

TH  
K589

A STUDY OF MORAL EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES  
WITH PARTICULAR REFERENCE TO THE PUBLIC SCHOOL,  
IN THE PERIOD FROM 1871 TO 1900, BASED UPON THE  
ADDRESSES TO THE ANNUAL CONVENTIONS OF THE  
NATIONAL EDUCATION ASSOCIATION

by

WILSON R. KING

A. B., Greenville College

A Thesis

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the require-  
ments for the degree of Master of Religious Edu-  
cation in The Biblical Seminary in New York.

April, 1934.

BIBLICAL SCHOOL OF  
THEOLOGY LIBRARY  
HATFIELD, PA.

241811

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Introduction . . . . .	2
A. The Field of Study . . . . .	2
B. The Problem of the Study . . . . .	3
C. The Method of Procedure . . . . .	5
II. Evidences of the Need of Moral Education . . . . .	7
A. Social Conditions . . . . .	7
B. Educational Conditions . . . . .	12
1. Secularization of Public Education . . . . .	12
2. Dominance of Mental Training . . . . .	15
3. Neglect of Moral Training . . . . .	17
C. Interpretation of Educational Conditions . . . . .	20
1. The Moral Problem of Intellectual Growth . . . . .	20
2. The Relative Responsibility of the School . . . . .	23
D. The Coming Moral Education . . . . .	26
E. Summary . . . . .	29
III. Relation of Moral Education to Education as a Whole and to Religion . . . . .	34
A. Education as a Mode of Life . . . . .	34
1. The Significance of Character . . . . .	34
2. The Relation of Religion to Character . . . . .	39

19942 Gift of author.  
MAY 28 1934

B. Education as Modification of the Learner . . . . .	41
1. The Nature of the Person . . . . .	41
2. The Significance of Religion to the Person . . . . .	42
C. Education as Social Development . . . . .	44
1. The Significance of Moral Training in Education . . . . .	44
2. The Relation of Religion to Moral Training . . . . .	48
D. Education as Political Function . . . . .	51
1. The Significance of Moral Citizenship to the State . . . . .	51
2. The Relation of Religion to Moral Citizenship . . . . .	54
E. Summary . . . . .	56
IV. Agents and Methods of Moral Education . . . . .	61
A. School Studies and Exercises . . . . .	61
1. Bible . . . . .	62
2. Ethics . . . . .	64
3. Literature . . . . .	65
4. History . . . . .	67
5. Music . . . . .	69
6. Art . . . . .	70
7. Natural Science . . . . .	71
8. Manual Training . . . . .	72
9. Commercial Training . . . . .	73
10. Mathematics . . . . .	73
11. Physical Culture and Play . . . . .	74
12. Sociology . . . . .	75

B. School Atmosphere . . . . .	75
1. Qualities of Right Discipline . . . . .	77
2. Qualities of Wrong Discipline . . . . .	79
C. The Personality of the Teacher . . . . .	81
D. Summary . . . . .	84
V. Conclusion . . . . .	87
A. Summary . . . . .	87
B. Conclusions . . . . .	89
Bibliography . . . . .	93

## **CHAPTER I**

### **INTRODUCTION**

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION

#### A. The Field of Study

The moral development of children and young people has always been a matter of great concern to parents and to educational, civil, social, and Christian leaders. Beginning in colonial days, education in America included moral objectives and there are evidences of continuous efforts to solve the problems of moral education by developing adequate programs and methods in the public schools.

The rise of a tax supported system of public education, under the American doctrine of the separation of secular and religious functions, and the increasing emphasis upon secular knowledge and skills which was gradually crowding out religion, did not eliminate moral needs from the system of education.

At the present time there is an unusual interest in moral education because of the universal recognition on the part of parents, educators, moral, civil, and religious leaders, that it is urgently needed. It must be added, however, that the great problems involved in meeting this need are not finally solved and may never be because the solutions of one generation are generally outmoded in the next not only by new problems but by the new forms in which old problems reappear.

The failure to develop adequate moral education is largely

due to the fact that there is so much diversity of opinion concerning the whole question of morality and education. In the first place, there is lack of agreement as to what constitutes morality. There are differences of opinion among individuals and divergent practices in various social groups. In the second place, there is lack of agreement as to the agents and methods of moral education. In the third place, there is lack of agreement as to where the responsibility for moral education rests. Is it upon the home, the church, the school, or some other social agency? Since the educative process involves all the influences touching individuals, the responsibility for the moral education of youth must belong in due measure to each agency.

This brief statement of the general field of study leads us to the statement of the specific problem of this thesis.

#### B. The Problem of the Study.

Historical study assists in the understanding and solution of present-day problems because of the perspective gained by looking at former movements as historical unities and in relation to their times. Wherefore in this study we shall undertake to throw light upon present problems in the field of moral education by an historical approach to certain of its outstanding agents, factors, and methods.

The history of moral education in the public schools of the United States would require many volumes for a complete and satisfactory record. If only the present problems in this field, with the



many theories and practices, were studied and interpreted, the project would still be impossible as a thesis because of its magnitude. It is also beyond the possibilities of a single thesis to cover all of the aspects of moral education for any one period unless it were very short.

This study, therefore, will be limited, first of all, to those phases of the question which come within the expressed interests of leaders in the public schools, that is, moral education in connection with state educational systems. We shall further limit the study particularly to pedagogical considerations, to the exclusion of such controversial questions as, Church versus State, and Parochial versus Public School. We have temporally limited the study to the period between 1871 and 1900, which begins with the founding of the National Education Association and closes with the century, at about which time, namely in 1903, the Religious Education Association was founded and moral and religious education entered upon an era of intensified and distinctive expression.

Assuming that the annual addresses of educators recorded in the Proceedings of the National Education Association truly represent professional opinion on educational matters, we have used these documents as the basis for this investigation.

In short, this thesis is an attempt to bring together information from a selected period and a selected group in the history of education in the United States, and it is also an attempt, in the light of the historical background, to clarify the essential factors involved in the moral education of pupils in the public schools with special reference to the relation of moral education to religious

education and to the general educative process.

### G. The Method of Procedure.

The research for this thesis consisted in a thorough examination of the Proceedings of the National Education Association, and included all addresses obviously pertinent to the investigation and also many others whose connection was not so apparent. The investigation of the latter brought to light much valuable material in the most unlikely places.

Analysis of the material so obtained has resulted in the present plan of classification by topics as indicated in the Table of Contents. Following a statement of the needs of moral education, there will be a chapter devoted to a theoretical statement of the relation of character education to general education and to life as a whole. Finally it will be the purpose of the author to discuss agents and methods which will enhance the theory and practice of moral education in the public schools of the present day.

Not all possible references have been given in as much as they numbered dozens and scores on some of the topics. To avoid cumbersomeness a selection has been made which it is believed honestly represents educational opinion in any case.

## **CHAPTER II**

### **EVIDENCES OF THE NEED OF MORAL EDUCATION**

## CHAPTER II

### EVIDENCES OF THE NEED OF MORAL EDUCATION

In opening this study of moral education in the period from 1871 to 1900, we will first observe actual conditions from the educators' viewpoints together with their reactions to them.

#### A. Social Conditions.

American democracy brought blessings but not unmixed with abuses. Taking power from the tyrant and giving it to the tyrannized had not been a panacea.<sup>1</sup> Popular government was built upon the idea of the "separation of church and state, which forms the marrow of modern history" -- "the secularization of politics"<sup>2</sup> -- and upon the idea of absolute religious freedom.<sup>3</sup> In this way "education in general has come into the hands of the people".<sup>2</sup> The multiplication of sects,<sup>3</sup> the rapid outreach of physical science with its material

-----

Note: The number at the end of each reference gives the date and the page of the annual volume where found. E.g. (96:76) means volume for 1896, page 76.

1 cf. Dougherty, N. C., School Superintendent, Peoria, Ill., "Do Our Public Schools Meet Reasonable Expectations?" (96:76)

2 cf. Felwell, William W., President, Minnesota University, "Secularization of Education." Abstract. (82:42,43)

3 cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:130)

interests,<sup>1</sup> and a change in public sentiment<sup>2</sup> allowed, where not actually legislating, the secularization of the public schools.<sup>3</sup>

Evil conditions in society brought the suspicion and indictment of many educators upon this secularizing trend. The least that can be said is that the two were parallel and contemporary.

Whatever the cause, conditions were bad enough and called for remedy. In 1872 warning was given of the danger of the "decay of social and civil morality" supported by a list of national evils including war, speculation, undermined family relations, immigration, loose divorce laws, Tammany, corporate despotism,<sup>4</sup> and four years later the same voice deplored the scandals of Centennial year.<sup>5</sup> Another says, "America can undertake nothing without a scandal" whether politics, railroads, banks, Wall Street, or law, and public conscience apologized for the guilty and tried to free them from punishment.<sup>6</sup>

-----

1 cf. Bartholomew, E. F., Rock Island, Ill.,  
"The Spiritual Element in Education." (90:697)

2 cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:135)

3 Cooper, Oscar H., Austin, Texas, "The Superintendent and Good Literature in the Schools." "—secularization of education has resulted from secularization of life and society. The control of education by religion has passed away, most probably forever.... Better mediaeval superstition, with its lofty if mistaken spiritual aspirations, than the dead sea of materialism." (87:530)

4 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:18)

(b) cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart." (83:26)

5 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:27)

6 cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass., "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:228)

Brutal crimes were decreasing but crimes of intelligence such as forgery, counterfeiting, embezzlement, perversion of trust, food adulteration, bribery, ballot fixing, and political jobbery had increased under the urge of the more cultured passions of covetousness, ambition, and extravagance.<sup>1</sup> In 1879 "a generation, sound in neither body, mind, nor soul, and the next is no better", was diagnosed as the product of unbalanced emphasis on intellectual cultivation.<sup>2</sup> Educators blamed the parents in that they showed less shame for rascality than for dullness.<sup>3</sup> Such were the 'Seventies'.

A list of things for which educators, of the decade from 1880 to 1890, demanded moral remedy by way of education included: public dishonesty, youthful depravity, rumblings of communism, wild theories of social and private duties, political corruption;<sup>4</sup> youth's sham politeness, dishonesty, greed, speculation, irreverence, frivolity, lawlessness;<sup>5</sup> increase of subtle crimes — forgery, perjury, etc., the all-is-fair-in-trade idea;<sup>6</sup> immoral effects of high pres-

1 cf. Bittinger, J. B., Sewickly, Pa.,  
"Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime." (75:116,117)

2 cf. Partridge, Lelia E., Philadelphia, Pa.,  
Discussion- "Relations of the Kindergarten to the School." (79:161)

3 Smart, James H., Indianapolis, Ind., "The High School Question."  
"Tell a man that his child is quick to learn but that he is a young rascal, and he will smile; tell him that the child is dull at his books but that he is truthful and good, and he will frown." (79:sp169)

4 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
"Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School." (80:9)

5 cf. Raab, Henry A., State Superintendent Public Instruction, Illinois, "Primary Education: What and How?" (83:16,17)

6 cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart." (83:27)

sure living, national conceit of wealth and superiority, evasion of law, more slackness in training each generation;<sup>1</sup> sham, deceit, 'smartness' of close bargaining, child-ruled families;<sup>2</sup> emphasis on money value of education, commercial growth outdistancing spiritual control;<sup>3</sup> crime increase due to greater freeness and crowding of the city.<sup>4</sup>

"Ill fares the land to hastening ills a prey,<sup>1</sup>  
When wealth accumulates and men decay."

And that sums up perfectly what observant schoolmen thought of the increasingly wicked 'Eighties'.

The succeeding decade, 1891 to 1900, continued the process of "losing sight of the fundamental ethical principles that hold society together";<sup>5</sup> machinery was making men lazy physically;<sup>6</sup> the generation was "lacking in idealism" and "given to scornful materialism."<sup>7</sup>

A specific case was cited<sup>8</sup> of a religious service held by an eminent New York minister and his choir in Tombs prison for a con-

-----

1 cf. Kellogg, Mrs. Eva D., Boston, Mass.,  
"Needs in American Education." (84:134,138,139,141)

2 cf. Meleney, Clarence E., School Superintendent, Paterson, N. J.,  
"The True Object of Early School Training." (85:317,318)

3 cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach  
Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:130)

4 cf. Harris, W.T., Washington, D. C., "The General Government  
and Public Education Throughout the Country." (90:487)

5 cf. Macalister, James, President Drexel Institute of Art, Science,  
and Industry, "Art Education in the Public Schools." (91:460)

6 cf. Todd, Samuel B., Sterling, Kansas,  
"Necessity and Means of Developing Individuality." (91:669)

7 cf. Bellamy, Francis, of the 'Youth's Companion',  
"Americanism in the Public Schools." (92:62)

8 cf. Packard, S. S., New York City,  
"The Religion of Morals as Applied to Business." (94:966)

fessed forger in which the criminal was lauded as like Christ. The government of that same city was being exposed as "vile and reeking",<sup>1</sup> and the "greatest political criminal of modern times", while his trial was in progress and guilt known, continued as Sunday School superintendent, though that did not keep him from going to Sing Sing.<sup>2</sup>

C. C. Rounds of New Hampshire, an educator prominent in the Association, thought the "conception of a spiritual universe" about dead.<sup>3</sup> There was no "honest thinking and practical common sense" in public life but instead widespread trickery.<sup>4</sup> From such an authority as Jane Addams of Hull House came an indictment which would include indirectly the educational system: "It is precisely on the undeveloped morality of voters that municipal corruption flourishes. Theirs is largely the crime of ignorance of what morality is; they live up to their highest conception." From this statement the point was pressed that the schools were then making the next generation of voters and business men whatever it was to be.<sup>5</sup>

These opinions of conditions during the thirty years from 1871 to 1900 are significant as an evaluation by educators themselves of the society and age which they were endeavoring to educate. The

---

1 cf. Packard, S. S., New York City,  
"The Religion of Morals as Applied to Business." (94:967)

2 cf. Reference 1, page 968. (94:968)

3 cf. Rounds, C. C., Plymouth, N. H.,  
Discussion- "The Incidental Method of Moral Instruction." (96:418)

4 cf. Rowe, H. M., Baltimore, Md., "Laws and Ethics of Business,  
Duties of Citizenship, and Science of Wealth." (97:822)

5 cf. Evans, Margaret J., Carleton College, Northfield, Minn.,  
"Women's Clubs as an Educational Factor." (98:242)



ideas and even the terms used sound surprisingly familiar in their perfect similarity to the present-day 'viewing with alarm' with its sigh for the 'good(?) old days'.

"It is idle, in the presence of such disclosures, to ask whether the school should teach morality. That the founders of the nation believed it....no one can doubt."<sup>1</sup> And so we conclude that not only the founders of the nation believed in morally-powered education but so did leading educators of the late nineteenth century.

### B. Educational Conditions.

The questions which logically follow the foregoing presentation of the ills of the period are: What effect had such conditions upon education, and what was the condition of education itself at the same time. In this section we present an answer thereto.

#### 1. Secularization of Public Education

The early schools of New England, the first in America, while not ecclesiastic in the technical sense, gave emphatic attention to character,<sup>2</sup> though their methods are sometimes laughed at today. Their founders "never conceived the mischievous theory that respect for the individual conscience demands the expulsion from the

-----  
1 cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:130)

2 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:21,22)

(b) cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., "Moral Training in the Elementary Schools." (92:320,321)

schoolroom of everything any man may declare sectarian."<sup>1</sup> Said Zalmon Richards of Washington, D. C.,<sup>2</sup>

"It is a latter day notion that pure morality - er, if you please, that sound religious instruction - is to be ruled out of our free elementary schools. ...in these days of boasted improvement and enlightenment we have become so refined and reformed(?), that in some places the Bible, prayer, and even 'instruction in morals', have been expurgated from the school curriculum."

We find two definitions of secularization. The first means control by the people as political groups rather than as churches.<sup>3</sup> This does not necessarily connote the absence of religion, because religious people may through secular control have schools which include religious and moral training. In this sense the early schools mentioned were truly secular. The second definition means<sup>4</sup>

"no recognition of the religious nature of man, no confession of the existence of God, no use of the Bible or other religious book, no song, prayer, or instruction that could jar on the conscience of the most thorough unbeliever in the spiritual nature of man,"

and declares the trend and goal of the extreme secularists.

The conditions of the second definition could grow out of the first only by the secularization of the personalities of a majority of those in control -- that is, by a "secularization of life"

-----

1 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School," (76:21,22)

2 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., "Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:320,321)

3 cf. Folwell, William W., President Minnesota University, "Secularization of Education." Abstract. (82:42,43)

4 Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School." (80:6,7)

which extended clear beyond just the matter of moral education.<sup>1</sup> The church and religion are not things-in-themselves with power to make schools or anything else of one type or another. They are expressions and agents of expression of the people, which fact causes us to question the statement that "the control of education by religion has passed away....forever".<sup>1</sup> It is conceivable that a democracy of religious people controlling education secularly instead of through the church might have schools which gave religion a more suitable and effective place than those of any hierarchy ever did or could give.<sup>2</sup>

Many notables, however, did not feel that the situation as it existed was enough like this last conception to be blandly viewed. Lyman Abbott, the famous editor and minister, saw<sup>3</sup> "such a panic lest

-----

1 See footnote in Reference 3, page 8.

(87:530)

2 Folwell, William W., President Minnesota University, "Secularization of Education." Abstract. "This secular position of schools has not been the work of any party of infidels or agnostics" or "of a corrupt and decaying Christianity. It is an essential factor in the purest, fairest Christian civilization the world has ever known. It is not destructive in its aims and purposes. It is....a great providential fact, a movement in the great historic evolution of human history."

(82:44)

3 Abbott, Rev. Lyman, Editor-in-chief "Outlook", Pastor Plymouth Church, Brooklyn, N. Y., "The Democracy of Learning." "We have agreed that we may learn the language and literature and history of every other people, but we must learn nothing of the language or the literature or the history of the Hebrew people. We may study the laws of Solon, but we must not study the laws of Moses. --not the history of the institutions and laws and literature which come most closely home to us. It is true that these laws concern us more than the laws of the Greeks or Romans; --to whose(Hebrew) schools we can trace ours as we can trace the oak to the acorn. We must not study-- Why? Because we must not study religion? Not at all. We may study religion as much as we please -- the religion of Greece, or Rome, or India, or China. It is only the religion of the Hebrews which we must not study. ... Justice, mercy, humility -- that is the Hebrew religion. ... With two hundred lynchings in the past year, where is the danger of overdoing justice?"

(97:193)

religion should creep into our schools that we have put clauses in our statutes and constitutions against it, and have arrayed judges at the door to keep it out." The lamentable fact for lovers of democracy was, according to Professor Barnes of Stanford University, that the majority had not desired the change but, having had their sect-fear aroused,<sup>1</sup> they unwittingly played into the hands of the anti-religious minority, and the most serious feature was not the curricular effect but the secularization of the child's own ideas of life.<sup>2</sup> Which thought leads at once into our next topic.

## 2. Dominance of Mental Training.

Secularly controlled education during the period under discussion was increasingly intellectual in trend and interest.<sup>3</sup> Professor Brumbaugh of Pennsylvania University looked upon the situation as the current expression of a mis-aimed endeavor beginning from Rousseau "to make character...by training the intellect".<sup>4</sup> It would not be true to say that this was the result of deliberate planning on the part of a majority of educators, but it was a "time of revolution in religious opinions and beliefs".<sup>5</sup>

---

1 cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass., "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:222)

2 cf. Barnes, Earl, Stanford University, California, Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:443)

3 (a) cf. Reference 1, page 224. (73:224)  
(b) cf. Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Kentucky, "Full-Orbed Education." (75:43)

4 cf. Brumbaugh, Prof. Martin G., Pennsylvania University, "The Mission of the Elementary School." (98:344)

5 cf. Brown, George P., President Elementary Department, Terre Haute, Ind., "Culture in Elementary Schools." (79:137)

Whatever the basic cause, in some of the "most highly lauded schools... 'instruction in morals' and the 'reading of the Bible' have been stricken from the course of study" and "moral instruction has no place" in the normal schools. Even in New England the people seemed "afraid to take positive ground for introducing moral and religious training in their schools, and there is a general demoralization upon the subject".<sup>1</sup> We are loath to accept this last statement and instead consider "the public sentiment that thinks more highly of money than of men is alone responsible"<sup>2</sup> as nearer the truth. People in general were not afraid nor indifferent so much as they were increasingly preoccupied by material interests. There was a growing demand for practical preparation for life<sup>3</sup> through studies having commercial value.<sup>4</sup> This might only reflect the rapidly expanding commercial interests of society but it points to the fact that the schools, as usual, were giving or trying to give what public and parents preferred.<sup>5</sup> People increasingly looked to the schools for new

---

1 (a) Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
Discussion of State Organization and Administration. (90:446)

(b) cf. Same authority,  
"Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:323)

2 Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach  
Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:135)

3 cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Illinois,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:69)

4 (a) cf. Reference 2, page 130. (88:130)  
(b) cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass.,  
"What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:224)  
(c) cf. Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Kentucky,  
"Full-Orbed Education." (75:43)

5 cf. Smart, James R., Indianapolis, Indiana,  
"The High School Question." (79:supp.169)

courses to meet every need whether in the home or the church, at the shop or on the farm, and yet were quick to blame education for "the ills of society that exist in spite of the public school" in blind disregard of the "dire calamities there would be if it were not for the public school".<sup>1</sup> Under such pressure curricula were being "crowded to the verge of feebleness".<sup>2</sup> The so-called "enriching" of the courses of study was in reality a "criminal" crowding of the child intellect at the expense of morality and health.<sup>3</sup> As the century mark neared, both teachers and students complained that, with intellectual goals increasingly difficult if not impossible, it was futile to add morals to the program.<sup>4</sup>

### 3. The Neglect of Moral Training.

Freedom from bigotry was most desirable<sup>5</sup> and, if the leaving of the religio-moral side of education largely to fortuitous cir-

1 (a) cf. Campbell, Fred M., Oakland, Cal., Discussion- "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:164)

(b) cf. MacDonald, J. W., Stoneham, Mass., "Educating the Whole Boy." (88:415,416,417)

2 cf. Phillips, J. H., Superintendent, Birmingham, Ala., "History and Literature in Grammar Grades." (92:615)

3 cf. Sabin, Henry, State Superintendent Public Instruction, Iowa, "Horace Mann." Also a quotation from Horace Mann: "Such elevation of the subordinate (intellectual), such casting down of the supreme (moral), in the education of children, is incompatible with all that is worthy to be called the prosperity of their manhood." (96:65)

4 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:466)

5 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:23)

cumstance<sup>1</sup> had meant that the lack was or would be made good otherwise, it would not have been viewed so seriously, but many believed that the neglect was not made good<sup>2</sup> and indicted it as demoralizing to citizenship,<sup>3</sup> as faith-wrecking iconoclasm<sup>4</sup> and "materialistic lunacy"<sup>5</sup> which were even less to be desired than the religious 'superstition' that they supplanted.<sup>6</sup>

Such indictments did not go unanswered. Some replies went so far as to state that moral training in the public schools compared favorably with that of the religionists,<sup>7</sup> some pointed out that through literature, music, and the teacher himself there existed a vital, though non-sectarian religious influence.<sup>8</sup> Others argued logically that schools, though non-sectarian, when founded and maintained

---

1 cf. Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Kentucky,  
"Full-Orbed Education." (75:45)

2 cf. Evans, Margaret J., Carleton College, Northfield, Minn.,  
"Women's Clubs as an Educational Factor." (98:242)

3 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
"Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:323)

4 cf. Brown, George P., President Elementary Department, Terre Haute, Ind.,  
"Culture in Elementary Schools." (79:137)

5 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:23)

6 cf. Footnote in Reference 3, page 8. (87:530)

7 (a) cf. Bicknell, Thomas W., LL.D., Boston, Mass.,  
President's Address. (84:47)

(b) cf. Marble, A. P., Worcester, Mass.,  
Discussion- "The School of the Future." (91:94)

8 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio,  
"Religion in the School." (93:300)

by Christian people, can not be godless and irreligious.<sup>1</sup> The indictments themselves were branded as the work of sectaries vexed at their inability to 'use' the public school denominationally.<sup>2</sup>

United States Commissioner Harris divided the argument into three parts: (1) Secular education is anti-religious and tends to crime; (2) it only changes the type of crime; (3) it reinforces religion and represses crime: and each used statistical proof.<sup>3</sup>

Whatever the merits of the argument there was a deepening sense of the educational lack of balance,<sup>4</sup> and the growing agitation led the National Council of the Association to organize in 1891 a new standing committee on Moral Education.<sup>5</sup>

The fact that the trend, with its attendant condition, had come about, not through the deliberate, harmful intent of any social or educational group, but by the interplay of forces beyond the control of such groups, did not alter its seriousness which, in conclusion, we will have Professor Brumbaugh of Pennsylvania University sum up in the year 1898 from the angle of the most important factor

-----  
1 cf. Draper, Andrew S., President Illinois University,  
"American Universities and the National Life." (98:117)

2 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
"Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:318)

3 cf. Harris, W. T., United States Commissioner of Education,  
"School Statistics and Morals." (94:343)

4 (a) cf. DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa.,  
"Moral Training through the Common Branches." (94:165)

(b) cf. Stetson, Hon. W. W., State Superintendent Public Schools,  
Maine, "The Educational Outlook." (98:137)

5 Committee on Reorganization of the Council,  
Report recommending a Committee on Moral Education. (91:282)



involved — the learner:<sup>1</sup>

"We have created a pedagogical child, and we study it. We have lost the real child and the secret of his unfolding. This pedagogical child is a complex of philosophy and pedantry. It is the dream creature of visionary men and women, who spend their days and nights evolving schemes for evolving it. And as the thing itself has no existence in fact, so the theories based upon it have no direct reformative or pedagogic value.

"All educational systems, great in application, were fitted to the real child—"

The whole problem would be best approached from the basic fact (discussed later) that it is children, not subjects, which are taught,<sup>2</sup> and whole children, not fractions of them.<sup>3</sup>

### G. Interpretation of Educational Conditions.

In view of the seriousness of the social and educational situation just presented, and the striking similarity in its main points with present conditions, we shall be greatly interested in the interpretation of the situation by contemporary educators.

#### 1. The Moral Problem of Intellectual Growth.

Socrates said, "Knowledge is virtue", and probably as he meant it he was right, but the experience of centuries contradicts it

---

<sup>1</sup> Brumbaugh, Prof. Martin G., Pennsylvania University, "The Mission of the Elementary School." (98:344)

<sup>2</sup> cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Illinois, "What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:70)

<sup>3</sup> (a) cf. Gregory, Dr. J. M., Illinois Industrial University, Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:25)  
 (b) cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass., "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:223)

as a broad unqualified statement.<sup>1</sup> Dr. Bittinger, already quoted on this subject, says further, "an ignorant man will....pick your pocket; your educated rogue will....pick the nation's pocket. ...Crimes of intelligence are much wider in their pernicious reach than crimes of passion." Crimes of reflection, refinement, and skill advance with education and the great modern frauds were impossible in Sparta.<sup>2</sup>

Dr. Gregory, for years head of state education in Michigan, warned that intellectual reach can not be increased "without bringing a thousand new objects to tempt the appetite, a thousand possibilities of immoral indulgence".<sup>3</sup> Man is merely trained "for a fiercer part in the great human struggle for personal ends",<sup>4</sup> and he becomes "only a more splendid, as he is a more dangerous barbarian"(Horace Mann).<sup>5</sup>

"Education of the intellect simply increases a man's power - nothing more. It cures no immorality but the immorality that proceeds from ignorance. Those other and far more dangerous immoralities that are destructive of all governments, that spring up in the wake of civilization and wealth,

-----

1 (a) cf. Bittinger, J. B., Sewickly, Pa.,  
"Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime." (75:116,117)

(b) cf. Gregory, Dr. J. M., Illinois Industrial University,  
Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:25)

(c) cf. Missimer, H. C., Erie, Pa.,  
"The High School and the Citizen." (89:511)

2 (a) Same as Reference 1-a. (75:116,117)

(b) cf. Canfield, James H., Chancellor Nebraska University, Lincoln,  
"Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:109)

3 Same as Reference 1-b. (72:25)

4 (a) cf. Mathews, B. C., High School Principal, Newark, N. J.,  
"Ethical Instruction through Sociology." (95:625)

(b) cf. Luckey, G. W. A., Professor of Pedagogy, Nebraska University,  
"The Development of Moral Character." (99:127)

5 Sabin, Henry, State Superintendent Public Instruction, Iowa,  
"Horace Mann." (96:66)

education of the intellect can never root out, for the simple reason that such education makes them possible."<sup>1</sup>

If further proof be needed that morality lies outside the purely intellectual, it may be found in the frequent disagreement between knowledge and conduct. People deliberately choose wrong when they know what is right.<sup>2</sup> According to President Butler of Columbia (then) College, the great educational problem is to provide the intellect with that moral force to spur and to guide it<sup>3</sup> upon which it is dependent<sup>4</sup> and upon which the outcome of civilization depends,<sup>5</sup> so that judgement will not lag behind knowledge and control behind skill.<sup>6</sup> William Henry Harrison, President of the United States, in addressing the Convention of 1892, emphasized that "He is not a benefactor of his race who develops un- or mis-directed power".<sup>7</sup>

1 Missimer, H. C., Erie, Pa.,  
"The High School and the Citizen." (89:511)

2 (a) cf. DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa.,  
"The Value of Literature in Moral Training." (94:390)

(b) cf. Storm, A. V., Storm Lake, Iowa,  
"Discipline as the Result of Self Government." (94:770)

(c) cf. Soldan, F. Louis, St. Louis, Mo.,  
Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:446)

3 cf. Butler, Nicholas Murray, Columbia College, New York City,  
"What Knowledge Is of Most Worth?" (95:78)

4 cf. Williams, Mrs. Delia Lathrop, Delaware, Ohio,  
"Ethical Culture in Elementary and Secondary School." (92:101)

5 cf. Gilbert, Charles B., Superintendent, St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Reconstruction of the Grammar School Curriculum." (94:324)

6 cf. Dougherty, Newton C., School Superintendent, Peoria, Ill.,  
"Do Our Public Schools Meet Reasonable Expectations?" (96:80)

7 Harrison, William Henry, President of the United States,  
Address. (Title not given) (92:41)

## 2. The Relative Responsibility of the School.

The school deserved criticism and that sometimes of a severe nature yet it often received too large a share of the blame for moral failure in society. It touched the child for about one-third of his time awake during two-thirds of the year and divided the total educational responsibility with the church, church school, and especially the home.<sup>1</sup> When out of school and ostensibly under home control, the child was too frequently and too much under the influence of the street, literature, companions, or theater, any or all of which might be so evil as to completely neutralize the good which had been done at school, not to mention the home which was too often anything but uplifting. In the light of such facts the school could not justly be made the scapegoat.<sup>2</sup>

Be that as it may, the public school, as the educational agent of the state, was obliged to take up the burden wherever the home, for better or for worse, had left it.<sup>3</sup> In view of the many vicious outside influences<sup>4</sup> even good homes would welcome the help of the school, while homes which shirked responsibility made it im-

---

1 (a) cf. Smart, James H., Indianapolis, Ind.,  
"The High School Question." (79:supp.169)

(b) cf. Marble, Albert P., Superintendent Public Schools, Worcester, Mass., "The Unattainable in Public School Education." (80:40)

2 (a) cf. Wickersham, J. P., Harrisburg, Pa.,  
"Education and Crime." (81:54)

(b) cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:131)

3 cf. Williams, Mrs. Delia Lathrop, Delaware, Ohio,  
"Ethical Culture in Elementary and Secondary School." (92:102)

4 cf. Ward, Edward G., Brooklyn, N. Y.,  
"A Few Changes in Elementary School Instruction." (94:722)

perative.<sup>1</sup> Through the moral influence of the public school children from bad or broken homes had a chance in life otherwise denied.<sup>2</sup>

Compulsory attendance automatically made moral training just as much the obligation of the State<sup>3</sup> as was the sanitation or ventilation of the school buildings,<sup>4</sup> and the punishment of crime presupposed that the State had exercised every moral means of prevention.<sup>5</sup> If the State has the right to provide and compel education it has the right to educate morally<sup>6</sup> for purposes of self-preservation if nothing else.<sup>7</sup> In other words, if the school, both tacitly and officially, was given a social burden to bear, it had a right to employ the best means to bear that burden and if it was to be denied such means it could not be held responsible for any lack of success.

Even some of those who thought that the school as an institution was not availing itself in line of duty of its full rights in

---

1 cf. Evans, Margaret J., Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "Women's Clubs as an Educational Factor." (98:241)

2 cf. Swift, Edgar James, Normal School, Stevens' Point, Wis., "Heredity and Environment — A Study in Adolescence." (98:913)

3 cf. Committee on State School Systems, Report on "Compulsory Education." (91:296)

4 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:486)

5 cf. Cooper, Mrs. Sarah B., San Francisco, Cal., "The Organic Union of Kindergarten and Primary Schools." (93:340)

6 (a) cf. Abbott, Lyman, Editor-in-chief "Outlook", Pastor Plymouth Church, Brooklyn, N. Y., "The Democracy of Learning." (97:193-4)

(b) cf. White, Dr. Emerson E., Columbus, Ohio, "The Duty of the State in Education." (98:205)

7 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., "Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:319)

moral training, believed that public education was bearing unusually heavy and even unfair burdens and bearing them well. They explained this as a product of the personal morale of its teachers. Most of them were God-fearing, moral citizens whose example kept the schools far from being "godless" (as certain said), even if direct moral teaching was impossible or forbidden.<sup>1</sup> In this respect the public school bore favorable comparison with the much-vaunted moral atmosphere of the denominational private schools.<sup>2</sup> The difficulty was that, where the teacher did attempt something in spite of the great pressure for intellectual results, a definite program was lacking<sup>3</sup> and there had been no preparation received in normal school for such work.<sup>4</sup> The inconsistency therein lay in the frequency and fluency with which this admittedly vital subject was ably discussed in convention and the infrequency with which anything practical was ever heard of it in normal training, curriculum, or practice.<sup>5</sup>

-----

1 (a) cf. Smart, James H., Indianapolis, Ind.,  
 "The High School Question." (79:supp.169)  
 (b) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio,  
 "Religion in the School." (93:298)

2 (a) cf. Eaton, John, National Commissioner of Education,  
 "Education and the Building of the State." (81:40)  
 (b) cf. Marble, A. P., Worcester, Mass.,  
 Discussion- "The School of the Future." (91:94)

3 cf. Hinsdale, B. A., Ann Arbor, Mich.,  
 Discussion- "Essentials in Elementary Education." (90:356)

4 (a) cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
 Discussion of State Organization and Administration. (90:446)  
 (b) cf. Same authority,  
 "Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:321)  
 (c) cf. Stickney, Lucia, Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 "The Incidental Method of Moral Instruction." (96:415)

5 cf. Reference 4-c, page 414. (96:414)

D. The Coming Moral Education.

In view of the distrust already recorded -- to the effect that the public was careless and afraid, if not actually contributing to the educational trend -- the statement that this same public would not accept 'secularism' may sound either mistaken or blatant,<sup>1</sup> but we prefer to say prophetic, in the light of other testimony and succeeding events. J. P. Wickersham of Pennsylvania, insisted in 1879 that the question was far from settled,<sup>2</sup> while the President of the Association of that year noted that among the subjects persistently recurring for consideration at the annual meetings was that of "the most efficient mode of giving moral instruction in common schools",<sup>3</sup> and another President five years later called it an "infinite question" rapidly coming to the front.<sup>4</sup> Before this, in 1876, came an encouraging forecast of a future "science" of "formation of character";<sup>5</sup>

1 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:27)

(b) cf. Same authority,  
"Objects Lessens in Moral Instruction in the Common Schools." (80:7)

2 Wickersham, J. P., Harrisburg, Pa., Discussion- "Education at Home and Abroad." "I am not so sure....that one of the strong points of our system is the settlement we have made of the question of religious instruction in connection with the common schools. Have we settled it at all? Is our practice uniform? We have completely secularized the schools in some places, but in others there are daily religious exercises. The general tendency would seem to be towards the adoption of unsectarian religious instruction,--" (79:72)

3 cf. Hancock, John, Dayton, O., President of the Association, Inaugural Address. (79:9)

4 cf. Bicknell, Thomas W., LL.D., Boston, Mass., Address of the President. (84:44)

5 cf. Ruffner, W. H., (not placed)  
"The Moral Element in Primary Education." (76:39)

in 1888 it was proposed to add a "fourth 'r', righteousness, to the traditional three",<sup>1</sup> and the convention of 1890 heard the urgent call for a definite program.<sup>2</sup>

In 1891 the Association Council appointed its first standing Committee on Moral Education<sup>3</sup> and the interest during the decade continued to increase. The annual Resolutions Committee periodically stirred up the question.<sup>4</sup> There was much discussion of improvement in the quality and amount of moral training — as a great educational opportunity<sup>5</sup> — as a necessity because of an inadequate and even harmful existing moral program<sup>6</sup> — as a necessity because the increasing strenuousness of modern life called for more control factors in

---

1 cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:131)

2 cf. Hinsdale, B. A., Ann Arbor, Mich., Discussion- "Essentials in Elementary Education." (90:356)

3 Committee on Reorganization of the Council, Report recommending a Committee on Moral Education. (91:282)

4 (a) Committee on Resolutions, Report. (92:247)

(b) Committee on Resolutions, Report under the Resolution on Citizenship. (95:32)

5 (a) cf. Marble, A. P., Worcester, Mass., Discussion- "The School of the Future." (91:93)

(b) cf. DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "A Basis for Ethical Training in Elementary Schools." (91:170)

(c) cf. Plummer, Frank E., President Secondary Education Department, Des Moines, Iowa, "The Future High School." (91:628)

6 (a) cf. Bradley, John E., Jacksonville, Ill., Discussion- "The Incidental Method of Moral Instruction." (96:420)

(b) cf. Hailmann, Dr. William N., Superintendent, Dayton, O., Address - President Elementary Instruction Department. (98:621)



education.<sup>1</sup> In the International Congress on Education at the Columbian Exposition in 1893, Moral Education had a very prominent place and much discussion as it was a live topic not only in America, but at that very time in England, France, and Germany, as well.<sup>2</sup>

The task which faced educators, in spite of the ripeness of the problem and its much discussion, was to so arouse parents, citizens, and legislators, with the pressing need that a constructive and comprehensive program would be begun.<sup>3</sup>

The ideas advanced in this unremitting agitation of the question by educators and public indicated that, though the old set-up was rapidly passing and necessarily so, something better was just as surely developing to take its place.

The first annual convention of the Association, 1871, had heard W. T. Harris, later United States Commissioner of Education, philosophically explain the disconcert in the field of educative morals as only a "passing phase" in the transition from passivity to conscious self-determination by which education continually purges

-----

1 (a) cf. Phillips, J. H., Superintendent, Birmingham, Ala., "History and Literature in Grammar Grades." (92:615)

(b) cf. Kieffer, Prof. John B., Franklin and Marshall College, Pa., Discussion- "The Future of the Smaller College." (94:804)

(c) cf. Rounds, C. C., Plymouth, N. H., Discussion- "The Incidental Method of Moral Instruction." (96:418)

2 (a) cf. Harris, W. T., United States Commissioner of Education, "The World's Educational Congress." (92:595)

(b) cf. International Congress, Preliminary Program of subjects for discussion (93:6)

(c) cf. Committee of National Education Association on Arrangements for International Congress of Education, W. T. Harris, Chairman, Report. (93:28)

3 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., "Moral Training in Elementary School." (92:321-323)

itself and becomes more truly educative,<sup>1</sup> and the convention of 1899 heard Professor Luckey of the University of Nebraska happily acknowledge a "moral revival which is spreading throughout the country" in the field of the educational development of the child.<sup>2</sup>

#### E. Summary.

This review of conditions in the thirty years from 1871 to 1900 reveals their startling similarity to our own times and especially commends them to our attention. The statement of the fears and hopes and attitudes of those days, certain of which we have quoted, could be published under a current date without much danger of detection. This material, therefore, should prove at least suggestive in approaching present problems.

Progress is supposed to have made even the latter part of the nineteenth century out of date, yet we are pointed to the obvious conclusion that fundamentally social problems, at least in the United States in the last half-century, have not changed much. This may

---

1 Harris, William T., Superintendent Public Instruction, St. Louis, Mo., "The Education of Children at Public Cost." "That education necessarily loosens the hold of mere prescribed rules of morality and religion is true in its negative and elementary aspect. There can be no transition from passive obedience to conscious self-determination except through denial. It is a passing phase, and only a passing phase. But again the state of passive obedience is only a pyramid resting on its apex, and it is the most unstable of all rests. The state of conscious insight and conviction is the pyramid on its base, and the most stable of all rests. Passive obedience, mechanical unreason, is utterly non-spiritual existence; a mere windmill with prayers fastened to it, as in Persia, is the symbolic type of it." (71:36)

2 cf. Luckey, G. W. A., Professor of Pedagogy, Nebraska University, "The Development of Moral Character." (99:127)

sound trite but it is not unimportant in view of a present inclination to discredit everything past however valuable and to favor anything new however dubious. We subscribe to the more scientific and progressive attitude that truth is truth, old or new, and worthy of serious consideration and constructive application.

We have observed the educators of the period, perplexed by the social changes through which they were passing, changes born in the thinking of the society which they perplexed. The great ideas — public education, and separation of church and state — arose from necessity. Like other great ideas these had certain undesirable effects in realization and yet their advantages so outweighed their disadvantages as to give them a more and more secure place in the thought and action of the nation. They can not be eliminated and hence if progress is to be made it must be with them, not against them.

Material progress, desirable though it be, was another problem maker for educators. The industrial revolution and its developments increased the pressure upon the institutions of society — home, church, and school — and thus shifted the existing division of labor among them so that the school found itself with an ever increasing proportion of the burdens. It may be that such a condition is as it should be in the great onward march of the race but burden-shifting always raises mighty problems.

We have observed that education itself as one of the great functions and institutions of society, must needs change as the rest, developing its own internal strains and stresses which served to complicate the increasing tasks upon which it labored. Intellectual growth, apart from other forces, shifted moral balance and increased

the social control problem. In this period came the beginnings of child psychology and all too soon was it indicted as having become a mechanical thing-in-itself apart from the real child. Curriculum-crowding, caused by the attempt to meet these inner and outer problems, clogged rather than cleared the field of operation. All these things combined to blur the moral pattern of education.

These backward looks are valuable in that with detached perspective we may view problems similar to our own in their historical unity in another period. We see the generation under discussion handicapped, as are we, by the impossibility of standing off and calmly viewing itself and its problems. Conditions are never as bad as they seem at the time. Conditions then were serious enough, and we shall not minimize them in view of the fact that we have them multiplied upon our hands, but the dire moral disaster then feared did not happen. Since the beginning of the century character and religious education, in or related to the public school, has been developed, institutionalized, and made effective in new ways and the movement is yet in its infancy. In spite of the sinister evils of our times moral training is on the increase and on a more unshakable educational basis than before. We have observed society perplexed by the problems born within it, but at the same time we have seen in the problems and perplexity the developing potential of solution.

We view education, therefore, as the great social burden-bearer. Society will never finish solving problems because progress is in the business of increasing the number. Social change will never cease, new ideas will ever be born, material progress will continually unfold, and education, changing with the rest, may seem as

it does today to be dallying with every new and bizarre idea. These facts create an impression that society is losing ground and must eventually and inevitably go down. We hear the echo of this feeling in some of the statements which have been presented concerning education, but at the very same time there has been evidence that the old problems were not neglected but were being approached in new and better ways and that the new problems were being met as fast as adjustment could take place. Secularization was not only resisted it was met in other ways. As inevitable as the problems is the responsive willingness of education — and its distinctive expression, the public school — to carry on. It is the most typically democratic of institutions. Problems can not be met until they arise and social and educational adjustment is slow but education continually orients itself and patiently accepts every burden put upon it, fairly or unfairly, taking it up wherever it was dropped by others. Thus it takes the blame for failures not its own while the real magnitude of its service goes largely unappreciated.

Finally, the fact that society, and particularly the leaders, were so keenly aware of and so genuinely aroused over conditions, were so emphatic in demanding action and so quick in accepting the challenge of the task for education — all of which is true likewise today — witnesses to the vigilance that ever protects society from moral disaster no matter how mighty its changes.

**CHAPTER III**

**THE RELATION OF MORAL EDUCATION  
TO EDUCATION AS A WHOLE  
AND TO RELIGION**

### CHAPTER III

#### THE RELATION OF MORAL EDUCATION TO EDUCATION AS A WHOLE AND TO RELIGION

The second main consideration in this study is to find and to analyze the way in which moral education was regarded philosophically, psychologically, sociologically, and politically.

##### A. Education as a Mode of Life.

##### 1. The Significance of Character.

The aim of life is 'to be' not 'to know'.<sup>1</sup> Character is more important than knowledge. Education, being life functioning to find its own meaning and to give itself direction thereby, keeps the same relation of values, whence character education will be first in importance. Hegel said that "the end of all education is ethical".<sup>2</sup> President Strong, of Carleton College, called Christian character the "end" of education<sup>3</sup> which statement was seconded by President Angell of Michigan University.<sup>4</sup> Josiah Royce, the Harvard philosopher,

-----

1 cf. Dowd, John W., Toledo, Ohio,  
"Education of the Sensibilities."

(81:231)

2 cf. Newcomb, Mrs. L. T., Hamilton, Ont., "The Related Development of Morality and Intelligence in the Kindergarten Idea." (94:686)

3 cf. Strong, James W., President Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:153,154)

4 cf. Angell, J. B., President Michigan State University, Discussion- "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:177)

said that "there is no doubt that the chief purpose of education is to make the best character in human beings possible to be made",<sup>1</sup> and "Arnold (of Rugby) held that all the scholarship man ever had was infinitely worthless in comparison with even a humble degree of spiritual advancement",<sup>2</sup> and all the great educators from Luther (1483-1546) to Spencer (1820-1903) stressed the importance of symmetrical education and the necessity of attention to character to make it symmetrical.<sup>3</sup> From Aristotle's Ethics was brought this thought:<sup>4</sup>

"It is by the gradual perfection of the moral nature, and by this method only, that we are brought into that state in which the intellectual principle is able to act purely and uninterruptedly."

In support of this same idea educational history instances<sup>5</sup>

"men like Ratich and Basedow, both gifted with unusual ability, and the originators of great and promising education-

-----  
1 Royce, Josiah, Harvard University,  
Discussion- "The Social Basis of Conscience." (98:202)

2 Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Illinois,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:70)

3 (a) cf. Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Ky.,  
"Full-Orbed Education." (75:44)

(b) cf. Raab, Henry A., State Superintendent Public Instruction,  
Illinois, "Primary Education: What and How?" (83:15)

(c) cf. Hailmann, W. N., LaPorte, Ind.,  
"Harmonious Development." (89:409,410)

(d) cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
"Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:320)

4 (a) Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio,  
"Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:463)

(b) cf. Williams, Mrs. Delia Lathrop, Delaware, Ohio,  
"Ethical Culture in Elementary and Secondary School." (92:101)

(c) cf. Grisham, G. N., Principal, Kansas City, Mo.,  
"The Proper Education of an American Citizen." (98:275)

5 Williams, S. G., Ithaca, N. Y.,  
"Value to Teachers of the History of Education." (89:231)



al projects, yet both doomed to failure by the defects of their moral organization; or....Pestalozzi emerging from the ruins of all his undertakings — ruins caused by his various 'unrivalled incapacities' and limitations — his head crowned with a garland of victory by virtue of 'his inexhaustible love for the people, his pure heart, his glowing enthusiasm, and his restless efforts and sacrifices for human welfare through human culture'."

The effect of the religio-moral on all educational systems, even to conditioning their form in the great oriental civilizations, revealed its close relation and tremendous influence and warned educators not to try to divorce the two but rather to seek union with moral training at its best.<sup>1</sup> The much anathematized radical Huxley stated before the London School Board his belief<sup>2</sup>

"that no human being, and no society composed of human beings, ever did or ever will come to much, unless their conduct be governed and guided by the love of some ethical ideal;"<sup>3</sup> morality made the difference between a high and low civilization.

Character education should develop, not merely the negative virtue of avoiding wrong-doing, but dynamic goodness the scarcity of which was said to be "endangering the fabric of civilization".<sup>4</sup> Teachers must realize the paramount importance to the student of getting

---

1 cf. Williams, S. G., Ithaca, N. Y.,  
"Value to Teachers of the History of Education." (89:230)

2 White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School." (86:134)

3 cf. Gilbert, Charles B., Superintendent, St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Reconstruction of the Grammar School Curriculum." (94:324)

4 (a) cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart." (83:28)  
(b) cf. Parker, Francis W., Cook County Normal School, Chicago,  
Ill., "The School of the Future." (91:85)

character as compared with getting subjects.<sup>1</sup> Those who urged the importance of 'practical' studies, to the exclusion of morals, were open to the charge of contradictory logic, because nothing is more practical than good character.<sup>2</sup> The idea that the sole duty of the public school is intellectual was used, never as a defense, always as an objection,<sup>3</sup> in fact, such a school is indefensible.<sup>4</sup>

Let Nicholas Murray Butler, of Columbia (then) College, conclude this point — education is "spiritual growth toward intellectual and moral perfection" and it is peril to view it as "an artificial process according to mechanical formulas."

"Truth is within ourselves; it takes no rise  
From outward things, whate'er you may believe,  
There is an inmost center in us all,  
Where truth abides in fulness; and around,  
Wall upon wall, the gross flesh hems it in,  
This perfect, clear perception. ....

.... And, to know,  
Rather consists in opening out a way  
Whence the imprisoned splendor may escape,  
Than in effecting entry for light  
Supposed to be without." (Browning)<sup>5</sup>

It seems to us that in many of the statements the use of

-----

1 (a) cf. Smart, J. H., Indianapolis, Ind., Discussion- "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:29)

(b) cf. Gates, President Merrill E., Amherst, Mass.,  
"The Profession of teaching for Light and Power." (91:183)

2 cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Illinois,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve." (71:69)

3 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School." (86:128)

4 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio,  
"Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:467)

5 Butler, Nicholas Murray, Columbia College, New York City,  
"What Knowledge Is of Most Worth?" (95:80)

the terms 'intellectual' and 'cultural' as distinct from 'moral' is as contradictory as was the use of 'practical' mentioned above. Moral education is unquestionably an intellectual and cultural process<sup>1</sup> and none can be truly called intellectual and cultured, no matter how widely informed otherwise, if he is lacking in keen moral sense.

Primacy of character was one of the facts most frequently attested by educators throughout the period under discussion, as a further list of references on this particular point shows.<sup>2</sup>

1 cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wisconsin, "The Public Schools and Morality."

(85:81)

2 cf. (a) Ruffner, W. H., "The Moral Element in Primary Education." (76:43); (b) Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The New Teacher in New America." (79:64); (c) Singer, Edgar A., Philadelphia, Pa., "What Constitutes a Practical Course of Study?" (80:109,117); (d) Kellogg, Mrs. Eva D., Boston, Mass., "Needs in American Education." (84:142); (e) Johnston, William P., President Tulane University, New Orleans, La., "Education in Louisiana." (86:186); (f) Parkinson, D. B., Carbondale, Ill., Discussion- "The Practical Value of a Taste for Good Literature." (88:93); (g) Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn., "The Ethics of School Management." (88:529); (h) Committee on Elementary Education, Report- "Essentials in Elementary Education." (90:351); (i) Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., Discussion of State Organization and Administration. (90:446); (j) Preston, J. R., State Superintendent Public Instruction, Jackson, Miss., "Teaching Patriotism." (91:107); (k) Committee on Pedagogy, Report- "The Education of the Will." (91:342); (l) Shepard, Irwin, Winona, Minn., "Ethical Culture in the Kindergarten." (92:98); (m) Canfield, Chancellor James H., Lincoln, Nebr., "Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:114); (n) Committee on Moral Education, Report- "Practical Culture of the Moral Virtues." (92:762); (o) Pickard, Joseph L., Iowa City, Ia., "Essentials in a Course of Study for Children." (93:255); (p) White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, O., "Religion in the School." (93:295); (q) Committee on Moral Education, Report- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (96:410); (r) Rowe, H. M., Baltimore, Md., "Laws and Ethics of Business, Duties of Citizenship, and Science of Wealth." (97:318); (s) White, Dr. Emerson E., Columbus, O., "The Duty of the State in Education." (98:207); (t) Mott, T. A., Superintendent of Schools, Richmond, Ind., Discussion- "Successive Differentiation of Subjects in the Elementary Schools." (98:641)

## 2. The Relation of Religion to Character.

History shows that great moral codes, non-Christian as well as Christian, from earliest time to the present, derive authority from religion.<sup>1</sup> They require a mandate from some Source, believed to be extra-human and personal in nature.<sup>2</sup> Josiah Royce said that high, progressive morality in any creed was possible only when related to an unseen world of particular characters.<sup>3</sup> Their God made the Hebrews a perpetual racial miracle.<sup>4</sup> To the individual religious feeling is, according to Huxley, "the essential basis of conduct".<sup>5</sup> Not only in religions like Christianity, claiming a high degree of revelation, but in the myth religions as well, moral decay inevitably followed religious decay.<sup>1</sup>

The statement was made, however, that it was no longer sound theology "to found morality on religion, but to build religion

---

1 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio,  
"Religion in the School."

(93:295)

2 Allyn, Rev. Robert, D.D., Carbondale, Ill., "The Importance of Religious Motives and Sanctions in Moral Training." "—we must bow to a person somewhere who originates and controls, who enacts law, and requires obedience, and we must give to the name by which we know him a capital letter, and whether we call him the Unknown, the Unknowable, the Absolute, the Infinite, Jehovah, Jove, or Lord and God, we must represent him by the virile and creative pronoun He, with a large letter. We then find a basis for authority, accountability, and command. All else is narrow and selfish, shifting and transitory, and makes might and opportunity the rules of the universe."

(87:386-387)

3 cf. Royce, Josiah, Harvard University,  
"The Social Basis of Conscience."

(98:196-198)

4 cf. Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Practical Culture of the Moral Virtues."

(92:759)

5 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School."

(86:134,135)

on the bed rock of morality. The Bible presumes virtue."<sup>1</sup> We do not know upon what scripture and theology this assertion was based and we believe it would be hard to support it when theology, philosophy, history, and experience speak otherwise. It is true that moral sanctions have been sustained by long experience<sup>2</sup> and that they may be organized in a non-religious way and so set forth educationally but, however well they are thus rationalized, they are not the source of morality nor can they alone maintain its authority. History witnesses that every attempt to ground morals on human authority alone has resulted in moral decay.<sup>3</sup> Religion is the vital force in morality and without God (or gods) it does not hold up under the stress of social life<sup>4</sup> but decays and disappears.<sup>5</sup>

The sanction for America will be, not Confucian, Buddhist, or Mohammedan, but Christian.<sup>6</sup> Christianity has been the force that has given superiority, if such exists, to western civilization<sup>7</sup> and

-----

1 Folwell, William W., President Minnesota University, "Secularization of Education." Abstract. (82:44)

2 cf. Stern, Prof. D. W., Madison, Wisconsin, Discussion- "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:139)

3 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:134,135)

4 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio, "Religion in the School." (93:296)

5 cf. Strong, James W., President Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:154,155)

6 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:12)

7 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School." (80:9)

"far transcends any other force or movement that has acted upon education".<sup>1</sup> Christ is the all-essential, unique, transcendent dynamic for American teachers and teaching.<sup>2</sup>

## B. Education as Modification of the Learner.

### 1. The Nature of the Person.

Whatever the teacher's conception or plan of teaching, it is children, not subjects, which are taught.<sup>3</sup> The student is a unit, not an assembly of demountable parts for piecemeal treatment, hence no function of the person — physical, psychological, spiritual — can be affected exclusively. That personality is not divisible at the whim of educators<sup>4</sup> was repeatedly emphasized.<sup>5</sup> The idea that

-----

1 cf. Hinsdale, B. A., Ann Arbor, Michigan,  
"The Culture Value of the History of Education." (89:213)

2 cf. Gates, President Merrill E., Amherst, Mass.,  
"The Profession of Teaching for Light and Power." (91:183-184)

3 cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Ill.,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:70)

4 cf. Meleney, Clarence E., Superintendent of Schools, Paterson,  
N. J., "The True Object of Early School Training." (85:318)

5 (a) Gregory, Dr. J. M., Illinois Industrial University, Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." "It is impossible to send the intellect of a child to school and keep the heart at home." (72:25)

(b) Harrington, Henry F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass.,  
"What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" "You can not retain the remainder of the natures of the children in passive abeyance five or six hours of every day, while you are furbishing and furnishing their intellects." (73:223)

(c) Newcomb, Mrs. L. T., Hamilton, Ont., "The Related Development of Morality and Intelligence in the Kindergarten Idea." "We talk of 'mental, moral, and physical' education from the very complexity of the nature to be trained, and often imply the separation of these; but the true educator ever holds to the idea of educational

divisibility existed, or could be made to exist, was a fallacy<sup>1</sup> whose successive and increasing repudiation in theory and practice by great educators from Luther to the present is the rise of modern education.<sup>2</sup>

Character modification is ceaseless and the absence of intention and direction may affect its trend for the worse but can not stop the process.<sup>3</sup> Finally, the public — no matter how opposed to definite moral education for any reason — plainly expected the whole child to be developed because they always blamed the school for any of his acts or qualities whose morality they did not approve.<sup>4</sup>

## 2. The Significance of Religion to the Person.

If morals and moral development can not be excluded nor exclusive in education, the vital relationship already mentioned between morals and religion can only mean that religion, at least in so

unity....as Montaigne puts it, "It is not a soul, it is not a body we are training up, but a man, and we cannot divide him." (94:686)

(d) Luckey, G. W. A., Professor of Pedagogy, Nebraska University, "The Development of Moral Character." "Character represents the whole man, and true character means the harmonious development of body, mind, and soul. ... It is the very essence of the individual's life, and can only be changed or modified with the life itself. ... —the physical condition, the health, growth, and strength of body greatly affect the individual's character." (99:131-132)

1 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:22)

2 (a) cf. Hailmann, W. N., LaPorte, Ind., "Harmonious Development." (89:409,410)

(b) cf. Dickinson, J. W., Secretary State Board of Education, Mass., "Results of Methods of Teaching." (80:101)

3 cf. Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn., "The Ethics of School Management." (88:529)

4 cf. MacDonald, J. W., Stoneham, Mass., "Educating the Whole Boy." (88:415-417)

far as it is a moral sanction, must be included in any attempt at moral training and symmetrical intellectual development. Personality is inevitably religious and must be trained and experienced on high levels or it will seek satisfaction on lower ones.<sup>1</sup> The will, which is the determining moral function of the person, is stimulated and guided by the authority found only in religion.<sup>2</sup> Rationalized motives are weak without a Supreme Being.<sup>3</sup> The highest manifestation of moral personality is the Christ-like spirit.<sup>4</sup> It was objected that religion is inspirational and intuitional and not 'learnable'.<sup>5</sup> This might be true as far as what is termed one's inner experience is concerned — just as for inner experience of any kind — but knowledge of the beliefs and experiences of others, the fact and sanction of religion in the third person, has been from the beginning a recognized preparation for experience in the first person, in all religions. The Bible is funded knowledge of this kind.

1 cf. Brumbaugh, Prof. Martin G., Pennsylvania University, Philadelphia, Pa., "The Mission of the Elementary School." (98:345)

2 (a) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:134)

(b) See footnote in Reference 2, page 39. (87:386-387)

3 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio, "Religion in the School." (93:295,296)

4 cf. Committee on Higher Education, Report- "The Higher Life of the College." (96:433)

5 cf. Wiener, Professor, Kansas City, Mo., Discussion- "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:143)



### C. Education as Social Development.

#### 1. The Significance of Moral Training in Education.<sup>1</sup>

The importance attached to character training has already been evidenced by the numerous references under Section A of this chapter. Dr. White, President of the Association in 1872, believed that the first and highest duty of the teacher was moral training,<sup>2</sup> and Dr. Gregory in the same discussion added that without the moral element "there is no just claim on which our school system can be maintained as a public school system".<sup>3</sup> Public instruction must somehow retain its moral quality in the face of the progressive banishment of religion or the Catholic position on the necessity of church leadership of the school system would be maintained.<sup>4</sup>

The school being an expression of society, reflects the ideals of at least the local community to which it belongs. Its directors, teachers, and the parents of its pupils are a part and product of the community life<sup>5</sup> and have a right to expect and demand

---

1 Committee on Moral Education, Report- "Practical Culture of the Moral Virtues." The whole article is pertinent. (92:759-763)

2 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio, Association President, Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:24)

3 (a) Gregory, Dr. J. M., Illinois Industrial University, Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:24)

(b) cf. Thurber, Samuel, Milton, Mass., "The Order and Relation of Studies in the High School Course." (87:431)

4 cf. DeGarmo, Charles, Normal, Illinois, "Relation of Instruction to Will-Training." (90:119)

5 cf. Morgan, Thomas J., Providence, R. I., Discussion- "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:156)

that it shall at least maintain, not to say raise, accepted moral standards.<sup>1</sup> The danger of assuming that intellectual training is the sole duty of the public school has already been noted.<sup>2</sup> G. Stanley Hall, the well known psychologist of Clark University, said that "the will is no less dependent on the culture it receives than the intellect."<sup>3</sup> It is certain, therefore, that each child can not be left to construct his own code of ethics. He has a right to know and be trained in the best code extant, and public education, in the nature of the case, will have a large share in such work.<sup>4</sup> Social safety and progress depend thereon.

The earliest home training of the child is chiefly of a moral nature and there can not be an abrupt break between the morals of the good home and of the school, they must be mutually continuous.<sup>5</sup> Hence the kindergarten and primary grades are of utmost importance, and for the additional reason that the child from the least favorable

-----

1 (a) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:128)

(b) cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:128)

2 See pages 35 to 37.

3 cf. Johnson, George E., Superintendent of Schools, Andover, Mass., "Play in Physical Education." (98:951)

4 cf. Payne, William H., Nashville University, Nashville, Tenn., "Education According to Nature." (95:124)

5 (a) cf. Rivers, Rev. R. H., D.D., Martin College, Pulaski, Tenn., "Moral Training." (77:180,185)

(b) cf. Singer, Edgar A., Philadelphia, Pa., "What Constitutes a Practical Course of Study?" (80:112)

(c) cf. White, E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio, Discussion- "The Function of the Public School." (87:279)

(d) cf. Brown, George P., Bloomington, Ill., Discussion- "The Function of the Public School." (87:279)

home may have wholesome moral training as soon and as much as possible.<sup>1</sup> Furthermore, morals in grade school were all-important to the many who never went on to high school.<sup>2</sup> It is very suggestive that the reforms, leading to modern education, instituted by such men as Froebel and Pestalozzi, began in schools for the youngest children, and with great stress upon character training.<sup>3</sup>

There were two general methods, direct and indirect, each of which had its advocates. The necessity for special permission to teach morals<sup>4</sup> and the argument that the teacher's time is too full to permit it,<sup>5</sup> can only refer to formal instruction and not to the incapable and more important informal training which is involved in every exercise of the school.

To the pupil school is not merely preparation for life, it is life, possessing potentially the factors of adult life and presenting moral problems and demanding moral solutions.<sup>6</sup> Viewed thus mo-

---

1 (a) cf. Harris, W. T., LL.D., Superintendent Public Instruction, St. Louis, Mo., "Relations of the Kindergarten to the School." (79:152)

(b) cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis., "The Public Schools and Morality." (85:82)

(c) cf. Brown, Kate L., Boston, Mass., "Application of Froebel's Principles to the Primary Schools." (87:346)

2 cf. Newell, M. A., Superintendent Public Instruction, Maryland, Address as President of the Association. (77:12)

3 cf. Partridge, Lelia E., Philadelphia, Pa., Discussion- "Relations of the Kindergarten to the School." (79:161)

4 cf. Dowd, John W., Toledo, Ohio, "Education of the Sensibilities." (81:231)

5 cf. Kellogg, Mrs. Eva D., Boston, Mass., "Needs in American Education." (84:142)

6 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:16)

ral training is not a distinctly separated study<sup>1</sup> but rather an inherent part of every school activity all the time.<sup>2</sup> In fact, this inevitable and continuous, though incidental and informal, training was considered more important morally than any book ethics could be, and deserving of more teacher attention.<sup>3</sup> However, though informal, it should not be accidental, spasmodic, or whimsical, but as systematic and well thought out by the teacher as any lesson.<sup>4</sup> On the other hand, the teacher must avoid obvious and habitual moralizing about everything, a practice which will surely develop pupil dislike and rebellion, and defeat its own moral purpose entirely.<sup>5</sup>

There can be no objection to the cultivation of such fundamental virtues as justice, honesty, truthfulness, kindness, politeness, purity, self-control, industry, prudence, reverence, courage.<sup>6</sup> The school should not neglect ethical instruction just because of its

-----

1 cf. Singer, Edgar A., Philadelphia, Pa.,  
"What Constitutes a Practical Course of Study?" (80:112)

2 (a) cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Ill.,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:69)

(b) cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass.,  
"What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:223)

(c) cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
"The Public Schools and Morality." (85:81,89)

(d) cf. Harris, W. T., Washington, D. C.,  
Discussion- "Essentials in Elementary Education." (90:356)

3 (a) cf. Reference 1, page 117. (80:117)

(b) cf. Hyde, Ellen, Principal Normal School, Framingham, Mass.,  
"How Can Character Be Symmetrically Developed?" (80:213)

4 cf. Newell, M. A., Superintendent Public Instruction, Maryland,  
Address as President of the Association. (77:12)

5 cf. DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, Swarthmore College, Pa., "The Principals upon which the Co-ordination of Studies Should Proceed." (95:94)

6 cf. Reference 2-c, pages 89 and 90. (85:89,90)

close relation to religion.<sup>1</sup> Morals may be systematized and taught according to their necessity and practicability in social experience apart from religion.<sup>2</sup> This secular approach to ethical questions should not be antithetical to the religious approach, not a substitute, but a reinforcement which would supplement and strengthen it.<sup>3</sup>

## 2. The Relation of Religion to Moral Training.

The vital relation between moral training and the church and religion raised the problem as to just how much religion must be necessarily brought into school with moral training and how much may be brought in agreeable to all principles and attitudes. A great difficulty had been (and still is) the prevalent belief that sectarianism and indoctrination were indispensable to religious teaching.<sup>4</sup> The truth is that their elimination does not totally deny nor devitalize religion itself.<sup>5</sup> Religion is essential and fundamental and is above any sect, wherefore sectarianism is not an essential to basic religious instruction. The misunderstanding has arisen from a fail-

---

1 cf. Soldan, F. Louis, St. Louis, Mo.,  
"The Century and the School." (81:156)

2 (a) cf. Ruffner, W. H., (not placed)  
"The Moral Element in Primary Education." (76:43)

(b) cf. Peaslee, J. B., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral and Literary Training in the Public Schools." (81:108)

3 cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
"The Public Schools and Morality." (85:82)

4 cf. DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa.,  
"Moral Training through the Common Branches." (94:165)

5 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School." (86:136,137)

ure to distinguish.<sup>1</sup> Apart from religion the teacher can present only "the bald facts of morality without real life in them".<sup>2</sup> There must be enough religion to make morals work.<sup>3</sup> The fact of God and the universal sanction of religion should be emphasized to the utmost in moral education, urged Professor Ormond of Princeton University,<sup>4</sup> but without making morality the arbitrary compulsion of a divine Despot,<sup>5</sup> or preaching sermons and trying to make sectarian converts.<sup>6</sup>

The kindergarten was undogmatically yet thoroughly religious<sup>7</sup> without arousing conflict among Jews, Catholics, or Protestants.<sup>8</sup> It was true that these groups agreed on many cardinal

---

1 (a) cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass., "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:222)  
 (b) cf. Hoose, Dr. J. H., Principal State Normal, Cortland, N. Y., "What is a School?" (76:186)

(c) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Moral Training in the Public School" and discussion. (86:136-7,147)  
 (d) cf. Strong, Rev. James W., President Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:155)

2 cf. Larimer, H. G., Principal, Topeka, Kans., Discussion- "The School and the Criminal." (92:216)

3 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio, "Religion in the School." (93:296)

4 cf. Ormond, Prof., Princeton University, Discussion- "The Social Basis of Conscience." (98:202)

5 cf. Marble, A. P., Worcester, Mass., Discussion- "The School and the Criminal." (92:217)

6 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:12)

(b) cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Education of the Heart." (83:34)

7 cf. Brooks, Angeline, (not placed) "Essential Principles of the Kindergarten System." (94:697)

8 cf. Partridge, Lelia E., Philadelphia, Pa., Discussion- "The Relations of the Kindergarten to the School." (79:162)

points<sup>1</sup> but it was next to impossible to get them officially to say so and to produce a common code which would have been generally satisfactory and usable.<sup>2</sup> Religious education at that time was a most variable quantity and always under suspicion of sectarianism.<sup>3</sup>

The ideal school teacher is a Christian, not a bigoted sectarian propagandist.<sup>4</sup> It was through teacher character more than any other way that the vexed problem of actually having, yet technically not having, Christianity in the school room was to be solved, according to no less an authority than President Angell of Michigan University.<sup>5</sup> In conclusion a statement from Huxley:

"If I were compelled to choose for one of my own children, between a school in which religious instruction is given and one without it, I should prefer the former, even though the child might have to take a good deal of theology with it,"

and he furthermore likened the abolition of religion in schools, to obviate sectarian difficulties, to the burning of a ship to free it from cockroaches.<sup>6</sup>

J. P. Wickersham of Pennsylvania gave probably the best

-----

1 cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart." (83:34)

2 cf. Wiener, Prof., Kansas City, Mo.,  
Discussion- "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:143)

3 cf. Cook, J. W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach  
Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:134)

4 cf. Morgan, Gen. Thomas J., Providence, R. I.,  
"The Ideal School Master." (85:79)

5 cf. Angell, J. B., President Michigan State University,  
Discussion- "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:177)

6 cf. Harrington, Henry F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass.,  
"What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:223)

summing up of the actual situation to be found.<sup>1</sup>

"The schools are managed by Christian men, taught by Christian teachers, patronized by Christian parents; but their spirit is to avoid any exercise of a religious character that will offend the most tender conscience. The Bible is read and hymns are sung in the great majority of the public schools; prayers are offered in a smaller number; but such observances are practised by common consent, and without objection. The laws bearing upon the subject of religious instruction in schools are exceedingly flexible, wisely adapted to the varying denominational character of the population. --the exclusion of formal religious instruction from a school may leave undisturbed its religious life, the purest morals may still be inculcated, and the teacher's example may remain an unwritten gospel, touching and ennobling every child coming within its influence."

#### D. Education as Political Function.

##### 1. The Significance of Moral Citizenship to the State.

A moral citizenry is fundamental to the permanence of a nation and the state function of education is fundamental to the making of such citizens.<sup>2</sup> Put into the schools what you want to come out in the life of the nation.<sup>3</sup> Education has always controlled national character,<sup>4</sup> and character is not a product merely of the knowledge

---

1 Wickersham, J. P., Harrisburg, Pa., "The Leading Characteristics of American Systems of Public Education." (81:97-98)

2 cf. Atkinson, George H., Portland, Ore., "The Culture Most Valuable to Prepare Law-abiding and Law-respecting Citizens." (88:120)

3 cf. Gates, President Merrill E., Amherst, Mass., "The Profession of Teaching for Light and Power." (91:183)

4 cf. Strong, Rev. James W., President Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:154)



of certain studies.<sup>1</sup> Such knowledge alone was considered a "rope of sand"<sup>2</sup> and even "suicidal"<sup>3</sup> because it might be turned against society.<sup>4</sup> President Butler of Columbia University warned that "that democracy alone will be triumphant which has both intelligence and character. To develop both among the whole people is the task of education in a democracy."<sup>5</sup>

Good moral citizenship is demanded by the state and wrongdoing is punished by the state, whence, if it has the right to teach at all, it is imperative that it provide moral training<sup>6</sup> for in a

-----

1 (a) cf. White, Joseph, Secretary State Board of Education, Mass., Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools."(72:26)

(b) cf. Baldwin, Joseph, Huntsville, Texas, "The Culture Most Valuable for Educating Law-abiding and Law-respecting Citizens." (88:113)

(c) cf. Donnan, Laura, Indianapolis, Ind., "The High School and the Citizen." (89:518)

2 cf. Gregory, Dr. J. M., Illinois Industrial University, Discussion- "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools."(72:25)

3 (a) cf. Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn., "The Ethics of School Management." (88:529)

(b) cf. Laughlin, Ada M., St. Paul, Minn., "The Moral Value of Art Education." (90:147)

4 cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Education of the Heart." (83:27)

5 Butler, Nicholas Murray, Columbia University, New York City, "Democracy and Education." (96:95)

6 (a) cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass., "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?"(73:223)

(b) cf. Cornwall, A. R., Principal Albion Academy, Wis., Discussion- "Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime." (75:122)

(c) cf. Hoose, Dr. J. H., Principal State Normal, Cortland, N. Y., "What Is a School?" (76:186)

(d) cf. Cooper, Mrs. Sarah B., San Francisco, "The Organic Union of Kindergarten and Primary Schools." (93:340)

democracy that means training its governors - the voters.<sup>1</sup> On the authority of Jane Addams of Hull House, much ballot corruption flourished by the exploitation of people morally ignorant of civic duty.<sup>2</sup> Public education must give enough moral training, regardless of any objections which may be raised, to produce good citizens.<sup>3</sup> The nation's common schools are her bulwark.<sup>4</sup>

Those who make morals entirely a church duty forget the many children whose homes are untouched by the church and whose logical understanding of morality, upon which the safety of the state depends, can come only from the school.<sup>5</sup> If criminals can be reformed, and they can be, then criminality can be prevented. The same effort given to youth would virtually end crime, and even war, in two generations, just as disease is brought under control.<sup>6</sup> Maximum moral impulse means minimum physical restraint.<sup>7</sup>

-----

1 cf. Abbott, Rev. Lyman, Editor-in-chief "Outlook", Pastor Plymouth Church, Brooklyn, N. Y., "The Democracy of Learning." (97:193)

2 cf. Evans, Margaret J., Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "Women's Clubs as an Educational Factor." (98:242)

3 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., "Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:317-319)

4 cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Ill., "What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:76)

5 cf. Newell, M. A., Superintendent Public Instruction, Maryland, Address as President of the Association. (77:12)

6 cf. Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Kentucky, "Full-Orbed Education." (75:43,46,48)

7 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "In fundamental Civics, what shall we teach as the American Doctrine of Religion and the State?" (99:618)

## 2. The Relation of Religion to Moral Citizenship.

Religion is essential to the development and maintenance of a moral citizenry.<sup>1</sup> Such an important social and racial force must be included in citizenship training.<sup>2</sup> Free society can not be maintained if education is completely severed from its root in religion. Professor Pickard of Iowa University refers in this connection to the founding of the nation and quotes from Washington and Jefferson.<sup>3</sup>

The Territorial Ordinance of 1787, inferior only to the Federal Constitution in importance, definitely guarded and promoted religion,<sup>4</sup> as did many of the states' Bills of Rights.<sup>5</sup> Recognition of God in national life, as expressed by President Scovel of Wooster University, was essential to the very conception, to the definition, to the realization, and to the transmission of liberty.<sup>6</sup> The church

---

1 cf. Atkinson, George H., Portland, Ore., "The Culture Most Valuable to Prepare Law-abiding and Law-respecting Citizens." (88:120)

2 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "In fundamental Civics, what shall we teach as the American Doctrine of Religion and the State?" (99:616)

3 (a) cf. Pickard, J. L., Professor of Political Science, Iowa State University, "What Lessons Does the Ordinance (of 1787) Teach in Regard to the Future Educational Policy of Our Government?" (87:132)

(b) cf. Price, Dr. G. W. F., Nashville, Tenn., Discussion- "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:170)

4 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:22)

(b) cf. Bonney, Charles G., President of the World's Congress in Chicago, Closing remarks in last session. (93:65-66)

5 cf. Hoose, Dr. J. H., Principal State Normal, Cortland, N. Y., "What is a School?" (76:171-173)

6 cf. Reference 2, page 622. (99:622)

itself is protected by the state though separated from it.<sup>1</sup> If God must needs be recognized in civil life — to safeguard legal documents and court proceedings, to solemnize marriage vows, in the appointment of chaplains for government services, on the national coinage — it is inconsistent not to have Him in the training program.<sup>2</sup>

History shows the fallacy of grounding morals on human authority,<sup>3</sup> and experience says that loss of religion means loss of morals in a social group.<sup>4</sup> Horace Mann was very positive that<sup>5</sup>

"if we fail to give due prominence to the cultivation of the moral and religious nature of the child, the fate which has always overtaken godless nations will overtake the American Republic."

The right of the nation to preserve itself transcends private right of conscience, even to the retention of Bible and religion in education to the extent necessary to insure moral citizenship.<sup>6</sup> In fact the American Doctrine of the separation of church and state does not

-----

1 cf. Eaton, John, National Commissioner of Education, "Education and the Building of the State." (81:36)

2 (a) cf. Price, Dr. G. W. F., Nashville, Tenn., Discussion- "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:170)

(b) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio, "Religion in the School." (93:296)

3 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:135)

4 cf. Strong, Rev. James W., President Carleton College, Northfield, Minn., "The Relation of the Christian College." (87:155)

5 Sabin, Henry, State Superintendent Public Instruction, Iowa, "Horace Mann." (96:66)

6 (a) cf. Hoose, Dr. J. H., Principal State Normal, Cortland, N. Y., "What Is a School?" (76:186)

(b) cf. Atkinson, George H., Portland, Ore., "The Culture Most Valuable to Prepare Law-abiding and Law-respecting Citizens." (88:120)

(c) cf. Reference 2-b. (93:296)

mean the loss of religion but rather a different and better basis for it.<sup>1</sup> DeTocqueville said, "Despotism may govern without religious faith, but liberty cannot."<sup>2</sup>

#### E. Summary

In the former chapter we considered moral education as contemporary educators viewed it in relation to social and educational conditions. In this chapter we have looked at it through the minds of the same group but from the standpoint of logic. The opinion of the period 1871 - 1900 naturally fell into four types: philosophical, psychological, sociological, and political. All opinion supported the reasonableness and necessity of moral training in the educational program.

Character, not knowledge, was pronounced the end of education, and religion a necessary basis to good character. History and the wisdom of the ages supported these premises whether in pagan or Christian civilizations. Wherefore a school which did not conserve morals had no logical right to exist.

Attention was also directed to the significant fact that the moral nature - the self-active part - of the individual person as a learner, goes to school as well as the intellect. Mind or person-

---

1 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "In fundamental Civics, what shall we teach as the American Doctrine of Religion and the State?" (99:617,620)

2 cf. Name omitted, perhaps a committee report, "State Supervision: What Plan of Organization and Administration is Most Effective?" (90:439)

ality can not be split educationally, nor can moral activity be 'thrown into neutral' while intellectual processes proceed. On the contrary, moral activity is inseparably essential to intellectual development. The former may be neglected but never halted. In fact, an attempt to halt such activity, or even the laissez-faire attitude toward it (which seems to be the position some think the public school should take) would itself constitute a moral influence of a most undesirable kind. A school without definite moral tuition, direct or indirect, is therefore a paradox, a psychological anomaly.

Viewed sociologically the school was considered first a social product and then a social influence. Nothing could come out of education which had not first been put in, and nothing could be put into education that was not already in the social mind. The school function was to reproduce for the coming generation the best of the social heritage in the various fields of knowledge. If, as was insisted, moral training belonged in, then anything less than the best would be inconsistent with the purpose and detrimental to the success of the whole program. Furthermore, to the pupil school is not mere training for life, it is life, and the moral element could not be neglected in the school experience of the person without creating a distorted conception of life which would affect all later living. In so far as religion - that is ideas of God - was necessary to a proper training in morals it must be allowed, and it could be supplied without sectarian implications or legal objection by teachers who understood children and were not bigots. Lack in this respect makes any school, however excellent otherwise, a social detriment.

At the very point where the question of morals and religion in American schools ought to be best supported — namely, the political — it had been most successfully attacked. To give keener point to the findings here presented we will insert a brief parenthesis on the acknowledged status of this question. The historical background of American society and the beginnings of public education ought to establish moral training on a firm political basis in educational practice. The separation of church and state was not conceived of in the days of the founding of our institutions as an elimination of religion. The church as an institution and religion as a developmental essential were not identical. It was not until nearly a century later, in other words, as we approach and enter the period under discussion, that the idea that the official separation of church and state meant elimination of everything religious and even moral from the public school, gained general attention. Individual freedom to believe became thereby a 'special privilege' to hinder the belief of others. Majority opinion, the democratic fundamental, began to work only one way. If a majority in a school district want moral training eliminated it must be done for democracy's sake, but when a majority want it retained the wishes of one objector must be respected according to the principle of religious freedom. Thus the most exalted and proudest principles of American democracy were worked one-sidedly against education's great essential. With these things in mind we turn to our findings regarding the political implications of moral education. The state, though separate has always acknowledged the church and protected morality and religion. Church property is

generally untaxed which is in the nature of a subsidy to the church by the state. God is recognized directly and indirectly in governmental business. History records the fact that every nation whose religion, whatever its kind and quality, declined has gone down. The state forbids and punishes immorality and therefore must use every logical means to prevent same. If, as was emphasized, the citizens of each generation determine the character of the next generation through their schools then a de-moralized school means inevitably a demoralized nation and is a process of national suicide. We agree with Huxley as quoted that de-moralizing education for the reasons generally given is like burning a ship to rid it of cockroaches.

These logical reasons coming from the educators themselves constitute the basis for the agitation of the question of moral education in the period under discussion, and for the solutions proposed as given in the preceding chapter. They felt that the duty of the school was plain and their arguments have lost none of their force with the passage of time.



## **CHAPTER IV**

### **AGENTS AND METHODS OF MORAL EDUCATION**

## CHAPTER IV

### AGENTS AND METHODS OF MORAL EDUCATION

As already noted there was a general agreement that the public school should train children further than the strictly intellectual. The important problem was one of method. Should it be formal or informal, direct or indirect, explicit or implicit?

There were three principal agencies through which such training might be given -- the curriculum, the management of the school, and the teacher.

The third consideration in this study is to observe the actual and potential moral values of the public educational agencies as viewed by the educators of the period.

#### A. School Studies and Exercises.

Committee reports on Moral Education in 1896<sup>1</sup> and 1897<sup>2</sup> insisted on definite moral instruction, as had individuals throughout the period.<sup>3</sup> While the weight of opinion seems to have been on that

1 cf. Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (96:408)

2 cf. Committee of National Council on Rural Schools,  
Report- "Intellectual and Moral Education." (97:582)

3 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
Discussion- "Religion in the School." (93:300)

side, and some called the attempt to teach morals through the general subjects false and pernicious,<sup>1</sup> yet there were always those who questioned the practicability of the direct method<sup>2</sup> and attached most importance and usefulness to moral training through the various subjects and activities.<sup>3</sup> The fact of moral value in the regular academic subjects received little mention at first but had growing attention during the last decade of the period. It was a most welcome idea to those who felt the need of moral power to offset secularization yet who feared to urge the use of Bible and religion in school.

### 1. Bible.

The use of the Bible in the classroom would be the most important of the direct methods of instruction.<sup>4</sup> Horace Mann in his famous reports to the Massachusetts State Board of Education advoca-

---

1 cf. Gordy, Prof. J. P., Columbus, Ohio, "What Can Child-Study Contribute to the Science of Education?" (98:352)

2 (a) cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Illinois, "What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:76)

(b) cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Illinois, Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:445)

3 (a) cf. McLellan, J. A., Principal Ontario School of Pedagogy, Toronto, "The Ethical Element in Literature, and How to Make the Most of It in Teaching." (94:73)

(b) cf. DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "Moral Training through the Common Branches." (94:165-172)

(c) cf. Same authority, "The Value of Literature in Moral Training." (94:390)

(d) cf. Pringle, W. J., Principal, Aurora, Illinois, Round Table- "The High School as a Social Factor." (97:695)

4 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:20)

(b) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School." (76:27)

(c) cf. Same authority, "Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School." (80:15)

ted use of the Bible.<sup>1</sup> Truth, not creed, insisted that it remain in the classroom,<sup>2</sup> and the State should protect the teacher's right to its use,<sup>3</sup> in fact the will of the majority of the people would keep it in school without legislation if given a chance.<sup>4</sup>

Many considered it next to impossible to teach morals without the best known text-book - the Bible,<sup>5</sup> and when it was removed from the schools there was nothing to replace it, said President DeGarmo of Swarthmore College.<sup>6</sup> United States Commissioner Harris thought it essential to an insight into the institutions under which Americans lived.<sup>7</sup> Another argument was that if morals were essential, and Bible morals were to be taught from other literature, then why not from the Bible?<sup>8</sup> It was pointed out that the noted Huxley,

-----

1 cf. Harris, William T., United States Commissioner of Education, The Horace Mann Reports as Secretary of Massachusetts Board of Education. (96:59)

2 cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Illinois, "What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:76)

3 cf. Magoun, Dr. G. F., Iowa, Discussion- "Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime." (75:122)

4 cf. Roe, Alvan D., Superintendent, Washington County, Minn., Discussion- "Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime." (75:123)

5 (a) cf. Fischer, H. A., Wheaton College, Illinois, Discussion- "Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:116)

(b) cf. Abbott, Rev. Lyman, Editor-in-chief "Outlook", Pastor Plymouth Church, Brooklyn, "The Democracy of Learning." (97:194)

6 cf. DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "A Basis for Ethical Training in Elementary Schools." (91:170)

7 cf. Harris, W. T., United States Commissioner of Education, "The Curriculum for Secondary Schools." (94:507)

8 cf. Kealing, H. F., Texas, Discussion- "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:145)

who denied the inspiration of the scriptures, looked upon their exclusion from school as intolerable.<sup>1</sup>

All this agitation about the necessity of the Bible was mainly for its use in devotional exercises and as a support for moral principles. The impression was too often given that it might be rather unpalatable medicine but it was good for one. It seems strange to us that no one was revealed in our research who definitely proposed making an interesting course in Bible, for its own sake as great literature and history, and thence naturally to its moral truth.

## 2. Ethics.

The other direct method of instruction was the study of ethics itself as a regular subject. A spokeswoman for women's clubs said that it was the most essential study of all,<sup>2</sup> and another whose voice was often heard in the national meetings suggested that no curriculum should be tolerated without it.<sup>3</sup> Such a course had to be as definitely planned as any other in order to succeed<sup>4</sup> and was reported to have had remarkable results on trial.<sup>5</sup> President Hyde of Bowdoin

---

1 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio,  
"Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:484)

2 cf. Evans, Margaret J., Carleton College, Northfield, Minn.,  
"Women's Clubs as an Educational Factor." (98:241)

3 cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
"Moral Training in Elementary Schools." (92:319)

4 (a) cf. Newell, M. A., Baltimore, Md.,  
"Revision of the Common School Curriculum." (81:84)

(b) cf. Kirby, Lydia A., Philadelphia, Pa.,  
Discussion- "The Ideal Primary School Curriculum." (94:737)

5 cf. Rounds, C. C., Plymouth, N. H.,  
Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:444)

College, and others, advocated just such a course based on sound teaching principles, not stressing the subtleties of an ethical theory, but practical and concrete values.<sup>1</sup>

### 3. Literature.

Literature may be considered on the borderline between the direct and indirect types of studies as to moral value. That it had pre-eminent moral possibilities all who spoke of it agreed, and it was repeatedly referred to in that connection, especially in the latter half of the period. Its method of use would of course determine how far the moral values became effective. Ethical ideas embodied in literature appealed powerfully to youth, according to President DeGarmo.<sup>2</sup> They had added effectiveness over everyday incidents because of their beautiful expression,<sup>3</sup> and because they were more easily carried in memory, and so had a greater influence in after life,<sup>4</sup> in fact books were said to approach living personalities in moral

---

1 (a) cf. Canfield, Chancellor James H., Lincoln, Nebr.,  
"Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:115)

(b) cf. Hyde, William DeWitt, President Bowdoin College, Brunswick, Me., "The Organization of American Education." (92:224)

2 (a) cf. DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa.,  
"A Basis for Ethical Training in Elementary Schools." (91:177)

(b) cf. Hotchkiss, Mary T., Milwaukee, Wis.,  
"Story-Telling in the Kindergarten." (93:352)

(c) cf. McLellan, J. A., Principal Ontario School of Pedagogy, Toronto, "The Ethical Element in Literature, and How to Make the Most of It in Teaching." (94:73)

3 cf. Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (96:410)

4 cf. Phillips, Supt. J. H., Birmingham, Ala.,  
"History and Literature in Grammar Grades." (92:608)

power.<sup>1</sup> The most admirable feature of literature in the opinion of Principal Halleck, well known writer of literature texts, was that it dealt with whole lines of conduct.<sup>2</sup> The reader saw choices made and the results of those choices,<sup>3</sup> "how deeds return upon the doer to bless him or to curse him," as Commissioner Harris expressed it.<sup>4</sup> Literature was of particular value where the Bible could not be used<sup>5</sup> on account of sectarian fear.<sup>6</sup> If the literature was not mutilated

-----

1 (a) cf. Rickoff, Mrs. R. D., New York City, Discussion- "The Superintendent and Good Literature in the Schools." (87:537)

(b) cf. Beecher, Mary L., Memphis, Tenn., "The Practical Value in Life of a Taste for Good Literature." (88:82)

(c) cf. Clark, Minnie Caroline, Kansas City, Mo., "Literature in the High School." (89:273,274)

2 (a) cf. Halleck, Reuben Post, Principal Boys' High School, Louisville, Ky., "The Value of English Literature in Ethical Training." (00:160-168)

(b) cf. DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "The Value of Literature in Moral Training." (94:388-397)

3 cf. Schreiber, Mae E., Literature Teacher, Milwaukee Normal School, "The Training of Teachers so that They May Cooperate with Libraries." (97:1010)

4 cf. Harris, Dr. W. T., United States Commissioner of Education, Washington, D. C., "The Educational Value of the Tragic as Compared with the Comic in Literature and Art." (98:403)

5 cf. Peaslee, Dr. J. B., Cincinnati, Ohio, Discussion- "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:141)

6 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass., "Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School." (80:16,17)

(b) cf. Peaslee, J. B., Cincinnati, Ohio, "Moral and Literary Training in the Public Schools." (81:109)

(c) cf. Johnston, William P., President Tulane University, New Orleans, "Education in Louisiana." (86:187)

(d) cf. Parkinson, D. B., Carbondale, Ill., Discussion- "The Practical Value in Life of a Taste for Good Literature." (88:93)

(e) cf. M'Chesney, J. B., Oakland, Cal., "Teaching English in the Secondary Schools." (88:406)

it was bound to bring religion into school,<sup>1</sup> and study of the best literature would accomplish the most vital part of ethical training.<sup>2</sup>

#### 4. History.

History was not mentioned for its moral worth until the last decade of our period, but then it received so much attention as to make it a rival, if not superior, of literature. This was probably due to the beginning 'social studies' movement, since come to great curricular prominence. History like literature is a borderline subject depending on the teacher to bring out its moral value.

History was commended as an excellent first approach to practical morals long before ethics as such could profitably be presented.<sup>3</sup> There was wide agreement among the most prominent educators on the superior value of history as a source of moral truth and a molder of character throughout the school period.<sup>4</sup> Of particular

-----

1 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio,  
"Religion in the School." (93:298)

2 cf. Hardy, Principal George E., New York City,  
"Literature for Children." (92:154)

3 (a) cf. Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Practical Culture of the Moral Virtues." (92:759-760)  
(b) cf. Peabody, Mrs. Mary H., New York,  
"Methods of Teaching History to Children." (93:284)  
(c) cf. Reference 1. (93:298)

4 (a) cf. Jones, L. H., School Superintendent, Indianapolis, Ind.,  
Discussion- "Essentials in a Course of Study for Children." (93:260)  
(b) cf. Baldwin, Dr. J., Professor of Pedagogy, Texas University,  
Austin, Texas, "The Study of American History as a Training  
for Good Citizenship." (95:140)  
(c) cf. McMurry, Frank M., Illinois State University,  
Discussion of Report of the Committee of Ten on History. (94:163)  
(d) cf. Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (96:409)

(continued on page 68)



note was its repeated demonstration of the inevitable connection between cause and effect, the certainty of consequences,<sup>1</sup> and the fact that life was portrayed beyond the horizon of the individual student's experience.<sup>2</sup> Lessons learned from history were remembered longer and had a greater after effect than those from any other academic source.<sup>3</sup> For this reason it was very important in establishing the student's philosophy of life by its presentation of the permanence of fundamental moral values.<sup>4</sup> In conclusion, history was credited with much of the moral good which came from the school,<sup>5</sup> and its neglect was blamed for the lack of moral keenness among 'good' people as seen in their attitude and action on public questions.<sup>6</sup>

-----  
(continued from page 67)

(e) cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio,  
"Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:470)

1 (a) cf. Gilbert, Supt. Charles B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Reconstruction of the Grammar School Curriculum." (94:329)

(b) cf. Millsbaugh, J. F., Salt Lake City, Utah,  
"The Ethical Value of History in Elementary Schools." (96:410)

(c) cf. Dougherty, Newton C., School Superintendent, Peoria,  
Ill., "The Study of History in Our Public Schools." (97:66)

2 cf. DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa.,  
"Moral Training through the Common Branches." (94:168)

3 cf. Phillips, Supt. J. H., Birmingham, Ala.,  
"History and Literature in Grammar Grades." (92:608)

4 (a) cf. Andrews, Charles M., History Professor, Bryn Mawr College, Pa., "History as an Aid to Moral Culture." (94:398-409)

(b) cf. Bellamy, Francis, Editor Youth's Companion,  
Discussion- "History as an Aid to Moral Culture." (94:410-411)

5 cf. Baker, James H., Boulder, Colo.,  
Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:446)

6 cf. Reunds, C. C., Plymouth, N. H.,  
Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:444)

5. Music.

Judged by the amount of reference made to it, music ranked next to literature and history in importance in the field of scholastic moral training. It was first mentioned in 1885 and frequently thereafter. Music had an advantage even over literature and history in that its appeal was less dependent on a person's culture in other respects, and was universal to all kinds of people and all phases of life.<sup>1</sup> Certain educators positively termed it the most potent and ennobling of all school influences, and a satisfaction of needs met by no other school exercise.<sup>2</sup> Others called attention to the favor in which music as a moral power had been held by leaders as far back

- 
- 1 (a) cf. Hagar, Daniel B., Ph.D., Salem, Mass.,  
Address as President of Department of Music Education. (85:373)
- (b) cf. Elwood, J. H., San Jose, Cal.,  
"Elementary Music in Our Public Schools." (88:653)
- (c) cf. Winship, A. E., Boston, Mass., "The Relation of  
Music Instruction to Our Educational System." (89:694)
- 2 (a) cf. Mowry, William A., Boston, Mass.,  
"The Province of Music in Education." (89:678,679)
- (b) cf. Morris, Margaret, Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Music as a Factor in Education." (90:817)
- (c) cf. Silver, Edgar O., Massachusetts,  
"The Growth of Music among the People." (91:818)
- (d) cf. Jones, L. H., School Superintendent, Indianapolis, Ind.,  
Discussion- "Essentials in a Course of Study for Children." (93:260)
- (e) cf. Stewart, N. Coe, Cleveland, Ohio, "Some Helpful Things  
Concerning Music in the Public Schools." Abstract. (94:954)
- (f) cf. Treudley, F., Youngstown, Ohio,  
"The Purpose of Music Study in the Public Schools." (95:773)
- (g) cf. Gantvoort, Prof. A. J., College of Music, Cincinnati,  
O., "The Influence of Music and Music Study upon Character." (98:395)
- (h) cf. Winship, Dr. A. E., Editor "Journal of Education",  
Boston, Mass., "School Music in Character Making." (98:848)
- (i) cf. Hayden, P. C., Quincy, Ill., President Music Department,  
"The Ultimate Object of Music Study in the Schools." (99:974)

as Plato,<sup>1</sup> and in which it was held then as shown by a questionnaire.<sup>2</sup> One of its chief features, as pointed out by Frank Damrosch of the famous musical family, was that its influence was spontaneous and unconsciously received, and hence not subject to the difficulties involved in many other subjects.<sup>3</sup>

#### 6. Art (drawing, painting, etc.)

Like its sister subject music, this form of art was not mentioned in connection with morals until 1885. The ideas advanced in this connection followed similar lines. Love of the beautiful led to the good and prevented the development of evil, wherefore it could be and actually had been of real moral value in education.<sup>4</sup>

-----

1 cf. Young, George C., Wichita, Kan., "The Value of Music in Public Education as a Means of Discipline and Culture." (92:515-518)

2 cf. Pulsifer, W. E., New York City, Discussion- "The Value of Music in Public Education as a Means of Discipline and Culture." (92:520-524)

3 (a) cf. Damrosch, Frank, New York City, "How Good Music Makes Good Citizens." (96:725-726)

(b) cf. MacKenzie, Constance, Public Kindergarten Director, Philadelphia, "The Song in the Kindergarten — Its Place, Value, and the Dramatic Element." (93:333)

(c) cf. Hawn, Miss Linn Marie, Saginaw, Mich., "Children's Voices." (95:793)

4 (a) cf. Dimmock, Mrs. E. F., Drawing Supervisor, Chicago Schools, "Drawing in Primary and Grammar Schools." (85:285)

(b) cf. Laughlin, Ada M., St. Paul, Minn., "The Moral Value of Art Education." (90:144-146)

(c) cf. Macalister, James, President Drexel Institute of Art, Science, and Industry, "Art Education in the Public Schools." (91:460)

(d) cf. Aborn, Frank, Director of Drawing, Cleveland, Ohio, "The Highest Office of Drawing." (91:478)

(e) cf. Sullivan, Christine, Cincinnati, Ohio, "The Aim of Art Instruction." (92:501)

(f) cf. Same authority, as President Art Department, "Art Education - Its Influence: Industrial, Educational, Ethical." (94:899)

(g) cf. Clark, John S., Boston, "The Place of Art Education in General Education." (95:832)

The experiment had been tried in several cities of showing great and good works of art where slum dwellers might see them and the results had been beneficial beyond all expectation.<sup>1</sup>

#### 7. Natural Science.

Suggestions as to the moral uses of science study were confined to the last decade of the century. Science as we know it today was a new study just beginning to demand a place in the curriculum and could not have had earlier mention. In the first place nature study aroused a sympathy for life outside of self,<sup>2</sup> it decreased cruelty to animals and to others,<sup>3</sup> and led beyond that to reverence for God.<sup>4</sup> It showed the meaning and value of the discipline of law and effort<sup>5</sup> to man as a part of the universe.<sup>6</sup> An early-found love of nature was noted as an important influence in many great lives.<sup>7</sup> The fact that natural science also involved much objective activity

---

1 cf. Partridge, William Ordway, Boston, Mass., "The Function of Art in the Education of the American Citizen." (98:829)

2 cf. Lange, D., Nature Study Supervisor in City Schools, St. Paul, Minn., "Nature Study in the Public Schools." (00:409)

3 cf. DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "Moral Training through the Common Branches." (94:170)

4 (a) cf. Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:135)

(b) cf. Gilbert, Supt. Charles B., St. Paul, Minn., "The Reconstruction of the Grammar School Curriculum." (94:328)

5 cf. Brumbaugh, M. G., President Juniata College, Huntingdon, Pa., "The Function of Nature in Elementary Education." (96:149)

6 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:473)

7 cf. Hoyt, Supt. W. A., Brookfield, Mass., "Children's Love of Nature." (94:1010-1013)

made it a valuable moral discipline according to President Jordan of Stanford University.<sup>1</sup> However, this study would not develop moral value unless definitely purposed,<sup>2</sup> and here it is interesting to note that criticism of the materialistic effect of science teaching, so frequent since, had already begun, teacher and method, not subject, being condemned for such a result.<sup>3</sup>

#### 8. Manual Training.

Manual work, another newcomer in up-to-date education, was most commended as a moral force because it provided activity,<sup>4</sup> taught skill, accuracy, and honest work habits, and so served to prevent criminal development.<sup>5</sup> Negatively, by preoccupying muscles and

---

1 cf. Jordan, David Starr, President Leland Stanford University, Cal., "Nature Study and Moral Culture." (96:130)

2 cf. Stickney, Lucia, Cincinnati, Ohio, "The Incidental Method of Moral Instruction." (96:414)

3 cf. Palmer, Charles S., Boulder, Colo., Remarks in the Minutes of the Department of Natural Science. (95:957)

4 cf. Tadd, J. Liberty, Director Public Industrial Art School, Philadelphia, Pa., "Manual Training Methods in Philadelphia Public Schools." (94:890)

5 (a) cf. Fairchild, Prof. George T., (not placed) "Systematic Manual Labor in Industrial Education." (77:225)

(b) cf. Adler, Prof. Felix, "Technical and Art Education in Public Schools, as Elements of Culture." (84:312,313)

(c) cf. Crawford, T. O., Oakland, Cal., "The Educational Power and the Utility of Industrial Education and of Manual Training in Our Grammar Schools." (88:581)

(d) cf. Thompson, L. S., Lafayette, Ind., Discussion of preceding subject. (88:582)

(e) cf. Laughlin, Ada M., St. Paul, Minn., "The Moral Value of Art Education." (90:143)

(f) cf. Leipziger, Dr. Henry W., New York City, "Education as Affected by Manual Training." (92:442)

(g) cf. Trybom, J. H., Horace Mann School, Boston, Mass., "Sloyd as an Educational Subject." (92:460)

(continued on page 73)

mind<sup>1</sup> and thus decreasing idleness it served the same purpose.<sup>2</sup>

### 9. Commercial Training.

Business training in its accounting courses emphasized exactness and the perfect balancing of rights and obligations. Almost right was not right.<sup>3</sup> This would continuously present an important moral lesson. Furthermore, ethics itself was so naturally a part of all business that courses therein had great moral possibilities.<sup>4</sup>

### 10. Mathematics.

For reasons similar to those just stated mathematics also had moral value. In algebra and geometry there was no middle ground between right and wrong.<sup>5</sup> Mathematics (and grammar also) taught ha-

-----  
(continued from page 72)

(h) cf. Keyes, Charles H., Throop Polytechnic Institute, Pasadena, "The Modifications of Secondary School Courses Most Demanded by the Conditions of Today, and Most Ignored by the Committee of Ten." (95:738)

1 cf. Carroll, Supt. C. F., Worcester, Mass., "Manual Training and the Course of Study." (96:782)

2 cf. Robinson, Albert R., Principal Chicago English High and Manual Training School, "Industrial Education a Necessity of the Times." (95:743)

3 (a) cf. Gallagher, R. E., Hamilton, Ontario, "The Higher Aspects of Business Education." Abstract. (93:796-797)

(b) cf. Osborn, A. S., Rochester, N. Y., "The Disciplinary Value of the Business Course of Study." (94:993)

4 (a) cf. Springer, D. W., Ann Arbor, Mich., "Ethical Side of Business Training." (95:890)

(b) cf. Gage, Lyman J., United States Secretary of Treasury, "Reasonable Expectations Concerning Business Education." (98:866)

(c) cf. Stevenson, W. C., Bookkeeping and Penmanship Department, State Normal School, Emporia, Kan., "The Advent of the Commercial High School." (99:1029-1030)

5 cf. Karnes, Matilda T., Buffalo, N. Y., "Geometry in Our Schools." (91:653)

bits of accuracy and insistence on getting right results by honest methods.<sup>1</sup> Such considerations are indeed of moral importance.

#### 11. Physical Culture and Play.

This subject was not mentioned for its moral worth until as late as 1895. The school up to that time assumed little care for health and bodily development, but its moral importance speedily developed. A healthy body related closely to good conduct<sup>2</sup> and the fact that a majority of reformatory inmates were physically defective emphasized the point.<sup>3</sup> Physical exercise gave needed release to energy which if not beneficially expended found mischievous outlets. The necessity for precision, obedience, co-operation, and quick thinking in drills and games provided essential moral training of the highest value<sup>4</sup> which the teacher could utilize in many ways.

-----

1 (a) cf. DeGarme, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "Moral Training through the Common Branches." (94:170)

(b) cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:473)

2 cf. Hughes, James L., Public School Inspector, Toronto, "Physical Training as a Factor in Character Building." (96:911-917)

3 cf. Taylor, Henry Ling, M.D., New York City, "Exercise and Vigor." (98:939)

4 (a) cf. Hermanns, Edward F., High School Principal, Denver, Colo., "Physical Training." (95:67)

(b) cf. Kimberlin, Miss N. D., Detroit, "Physical Training in Public Schools." (95:947)

(c) cf. Felker, Allie M., State Normal School, San Jose, Cal., "Play as a Means for Idealizing and Extending the Child's Experience." (98:624,625)

(d) cf. Johnson, George E., School Superintendent, Andover, Mass., "Play in Physical Education." (98:954)

## 12. Sociology.

In the period under discussion an extended mention of sociology would not be expected, for the first scientific text-books on the subject were being written as the period closed. It did not become a part of the regular curriculum until well into the new century. Even so, in 1895 "the new science of sociology" was mentioned as the coming study, with the prediction that future education would be dominantly "sociological".<sup>1</sup> These statements were made in discussing the crowding out of ethical training for intellectual, and the resulting social disorders, which, it was said, the new social understanding would help to correct. In 1898 sociology was termed inevitably a character-building study.<sup>2</sup> The first prediction came true, but the tremendous material progress since then has kept society well supplied with social and ethical problems in spite of all that social science has unquestionably done.

### B. School Atmosphere.

Whatever the curricular strength of the school its atmosphere and discipline were considered concerns of graver import<sup>3</sup> to

1 cf. Mathews, B. C., High School Principal, Newark,  
"Ethical Instruction through Sociology." (95:627-628)

2 cf. Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio,  
"Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:474-475)

3 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:17)

(b) cf. Johnston, William P., President Tulane University,  
New Orleans, La., "Education in Louisiana." (86:187)

(c) cf. MacDonald, J. W., Stoneham, Mass.,  
"Educating the Whole Boy." (88:420)



the moral development of the pupils. Good atmosphere could do much with meager equipment, but the finest equipment could not atone for poor atmosphere. Everything about school life had moral value.<sup>1</sup> School should be a miniature of life<sup>2</sup> with the same standards as life outside<sup>3</sup> and connected intimately with that life in the immediate community.<sup>4</sup> Thus it would continually present life situations<sup>5</sup> which the teacher could use<sup>6</sup> and by which the students learned by doing, not merely by being told.<sup>7</sup> Special lessons, the weakest method, would then be scarcely necessary.<sup>8</sup> The old "no lickin", no larnin'"

-----

- 1 (a) cf. Conway, Clara, Memphis, Tenn.,  
 "The Child's Environment." (85:110)  
 (b) cf. Thurber, Samuel, Milton, Mass., "The Order and Relation of Studies in the High School Course." (87:431)

- 2 cf. Committee on Pedagogics,  
 Report- "The Function of the Public School." (87:276)

- 3 cf. Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
 "The Ethics of School Management." (88:538)

- 4 cf. Thompson, Rev. Robert E., (not placed)  
 "The Neighborhood as a Starting-Point in Education." (79:35)

- 5 cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
 "The Public Schools and Morality." (85:86)

- 6 cf. Singer, Edgar A., Philadelphia, Pa.,  
 "What Constitutes a Practical Course of Study?" (80:117,125)

- 7 (a) cf. Calkins, N. A., Assistant Superintendent Public Schools, New York City, "The Teacher's Work in the Development of Mental and Moral Power." (81:76)

- (b) cf. Wheelock, Lucy, Boston, "Ideal Relation of Kindergarten to Primary Schools." Abstract. (94:703)

- (c) cf. Storm, A. V., Storm Lake, Iowa,  
 "Discipline as the Result of Self Government." (94:769)

- 8 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
 "Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School." (80:10)

- (b) cf. Cook, J. W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment." (88:132)

idea was in disrepute<sup>1</sup> as was the idea that being good meant not to be bad.<sup>2</sup> In such an atmosphere each study would touch life and enhance moral development.<sup>3</sup> The better the spirit of the school, the more discipline merged into the general atmosphere. Its moral value depended on certain qualities which we will list in outline:

# 1. Qualities of Right Discipline.

- a. A means, not an end;<sup>4</sup>
- b. Stimulating, not a mechanical curb;<sup>5</sup>  
Enthusiasm, spontaneity, through interest;<sup>6</sup>  
As much freedom as possible, few rules;<sup>7</sup>

-----

1 cf. Storm, A. V., Storm Lake, Iowa,  
"Discipline as the Result of Self Government." (94:765)

2 (a) cf. Halleck, Reuben Post, Louisville, Ky., "Some Contributions of Child-Study to the Science of Education." (98:361)

(b) cf. Gregory, B. C., School Supervisor, Trenton, N. J.,  
"Social Co-operation." (98:657)

3 (a) cf. Soldan, F. Louis, Ph.D., President St. Louis Normal School, "Outline of a Philosophy of Education." (87:78)

(b) cf. DeGarmo, Charles, Normal, Ill.,  
"Relation of Instruction to Will-Training." (90:123,125)

4 cf. Committee on Elementary Education,  
Report- "Essentials in Elementary Education." (90:351)

5 cf. Wiggins, B. L., University of the South, Tennessee,  
"Forms of Discipline and Discipline of Forms." (90:98,102,105)

6 (a) cf. Hyde, Ellen, Principal Normal School, Framingham, Mass., "How Can Character Be Symmetrically Developed?" (80:220)

(b) cf. Reference 3-a, page 76. (87:76)

(c) cf. Harris, W. T., President School of Philosophy, Concord, Mass., Discussion- "The Psychological and Pedagogical Value of the Modern Methods of Elementary Culture." (87:90,91)

(d) cf. Reference 3-b, page 123. (90:123)

7 (a) cf. Rivers, Rev. R. H., D.D., Martin College, Pulaski, Tenn., "Moral Training." (77:184)

(b) cf. Reference 6-a, page 216. (80:216)

(c) cf. Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Ethics of School Management." (88:529)

- Proper stimuli to study and do right, no sham;<sup>1</sup>  
 Punishment just, uniform, remedial, not humiliating;<sup>2</sup>
- c. Through will training;<sup>3</sup>  
 By moral sense, not by force;<sup>4</sup>  
 'Is it right' not 'what will people say';<sup>5</sup>
- d. Aimed at self-control, self-government, responsibility;<sup>6</sup>  
 Prepared to go out from under authority.<sup>7</sup>

-----

1 cf. Harrington, Henry F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass.,  
 "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:225)

2 (a) cf. Brown, Duncan, Highland, Kansas,  
 "The Discipline Most Valuable to this End." (Citizenship) (88:110)  
 (b) cf. Barnes, Earl, Leland Stanford University,  
 "Punishment as Seen by Children." (95:914,923)

3 (a) cf. Harris, W. T., LL.D., Concord, Mass.,  
 "Psychological Inquiry." (85:101)  
 (b) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:130,131)  
 (c) cf. Gilbert, G. B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
 "The Ethics of School Management." (88:531)

4 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 "Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:18)  
 (b) cf. Ruffner, W. H., (not placed)  
 "The Moral Element in Primary Education." (76:43)  
 (c) cf. Soldan, F. Louis, Ph.D., President St. Louis Normal  
 School, "Outline of a Philosophy of Education." (87:76)  
 (d) cf. Reference 3-c, page 532. (88:532)  
 (e) cf. Dutton, Bettie A., Cleveland, Ohio,  
 "Discipline in Elementary Schools." (89:488)  
 (f) cf. Committee on Elementary Education,  
 Report- "Essentials in Elementary Education." (90:351)

5 cf. Hyde, Ellen, Principal Normal School, Framingham, Mass.,  
 "How Can Character Be Symmetrically Developed?" (80:215,216)

6 (a) cf. Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Ky.,  
 "Full-Orbed Education." (75:57)  
 (b) cf. Hinsdale, B. A., School Superintendent, Cleveland,  
 Ohio, "The Constant in Education." (84:150)  
 (c) cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
 "The Public Schools and Morality." (85:85)  
 (d) cf. Reference 3-c, page 540. (88:540)  
 (e) cf. Reference 4-e. (89:488)  
 (f) cf. DeGarmo, Charles, Normal, Ill.,  
 "Relation of Instruction to Will-Training." (90:118)

(continued on page 79)

## 2. Qualities of Wrong Discipline.

- a. Too much authority, slavish discipline and order,  
constant watching, threats, and severity;<sup>1</sup>  
More emphasis on what is bad than on what is good;<sup>2</sup>  
Mechanical, too many rules;<sup>3</sup>  
Vengeful or humiliating punishment;<sup>4</sup>  
Attitude of expecting students to do wrong;<sup>5</sup>

-----  
(continued from page 78)

(g) cf. Hughes, Inspector James L., Toronto, Ontario,  
"The Harmony between Control and Spontaneity." (92:189)

(h) cf. Storm, A. V., Storm Lake, Iowa,  
"Discipline as the Result of Self Government." (94:768)

7 cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School." (86:130,131)

1 (a) cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools." (72:18)

(b) cf. Harrington, Henry F., Superintendent New Bedford, Mass.,  
"What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:225)

(c) cf. Hyde, Ellen, Principal Normal School, Framingham, Mass.,  
"How Can Character Be Symmetrically Developed?" (80:214,215,216,218)

(d) cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
"The Public Schools and Morality." (85:86)

(e) cf. Brown, Duncan, Highland, Kansas,  
"The Discipline Most Valuable to this End." (Citizenship) (88:104)

(f) cf. Gilbert, G. B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Ethics of School Management." (88:532)

(g) cf. Dutton, Bettie A., Cleveland, Ohio,  
"Discipline in Elementary Schools." (89:488)

(h) cf. Canfield, Chancellor James H., Lincoln, Nebr.,  
"Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:115)

(i) cf. Hughes, Inspector James L., Toronto, Ontario,  
"The Harmony between Control and Spontaneity." (92:189)

(j) cf. Storm, A. V., Storm Lake, Iowa,  
"Discipline as the Result of Self Government." (94:769)

2 cf. Gregory, B. C., School Supervisor, Trenton, N. J.,  
"Social Co-operation." (98:657)

3 (a) cf. Rivers, Rev. R. H., D.D., Martin College, Pulaski,  
Tenn., "Moral Training." (77:184)

(b) cf. Wiggins, B. L., University of the South, Tennessee,  
"Forms of Discipline and Discipline of Forms." (90:98,102)

4 cf. Reference 1-e, page 110. (88:110)

5 cf. Reference 1-i, page 190. (92:190)

- b. School standards unlike those for life outside;<sup>1</sup>
- c. Teachers take the place of moral sense,<sup>2</sup>  
force obedience just to be obeyed;
- d. Sham - showing off for visitors;<sup>3</sup>  
working for grades, prizes, privileges, etc.;<sup>4</sup>  
statistical atmosphere, grades, demerits, exams;<sup>5</sup>
- e. Teacher poses as infallible, intellectual dishonesty;<sup>6</sup>  
inconsistent with own teaching, moral dishonesty;<sup>7</sup>
- f. Work made too easy, no challenge.<sup>8</sup>

-----

- 1 cf. Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Ethics of School Management." (88:529)
- 2 (a) cf. Ruffner, W. H., (not placed)  
"The Moral Element in Primary Education." (76:43)  
(b) cf. Reference 1, page 530. (88:530)  
(c) cf. Dutton, Bettie A., Cleveland, Ohio,  
"Discipline in Elementary Schools." (89:488)  
(d) cf. Hughes, Inspector James L., Toronto, Ontario,  
"The Harmony between Control and Spontaneity." (92:190)
- 3 cf. Hyde, Ellen, Principal Normal School, Framingham, Mass.,  
"How Can Character Be Symmetrically Developed?" (80:217)
- 4 (a) cf. Bittinger, Rev. J. B., Sewickly, Pa.,  
"Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime." (75:118,119)  
(b) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School." (86:132)  
(c) cf. Allyn, Rev. Robert, D.D., Carbondale, Ill., "The Importance of Religious Motives and Sanctions in Moral Training." (87:390)  
(d) cf. Canfield, Chancellor James H., Lincoln, Nebr.,  
"Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:115)
- 5 (a) cf. Reference 3, page 215. (80:215)  
(b) cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart." (83:30)  
(c) cf. Gregory, B. C., School Supervisor, Trenton, N. J.,  
"Social Co-operation." (98:659-660)
- 6 (a) cf. Reference 3. (80:217)  
(b) cf. Wiggins, B. L., University of the South, Tennessee,  
"Forms of Discipline and Discipline of Forms." (90:104)
- 7 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
"The New Teacher in New America." (79:64,65)

(continued on page 81)

C. The Personality of the Teacher.

Thus far in this chapter we have found that regular school subjects had moral possibilities but that these would not be realized without a teacher who aimed to do so; and that the daily life and atmosphere of the classroom was a continuous school of morals, for good or ill, depending on the teacher. Coming finally to the person of the teacher we are not surprised that teacher character was the most unanimously attested influence in this study.

When his daughter asked him what she should study, the philosopher Emerson answered that "it mattered little what she studied, but everything with whom she studied",<sup>1</sup> and the Committee on Pedagogy for 1891 stated in its report that "the pressing need of the schools is a large number of teachers possessed of a moral earnestness and of sufficient intelligence to make it effective".<sup>2</sup>

Teacher character fixed the moral plane of the school<sup>3</sup> and

-----  
(continued from page 80)

8 (a) cf. Dickinson, J. W., Secretary State Board of Education, Mass., "Results of Methods of Teaching." (80:99)

(b) cf. Tedd, Samuel B., Sterling, Kansas, "Necessity and Means of Developing Individuality." (91:670)

1 cf. Dewd, John W., Toledo, Ohio, "Education of the Sensibilities." (81:232,235)

2 Committee on Pedagogy, Report- "The Education of the Will." (91:343)

3 (a) cf. Harrington, H. F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass., "What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?" (73:226)

(b) cf. McLellan, J. A., Principal Ontario School of Pedagogy, Toronto, "The Ethical Element in Literature, and How to Make the Most of It in Teaching." (94:77)

(c) cf. Davis, Emma C., Superintendent Primary Instruction, Cleveland, O., "The Ideal Primary School Curriculum." (94:728)

provided a continuous and inescapable lesson in morality<sup>1</sup> which was more important than mere precepts<sup>2</sup> and even vied with the home in influence.<sup>3</sup> Acting indirectly but purposely through every study and activity<sup>4</sup> it was more influential than formal lessons<sup>5</sup> and really made them unnecessary.<sup>6</sup> This type of character did not imply mere brilliancy<sup>7</sup> nor rigid and narrow piety.<sup>8</sup> The teacher had to be

-----

- 1 (a) cf. Conway, Clara, Memphis, Tenn.,  
"The Child's Environment." (85:111)  
(b) cf. Williams, Mrs. Delia Lathrop, Delaware, Ohio,  
"Ethical Culture in Elementary and Secondary School." (92:104-105)
- 2 (a) cf. Calkins, N. A., Assistant Superintendent Public Schools,  
New York City, "The Teacher's Work in the Development of Mental  
and Moral Power." (81:75)  
(b) cf. Raab, Henry A., State Superintendent Public Instruc-  
tion, Illinois, "Primary Education: What and How?" (83:17)  
(c) cf. Preston, J. R., State Superintendent Public Instruc-  
tion, Jackson, Miss., "Teaching Patriotism." (91:107)  
(d) cf. Canfield, Chancellor James H., Lincoln, Nebr.,  
"Ethical Culture in the College and University." (92:114)  
(e) cf. Sabin, Henry, Des Moines, Iowa,  
Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:445)
- 3 (a) cf. Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart." (83:29,32)  
(b) cf. Gates, President Merrill E., Amherst, Mass.,  
"The Profession of Teaching for Light and Power." (91:181)
- 4 cf. Bellamy, Francis, Editor 'Youth's Companion',  
Discussion- "History as an Aid to Moral Culture." (94:411)
- 5 (a) cf. Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
"The Public Schools and Morality." (85:87,90)  
(b) cf. Committee of National Council on Rural Schools,  
Report- "Intellectual and Moral Education." (97:582)
- 6 cf. MacDonald, J. W., Stoneham, Mass.,  
"Educating the Whole Boy." (88:421)
- 7 cf. Blackinton, J. F., Boston, Mass.,  
"Silent Forces in Education." News report. (77:20)
- 8 cf. Bartholomew, E. F., Rock Island, Ill.,  
"The Spiritual Element in Education." (90:696)

everything that the pupils ought to be.<sup>1</sup> Many, including President Angell of Michigan University, testified to the absolute supremacy of the teacher as a moral influence.<sup>2</sup> Wherefore one realizes that, regardless of law, it would be impossible to make the schoolrooms of America non-religious as long as the teachers are religious at heart.<sup>3</sup> One speaker blamed the whole sectarian squabble on the teachers whose lives were inconsistent with the Bible that they read and taught.<sup>4</sup> This puts the responsibility for paganized schools, if such there be, upon those who hired the teachers, and who were supposed to represent community opinion in the matter.

-----

1 (a) cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C., Discussion-  
"State Supervision: What Plan of Organization and Administration  
is Most Effective?" (90:446)

(b) cf. Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Ill.,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve?" (71:70,76)

(c) cf. Steere, E. A., Butte City, Mont.,  
"The High School as a Factor in Mass Education." (90:647)

2 (a) cf. Rivers, Rev. R. H., D.D., Martin College, Pulaski,  
Tenn., "Moral Training." (77:181)

(b) cf. White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral Training in the Public School." (86:138)

(c) cf. Angell, J. B., President Michigan State University,  
"The Relation of the Christian College." (87:177)

(d) cf. Jones, Supt. L. H., Indianapolis, Ind.,  
"The School and the Criminal." (92:213)

(e) cf. Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools." (95:445)

(f) cf. Nightingale, A. F., Superintendent, Chicago, Ill.,  
Discussion- "Ethical Instruction through Sociology." (95:632)

(g) cf. Seovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University,  
Ohio, "Realizing Our Final Aim in Education." (98:482)

3 (a) cf. Stern, Prof. D. W., Madison, Wis.,  
Discussion- "Moral Training in the Public School." (86:140)

(b) cf. Allyn, Rev. Robert, D.D., Carbondale, Ill., "The Importance of Religious Motives and Sanctions in Moral Training."  
(87:388-391)

4 cf. Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
"The New Teacher in New America." (79:64,65)



An amusing reflection on the attitude toward teachers four centuries ago came in a quotation from Roger Ascham:<sup>1</sup>

"And it is a pity that commonly more care is had, yea, and that among wise men, to find out rather a cunning man for their Horse than a cunning man for their children. For to one they will generally give a Stipend of two hundred Crowns by the year, and are loth to offer the other two hundred Shillings. God that sitteth in Heaven laugheth their choice to scorn and rewardeth their liberality as it should. For he suffereth them to have tame and well ordered Horses, but wild and unfortunate children; and, therefore, in the end they find more Pleasure in their Horse than Comfort in their children."

#### D. Summary.

In this last chapter we come to the actual ways and means of developing moral power in education. The interest in the moral values and implications of public education in the period under consideration was an increasing one, judged by the relative amount of attention the subject received. It was a period of educational expansion and the addition of new subjects to the curriculum. Both old and new subjects were frequently measured relative to their moral potential and it appears to have been a most complimentary thing to say, that a subject had moral value. The teacher also was more and more discussed from the standpoint of moral influence. It is interesting to note that this tendency to give morals more attention paralleled the increasing secularization. Education characteristically was adjusting itself to the change and attempting to conserve its purpose.

---

<sup>1</sup> Brown, George P., State Normal School, Terre Haute, Ind., "Some of the Obstructions, Natural and Interposed, that Resist the Formation and Growth of the Pedagogic Profession." (80:188)

Our study shows that educators considered moral values inherent in the principal factors in public education — studies, methods, teachers. Wherefore it would be more difficult to attempt to carry on a distorted education devoid of moral features than to allow them their proper place and use them accordingly. In reality morals were inseparable from the educational agencies and the attempt to part them would have, not a non-moral, but an anti-moral, an immoral result. The unconscious and informal influences of the school room could not be neutral, if they were not good, they were bad.

The teacher was the key to any situation. Even with fullest freedom to use the Bible and religion, an unwise and inconsistent teacher would wield a harmful influence, while, where all direct moral training was denied, a wise and sincere teacher would produce moral uplift. This did not mean that subjects were of no value but rather that prohibition of moral training as such could not actually eliminate it though it might change its apparent mode of activity.

Considering our own times in the light of these facts we conclude that in most cases the moral possibilities, the character-building factors in the regular school set-up are not utilized fully. Many feel today that 'moral' and 'academic' are separate ideas and that moral work should be done only by the church. This study indicates, however, that moral tuition is necessary, logical, and has practically unlimited possibilities of development in our public schools today for those who are willing to see and use them.

## **CHAPTER V**

## **CONCLUSION**

## CHAPTER V

### CONCLUSION

#### A. Summary.

We have been examining a most important segment of United States history extending from 1871, that is shortly after the Civil War, until the end of the century. Great problems faced the educators of the period, prominent among which were those related to the great foundational principles of the nation. United States citizens in general believed in the wisdom of the political doctrine of the separation of church and state, yet a movement born of that very idea was slowly secularizing public school education, and to certain educators it seemed a deliberately guided plan to remove from education its most indispensable features. This trend was assisted by the great industrial expansion which was also something in which Americans took pride. The fact that the problem grew out of such sources made it a delicate and difficult one with which to deal. National principles and progress should not be unpatriotically called in question and yet the well-being of education seemed at stake.

Great social movements are impersonal, though made up of individuals. There was no plot to de-religionize or de-moralize the school, rather it was the inevitable inter-play of complex social forces. Nothing is so powerful as an idea in its time. The secularizing movement went on, but education did not break down as some

had feared. Educators found within the existing program latent moral possibilities heretofore undeveloped as well as new features to be added. Thus, while in many cases the school work became completely secularized in outward form, it retained much, if not all, of its moral power in communities and under teachers that wished to retain it. This tendency of education to adapt itself resembles the power of the body to heal injuries, knit broken bones, and build up disease resistance. Education, however, is not a thing-in-itself, it is just what educators and public make it, whence its development was, and is, due to their intelligent and vigilant interest.

Education today faces similar problems, in fact many of the same problems continue to the present. Principal among them is that of keeping up and improving moral tone in public school. The question naturally arises as to why education has not settled this problem by this time, if it is so adaptable and efficient. Had society in other respects moved moderately it might have the situation well in hand, but there ensued a period of material expansion and social and political change surpassing anything imagined a few decades ago. Times of expansion are not good times for education, for, as they multiply its problems, they also multiply distractions which delay solution of the problems. Hence education faces bigger, and we may say graver, moral problems today than ever before. What were national questions a few years ago are world questions today. A study such as this, however, brings encouraging evidence that education will not fail in its task.

In view of national and world conditions the need for moral education through the public school is greater than ever. Citizens

are needed who can understand moral issues clearly and know how to live and vote on the right side of public questions. Leaders are needed who will work for the good of all and not for selfish gain.

Religious education, it is true, has developed a program reaching far beyond the old Sunday School idea, but it remains largely a church matter, and half of the people of the United States are not touched directly by the church. Therefore, the task of giving these people the best moral understanding possible, if only for purposes of national safety, must be shared by the public school.

#### B. Conclusions.

Education must be moral to be truly educative and moral education depends ultimately upon religious sanctions for authority. We shall not repeat here the arguments of Chapter III, summarized at its close, except to say that philosophy, science, and social experience support the idea. Moral education does not mean to moralize tediously and naggingly on every occasion. Bringing in religious sanction does not mean making a church out of the school, preaching sermons, arguing theology and sectarian questions, and the like. The mention of God as a reality, as a person, as creator and thus vitally connected with all the facts learned in school, as good and the source of goodness, should find no objection anywhere, except with outright atheists, and would do much to banish the specter of godlessness which is said to haunt public education.

The supremacy of the Bible, properly used, in the field of moral education is sustained, in so far as it has been touched, by

this investigation. Many advocated its use in the public schools in spite of opposition, pleading the logic of the case. Objections, as expressed, were in no case against the Bible itself but against the difficulties, imagined or otherwise, which attended its use. Its acceptance was, and is, a matter of public opinion in each school situation, hence its varied use, extending from reading without comment to regular courses. No doubt there are many situations where it could be used without objection but is not. Huxley wanted his children in a school where the Bible was not excluded even though they might be taught some ideas with which he did not personally agree. We remark again our surprise that the matter of having interesting Bible courses was not brought out. Such courses, as interesting from several angles as any in the curriculum, are a fact. It is a weakness to employ the Bible simply as a moral tool, because it thus loses its vital connection with the various aspects of life and so ceases to be effective even as a tool.

The value of moral instruction in addition to the Bible and especially in its absence is unquestioned. This was unanimously attested as the chief end of education, and must be realized above all else. Direct instruction through a course such as ethics is of great worth, presenting the 'what' and the 'why' of right living. Many people fail, not through intention, but through ignorance.

The whole curriculum, and especially such fundamental studies as literature and history, provide a way of moral tuition of great effectiveness and yet not subject to the opposition given other means. These possibilities should be used whether the Bible or

other direct training is provided or not. We believe, in the light of this investigation, and in view of American principles and of present controlling influences in education, that the need for moral training in the public school is the great educational challenge of the day. It is quite neglected. We have never heard of a normal training course to this end. The educators of our period noted this lack and we believe it still exists. We have never heard of a book particularly on this subject. There may be such but they are scarce. Some teachers avail themselves of opportunities in this respect, but it is entirely a matter of personal initiative and lacks organization and definite direction. In view of the constant cry that our society is lacking in moral fiber, in view of the menace to the nation thus existing, and in view of the responsibility of public education in the matter of national morality, this crucial problem demands concentrated action in a field of great potential effectiveness.

The teacher is the all-important factor in the work of moral training. The above results will not be realized apart from the teacher. The best courses will fail of their purpose in the hands of incompetent instructors, while a determined and thoughtful teacher can accomplish much under difficulties. This is the most unanimously attested fact that we have considered. Teachers must be trained, they must have books to help them, they must be impressed with the moral need and the possibility of meeting it successfully. If these things are done, there is no question of the constructive power of education, and built thereby, of the future of the nation.



## **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Arranged according to date and page of the annual volumes of the Journal of the National Education Association.

The following data are not uniformly complete in every case but are given as found in the Journal.

Page 1871

- 36 Harris, William T., Superintendent Public Instruction,  
St. Louis, "The Education of Children at Public Cost."  
68 - 76 Kirk, Alfred, Chicago, Ill.,  
"What Moral Uses May a Recitation Be Made to Subserve."

1872

- 11 - 23 Mayo, Rev. A. D., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Methods of Moral Instruction in Common Schools."  
Discussion of same by:  
24 White, E. E., Columbus, O., Association President,  
24 - 25 Gregory, Dr. J. M., Illinois Industrial University,  
26 White, Joseph, Secretary State Board of Education, Mass.

1873

- 221-229 Harrington, Henry F., Superintendent, New Bedford, Mass.,  
"What Should Be the Leading Object of American Free Schools?"

1875

- 41 - 58 Buchanan, Dr. J. R., Louisville, Ky.,  
"Full-Orbed Education."  
116-121 Bittinger, Rev. J. B., Sewickly, Pa.,  
"Relation and Duties of Educators to Crime."  
Discussion of same by:  
121-122 Magoun, Dr. G. F., Iowa,  
122 Cornwall, A. R., Principal Albion Academy, Wisconsin,  
123 Ree, Alvan D., School Superintendent, Washington County,  
Minn.

1876

- 21 - 27 Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
 "The Demands of the Coming Century on the American Common School."  
 Discussion of same by:  
 29 Smart, James H., Indianapolis.
- 39 - 45 Ruffner, W. H., (not placed)  
 "The Moral Element in Primary Education."
- 171-186 Hoose, Dr. J. H., Principal State Normal, Cortland, N. Y.,  
 "What Is a School?"

1877

- 11 - 12 Newell, M. A., Superintendent Public Instruction, Maryland,  
 Address as President of the Association.
- 20 - 21 Blackinton, J. F., Boston, Mass.,  
 "Silent Forces in Education."
- 180-185 Rivers, Rev. R. H., D.D., Martin College, Pulaski, Tenn.,  
 "Moral Training."
- 225 Fairchild, Prof. George T., (not placed)  
 "Systematic Manual Labor in Industrial Education."

1879

- 9 Hancock, John, Dayton, Ohio,  
 Inaugural Address as President of the Association.
- 35 Thompson, Rev. Robert E., (not placed)  
 "The Neighborhood as a Starting-Point in Education."
- 64 - 66 Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
 "The New Teacher in New America."
- 72 Wickersham, J. P., Harrisburg, Pa.,  
 Discussion- "Education at Home and Abroad."
- 135-137 Brown, George P., President Elementary Department, Terre  
 Haute, Ind., "Culture in Elementary Schools."
- 152 Harris, W. T., LL.D., Superintendent Public Instruction,  
 St. Louis, Mo., "Relations of the Kindergarten to the School."  
 Discussion of same by:  
 161-162 Partridge, Lelia E., Philadelphia, Pa.,
- 167-169(supp.) Smart, James H., Indianapolis, Ind.,  
 "The High School Question."

1880

- 6 - 17 Mayo, Rev. A. D., Springfield, Mass.,  
"Object Lessons in Moral Instruction in the Common School."
- 40 Marble, Albert P., Superintendent Public Schools, Worcester, Mass., "The Unattainable in Public School Education."
- 99 - 101 Dickinson, J. W., Secretary State Board of Education, Mass.,  
"Results of Methods of Teaching."
- 109-125 Singer, Edgar A., Philadelphia, Pa.,  
"What Constitutes a Practical Course of Study?"
- 188 Brown, George P., State Normal School, Terre Haute, Ind.,  
"Some of the Obstructions, Natural and Interposed, that Resist the Formation and Growth of the Pedagogic Profession."
- 213-220 Hyde, Ellen, Principal Framingham Normal School, Mass.,  
"How Can Character Be Symmetrically Developed?"

1881

- 36 - 40 Eaton, John, National Commissioner of Education,  
"Education and the Building of the State."
- 47 - 54 Wickersham, J. P., Harrisburg, Pa.,  
"Education and Crime."
- 70 - 76 Calkins, N. A., Assistant Superintendent Public Schools, New York City, "The Teacher's Work in the Development of Mental and Moral Power."
- 81 - 84 Newell, M. A., Baltimore, Md.,  
"Revision of the Common School Curriculum."
- 97 - 98 Wickersham, J. P., Harrisburg, Pa.,  
"The Leading Characteristics of American Systems of Public Education."
- 108-115 Peaslee, J. B., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Moral and Literary Training in the Public Schools."
- 145-156 Soldan, F. Louis, St. Louis, Mo.,  
"The Century and the School."
- 231-235 Dowd, John W., Toledo, Ohio,  
"Education of the Sensibilities."

1882

- 42 - 45 Folwell, William W., President Minnesota University,  
Minneapolis, "Secularization of Education." Abstract.

1883

- 15 - 17 Raab, Henry A., State Superintendent Public Instruction,  
Illinois, "Primary Education: What and How?"
- 25 - 34 Fick, Henry H., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"Education of the Heart."

1884

- 44 - 47 Bicknell, Thomas W., LL.D., Boston, Mass.,  
Address as President.
- 134-142 Kellogg, Mrs. Eva D., Boston, Mass.,  
"Needs in American Education."
- 147-152 Hinsdale, B. A., School Superintendent, Cleveland, Ohio,  
"The Constant in Education."
- 312-313 Adler, Prof. Felix, (not placed) "Technical and  
Art Education in Public Schools, as Elements of Culture."

1885

- 79 - 80 Morgan, Gen. Thomas J., Providence, R. I.,  
"The Ideal School Master."
- 81 - 90 Stearns, J. W., LL.D., Madison, Wis.,  
"The Public Schools and Morality."
- 101 Harris, W. T., LL.D., Concord, Mass.,  
"Psychological Inquiry."
- 110-113 Conway, Clara, Memphis, Tenn.,  
"The Child's Environment."
- 285 Dimmock, Mrs. E. F., Drawing Supervisor, Chicago Schools,  
"Drawing in Primary and Grammar Schools."
- 317-318 Meleney, Clarence E., School Superintendent, Paterson, N. J.,  
"The True Object of Early School Training."
- 373-374 Hagar, Daniel B., Ph.D., Salem, Mass.,  
Address as President of Department of Music Education.

1886

- 128-138 White, Dr. E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 "Moral Training in the Public School."  
 Discussion of same by:  
 139-141 Stern, Prof. D. W., Madison, Wis.,  
 141 Peaslee, Dr. J. B., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 143 Wiener, Prof., Kansas City, Mo.,  
 145 Kealing, H. F., Texas,  
 147 White, E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio.
- 186-188 Johnston, William Preston, President Tulane University,  
 New Orleans, "Education in Louisiana."

1887

- 74 - 79 Soldan, F. Louis, Ph.D., President St. Louis Normal School,  
 "Outline of a Philosophy of Education."
- 90 - 91 Harris, W. T., President Concord School of Philosophy, Mass.,  
 Discussion- "The Psychological and Pedagogical Value of  
 the Modern Methods of Elementary Culture."
- 132-133 Pickard, J. L., Professor of Political Science, Iowa State  
 University, "What Lessons Does the Ordinance (of 1787) Teach in  
 Regard to the Future Educational Policy of Our Government?"
- 152-156 Strong, Rev. James W., President Carleton College, North-  
 field, Minn., "The Relation of the Christian College."  
 Discussion of same by:  
 170-171 Price, Dr. G. W. F., Nashville, Tenn.,  
 177 Angell, J. B., President Michigan State University.
- 272-276 Committee on Pedagogics: Soldan, F. Louis, St. Louis, Mo.,  
 Hoose, James H., Cortland, N. Y., Report- "The Function of  
 the Public School."  
 Discussion of same by:  
 279 White, E. E., Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 279 Brown, George P., Bloomington, Ill.
- 346 Brown, Kate L., Boston, Mass.,  
 "Application of Froebel's Principles to the Primary Schools."
- 384-391 Allyn, Rev. Robert, D.D., Carbondale, Ill., "The Importance  
 of Religious Motives and Sanctions in Moral Training."
- 431 Thurber, Samuel, Milton, Mass.,  
 "The Order and Relation of Studies in the High School Course."
- 530 Cooper, Oscar H., Austin, Texas,  
 "The Superintendent and Good Literature in the Schools."  
 Discussion of same by:  
 537 Rickoff, Mrs. R. D., New York City.

1888

- 82 - 83 Beecher, Mary L., Memphis, Tenn.,  
 "The Practical Value in Life of a Taste for Good Literature."  
 Discussion of same by:
- 93 - 95 Parkinson, D. B., Carbondale, Ill.
- 104-110 Brown, Duncan, Highland, Kansas,  
 "The Discipline Most Valuable to This End." (citizenship)
- 113-114 Baldwin, Joseph, Huntsville, Texas, "The Culture Most  
 Valuable for Educating Law-abiding and Law-respecting Citizens."
- 114-120 Atkinson, George H., Portland, Oregon, "The Culture Most  
 Valuable to Prepare Law-abiding and Law-respecting Citizens."
- 128-135 Cook, John W., Normal, Ill., "The Schools Fail to  
 Teach Morality or to Cultivate the Religious Sentiment."  
 Discussion of same by:
- 156-158 Morgan, Thomas J., Providence, R. I.,  
 164 Campbell, Fred M., Oakland, Cal.
- 406-407 M'Chesney, J. B., Oakland, Cal.,  
 "Teaching English in the Secondary Schools."
- 415-421 MacDonald, J. W., Stoneham, Mass.,  
 "Educating the Whole Boy."
- 529-540 Gilbert, C. B., St. Paul, Minn.,  
 "The Ethics of School Management."
- 564-565 Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D.C., "The Relation of Indus-  
 trial to Intellectual and Moral Training in Our Public Schools."
- 581 Crawford, T. O., Oakland, Cal., "The Educational Power  
 and the Utility of Industrial Education and of Manual Training  
 in Our Grammar Schools."  
 Discussion of same by:
- 582 Thompson, L. S., Lafayette, Ind.
- 652-653 Elwood, J. H., San Jose, Cal.,  
 "Elementary Music in Our Public Schools."

1889

- 210-217 Hinsdale, B. A., Ann Arbor, Mich.,  
 "The Cultural Value of the History of Education."
- 230-231 Williams, S. G., Ithaca, N. Y.,  
 "Value to Teachers of the History of Education."

1889 continued

- 273-274 Clark, Minnie Caroline, Kansas City, Mo.,  
"Literature in the High School."
- 409-410 Hailmann, W. N., LaPorte, Ind.,  
"Harmonious Development."
- 488 Dutton, Bettie A., Cleveland, Ohio,  
"Discipline in Elementary Schools."
- 510-511 Missimer, H. C., Erie, Pa.,  
"The High School and the Citizen."
- 518 Donnan, Laura, Indianapolis, Ind.,  
"The High School and the Citizen."
- 678-679 Mowry, William A., Boston, Mass.,  
"The Province of Music in Education."
- 693-694 Winship, A. E., Boston, Mass.,  
"The Relation of Music Instruction to Our Educational System."

1890

- 98 - 106 Wiggins, B. L., University of the South, Tennessee,  
"Forms of Discipline and Discipline of Forms."
- 118-125 DeGarmo, Charles, Normal, Ill.,  
"Relation of Instruction to Will-Training."
- 141-149 Laughlin, Ada M., St. Paul, Minn.,  
"The Moral Value of Art Education."
- 351-352 Committee on Elementary Education,  
Report- "Essentials in Elementary Education."  
Discussion of same by:
- 355-356 Hinsdale, B. A., Ann Arbor, Mich.,
- 356 Harris, W. T., Washington, D. C.
- 432-439 Author not given, probably a committee report,  
"State Supervision: What Plan of Organization and Administration  
is Most Effective?"  
Discussion of same by:
- 446 Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.
- 487 Harris, W. T., Washington, D. C., "The General  
Government and Public Education Throughout the Country."
- 647 Steere, E. A., Butte City, Mont.,  
"The High School as a Factor in Mass Education."



1890 continued

696-701 Bartholomew, E. F., Rock Island, Ill.,  
 "The Spiritual Element in Education."

815-818 Morris, Margaret, Cincinnati, Ohio,  
 "Music as a Factor in Education."

1891

85 - 87 Parker, Francis W., Cook County Normal School, Chicago,  
 "The School of the Future."

Discussion of same by:

93 - 94 Marble, A. P., Worcester, Mass.

106-107 Preston, J. R., State Superintendent Public Instruction,  
 Jackson, Miss., "Teaching Patriotism."

170-177 DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa.,  
 "A Basis for Ethical Training in Elementary Schools."

180-186 Gates, President Merrill E., Amherst, Mass.,  
 "The Profession of Teaching for Light and Power."

281-282 Committee on Reorganization of the Council,  
 Report recommending a Committee on Moral Education.

296-298 Committee on State School Systems,  
 Report- "Compulsory Education."

337-343 Committee on Pedagogy, George P. Brown, Chairman,  
 Report- "The Education of the Will."

460 Macalister, James, LL.D., President Drexel Institute of Art,  
 Science, and Industry, "Art Education in the Public Schools."

478 Aborn, Frank, Director of Drawing, Cleveland, Ohio,  
 "The Highest Office of Drawing."

628-630 Plummer, Frank E., President Department Secondary Education,  
 Des Moines, Iowa, "The Future High School."

653 Karnes, Matilda T., Buffalo, N. Y.,  
 "Geometry in Our Schools."

669-670 Todd, Samuel B., Sterling, Kansas,  
 "Necessity and Means of Developing Individuality."

817-819 Silver, Edgar O., Massachusetts,  
 "The Growth of Music among the People."

1892

- 41 Harrison, William Henry, President of the United States,  
Address. (Title not given)
- 62 Bellamy, Francis, of the 'Youth's Companion',  
"Americanism in the Public Schools."
- 96-101 Shepard, Irwin, Winona, Minn.,  
"Ethical Culture in the Kindergarten."
- 101-107 Williams, Mrs. Delia Lathrop, Delaware, Ohio,  
"Ethical Culture in Elementary and Secondary School."
- 109-115 Canfield, Chancellor James H., Lincoln, Nebr.,  
"Ethical Culture in the College and University."
- 116 Fischer, H. A., Wheaton College, Illinois,  
Discussion of preceding papers on Ethical Culture.
- 154-155 Hardy, George E., Principal, New York City,  
"Literature for Children."
- 187-198 Hughes, Inspector James L., Toronto, Ontario,  
"The Harmony between Control and Spontaneity."
- 213-215 Jones, L. H., Superintendent, Indianapolis, Ind.,  
"The School and the Criminal."  
Discussion of same by:
- 216 Larimer, H. G., Principal, Topeka, Kansas,
- 217 Marble, A. P., Worcester, Mass.
- 224-226 Hyde, William DeWitt, President Bowdoin College, Brunswick,  
Maine, "The Organization of American Education."
- 247 Committee on Resolutions, Report.
- 317-323 Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,  
"Moral Training in Elementary Schools."
- 442 Leipziger, Dr. Henry W., New York City,  
"Education as Affected by Manual Training."
- 460 Trybom, J. H., Horace Mann School, Boston, Mass.,  
"Sloyd as an Educational Subject."
- 501 Sullivan, Christine, Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"The Aim of Art Instruction."
- 515-518 Young, George C., Wichita, Kansas, "The Value of Music  
in Public Education as a Means of Discipline and Culture."  
Discussion of same by:
- 520-524 Pulsifer, W. E., New York City.

1892 continued

594-595 Harris, W. T., United States Commissioner of Education,  
"The World's Educational Congress."

608-616 Phillips, J. H., Superintendent, Birmingham, Ala.,  
"History and Literature in Grammar Grades."

759-763 Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Practical Culture of the Moral Virtues."

1893

6 - 10 Preliminary Program of Subjects for International Congress,  
Discussion.

28 Committee of Association on Arrangements for International  
Education Congress, William T. Harris, Chairman, Report.

65 - 66 Bonney, Charles G., President of World's Congresses at  
Chicago, Closing remarks in final session.

251-257 Pickard, Joseph L., LL.D., Iowa City, Iowa,  
"Essentials in a Course of Study for Children." World Congress.  
Discussion of same by:

258-260 Jones, L. H., School Superintendent, Indianapolis, Ind.

284-285 Peabody, Mrs. Mary H., New York,  
"Methods of Teaching History to Children."

295-300 White, Dr. E. E., Columbus, Ohio,  
"Religion in the School."

Discussion of same by:

300 Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.

333 MacKenzie, Constance, Public Kindergarten Director,  
Philadelphia, "The Song in the Kindergarten - Its Place,  
Value, and the Dramatic Element."

339-340 Cooper, Mrs. Sarah B., San Francisco,  
"The Organic Union of Kindergarten and Primary Schools."

352-353 Hotchkiss, Mary T., Milwaukee, Wis.,  
"Story-Telling in the Kindergarten."

796-797 Gallagher, R. E., Hamilton, Ontario,  
"The Higher Aspects of Business Education." Abstract.

1894

- 71 - 83 McLellan, J. A., Principal Ontario School of Pedagogy, Toronto, "The Ethical Element in Literature, and How to Make the Most of It in Teaching."
- 162-163 McMurry, Frank M., Illinois State University, Discussion of Report of 'Committee of Ten' on History.
- 165-173 DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "Moral Training through the Common Branches."
- 324-329 Gilbert, Charles B., Superintendent, St. Paul, Minn., "The Reconstruction of the Grammar School Curriculum."
- 343-347 Harris, W. T., United States Commissioner of Education, "School Statistics and Morals."
- 388-397 DeGarmo, Charles, President Swarthmore College, Pa., "The Value of Literature in Moral Training."
- 398-409 Andrews, Charles M., History Professor, Bryn Mawr College, Pa., "History as an Aid to Moral Culture."  
Discussion of same by:
- 409-411 Bellamy, Francis, Editor 'Youth's Companion',
- 507 Harris, W. T., United States Commissioner of Education, "The Curriculum of the Secondary Schools."
- 686-690 Newcomb, Mrs. Leontine T., Hamilton, Ont., "The Related Development of Morality and Intelligence in the Kindergarten Idea."
- 697 Brooks, Angeline, (not placed)  
"Essential Principles of the Kindergarten System."
- 703 Wheelock, Lucy, Boston,  
"Ideal Relation of Kindergarten to Primary Schools." Abstract.
- 722 Ward, Edward G., Brooklyn, N. Y.,  
"A Few Changes in Elementary School Instruction."
- 727-732 Davis, Emma C., Superintendent Primary Instruction, Cleveland, Ohio, "The Ideal Primary School Curriculum."  
Discussion of same by:
- 737-739 Kirby, Lydia A., Philadelphia, Pa.
- 765-771 Storm, A. V., Storm Lake, Iowa,  
"Discipline as the Result of Self Government."
- 890 Tadd, J. Liberty, Director Public Industrial Art School, Philadelphia, Pa., "Manual Training Methods in Philadelphia Public Schools."

1894 continued

- 894-899 Sullivan, Christine, A.M., Ph.D., President Art Department of Association, Cincinnati, Ohio, "Art Education - Its Influence: Industrial, Educational, Ethical."
- 954 Stewart, N. Coe, Cleveland, Ohio, "Some Helpful Things Concerning Music in the Public Schools." Abstract.
- 965-971 Packard, S. S., New York, "The Religion of Morals as Applied to Business."
- 989-994 Osborn, A. S., Rochester, N. Y., "The Disciplinary Value of the Business Course of Study."
- 1010-14 Heyt, W. A., Superintendent, Brookfield, Mass., "Children's Love of Nature."

1895

- 32 Committee on Resolutions, Orville T. Bright, Chairman, Report under the Resolution on Citizenship.
- 67 Hermanns, Edward F., High School Principal, Denver, Colo., "Physical Training."
- 74 - 80 Butler, Nicholas Murray, Columbia College, New York City, "What Knowledge Is of Most Worth?"
- 94 DeGarmo, Dr. Charles, Swarthmore College, Pa., "The Principles upon which the Co-ordination of Studies Should Proceed."
- 116-124 Payne, William H., Nashville University, Nashville, Tenn., "Education According to Nature."
- 140 Baldwin, Dr. J., Pedagogy Professor, Texas University, Austin, "The Study of American History as a Training for Good Citizenship."
- 443 Barnes, Earl, Stanford University, Cal., Discussion- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools."  
Also discussed by:
- 444 Rounds, C. C., Plymouth, N. H.,
- 445 Richards, Zalmon, Washington, D. C.,
- 445 Cook, John W., Normal, Illinois,
- 445 Sabin, Henry, Des Moines, Iowa,
- 446 Soldan, F. Louis, St. Louis, Mo.,
- 446 Baker, James H., Boulder, Colo.

1895 continued

- 624-631 Mathews, B. C., High School Principal, Newark,  
"Ethical Instruction through Sociology."  
Discussion of same by:
- 632 Nightingale, A. F., Superintendent, Chicago, Ill.
- 731-741 Keyes, Charles H., Throop Polytechnic Institute, Pasadena,  
"The Modifications of Secondary School Courses Most Demanded by  
the Conditions of Today, and Most Ignored by  
the 'Committee of Ten'."
- 741-745 Robinson, Albert R., Principal Chicago English High and Man-  
ual Training School, "Industrial Education a Necessity  
of the Times."
- 772-773 Treudley, F., Youngstown, Ohio,  
"The Purpose of Music Study in the Public Schools."
- 793 Hawn, Miss Linn Marie, Saginaw, Mich.,  
"Children's Voices."
- 832-842 Clark, John S., Boston,  
"The Place of Art Education in General Education."
- 890 Springer, D. W., Ann Arbor, Mich.,  
"Ethical Side of Business Training."
- 914-923 Barnes, Earl, Leland Stanford University,  
"Punishment as Seen by Children."
- 947 Kimberlin, Miss N. D., Detroit,  
"Physical Training in Public Schools."
- 957 Palmer, Charles S., Boulder, Colo.,  
Remarks in Minutes of Department of Natural Science.

1896

- 57 - 60 Harris, William T., United States Commissioner of Education,  
The Horace Mann Reports as Secretary of the Massachusetts  
State Board of Education.
- 65 - 66 Sabin, Henry, Superintendent Public Instruction, Iowa,  
"Horace Mann."
- 76 - 85 Dougherty, Newton C., School Superintendent, Peoria, Ill.,  
"Do Our Public Schools Meet Reasonable Expectations?"
- 94 - 95 Butler, Dr. Nicholas Murray, Columbia University, New York  
City, "Democracy and Education."

1896 continued

- 130-135 Jordan, David Starr, President Leland Stanford Jr.  
University, Cal., "Nature Study and Moral Culture."
- 
- 142-149 Brumbaugh, M. G., President Juniata College, Huntingdon, Pa.,  
"The Function of Nature in Elementary Education."
- 407-410 Committee on Moral Education,  
Report- "Moral Instruction in Elementary Schools."
- 410-413 Millsbaugh, J. F., Salt Lake City, Utah,  
"The Ethical Value of History in Elementary Schools."
- 414-418 Stickney, Lucia, Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"The Incidental Method of Moral Instruction."  
Discussion of same by:
- 418-419 Rounds, C. C., Plymouth, N. H.,
- 420-421 Bradley, John E., Jacksonville, Ill.
- 432-434 Committee on Higher Education,  
Report- "The Higher Life of the College."
- 722-729 Damrosch, Frank, New York City,  
"How Good Music Makes Good Citizens."
- 781-782 Carroll, Supt. C. F., Worcester, Mass.,  
"Manual Training and the Course of Study."
- 911-917 Hughes, James L., Public School Inspector, Toronto,  
"Physical Training as a Factor in Character Building."

1897

- 66 Dougherty, Newton C., School Superintendent, Peoria, Ill.,  
"The Study of History in Our Public Schools."
- 193-194 Abbott, Rev. Lyman, Editor-in-chief 'Outlook', Pastor  
Plymouth Church, Brooklyn, N. Y., "The Democracy of Learning."
- 581-582 Committee of National Council on Rural Schools,  
Report- "Intellectual and Moral Education."
- 695 Pringle, W. J., Principal, Aurora, Ill.,  
Round Table- "The High School as a Social Factor."
- 818-822 Rowe, H. M., Baltimore, Md., "Laws and Ethics of Business,  
Duties of Citizenship, and Science of Wealth."
- 1010-11 Schreiber, Mae E., Literature Teacher, Milwaukee Normal  
School, "The Training of Teachers so that They May Cooperate  
with Librarians."

1898

- 116-117 Draper, Andrew S., LL.D., President Illinois University,  
"American Universities and the National Life."
- 133-139 Stetson, Hon. W. W., State Superintendent Public Schools,  
Auburn, Maine, "The Educational Outlook."
- 196-198 Royce, Josiah, Harvard,  
"The Social Basis of Conscience."  
Discussion of same by:  
202 Ormond, Prof., Princeton University,  
202 Royce, Josiah, Harvard.
- 238-243 Evans, Margaret J., Carleton College, Northfield, Minn.,  
"Women's Clubs as an Educational Factor."
- 275 Grisham, G. N., Principal, Kansas City, Mo.,  
"The Proper Education of an American Citizen."
- 344-348 Brumbaugh, Prof. Martin G., Pennsylvania University,  
Philadelphia, "The Mission of the Elementary School."
- 352-354 Gordy, Prof. J. P., Columbus, Ohio, "What Can Child-Study  
Contribute to the Science of Education?"
- 361-362 Halleck, Reuben Post, Louisville, Ky.,  
"Some Contributions of Child-Study to the Science of Education."
- 390-396 Gantvoort, Prof. A. J., College of Music, Cincinnati, Ohio,  
"The Influence of Music and Music Study upon Character."
- 398-403 Harris, Dr. W. T., United States Commissioner of Education,  
Washington, D. C., "The Educational Value of the Tragic  
as Compared with the Comic in Literature and Art."
- 462-488 Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio,  
"Realizing Our Final Aim in Education."
- 621 Hailmann, Dr. William N., Superintendent of Instruction,  
Dayton, O., Address as President Department of  
Elementary Instruction.
- 624-629 Felker, Miss Allie M., State Normal School, San Jose, Cal.,  
"Play as a Means for Idealizing and Extending the  
Child's Experience."
- 640-641 Mott, T. A., School Superintendent, Richmond, Ind.,  
Discussion- "Successive Differentiation of Subjects in  
Elementary Schools."
- 656-661 Gregory, B. C., School Supervisor, Trenton, N. J.,  
"Social Co-operation."



1898 continued

- 820-829 Partridge, William Ordway, Boston, Mass., "The Function of Art in the Education of the American Citizen."
- 845-848 Winship, Dr. A. E., Editor 'Journal of Education', Boston, Mass., "School Music in Character Making."
- 866 Gage, Hon. Lyman J., United States Secretary of the Treasury, "Reasonable Expectations Concerning Business Education."
- 911-916 Swift, Edgar James, Normal School, Stevens' Point, Wis., "Heredity and Environment - A Study in Adolescence."
- 939 Taylor, Henry Ling, M.D., New York City, "Exercise and Vigor."
- 950-954 Johnson, George E., School Superintendent, Andover, Mass., "Play in Physical Education."

1899

- 616-623 Scovel, Sylvester F., President Wooster University, Ohio, "In fundamental Civics, what shall we teach as the American Doctrine of Religion and the State?"
- 972-977 Hayden, P. C., Quincy, Ill., Address as President of Music Department, "The Ultimate Object of Music Study in the Schools."
- 1029-30 Stevenson, W. C., Bookkeeping and Penmanship Department, State Normal School, Emporia, Kansas, "The Advent of the Commercial High School."

1900

- 160-168 Halleck, Reuben Post, Principal Boys' High School, Louisville, Ky., "The Value of English Literature in Ethical Training."
- 409 Lange, D., Nature Study Supervisor in City Schools, St. Paul, Minn., "Nature Study in the Public Schools."