bible Schools. New York Century Company, New York, 1921.

Cromer, Mary Elizabeth: A Comparative Study of Representative Song Books for Use in the Christian Education of the Pre-School and Primary Child. Thesis, Biblical Seminary in New York, New York, 1937.

Dixon, C. Madeleine: Children are Like That. The John Day Company, New York, 1930.

- Horne, Herman Harrell: The Philosophy of Christian Education.
Fleming H. Revell Company, New York, 1937.
- Manwell, Elizabeth M., and Fahs, Sophia: Consider the
Children How They Grow. The Beacon Press, Boston,
1940.
- O'Shea, M. V. (Editor): The Child: His Nature and His Needs.
The Children's Foundation, New York, 1924.
- Roget's Thesaurus of the English Language in Dictionary Form.
Garden City Publishing Company, New York, 1937.
- Smither, Ethel: Teaching Primaries in the Church School.
Methodist Book Concern, 1930.
- Thomas, Edith: A First Book in Hymns and Worship. The
Abingdon Press, New York, 1922.
- Thomas, Edith: A Child's Garden of Song. The Century
Company, New York, 1929.
- Vincent, Geraldine: A Study of the International Child
Evangelism Fellowship. Thesis, Wheaton College,
Wheaton, Illinois, 1945.