

TH
W 254

THE PRINCIPLE OF PURITANISM
AND THE
SIGNIFICANCE OF ITS RECURRING
MANIFESTATIONS

by

Paul Christopher Warren
A.B., McPherson College
S.T.B., The Biblical Seminary
in New York

A THESIS

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Sacred Theology
in the
Biblical Seminary in New York

April, 1929

BIBLICAL SCHOOL OF
THEOLOGY LIBRARY
HATFIELD, PA.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	2.
I. The Subject.....	2
II. Justification of the Subject.....	5
III. The Principle of Puritanism Defined.....	6
IV. The Definition Illustrated.....	9
V. The Plan of Procedure.....	12
VI. The Sources.....	14
TWO: MONTANISM: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST <u>SECULAR-</u> <u>IZING TENDENCIES OF THE EARLY CHURCH.</u>	16
I. The Historical Development of Montanism.....	16
A. Its Origin.....	16
B. Its Early Characteristics.....	17
C. Its Spread.....	18
D. Its Condemnation and Decline.....	20
II. The Relation of Montanism to the Principle of Puritanism.....	22
A. Difficulty of the Usual Interpretations.....	22
B. As Reflecting a Protest to Secularizing Ten- dencies.....	24
C. The Form of this Protest.....	30
1. The Revival of Prophecy.....	30
2. The Emphasis on Asceticism.....	36
D. Significance of the Decline of Montanism.....	45
III. Conclusion.....	46
THREE. THE ALBIGENSES: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST <u>MEDIEVAL ECCLESIASTICISM.</u>	50
I. Their Interest as a Puritanist Movement.....	51
II. The Historical Development of the Albigenses.....	52
A. Their Origin.....	52
B. Their Conflict with the Church.....	55
C. Their Doctrines and Practices.....	56
1. Their Alleged Manichaeism.....	57
2. Their Daily Faith and Practice.....	58
III. The Albigenses Interpreted by the Principle of Puritanism.....	64
A. Inadequacy of Other Interpretations.....	65
B. A Protest against Medieval Ecclesiasticism.....	66
1. A Stern Morality against Clerical Immoral- ity.....	67
2. Simplicity in Worship against a Formal Sacerdotalism.....	68
IV. Conclusion: The Contribution of the Albigenses to the Nature of Puritanism.....	70

Gift of Dr. Warren

17049

DEC 2 1929

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
FOUR. MYSTICISM: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST EXTERNAL AUTHORITY.....	73
I. Introduction.....	73
II. The Meaning of Mysticism.....	75
III. A. Its Essential Idea.....	75
B. Its Prominent Characteristics.....	77
III. Historical Aspects of German Mysticism.....	78
A. Its Times.....	78
B. Its Leaders.....	78
C. Its Distinctive Features.....	79
1. The Immanence of God in the Soul.....	80
2. Practical Devotion.....	81
IV. The German Mystics as Puritans.....	82
A. Protesting against the Authority of a Formal Rationalism.....	83
B. Protesting against the Formalism in Christian Life.....	84
V. Conclusion.....	85
FIVE. THE REFORMATION: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST ECCLESIASTICAL BONDAGE.....	87
I. Introduction.....	87
II. Historical Development Of the Reformation.....	88
A. Its Preparatory Background.....	88
1. An Awakening Society.....	89
2. An Awakening Mind.....	89
3. An Awakening Heart.....	90
B. Its Historical Landmarks.....	91
III. The Reformation Viewed as a Puritanist Protest...	93
A. Against Ecclesiastical Mediation in Religion...	95
1. Illustrated in Luther's Experience.....	96
2. Confirmed in the Ninety-five Theses.....	97
B. Against an Ecclesiastical System of Works.....	97
1. Luther's Failure to Find Peace in Them....	98
2. The Answer of the Augsburg Confession.....	99
C. Against Ecclesiastical Authority.....	101
1. A New Emphasis on the Laity.....	101
2. A New Emphasis on the Scriptures.....	102
IV. Conclusion.....	103
CONCLUSION.....	106
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	114

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER I.

INTRODUCTION

"Through all the ages one increasing
purpose runs
And the thoughts of men are widen'd
with the process of the suns."
--Tennyson.

I. The Subject

"Puritanism" as a term is largely associated in the modern mind with that modern movement which during the sixteenth to eighteenth centuries exerted a large influence in the religious and political life of England, Holland and America. It is not infrequently used in current literature and speech to describe modern movements and ideas, but the meaning given to it even then is received from the popular understanding of the nature and principles of English and Colonial Puritanism. Or a cartoonist seeks to portray what he feels in a modern Puritan's view on a present-day issue and he represents his characters in the plain garb and severe mien of a New England colonist. That is, the modern use of the term, although generally involving the root idea of the word (Latin: puritas, purity) is based on the particular expression given it in the English movement bearing the name.

To the student of Christian history, however, the Puritan is a familiar figure long before he makes his appearance in England during the reign of Edward VI., contending for what he considered an absolutely pure form of worship, purged entirely of all popish usages and superstitious

practices. (1) To some he has been found to be "as antique as the apostles, especially St. James." (2) Harnack would go back even farther and applies the term to the Jewish Pharisees whom he likens to the English Puritans, although the differences would seem to more than balance the likenesses. (3) However that may be, with the Christian era one finds the Puritan appearing somewhere in every period of the church's history, sometimes bearing the name, but, if not, representing in some way the Puritan spirit. He looms large on the horizon of the second and third centuries when in the person of the Montanists and later of the Novatianists he made protest against what he felt were evils in the life of the church. As far as we know, the Novatians were the first to assume the appellation, Puritan. Refusing fellowship with those who had denied Christ in time of persecution, "they leagued themselves into a schismatic community and took the name of Cathari (katharoi--the pure) or Puritan." (4) Eusebius angrily suggests that they did so "in the pride of their imagination." He also dismisses them as heretics. (5) And the Donatists of the fourth century also

.....

1. Campbell, The Puritan in Holland, England and America, p.1. Thomas Fuller (Church History) traces the earliest use of the term, Puritan, to 1564, in the reign of Elizabeth.
2. Lorimer, Papers of the New England Society of N.Y., No. 2.
3. ↙ Foakes-Jackson concurs in this view. He says: "The hard legalizing spirit, which in the Jewish sect led to the most blinding form of ritualism the world has ever known, in the Christian Puritan took an opposite direction; but both in their strength and weakness the Puritan and Pharisee are nearly related.--Hist. of the Early Ch. p. 12.
4. Ibid. p. 261.
5. Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, Second Ser., I:286.

belong to the Puritanist movements of the early centuries, although, like the Montanists, they did not receive the appellation "Cathari" in their day.

Again in the later middle ages, when the papacy had achieved imperial power with all Europe under its sway, and soldier and scholar were united in the service of the church, another Puritan movement was rising which was to disturb the peace of western Europe and to precipitate at last a deluge of blood in the Inquisition. This movement comprised a number of so-called heretical sects; indeed one document speaks of no less than seventy-two. (1.) The largest of these were the Albigenses, as they were known in Southern France, from the town of Albi, one of the centers of their strength. But they called themselves the Cathari (2) and they are indeed the most notable representatives of medieval Puritanism.

Nor has Puritanism been confined to those groups which bear its name. It is to be seen in the origin and discipline of monasticism, in the ideals and principles of the Franciscans, in the devotional practices of mysticism and pietism. It not only found expression in the Reformation, but has been a constant factor in the history of the Reformed Churches. And it has its modern exponents in a number of schismatic groups, all of which are akin in one

.....

1. Döllinger, Beiträge zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters, Vol. II. p. 300.
2. Ibid., Vol. I. p. 127.

or more features to Puritan movements of other centuries.

Now it is this recurrence from time to time of a Puritanist manifestation which prompts the questions of this thesis, namely, whether there is not a principle of Puritanism underlying these various movements which is in itself a key to the interpretation and understanding of them; if so, what significance there is in the repeated manifestations of this principle through the history of the Christian church. The concern of this thesis is the answer to these questions.

II. Justification of the Subject.

So far as can be discovered, there is available no such discussion of Puritanism as is here proposed. The records of the Puritan movements, such as Montanism, the Albigensian Heresy, the English Reformation, have been written in ample detail. What is needed now is not a restatement of the facts already evident, but an interpretation of these facts as it is revealed in the light of their common denominator, an interpretation that will destroy the isolation of these movements and bring them together into their proper place in the system of knowledge. In other words, the requirement is for a hypothesis which applied to the facts will make clear their inner meaning, without which the study of history is valueless. Only as that is discovered can the past interpret the present or throw light on the future, and thus fulfill the ultimate purpose of historical research.

Herbert Spencer once remarked that "it is a truth perpetually, that accumulated facts lying in disorder begin to assume some order if an hypothesis is thrown among them."

Nor can history be understood otherwise or its richer values discovered. As Francis Palgrave suggested in his "History of the Angle Saxons",

"No person ever attempts any historical inquiry who does not bring some favorite dogma of his own to the task,- some principle which he wishes to support, some position which he is anxious to illustrate or defend, and it is quite useless to lament these tendencies to partiality, since they are the very incitements to labor."

The recurrence through the centuries of Puritanist movements constitutes a series of facts. What do they mean? And what is the key to their interpretation? It is the conviction of the writer--a conviction which he hopes to vindicate in the following pages and without undue partiality--that the development of these various Puritanist movements from the early days of the church till the present time arises from the activity of a principle, inherent in the soul of man and consonant with the inner spirit of Christianity, which may be called the principle of Puritanism.

III. The Principle of Puritanism Defined.

The establishment of this principle and a detailed consideration of its nature are found in the discussion, in the following chapter, of Montanism, the first Puritanist

movement of Christian history. It may be helpful at this point, however, to state generally what Puritanism, as an informing and interpreting principle, is understood to mean in its use in the following chapters.

Puritanism we hold to be that principle, native to the soul of man, which rises in protest against whatever causes spiritual bondage, and seeks out a way by which relationship with God may be attained and maintained. It finds expression whenever the forms of religion in any age thwart the free exercise of the soul's outreach toward God and make difficult the realization of communion with Him.

It will be observed at once that this definition assumes a certain conception of religion. But it is not a view that needs argument or defense. While religion is variously defined in terms of its philosophic nature, or of worship, or of ethics, at the heart of each definition is the conviction, attested by the experience of the centuries, that religion is essentially man's endeavor to attain and maintain relationship with God. Augustine voiced the longing of the ages in the familiar words: "Thou awakest us to delight in Thy praise; for Thou madest us for Thyself, and our heart is restless, until it repose in Thee." And the principle of Puritanism is the soul's protest against whatsoever may hinder the realization of the divine life within.

By the principle of Puritanism we mean that which has often been recognized by thoughtful historians. For instance, Gregory in his discussion of English Puritanism writes:

"The name is not more than three hundred years old, but that which it describes is older than Christianity itself. As there were reformers before the Reformation, so there were Puritans before that which we call Puritanism had sprung into existence.....It was the spirit of Puritanism that flamed up in the breast of Ambrose when he required the Emperor Theodosius, before entering the church at Milan, to make reparation for the slaughter of the citizens of Thessalonica. When Savonarola made the proud citizens of Florence to cower under his invective, and unsparingly assailed their sins and their corruptions, the weapon which he wielded was of the true Puritan temper." (1)

It is this principle which Hermann recognizes in the suggestion that Puritanism, using the word in its widest sense, applies to St. Teresa far more than to Oliver Cromwell. (2)

Hatch designates it as the impelling spirit of Montanism which he sums up in the words: "It was a beating of the wings of pietism against the iron bars of organization. It was the first, though not the last, rebellion of the religious sentiment against official religion. (3)

And Allen, discussing the same movement, characterizes the issue at stake as a longing for "the vision by which each soul may see Christ for himself through direct and

.....

1. Puritanism in the Old World and the New, p. 1.
2. The Meaning and Value of Mysticism, p. 185.
3. The Organization of the Early Christian Churches, p. 125.

immediate communion with the Spirit of God, that Spirit whose testimony in the soul is the supreme authority and ground of certitude." (1)

IV. The Definition Illustrated

Illustration of this conception of what is the fundamental of Puritanism may be found in the English movement to which reference has already been made. It was pointed out that the modern usage of the term takes its connotation from the characteristics of Puritanism as it appeared in England. That is, the root idea of the word itself is taken up and clothed with the special features which attended that movement. As a result, scarcely any word in our language has been applied more loosely than Puritanism and often in concepts erroneous and entirely superficial. For instance, a common one is that which attributes to the term merely the idea of a strict discipline. The following sentence is an example:

"The ingredient most central to the Puritan character and the one most creditable to it, I conceive to have been the spirit of discipline." (2) To be sure, discipline was characteristic of its manifestation and always is, but it is, after all, what lay back of that discipline and of all the other diverse and conflicting forms in which it appeared that reveals its central, essential Puritanism. This a brief

.....

1. Christian Institutions, p. 103.

2. W. R. Huntington, D.D., Papers of the New England Society of New York, No. 1. p. 10.

survey of the movement will disclose.

English Puritanism illustrates the definitionⁱ which has been offered in that it was first of all a manifestation of protest and revolt. A historian of the movement has summarized it thus:

"In the course of time Puritanism took on diverse and conflicting forms, but fundamentally it was the outgrowth of the Reformation and the logical issue of the Protestant spirit.

In its first phase, Puritanism was a protest against forms of worship and religious observances which the English national church had brought over from Rome and incorporated in its Service Books, and a struggle for freedom from these idolatrous rites and practices.

In its second phase, Puritanism went farther and added to its protest against popish practices a protest against the existing forms of church organization and policy.

In its third phase, Puritanism was a protest against a national church of whatever sort, whether the Episcopal or Presbyterian, and a struggle for the freedom of separation and the right to organize churches independent of Parliament, self-created, self governing and free." (1)

Now behind this revolt, necessitating and motivating it, was the principle of Puritanism. It was the protest in church and state against that which restricted or denied the aspirations and longings of free souls for immediacy of fellowship with God. The spiritual world was an ever present reality to the mind of the Puritan. There arose anew within him the conviction that religion is not a set of forms nor an organization but is the life of God in the soul of man, a view which "brought to light the long-buried truth of the greatness and dignity of the human soul." The Puritan recognized the possibility of personal relationship

.....

1. Hulbert, "The English Reformation and Puritanism," pp.289-90.

with God. "God is a revealing God. He cares enough for man to speak to him. He speaks in a voice that is intelligible."

Conflicting with this realization of religious aspiration and longing the Puritan discovered two things. One was the non-Scriptural and non-spiritual forms of worship in which religion was then cast. The other was moral laxity in life, personal and public. Hence, on the one hand he rejected all forms and ceremonies not expressly commanded in the Bible. On the other, he attempted to frame and fashion life according to the primitive purity and simplicity of apostolic times with the Bible as the standard of conduct. In neither case was his protest or action an end in itself but merely a way of attaining spiritual freedom.

Politically, there developed, as a corollary, the fundamental principle that it is righteousness alone which makes a nation free, and the great aim and ideal of the Puritan was to make his country a holy nation, a people conspicuous for purity of life, doctrine and worship.

Thus did the Puritan in England work out the problem that challenged the longings of his soul. There may have been exaggerations in his discipline and conduct; he may indeed have seemed unduly severe in his handling of things of lesser import. He lived in a cavalier age that needed his stern protest to check its devastating course. But the great, all-important thing about him was that he was loyal to a fundamental craving of the human spirit, obedient to the divinely-appointed impulses of the soul that

urge the life toward the light of God's presence.

And it is because the conviction that the principle which animated him offers a means of understanding the Puritan movements throughout the centuries and that its recrudescence has a permanent significance, that the writing of this thesis has been undertaken.

V. Plan of Procedure.

It is not within the purpose of this thesis to present a history of Puritanism. Each of the so-called Puritanist movements of history has been subjected to careful research and has its standard authorities. Nor is it proposed to offer a defense of the theology or characteristic forms and features expressed in the Catharist sects. Rather the quest of this study is to bring to these movements a new evaluation with respect to their inner meaning and significance which we believe are to be discovered in a common energizing principle, which throughout this thesis we denominate as Puritanism.

In the pursuit of this quest, we propose, first, a more exhaustive discussion of the nature of Puritanism as it has been established and manifested in Montanism, the earliest Puritan movement in the life of the church. Secondly, we shall apply the principle thus established to three of the most prominent subsequent Puritan movements as a key to a fresh understanding and appreciation of their essential nature. Finally, we hope to be able to point out the relation which the frequent recrudescence of Puritanism

has to the progress of religion in the world.

The three illustrative movements selected are the Albigensian Heresy, Mysticism, and the Protestant Reformation. They were chosen because, like Montanism in the Early Church, they are representative of the period in which they occurred. The Albigenses were the most notable Puritanists of the Middle Ages; indeed, they were called the Cathari. Mysticism, while not confined to any one period, was the characteristic form Puritanism took in the Later Middle Ages. And the Reformation not only gave to Puritanism its finest expression, but also indicated to quite an extent the characteristic features of its manifestations in the Reformed churches during the past four hundred years.

It is recognized that if one were to consider all the Puritanist movements of Christian history, which is impossible within the limits of this thesis, it would be necessary to include Novatianism and Donatism, which were distinctly Puritanist manifestations in the Early Church; Monasticism which expressed during the Middle Ages certain aspects of the Puritanist spirit; Pietism, Quietism and Wesleyanism which belong to the period since the Reformation; and a number of other movements which in some way, to a greater or lesser degree, reveal the true Puritanist temper. But the four movements chosen are representative and are sufficient to establish and illustrate the essential characteristics of this timeless principle, the protest of the soul in behalf of its life in God.

VI. The Sources.

It is the aim of this study to follow a strictly scientific method and so base its detail upon the original sources and not upon the secondary texts of other historians. So far as is possible, this will be done. Unfortunately, however, the original records of Montanism, to an extent, and of the Albigenses, almost entirely, are either lacking or are very biased. In the case of these two movements extreme caution and critical judgment in the use of available documents are necessary if one is to do them justice. But a somewhat scientific reference to the nature and value of these sources is found at the beginning of each chapter. Due consideration will be given to the opinion of authoritative historians in these fields, and credit will be assigned to them for any facts, suggestions, or helpful definitions which the writer has received from them.

The spirit in which this task is undertaken is, we hope, that which is expressed in the following words:

"Not by unreasoning worship of the past, nor by ignorant contempt of it, but by critical and sympathetic study of it, we shall learn something of the grandeur of our own time, and the meaning of the mighty questions which lie before our children." (1)

.....

1. Gwatkin, Preface to Sohm's "Kirchengeschichte im Grundriss."

CHAPTER TWO

MONTANISM: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST
SECULARIZING TENDENCIES OF THE EARLY CHURCH

CHAPTER II.

MONTANISM: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST SECULARIZING TENDENCIES OF THE EARLY CHURCH

I. The Historical Development of Montanism

It is quite beside the purpose of this work to give any detailed and exhaustive history of the Montanist movement. Nor are we concerned to any extent here with the critical problems involved in certain disputed phases of this movement. Only as it bears upon the manifestation of the principle of Puritanism does it come within the scope of our present view. It is necessary, however, to present a statement of the salient features of Montanism as background for a discussion of its underlying ideas.

A. Its Origin

Near the middle of the second century (1) there arose the first Puritanist movement of Christian history. It took its name from its founder, Montanus, a presbyter, who

.....

1. The exact date of the rise of Montanism cannot be determined. The reports which we have of the movement vary greatly in their chronology. Eusebius, who bases his account on the writings of Apollonius, mentions the proconsulship of Gratus as the time of Montanus' appearance. But this, the most exact and reliable statement known, does not help, for the dates of Gratus are not known. Eusebius in his chronology fixes the rise of the movement in the year 172, and McGiffert suggests that "it is possible that this statement was based upon a knowledge of the time of Gratus' proconsulship. If so, it possesses considerable weight." Foakes-Jackson places Montanism at about 130 A.D. while Harnack holds to a later date, the close of the reign of Antonius Pius, probably in the year 156.

made his initial appearance as a religious leader in an obscure village called Ardabau, on the borders of Mysia and Phrygia. Lindsay remarks that it was natural that the movement which he led should emerge in these regions of Asia.

"No portion of the empire was so peopled by Christians.

Christian prophecy had flourished in the great city of Hierapolis. Polycarp, the most distinguished Christian of the whole of Asia, was a prophet. Ignatius had exhibited his prophetic gifts in Philadelphia." (1) Bigg notes that "enthusiasm had always been at home in that district." (2) And so the cult was known for a time as that of the Phrygians or Kataphrygians.

B. Its Early Characteristics

The early years of the movement are shrouded with considerable uncertainty due to the scarcity of sources. (3)

It is clear, however, that Montanus began his work with the

.....

1. The Church and the Ministry in the Early Centuries, p. 23.
2. The Origins of Christianity, p. 185.
3. Of the utterances of Montanus and his co-workers which would be our most important sources, if we had them, only twenty-one short sayings remain. They may be found in Bonwetsch, Geschichte des Montanismus, (1881) p. 197. The writings of the early historians, notably Eusebius, contain considerable material but it is of dubious value as it reflects, almost without exception, a biased and critical viewpoint. As a schismatic movement (to some it was a heresy) Montanism was viewed with suspicion and even hatred by the contemporary writers. Consequently, the writings of Tertullian form our most extensive and satisfactory source of information. They represent Montanism more generally in its later stage, however, although a few of the sayings of Montanus are preserved here and there.

claim that Christ's promises about the Paraclete were fulfilled in himself and that through him a new age of the Spirit had come. He believed himself to be a passive instrument of the divine spirit, and he was convinced that the messages given through him were the ipsissima verba of Deity. (1)

The spirit of prophecy found expression largely in the enunciation of a new standard of moral obligations, especially with respect to marriage, fasting and martyrdom. It was in this atmosphere of supernatural illumination combined with a rigid asceticism in life that the movement began which not only should rock the church of the day on its foundations, but also give expression to a spirit that down through the succeeding centuries would repeatedly appear. It was the first manifestation of the principle of Puritanism.

C. Its Spread

The claims of Montanus to a prophetic calling and the teaching which he set forth received a ready hearing and an enthusiastic response. Two noble ladies, Maximilla and Prisca, left their husbands, attached themselves to Montanus, had visions and prophecied. (2) These three constituted

.....

1. Montanus said, supposedly voicing the word of God,
"Behold a man is as a lyre, and I fly over it like a plectrum." Bonwetsch, p. 64.
2. The beginning of the movement is described by Eusebius on the basis of information received from Apollonius whose adverse opinion is readily discernible.
"There is said to be a certain village named Ardabau,

the original prophets of the sect. They organized their movement and set out to propogate their views. (1) The movement, restricted in the beginning to Phrygia, spread rapidly, first through Asia Minor, then to Africa (2) and the West (3), and for a time in Rome itself. (4) McGiffert

.....

in Mysia, on the borders of Phrygia. There, they say, when Gratus was proconsul of Asia, a recent convert, Montanus by name.....who, in his boundless desire for leadership, gave the adversary opportunity against him--first became inspired; and falling into a sort of frenzy and ecstasy raved and began to babble and utter strange sounds, prophesying in a manner contrary to the traditional and constant custom of the Church from the beginning...And he stirred up, besides, two women (Maximilla and Prisca), and filled them with a false spirit, so that they talked frantically, at unseasonable times, and in a strange manner, like the person already mentioned." -Nicene and Post N. F. I, p. 231.

1. Something of the method followed is suggested in this uncomplimentary comment by Apollonius:

"This is he who taught the dissolution of marriages; who laid down laws for fasting; who named Pepuza and Tymion (which were small cities in Phrygia) Jerusalem, desiring to gather people to them from everywhere; who appointed collectors of money; who devised the receiving of gifts under the name of offerings; who provided salaries for those who preached his doctrine, so that by gluttony the teaching of his doctrine might prevail." Ayer, Source Book, p. 108.

Short remarks that Montanus' "organized system of preachers, whose salaries be paid from the oblations of his followers, seems more like modern Methodism than the wild proceedings of an ignorant fanatic or imposter." -"The Witness of the Spirit with our Spirit." p. 161.

2. Schaff states that in Africa "the Montanists met with extensive sympathy, as the Punic national character leaned naturally towards gloomy and rigorous acerbity." And Schaff also agrees with the view that the account of the Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas, who died a heroic death at Carthage in the persecution of Septimus Severus, clearly reveals Montanist sympathies and suggests the possibility that the noble martyrs themselves belonged to the movement." Schaff, III, p. 203.

3. That it was known in the West by the year 177 is evident from the fact that two of the confessor-martyrs of Lyons, Alexander and Alcibiades, wrote from prison to Eleutherus, bishop of Rome, in behalf of the new sect. -Duchesne, p. 201.

4. It is Tertullian who reveals the fact that even in Rome

observes that "it appealed powerfully to the sterner moralists, stricter disciplinarians and more deeply pious minds among the Christians. All the Puritanically inclined schisms attracted the better class of Christians. And this one had the additional advantage of claiming authority of divine revelation for its strict principles."

(1) There was about it a contagious quality that gave to it momentum and volume.

D. Its Condemnation and Decline.

The spread of Montanism did not go unchallenged. (2)
Several synods in Asia Minor met, considered its claims,

.....

itself Montanism gained a foothold. Victor, bishop of Rome, sympathized with the teachings of the Montanists and was about to give them official recognition when he was dissuaded by a certain Praxeas. Tertullian says:

"For he it was again, who when the bishop of Rome was ready to recognize the prophecies of Montanus, Prisca and Maximilla, and in consequence of that recognition to give his peace to the churches of Asia and Phrygia--he by making false statements about the prophets themselves and their Churches, and by urging the bishop's predecessors, obliged him to recall the letters of peace he had already sent out, and to give up his purpose of acknowledging the gifts. Thus Praxeas managed two of the devil's businesses in Rome; he drove out prophecy and brought in heresy; he put to flight the Comforter and crucified the Father." Trans. by Gwatkin, Selections, p. 127.

1. Post-Nicene Fathers, I, p. 239.

2. It was inevitable that there should be a conflict with the established church. Both its major features aroused the suspicion and opposition of official Christendom. Its emphasis on prophecy as a superior authority directly challenged the supremacy of the church. McGiffert suggests the difficulty for the church in the matter:

"Prophecy in itself was nothing strange to them, but prophecy in this form they were not accustomed to, and did not realize that it was but a revival of the ancient form. That they should be shocked at it is not to be wondered at, and that they should . . . in that age, when all such manifestations were looked upon as supernatural in their origin,

and finally condemned it though not without hesitation.(1) Although this official disapproval was ratified in Rome and also in North Africa, it did not easily check the progress of the movement. Separate congregations were formed and for a time it continued to expand. The leadership of Tertullian, who joined the movement shortly after 200 A.D., gave it great impetus in the West, and in the period of his

.....

regard these prophecies as under the influence of Satan, is no more surprising. There was no other alternative in their minds. Either the prophecies were from God or from Satan; not their content mainly but the manner in which they were delivered aroused the suspicion of the bishops and other leaders of the church. Add to that fact that these prophets claimed supremacy over the constituted Church authorities, claimed that the Church must be guided by the revelations vouchsafed to women and apparently half-crazed enthusiasts and fanatics, and it will be seen at once that there was nothing left for the leaders of the church but to condemn the movement and pronounce its prophecies a fraud and the work of the evil one." Post-Nicene Fathers, I, p. 3.

Furthermore, the ascetic practices of the Montanists, based as they were on the revelations of the Paraclete and hence binding and final, made demands on individual Christians such as few could follow. As Harnack remarks:

"The lax Christians, who on the strength of their objective possession, viz., the apostolic doctrine and writings, sought to live comfortably by conforming to the ways of the world, necessarily sought to rid themselves of inconvenient societies and inconvenient monitors; and they could only do so by reproaching the latter with heresy and un-Christian assumptions. Here the bishops occupy the foreground." History of Dogma, Vol. II, p. 104.

1. The outcome of the issue is told by Eusebius:

"And the arrogant spirit taught them to revile the universal and entire Church under heaven, because the spirit of false prophecy received from it neither honor nor entrance into it; for the faithful in Asia met often and in many places throughout Asia to consider this matter and to examine recent utterances, and they pronounced them profane and rejected the heresy, and thus these persons were expelled from the Church and shut out from the communion."

-Ayer, p. 107.

life it exerted considerable influence. (1)

Gradually, however, the movement degenerated. Little is known of its later history but it is evident that the loss of the early prophetic enthusiasm and the increased emphasis in its later phase on ascetic practices spelled its ultimate end, and it disappeared in the fourth century.

II. The Relation of Montanism to the Principle of Puritanism

With this statement of the salient facts relating to Montanism, we may now proceed to examine and interpret it in the light of the principle of Puritanism which we believe to be the motif underlying it. Our particular endeavor is to find the relation of Puritanism as an actuating force to the rise of this movement, to its rapid spread and popular appeal, to its two major emphases of prophecy and rigorous discipline, to its final decline.

A. Difficulty of the Usual Interpretations

Various explanations have been offered for the different features of this movement. Neander sought to use the originating "locus" of Montanism as an explanation of it; that is, he based his view on the nature-elements

.....

1. Glover says of Tertullian: "He was the first man of genius of the Latin race to follow Jesus Christ, and to re-set his ideas in the language native to that race."
-Conflict of Religions, p. 317.

of the ancient Phrygian religion and temperament, as manifested in the ecstasies of Cybèle and Bacchus. (1) But no movement of the varied character and wide appeal of Montanism can be adequately interpreted on such a basis, and Neander's view has been found one-sided and insufficient.

Bauer advanced as the explanation of the origin and character of Montanism "the belief in the second coming of Christ (2) and the reaction against a view of the world which had lost its hold on the belief."

Now it is entirely possible, and indeed likely, that belief in the imminent coming of Christ was involved in Montanist thought. This is inferred largely from the reference by Eusebius (quoted earlier in this chapter) to the two cities into which Montanus sought to bring his followers. Harnack concludes from this that Montanus' "main effort was to make Christians give up the local and civil relations in which they lived, to collect them, and create a new individual Christian commonwealth, which, separated from the world, should prepare itself for the descent of

.....

1. Neander, History of the Christian Church, Vol. I, p. 513.

2. The Christian History of the First Three Centuries, p. 247.

"With other Christians, coldness and lukewarmness had laid hold of millenarianism; and for that very reason it became all the stronger and livelier with them.....The cause of this reactionary tendency was the Montanist's belief that he understood better than others the time in which the Christian was living; that he recognized it for what it was, for the last time."

the Jerusalem from above." (1)

However, too little is known of the early phases of the movement to warrant any dogmatic conclusions about the matter, and a study of Tertullian's Montanist writings, which represent in a comprehensive manner the later development of the movement, does not reveal any such emphasis as Baur suggests. Nor does this view fully account for the emphasis on prophecy, the widespread appeal of Montanism, or its final decline. The solution must be found in the historical background and in the Montanist writings themselves. The view of this thesis is that those external features which identify Montanism as a Puritanist movement arise from and are to be explained by that protest of the soul to those conditions which hinder the realization of the spiritual realities for which the soul longs. We designate it the principle of Puritanism.

B. As Reflecting a Protest to
Secularizing Tendencies.

A study of the historical background reveals that Montanism voiced a two-fold protest. First, it was a protest against secularization as represented in the magnifying of

.....

1. History of Dogma, Vol. II.p. 95. Swete quotes a saying of Maximilla which is in line with this view:

"Christ came to me in the likeness of a woman, clad in a bright robe, and He planted wisdom in me, and revealed that the place (Pepuza) is holy, and that here Jerusalem comes down from heaven." - The Holy Spirit in the Ancient Church, p. 69.

ecclesiastical organization. Secondly, it was a protest against secularism as manifested in laxity of church discipline and in conformity to worldly standards in life and practice. The two aspects of this protest to secularization developed side by side, just as the conditions to which it objected were inseparably interwoven. In both cases, the protest was grounded in the conviction that the soul's freedom in relationship to God was being impeded.

1. The Development of Organizational Solidarity.

The second century was particularly an age of transition in the life and development of the early church. Nowhere is this more clearly evidenced than in the development of solidarity in ecclesiastical organization, especially with respect to the episcopacy. In the words of Allen,

"At the beginning of the second century the bishop had been presented in the Epistles of Ignatius as the successor of Christ. When the century closed, the bishop had become known as the successor of the apostles. In this change is summed up as an epitome the modification which the intervening years had wrought in the ecclesiastical structure of the early church." (1)

We are not concerned here with the question of any divine authority for this development in the polity of the church. Whatever view one may hold with respect to the

.....

authority of the episcopacy, it is evident that it developed (1), and, as Hatch puts it, in response to a felt need. "Great crises give birth to great conceptions. There is a kind of unconscious logic in the minds of the masses of men, which some thinker throws into form." (2)

Various conditions and factors entered into this need but they centered in the demand for a central authority to deal with the intellectual and disciplinary problems attending the conflict with the world in which the church was engaged. In the welter of ideas which characterized the intellectual life of the early church, an authoritative voice was needed to distinguish between the true and the false. In addition, the church was under fire and in a most literal way. When a period of persecution was over there was always the problem of dealing with those who had lapsed and who now desired re-admittance to the church. Hatch, whose views stimulated a fresh and widespread study of the whole problem, sums up the relation of these problems to the development of a central authority as follows:

"The necessity for unity was supreme; and the unity in each community must be absolute. But such an absolute unity could only be secured when the teacher was a single person. That single person was naturally the president of the community." (3)

"The supremacy of a single officer which was thus forced

.....

1. Guignebert in his Christianity, Chapter VIII, condenses the whole process luminously.
2. Organization of the Christian Churches, p. 96.
3. Ibid. p. 98.

upon the churches by the necessity for unity of doctrine, was consolidated by the necessity for unity of discipline."(1)

There were obvious advantages in the creation of a central authority. Gwatkin suggests as the two greatest ones, strength and conservatism, "a quality perhaps of more importance in the church, which has to bear a definite witness, than in the state." (2)

But it had its disadvantages and its perils. It inevitably led to two results definitely related to the secularization to which Montanism made protest. One was the decline in the older prophetic ministry which in a measure had remained, in spite of damaging counterfeits, in highest honor in the church. The tendency of the new development was to exalt official rank above spiritual gifts, of which prophecy had been one of the best and at the same time one of the most dangerous forms. It was now the bishop over against the pneumatics. (3) Tertullian described the new situation in the saying, "Ecclesia est numerus episcoporum."

.....

1. Op. Cit. p. 100. Lightfoot in his notable Dissertation on the Christian Ministry (appended to the Epistle to the Philippians) gives an exposition of this development that had remained through a period of renewed research and writing a standard authority on the subject. A recent writer has said of him in this connection, "Subsequent research has left his position as strong as ever. He would not have claimed more than to have given a reasonable interpretation of the facts. New theories have since been offered to us; we can hardly say that new facts have come to light which require that his interpretation should be modified." -John A. Robinson in Essays on the Early History of the Church and Ministry, p. 90.

2. Early Church History to 313 A.D., p. 287.

3. Allen states the issue as follows: "Prophecy....was incompatible with the orderly administration of worship; it was an incongruity, to which the pastor or bishop could not

Another result was that the form easily became mistaken for the substance, and an organization was substituted for a living organism. Sohm asserts that the whole essence of Catholicism consists in its declaring legal institutions to be necessary to the church. The essence of church law is incompatible with the essence of the church.(1)

On this Harnack remarks that the thesis contains too narrow a viewpoint and argues that the communities cannot exist apart from some governing laws. But he also says:

"The whole essence of Catholicism, however, consists in the deification of tradition generally. (2)

"The older Catholicism never clearly put the question, "What is Christian?" Instead of answering that question it laid down rules, the recognition of which was to be the guarantee of Christianity....In throwing a protection around the Gospel, Catholicism also obscured it. It preserved Christianity from being hellenized to the most extreme extent, but as time went on, it was forced to admit into this new religion an ever greater measure of secularization....It permitted the genesis of a Church, which was no longer a communion of faith, hope, discipline, but a political commonwealth in which the Gospel merely has a place beside other things. In ever increasing measure it invested all the forms which this secular commonwealth required with apostolic, that is, indirectly, with divine authority." (3)

2. The Development of Secularism in Christian Life and Discipline.

Concomitant with this development of official organ-

.....

be reconciled. The prophet might at any moment lend the weight of his utterance to thwarting the plans of the bishop, who sought practical ends and practical means of attaining them." --Christian Institutions, p. 99.

1. Outlines of Church History, p. 39. Chapter II, section 10, of this book, which is a translation of Sohm's Kirchen-geschichte im Gundeiss, gives an excellent discussion of this development.

2. History of Dogma, Vol. II, p. 2. 3. Ibid. p. 4.

ization went a decline in the standards of Christian living which had been the heritage of the church from the apostles. Lindsay says, "With the neglect of the prophetic ministry there went hand in hand an attempt at conformity with the world and a relaxation of the more rigorous rule of the Christian life." (1) And he points out that this question of conformity to the world was a problem which the church had to settle if it were to attempt to win the Empire:

"The more thoughtful and politic among the leaders of the Christian societies could not help seeing that if there was to be any accommodation with the empire there must be some change on the part of Christian societies, and that the Christians must to some extent change their habits of life if they were to mingle more freely with their fellow-men who were not Christians. In the earlier times Christianity was held to be a 'mode of life' to use the expression of Tatian. Christians were men and women who had little or nothing to do with this world; who were not to conform themselves to it in any way and were not to mingle in its pursuits nor in its pleasures. They were little separate, secluded societies, awaiting on the threshold the opening of the new heavens and the new earth. The earliest Christians were content with this, and asked for nothing more.

"On the one hand, it could be urged that Christianity had a world-wide mission, and that if it could lay hold on the organization of the empire and use it for the extension of the knowledge of its Lord, it was only taking the path which Providence had plainly marked out for its progress. On the other hand, many Christians discerned the temptations which lay in accepting this view of the Church's duty." (2)

This then was the problem which the primitive church had to decide, namely, whether her members ought to remain a society of religious devotees, separated and shut out

.....

1. Op. Cit., p. 236.

2. Ibid, pp. 231, 232.

from the world, or not. When the decision came, it was on the side of worldly compromise and conformity. "The Church, unmindful of the higher ideal, allowed herself to pass under the aegis of the Roman State. The gravest mistake was thus committed, for in this way the Church became infected by worldliness while the State was barely veneered by Christianity." (1)

C. The Form of this Protest.

It was in relation to these secularizing tendencies in the early church that Puritanism first made its appearance.

1. The Revival of Prophecy.

In protest against the first of these tendencies, the exaltation of organizational authority, came the attempt of Montanism to revive and extend the prophetic ministry which the episcopacy was supplanting. The vehicle of this protest was the doctrine of the Paraclete, its fundamental proposition being the continuance of the divine revelation which had begun under the old dispensation, carried on in the time of Christ and his apostles, and had now reached its highest development with the new revelations in Montanus. Tertullian sets forth the logic of this progressive revelation:

"For what kind of (supposition) is it, that, while the

.....

1. Morgan, The Importance of Tertullian in the Development of Christian Dogma, p. 222.

devil is always operating and adding daily to the ingenuities of iniquity, the work of God should either have ceased, or else have desisted from advancing? Whereas the reason why the Lord sent the Paraclete was, that, since human mediocrity was unable to take in all things at once, discipline should, little by little, be directed and ordained, and carried on to perfection, by that Vicar of the Lord, the Holy Spirit. 'Still,' He said, 'I have many things to say to you, but ye are not able to bear them; when that spirit of truth shall have come, He will conduct you into all truth and will report to you the supervening things.' But above, withal, He made a declaration concerning this His work. What then is the Paraclete's administrative office but this: the direction of discipline, the revelation of the Scriptures, the re-formation of the intellect, the advancement toward the 'better things.' Nothing is without stages of growth; all things await their season.... So, too, righteousness--for the God of righteousness and creation is the same--was first in a rudimentary state, having a natural fear of God; from that stage it advanced, through the Law and the prophets, to infancy; from that stage it passed, through the Gospel to the fervor of youth; now through the Paraclete it is settling into maturity. He will be, after Christ, the only one to be called and revered as Master; for he speaks not from Himself, but what is commanded by Christ. Those who have received Him set truth before custom." (1)

And all this Tertullian states in order to add:

"They who have heard him prophesying even to the present time, not of old, bid virgins to be wholly covered."

In other words, the new discipline is received directly from the Divine Revealer and is based on his unimpeachable authority.

It cannot be adduced from the few sayings of Montanus which we possess that he was himself actuated by this principle of Puritanism which we are suggesting underlies the phenomena of Montanism. The absence of practically all his teachings leaves the originating motive open to conjecture. Harnack, however, on the basis of a report of Eusebius(v.16f),

.....

1. On the Veiling of Virgins, Ch. 1.

concludes that Montanus' main effort was to effect a completely new organization of Christendom, through which the spiritual character of the church would be restored and the promises contained in John fulfilled. (1)

What we have to account for, however, and that which is even more important than the purpose of Montanus, is the rapid spread of Montanism to all parts of the empire-- to Africa, Western Europe, Rome-- a spread that cannot be attributed to "a Phrygian temperament" or the locus of the New Jerusalem. (2)

It is a fact frequently illustrated in history that one man may voice the sentiments and aspirations of a nation or an age. Such was the case of Montanus, whose emphasis on the gifts of the Spirit as superior to the authority of official organization met a situation which, being more or less operative through the church at large, "gave to Montanism a degree of prevalence much in excess of the importance of its founders." (3) Whatever may have

.....

1. History of Dogma, Vol. II, p. 96.

2. Some idea of the extent to which Montanism secured a place in the world is suggested by Tertullian's boast:

"We are a people of yesterday, and yet we have filled every place belonging to you, cities, islands, castles, towns, assemblies, your very camp, your tribes, companies, palaces, senate, forum! We can count your armies; our numbers will be greater. For what war should we not be sufficient and ready, even though unequal in numbers, who so willingly are put to death, if it were not in the religion of ours more lawful to be slain than to slay?" --Kidd, Document Illustrative of the History of the Church, Vol. I, p. 143.

3. Sheldon, Vol. I. p. 268-9.

been the character of Montanus' claims, "there is no misreading the feelings, thoughts, and strivings of that great mass of Christians that welcomed the movement as something that encouraged them to resist the secularizing of the church which was being pressed forward by the heads of so many of the more powerful Christian communities."(1)

In other words, Montanism expressed the protests of thousands of Christians to that which they felt was taking from them some of their most precious possessions. Nor is it hard to understand why the exaltation in Montanism of the new prophecy should so readily appeal to those who were dissatisfied with the rapid approach of the church to the usages of the world. For one thing, prophecy had been a recognized element in the life of the apostolic church. Indeed, St. Paul had emphasized it as the gift to be desired above all. And Montanism affirmed that a continuance of the charisms of the apostolic age was to be expected as the normal possession of the church. (2) Pressense observes

.....

1. Lindsay, p. 238.

2. It was the realization of the imminence of the Spirit in the living Church which Montanus recovered for his day and it was that which appealed so powerfully to the hearts of Christians everywhere. The Montanist writer of the Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas has expressed his feeling with remarkable force in his preface:

"If the patterns of faith in ancient days bear witness to the grace of God and make edification of man, and for that reason have been collected in writing....why should not recent examples be collected in like manner, seeing that they serve both these ends equally with the old. Let those see it who regard the One Holy Spirit as exercising but one and the same power in all ages; it is rather to be supposed that His more recent manifestations will be the greatest,

that "the fundamental error which marred this grand inspiration was the failure to comprehend the operation of Christianity except under the form of permanent miracle." (1) But this criticism does not recognize that which was the more fundamental appeal in the Montanist emphasis on the prophetic ministry. What men desired and what they found in Montanism was not simply "a permanent miracle"; it was fellowship with God. Montanism recovered to an age that was rapidly losing it, the sense and possibility of personal relationship with Him. It found and emphasized that which has been characteristic of each Puritanist movement, namely, the priesthood of every believer in Christ, the right of the individual as opposed to priestly exclusiveness and hierarchical pretension. When Tertullian exclaims, "Are not we laymen also priests? It is written, 'He hath also made us a Kingdom of priests unto God and the Father,'" he voiced the rights of the soul before God, rights which

.....

since grace is to abound in the last stage of the world's history.... And so we, who recognize and honor alike the new prophecies and visions which were promised, and regard the other powers of the Spirit as sent for the better equipment of the Church..... feel ourselves compelled to compile the facts and provide they be read to the glory of God; in order that a feeble and desponding faith may not suppose that the grace of God dwelt only with the men of old time..... whereas God is always working as He promised, for a testimony to those that believe now and for the good of them that believe." And the writer ends by urging all who love the honor and glory of Christ to witness that the one and self-same Holy Spirit is working to the present hour.--Passion of Perpetua, p. 1.

1. Heresy and Christian Doctrine, Bk. I; 4.

were being lost in the developing ecclesiasticism. In another place (1), he declared, "Where one or two are is the Church, and the Church is Christ." He was expressing the answer of Montanism to the claims of the episcopacy that, as Sohm expresses it, "where the bishop is, there alone is the ecclesia." (2) The tendency of the times was to assert that "the channel of truth is not to be the lonely individual in communion with God, but the supernaturally ordained hierarch of the church." (3) It was against this tendency that the principle of Puritanism made its protest in the form of the Montanist movement. In the words of Lightfoot, "it issued from a true instinct which rebelled against the yoke of external tradition and did battle for the freedom of the individual spirit." (4)

It is in the light of this protest against that which thwarts the soul's realization of communion with God that the disciplinary emphasis is to be understood. "From a distance the most striking feature was the great moral austerity of the Montanists." (5) One cannot neglect this feature if he is to understand the principle of Puritanism. Ascetic practices of some sort have generally accompanied Puritanist movements. But their relationship to that which is the essence of Puritanism is oft-times entirely over-

.....

1. De Paenitentia, 10.
2. Sohm, p. 39.
3. Jones, The Church's Debt to Heretics, p. 142.
4. Commentary on Philippians, p. 238.
5. Duschene, Early History of the Christian Ch. p. 203.

looked or misunderstood.

2. The Emphasis on Asceticism.

Asceticism is one of the most deep-seated instincts of the human soul and as such has repeatedly asserted itself in all ages and religions. The forms in which it has been expressed are varied and many. (1) And it is evident that in the primitive and non-Christian religions, and even at times in the Christian Church, its motivating principle frequently has been a philosophic dualism which views matter, and so the flesh, as essentially evil, to be buffeted and disciplined for the spirit's sake.

That asceticism frequently arises from this dualistic conception of things and as often leads to unfortunate excesses is beyond dispute. But this feature does not belong to the essence of asceticism nor of Puritanism. The real relation of disciplinary practices to the principle of Puritanism is well illustrated in Montanism, and it should be noted for the light it throws on subsequent Puritanist movements.

In brief, these practices reflected the protest which we hold to be the most fundamental quality of the principle of Puritanism. Whatever one may think of the rigid rules which Montanism set forth--and it is not our purpose to defend them--the fact remains that they were the expression of an eternally valid conviction. They voiced the truth

.....

1. See Ency. Britannica, 13th ed., Vol. II, for excellent discussion.

that the vision of God is attainable for the pure in heart, that the price of fellowship with Him is the denial of self and the world. What lay behind this rigorous asceticism "was not an impersonal ideal or philosophic theory, but the longing of redeemed souls to know Christ and the fellowship of His sufferings." (1)

Such a vision and fellowship had been the characteristic experience of the apostolic church. It was the burden of the New Testament epistles, having expression in the first place in the hearts and lives of those who wrote. And men recognized it as of the essence of Christianity and the heritage of those who would truly follow Christ.

But now it was in danger of being lost. To the usurpation by a select hierarchy of the spiritual functions of the church was added the handicap of an ever-increasing worldliness. Baur suggests, "We may well conclude that in other respects also there had been a falling off from the strictness of the primitive custom. The church had entered into friendship with the world." (2) As a result, "contemporary church life failed to satisfy men's ideas of what religion ought to be, and the question was forced on the minds of all thoughtful men--'What is real religion and how may it be mine?'" (3)

Montanism offered the answer in its rigorous asceticism.

.....

1. Herman, The Meaning and Value of Mysticism, p. 182.
2. Baur, p. 252.
3. Cunningham, The Churches of Asia, p. 151.

It taught a rigid asceticism over against the growing worldliness of the church, and a severer discipline over against its laxer methods.

An examination of Tertullian's writings confirms the view which has been offered, namely, that the ascetic practices of Montanism reveal the true temper of Puritanism in that they voiced a protest to conditions that were preventing the attainment of divine fellowship. *groer*

It has been suggested in this connection that it was the ascetic character of Montanism which appealed to Tertullian and led him to give himself to its interpretation and defense. A recent biographer of Tertullian suggests that he became a schismatic because the teaching of the church failed to satisfy his natural love of asceticism."⁽¹⁾ However that may be, Tertullian makes the remark that "conduct is the index of doctrine." And we may well believe that his conversion was the witness of his heart to the conviction that the strict and careful conduct of the Montanists arose from a true desire to follow after and know God. That this was his own conception of the purpose of the rigorous discipline of Montanism may be indicated by several representative quotations.

Montanism, as have Puritanist movements generally, insisted on a certain simplicity in living, as, for instance, in personal apparel. It is now frequently emphasized as a

.....

1. Morgan, p. 197.

mark of non-conformity to the world and, incidentally, becomes nearly as often an end in itself. Tertullian, however, points out that the issue is between pleasing self and pleasing God and urges what he feels is the superior claim.

"You must know that in the eyes of the perfect, that is, Christian, modesty, (carnal) desire of oneself (on the part of others) is not only not to be desired, but even execrated; first, because the study of making personal grace (which we know to be naturally the inviter of lust) a means of pleasing does not spring from a good conscience.....We ought indeed to walk so holily, and with so entire substantiality of faith, as to be confident and secure in regard to our own conscience, desiring that that gift may abide in us to the end, yet not presuming that it will." (1)

And again,

"Now exaltation is incongruous for professors of humility according to God's precepts.....For even if 'glorying' is (allowable) we ought to wish our sphere of pleasing to lie in the graces of the Spirit, not in the flesh; because we are suitors of things spiritual. In those things wherein our sphere of labor lies, let our joy lie. From the sources whence we hope for salvation, let us cull our 'glory.' (2)

"What service, again, does all labor spent in arranging the hair render to salvation?" (3)

Tertullian feels also that the centering of one's time and interest in physical adornment is not likely to fit and train the soul for the test of martyrdom should that come. The object of the Monastic discipline "was to train athletes for the arena, men and women so hardened to endurance that prisons and torment no longer seem dreadful." (4) And so

.....

1. On the Apparel of Women, Bk. II, Ch. 2.
2. Op. Cit. Ch. 3. 20.
3. Ibid. 6. 21.
4. Bigg, Origins of Christianity, p. 186.

Tertullian writes:

"For such delicacies as tend by their softness and effeminacy to unman the manliness of faith are to be discarded. Otherwise I know not whether the wrist that has been wont to be surrounded with the palmleaf-like bracelet will endure till it grow in the numb hardness of its own chain. I know not whether the leg that rejoiced in the anklet will suffer itself to be squeezed into the gyve. I fear the neck, beset with pearl and emerald nooses, will give no room to the broadsword. Let us stand ready to endure every violence, having nothing which we may fear to leave behind. It is these things which are the bonds which retard our hope. Let us cast away earthly ornaments if we desire heavenly. Love not gold; in which (one substance) are branded all the sins of the people of Israel. You ought to hate that which ruined your fathers; what was adored by them who were forsaking God. But Christians always, and now more than ever, pass their times not in gold but in iron; the stoles of martyrdom are (now) preparing; the angels who are to carry us are (now) being awaited. Do you go forth (to meet them) already arrayed in the cosmetics and ornaments of prophets and apostles; drawing your whiteness from simplicity, your ruddy hue from modesty, painting your eyes with bashfulness, and your mouth with silence; implanting in your ears the words of God; fitting on your necks the yoke of Christ. Submit your head to your husbands and you will be adorned. Busy your hands with spinning;....Clothe yourselves with the silk of uprightness, the fine linen of holiness, the purple of modesty. Thus painted, you will have God as your lover." (1)

Second marriages were frowned upon in Montanist teachings; in fact, were regarded as almost the equivalent of adultery. Yet it was not a dualistic philosophy which regarded the flesh as evil and marital relationship as a sin that prompted this ban. Rather, it was the conviction that to know God was greater gain than a second husband to whom one would necessarily give one's time and thought. Thus Tertullian writes to his wife with respect to her conduct after his death whenever that should come:

.....

1. Op. Cit. Chap. 13.

"To meet these counsels, do you apply the examples of sisters of ours whose names are with the Lord, who when their husbands have preceded them to glory, give to no opportunity of beauty or of age the precedence over holiness. They prefer to be wedded to God. To God their beauty, to God their youth (is dedicated).....Thus they have laid hold for themselves of an eternal gift of God; and while on earth, by abstaining from marriage, are already counted as belonging to the angelic family." (1)

In another place, the issue is represented as being between marriage and fasting. Tertullian advances the opinion that the opposition to the new prophecies is "not that Montanus and Prisca and Maximilla preach another God,.....nor that they overturn any particular rule of faith and hope, but that they plainly teach more frequent fasts than marrying." And then he cites Anna of Luke II. as an example of the fact "that Christ is understood by none more than by the once married and oft fasting." (2)

Now fasting has ever been recognized not only in ascetic systems but also in the most spiritual minds of the church as a preliminary requisite for communion with God. Indeed, a modern philosopher has written:

"Let me note in passing that in all acts of will, the body plays its part. Thus in worship also, or rather, especially in worship, the physical basis must be cared for; the first preparation of the mystic has always been a physical preparation, more or less elaborate--of cleansing, fasting, continence, asetic practices generally, solitude, darkness, kneeling, of other special disposition of the body. We have no need to go into the details of these performances, which are at bottom quite as instinctive as are the physical efforts of thought and emotion. Worship is too spiritual a process to dispense with the material."(3)

.....

1. To his Wife, Ch. 14.
2. On Fasting, Ch. 1, 8.
3. Hocking, Meaning of God in Human Experience, p.372.

And there is no reason for believing that the great emphasis of Montanism arises from any less worthy reason than is suggested in the foregoing quotation. It was the expression of the heart's hunger for God in a form that was a protest against the careless, formal, worldly attitude toward divine realities which was becoming prevalent.

Reference is frequently made to the Montanist attitude toward persecution as a characteristic feature of its Puritanism. Here again, however, the practice enjoined represents a fundamental protest of men's souls to that which was a denial of the thing dearest to their faith. For, the duty of martyrdom was so little thought of that "whole churches purchased exemption from persecution with money and wholesale, and bishops and clergy gave their sanction to cowardice and encouraged it by their example!"(1)

To this attitude Tertullian made answer in "De Fuga in Persecutione" which Glover characterizes as the finest thing to read on martyrdom. (2) And the burden of the argument is that the one great thing to be desired is the presence of the Comforter and that having Him one need fear naught. A few lines will indicate the tone of this treatise:

"Lastly, if you cannot assemble by day, you have the night, the light of Christ luminous against its darkness.Keep pure for Christ His betrothed virgin; let no one make gain of her.

"It is not asked who is ready to follow the broad way, but also the narrow. And therefore, the Comforter is requi-

.....

1. Baur, p. 251.

2. The Christian Tradition and Its Verification, p. 189.

site, who guides into all truth, and animates to all endurance. And they who have received Him will neither stoop to flee from persecution nor buy it off, for they have the Lord Himself, One who will stand by us to aid in suffering, as well as to be our mouth when we are put to the question." (1)

What a magnificent rebuke to an age that was missing the joy of heroic living!

One could go on at length to adduce from Tertullian's writings proof of the view of which this thesis is an exposition. There is his treatise, "De Spectacules", which deals in detail with the question of conformity or non-conformity to worldly ideals and in which he argues that a Christian should not patronize heathen shows, the races and the theatre because God has prior claim and one must keep the lens of vision clear for Him. Reference might be made to "De Pudicitia" which teaches that idolaters, apostates and murderers are never to be committed to the communion of the church. Suffice it to say that which was first observed by Ritschl, namely, that in its moral requirements Montanism set up nothing new; that it was only new in so far as it was reactionary; that the only question of difference between the Montanists and their adversaries in the church concerned an increase of strictness in enforcing an old ordinance which was on the point of becoming obsolete; that their laws on marriage and fasting merely aimed at the carrying out in practice that which they believed to have been laid down in the writings of scripture.

.....

1. De Fuga in Persecutione, 13.

It should be noted in this connection, for it is a feature of the majority of the Puritanist movements, that Tertullian--and he represented the Montanist attitude in the matter--felt that he was basing his views on the precepts of the Scriptures entirely, as applied to the day in which he lived. "That is good and best which God commands," he says; "I count it audacity to question the goodness of a divine precept. We are not bound to observe it because it is good, but because God hath enjoined it." (1) Negatively, his view was that what is not expressly allowed in Scripture is forbidden. (2)

And so when Dr. Salmon says (3) that the bulk of what Tertullian taught as a Montanist he probably would equally have taught if Montanus had never lived, he is but stressing what is a fact, that Tertullian and the Christians who were joined with him in the Montanist sect saw in the movement something which was no innovation, but rather a strong assistance in preserving the old condition of the church with its prophetic ministry, its rules for daily life, and its separation from the world. And the underlying reason for these emphases was, as Allen puts it, "to stem the tide of secularism, which seemed to be sweeping away the church from its ancient moorings." (4)

.....

1. De Poenitentia, 5.
2. De. Cor. 3.19. "Sed quod non prohibetur ultro permissus est. Immo prohibetur quod non ultro est permissum."
3. Dict. of Christian Biography, 3:943 b.
4. Christian Institutions, p. 100.

D. Significance of the Decline of Montanism.

It was suggested in the beginning of this chapter that the decline of Montanism is also to be interpreted with reference to what has been set forth as its motivating idea, the principle of Puritanism.

Little is known of its later history, but it is evident that it slowly degenerated, disappearing by the 4th century. What seems to have happened--this is Harnack's view--is that prophecy died out, the legitimacy of almost every point of the Catholic system was gradually admitted so that Montanism reduced itself to the level of a sect, and finally, in place of the earlier intense moral earnestness there developed a legal casuistry and a finical morality, from which no good could ever come. "By one of the familiar paradoxes of history a movement which began in the claim of freedom ended in extreme rigidity." (1)

In these facts is revealed the danger and, what has too often been the fate, of Puritanism. Montanism, no doubt failed to commend itself permanently to the mind of men because it went to excesses. "A conservative reaction can scarcely avoid exaggerating the phases of Church life and organization for which it contends and perhaps suffers." (2) Yet that very over-emphasis of things which are good and right in their place has spelled the decline of any number

.....

1. Workman, Christian Thought to the Reformation, p. 100.
2. Lindsay, p. 239.

of causes which came into their age with a much-needed vision and message.

But still more dangerous to its life is the tendency of Puritanism to lose the enthusiasm of its original protest and center finally, as Montanism did, in an asceticism divorced from spiritual reality. When that happens, its discipline becomes an end in itself, and develops into legalism and a justification by works which is an outright denial of its fundamental principle--the free access of the believing soul to its Maker. That is what happened to Montanism. Schaff characterizes it as "the first example of an earnest and well-meaning but gloomy and fanatical hyper-Christianity, which, like all hyper-spiritualism, is apt to end in the flesh." (1)

III. Conclusion.

This survey of Montanism was undertaken in order to establish through a consideration of its animating ideas an understanding of the principle of Puritanism. With the right or wrong of the special features of Montanism we have not been concerned. One may agree with Hatch that "a careful survey of the evidence leads to the conclusion that, in view of the relation of the ecclesiastical office to the Christian life, the Montanism.....which Tertullian defended was theoretically in the right, though its theory had become in practice impossible. It did not make suffi-

.....

cient allowance for changed and changing conditions."(1)
Or one may even join with Cunningham in praise to God that He "saved His Church from this new danger, of a spasmodic ecstasy which claimed to over-ride the truth that was treasured in the consciences of men; from the danger of a haughty aristocracy that condemned all other Christians as physical;.....from the danger of a code that left no place for the consciences of God's children, and had no pity for weakness, no declaration for forgiveness; from a system which, beginning by a claim to special inspiration led only to petty regulation of external conduct." (2)

This writer certainly would claim more for Montanism than is admitted in the foregoing quotation. It is an unfortunate fact that the Montanists were too prone to take artificial short cuts and to run off into tangential lines. But they rendered, nevertheless, a real service to the great faith of the ages by emphasizing in a brave, outspoken way the vital fact of the divine presence in the world. "They called the church back to the original sources of life and inspiration, and they protested against the deadness of officialism and authority." And in their emphasis upon the importance of the inspired leader above the official office holder they gave to the world an example worthy of emulation.

But whatever may be one's judgment of the forms the move-

.....

1. Hatch, p. 125.

2. Cunningham, Op. Cit., p. 171-72.

ment took, it is evident that it arose from a true and fundamental instinct of the soul, that it reflected the eternal longing of the heart for God, that it illustrates the fact that the freedom and experience of primitive Christianity cannot be lost or placed in jeopardy without a protest being made against those conditions which seem to threaten the life of spiritual religion.

The spirit of Montanism lives on. Rufus M. Jones has said of it that it is a movement that will never stop, that out of it has come a subtle influence destined to be endlessly contagious. (1) The reason is that Montanism sprang from a vital principle which will make itself felt whenever the need arises. It is the principle of Puritanism.

.....

1. Jones, Op. Cit. p. 143.

CHAPTER III

THE ALBIGENSES: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM
AGAINST MEDIEVAL ECCLESIASTICISM

CHAPTER III.

THE ALBIGENSES; THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST MEDIEVAL ECCLESIASTICISM

In the preceding chapter we considered the first Puritanist movement in the Christian Church and established the fact that it arose as a protest against tendencies in the early church which were threatening the freedom of expression and attainment in the spiritual life. We saw that this protest constituted the essence of the Puritanist features which characterized Montanism, and so may be designated as the principle of Puritanism. It is our purpose now in this and succeeding chapters to give further illustration of the principle thus established by indicating its presence as the animating idea of three other typical Puritanist movements. At the same time its permanent validity and significance will be demonstrated. In this chapter we shall consider the Albigenses (1) or the Cathari(2) of the Middle Ages.

.....

1. The name by which they were known in Southern France, from the town of Albi around which they centered in large numbers. Although it has been so sanctioned by usage as to prevail over the other names by which they were known, it is not altogether accurate. Warner in the Albigensian Heresy takes exception to it on the ground that it is both inexact and incomplete; inexact, for it bears a local habitation and name, but its actual habitation was not local; incomplete, "because the movement was not one heresy, but many, defying rigid classification, heterogeneous, self-contradictory, and yet united in opposition to the church of Rome." -p. 5.

2. A general name, "the pure", denoting the heretical sects as a whole. Döllinger states that it was first used by the Cathari themselves. (I. p. 127) He also reports

I. Their Interest as a Puritanist Movement.

Two considerations have governed the choice of the Albigenian Heresy as an illustration of the principle of Puritanism. The first is that it belongs to the Middle Ages, and so places the Puritan in medieval garb. He not only reflects in his protest the life of the medieval church but demonstrates in his own testimony the relation of Puritanism to what has been designated as the medieval mind.

In the second place, interest is given to the Albigenes in their relation to the subject of this thesis in that they present Puritanism in the form of a heresy. The term "heresy" is, of course, relative, expressing a dissent from the established order, and is used with much latitude in its application. The Montanists were called heretics because they were schismatic, but in their theology they were essentially orthodox and are usually so considered. The Albigenes, however, have been regarded as heretics in a deeper sense than have other Puritan movements; that is, not only dissenters from the doctrines of the established church but heretics with reference to evangelical truth. Further reference will be made to this question later. Suffice it to say that they present through their doctrines and practices a

.....

a grotesque derivation of it, given of course by their enemies, and associated the sect with the form of a cat in whose form the devil was to appear. "Kathari dicuntur a charto (cato) cijus posteriora osculantur, in cujus specie eis Lucifer apparet, vel a Catha, quod fluxus, defluunt enim in diversa judicia et errores." -II, p. 293.

phase that cannot be omitted if a full understanding of the nature of Puritanism is to be had. On the other hand, it is our conviction that viewed in the light of the principle of Puritanism the shadows on their history seem less dark and they themselves become more easily understood and appreciated.

II. The Historical Development of the Albigenses.

We have defined Puritanism as that principle, native to the soul of man, which rises in protest whenever the forms of religion in any age bring upon mankind a spiritual bondage, depriving religion of spiritual reality. Our task, therefore, in this study of the Albigenses is to point out the nature of their protest and the conditions against which they reacted. But before this can be done, it will be necessary to give in as brief form as possible an account of the historical antecedents and the religious views and practices of the Albigenses. With these in mind we can the more easily inquire into the nature and significance of the sect as a manifestation of the principle of Puritanism.

A. Their Origin.

Schmidt, one of the foremost modern authorities regarding these people states that their origin is surrounded with a darkness which no writers of the sect or hostile to it have succeeded in dispelling. (1) Indeed, the whole

.....

1. "L'origine de la secte des Cathares est entourée

record of the sect is filled with uncertainty and many conflicting claims. (1)

Scholars are agreed, however, that the beliefs and practices peculiar to them suggest that we must look to the East for their origin, and that they probably emigrated to Western Europe directly from Bulgaria and Hungary. (2)

Their date is as uncertain as their antecedents. Davison states that as early as 372, "the Emperor Valentinian was alarmed at their numbers in the west and forbade their

.....

de ténèbres difficiles à dissiper. Aucun témorguoge historique ni de la secte elle-même, ni des écrivains qui l'ont combattue, ne vient jeter sur cette question obscure une lumière suffisante; aucun auteur ni contemporain, en postérieur, ne s'exprime à cet égard en termes précis, et l'on est forcément réduit à des conjectures." --Histoire des Cathares, Vol. I, p. 1.

1. There is extant but one document derived from the sect itself, a Catharan ritual preserved by Cunitz. Döllinger in Volume II. of his *Beitrag zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters* has gathered seventy-two Latin documents, comprising over three hundred pages. These documents, which Döllinger collected with much effort from all parts of Europe, are largely the reports of the Inquisitorial examiners about them and so are biased and unfavorable. Nevertheless, they have been characterized by Newman as "indispensable to all students of medieval history." Vedder remarks regarding these sources, "Of one thing we may be certain, any evidence that is to the credit of the sect may be accepted as worthy of implicit faith."

Of the general works on the Cathari, Schmidt's *Histoire et Doctrine de la secte des Cathares ou Albigeois* (1849) remains to this day, in the opinion of many, the standard authority on the sect.

2. While many of the titles of the Cathari were received from the places where they settled, certain of the sects were known as the Bulgari, or the Bogomili, or the Paulicians, all of which suggest their eastern origin. The author of a recent study entitled, "Manichaeism in Bulgaria", traces the Albigenses to the Bogomili, p. 41. Warner, p. 11, and Döllinger, I, pp. 1-51, hold that the Paulicians were the bridge between the Albigenses and their Eastern ancestors.

meetings.....The presence of a strong community of them in Rome about the middle of the fifth century so alarmed Pope Leo the Great that he caused them to be condemned by a synod and banished by the Senate, measures which checked them for the time being in that city, but which, by dispersing them to other parts, enabled them to establish new centres for the promulgation of their doctrines, traces of which might be found almost anywhere in western Christendom, in the Middle Ages. (1)

Most authorities hold, however, that the earliest certain indication of their activity in Western Europe is found in reports of church councils called at the beginning of the eleventh century to deal with their alleged heresy, (2) These early conflicts with the church seem to have ended their activity in Germany but did not stay their growth in France and Italy. They increased with alarming rapidity so that they were said by the 12th century to have followers in a thousand cities. (3) Schaff quotes the Dominican Rain-

.....

1. Davison, Forerunners of St. Francis, p. 201-2. A recent (1927) work of great value, based on a wide acquaintance with mss. sources, most of which are in European libraries. Contains an exhaustive bibliography.

2. Schaff, Vol. V, p. 472. Lea, Inquisition, Vol. I, p. 109. Beer, Social Struggles in the Middle Ages, refers to the Council of Arras as a typical case. Heretics were summoned before it, because they asserted: "the essence of religion is the performance of good works; life should be supported by manual labor; love should be extended to comrades; he who practices this righteousness needs neither sacrament nor church." p. 128.

3. Dollinger, Vol. I, p. 124.

erius, himself once a Catharist, to the effect that they numbered 4,000,000, an estimate based on a census made by the Cathari themselves. (1)

B. Their Conflict with the Church.

The rapid spread of the Catharist sects throughout Europe reflected an unrest and portended such far-reaching possibilities that the church was finally led to assume a thorough and determined effort to exterminate either the people or the doctrines which they held. With the details of this long and terrible striggle we are not concerned here. (2) It is one of the features of the Middle Ages that justifies the characterization of them as the Dark Ages. In Schaff's words, "Its history presents what is probably the most revolting spectacle in the annals of civilized Europe." (3) The shame and futility of it all is admirably summed up by Rufus M. Jones in "The Church's Debt to Heretics."

"It is one of the most appalling chapters in the history of the Christian Church, and it leaves upon the historical student, as it does upon the general reader, a sense of shame and horror. There mingled a large number of motives in the hearts of the leaders, and the springs of action which pushed on these armies of pitiless destruction, burning cities, spreading havoc, killing indiscriminately men, women and children, were too complicated to be psychologically analyzed either by them or by us today. Fury against heresy was one factor in the mission of terror and destruction, but it was only one of many factors. Simon de Montfort's name is forever associated with the wholesale crime, but so, too, is the name of Innocent. They both be-

.....

1. Op. Cit. p. 473.
2. Lea, History of the Inquisition, affords one of the most complete discussions of this subject.
3. Op. Cit. p. 515.

lieved that the Church could not rise to its place of power and splendor until those whom they called "the enemies of God" and "the emissaries of Satan" were annihilated, but at the same time they were both tangled up with political aims which helped to blind their eyes to the iniquities which, in the name of Christ, they were committing. When the bloody crusade finally came to an end many of the best moral lives in France had been wiped out, the civilization of a great, fair region of the country had been wrecked, the method most incompatible with the spirit of Christ had been tried to the hilt--but heresy was as virile as ever, and the spirit which inquired for truth and refused to take a stone for bread was still unconquered and unconquerable." (1)

Yet matching the brutality of the inquisitors was the courage and endurance of the victims. Lea asserts that "no religion can show a more unbroken roll of those who unshrinkingly and joyfully sought death in its most abhorrent form in preference to apostasy." (2) The fact is worthy of note for its bearing on the relation of this movement to the principle of Puritanism.

However, the crusade against them was successful; the heretics were hunted down till they had been killed, or had recanted, or found a haven in some hidden part of Europe. But at its close, villages and cities lay in ruins, industries were shattered, and a once thrifty population had been impoverished and well-nigh destroyed.

C. Their Doctrines and Practices.

It is unfortunate that so much uncertainty attends our information regarding the religious beliefs of the Albigenses. The lack of information derived from the Cathari them-

.....

1. Jones, p. 209.

2. Lea, Op. cit. p. 104.

selves and the fact that our knowledge of them is grounded almost entirely on the reports of their ecclesiastical enemies have resulted in a variety of opinions about them. The question at issue seems to be largely whether or not they were Manichaeian dualists in doctrine, and if so, to what extent. It is not required by the purpose of this thesis that any attempt should be made here to deal with this question. It is worthy of exhaustive treatment on its own account and awaits the discovery of further documentary evidence for definite settlement.

1. Their Alleged Manichaeism.

It is sufficient to state that in the opinion of modern critical scholars the weight of the evidence is on the side of the traditional view that these people were philosophical dualists, of the Manichaeian type. (1) But while they admit some of the heretical beliefs credited to them by their Catholic antagonists, they are ready to defend them with regard to their morality and Christian life. (2) Some

.....

1. A fresh and authoritative presentation of Manichaeism may be found in "A Study of Manichaeism in Bulgaria with Special Reference to the Bogomils," published in 1927 by Victor N. Sharenkoff, Ph.D.

2. This is the position of Schmidt, Döllinger, Lea and Davison. Döllinger is the least friendly. Schmidt, who cites 300 documents as the basis of his work and wrote with entire impartiality in the use of them, fully and firmly answers the charges of immoral practices among them. Yet he accepts the Manichaeian hypothesis. It is worthy of note that Davison's work, which is the latest in the field and is fully documented, follows this same line.

of the earlier protestant writers have been disposed to defend them against the charge of Manichaeian belief made against them. (1) But the question is not important here. We may grant that they were Manichaeian dualists--it seems plain that they were dualists of a kind, at least--but the fact does not explain them nor has it any essential bearing on the principle of Puritanism which we believe animated them. As Schaff points out, "it is impossible to understand the movement from this standpoint. How could an unlettered folk, as they were, be concerned primarily or chiefly with a metaphysical construction? Theirs was not a philosophy, but a daily faith and practice." (2)

2. Their Daily Faith and Practice.

It is in this realm of their "daily faith and practice" that we shall find expressed their Puritanist spirit.

.....

1. See Perrin, W. Jones, Faber. The latter points out how easy it would be for an examiner to twist the words of the Cathari into a Manichaeian doctrine. For instance, it was a Manichaeian doctrine that there are two independent principles, the one good, the other evil, and that the material world was created by the evil principle while the spiritual world was the work of the good principle. The Albigensian, speaking of the prince of this world, of the enmity between God and this world, would easily be taken as Manichaeian. Similarly, when they quoted such phrases as "Christ the living bread," "Unless a man is born of the spirit," etc., "in the resurrection there is neither marriage nor giving in marriage," they could be understood to be representing the Manichaeian view that Christ was never really incarnate, that baptism by material water ought not to be administered, and that marriage ought to be reviled and rejected. p. 10.

2. Op. cit. p. 474.

A first hand account of their essential characteristics is found in the Inquisition Guide Book of Bernard of Gui. It follows in part:

"In the first place, they usually say of themselves that they are good Christians, who do not swear, or lie, or speak evil of others; that they do not kill any man or animal or anything having the breath of life, and that they hold the faith of the Lord Jesus Christ and his gospel as Christ and his apostles taught. They assert that they occupy the place of the apostles and that, on account of the above mentioned things, they of the Roman Church, namely the prelates, clerks, and monks, and especially the inquisitors of heresy, persecute them and call them heretics, although they are good men and Christians, and that they are persecuted just as Christ and his apostles were by the Pharisees.

"Moreover, they talk to the laity of the evil lives of the clerks and prelates of the Roman Church, pointing out and setting forth their pride, cupidity, avarice and uncleanness of life, and such other evils as they know. They invoke with their own interpretation and according to their abilities the authority of the Gospels and Epistles against the condition of the prelates, churchmen and monks, whom they call Pharisees and false prophets--who say, but do not.

"They attack and vituperate, in turn, all the sacraments of the Church, especially the sacrament of the Eucharist, saying that it cannot contain the body of Christ, for had this been as great as the largest mountain, Christians could have entirely consumed it before this. They assert that the host comes from straw, that it passes through the tails of horses, to wit, when the flour is cleaned by a sieve (of horse hair), that moreover it passes through the body and comes to a vile end, which they say could not happen in God were in it.

"Of baptism they assert that water is material and corruptible and is therefore the creation of the evil power and cannot sanctify the soul, but that the churchmen sell this water out of avarice, just as they sell earth for the burial of the dead and oil to the sick when they anoint them, and as they sell confession of sins as made to the priest.

"They claim that confession made to priests is useless, and that since the priests may be sinners, they cannot loose or bind, and being unclean themselves, cannot make others clean.

"Moreover they read from the Gospels and Epistles in a vulgar tongue, applying them and expounding them in their favor and against the condition of the Roman Church in a

manner which it would take too long to describe in detail, and all that relates to the subject may be read more fully in the books they have written and infected; and may be learned from the confessions of such of their followers as have been converted." (1)

Now it will be noted that five prominent features are emphasized in this account of them by one of their opponents. The first is their claim to be good Christians. The reference is to their plan of classifying their members. The Good Men were the Perfecti, (2) those who had received the rite of Consolamentum. (3) It appears that it is to these that the name Cathari properly belongs. For when a man had received the Consolamentum, and with it the Holy Spirit and deliverance from the power of matter and its creator, he was regarded as perfect; that is, wholly cleansed from the guilt and taint of sin. The work of the Perfecti was to go from place to place, teach, give counsel, exhort to remain faithful. They had no personal property, renounced the ties and joys of family life, lived simply, regulated their lives by fasts and privations. They were held in

.....

1. Robinson, Readings in European History, Vol. I, p. 381.

2. "Tunc dicta Raymunda fecit sibi mentionem de bonis hominibus videlicet de illis, etc." Döllinger, II.27.

3. In the reception of the Consolatum it was not the outward act, the laying on of hands that counted, but the prayer. If the minister had sinned and lost the Holy Spirit his prayer would have no effect. The recipient must be an adult, in full possession of his faculties, under observation for some time previously, and must have prepared himself for the rite by prayer and by three days of complete abstinence from food. --Holmes, p. 31; Davison, p. 210. A full account of the rite is given in Lea, I, p. 94-5.

great reverence and listened to by all. (1) The other two classes of followers were the *Credientes* who confessed membership in the sect but carried on their business and life much as the world. The receiving of the *Consolatum* was postponed for the majority till their death-bed, lest they commit the sin of apostasy. (2) Then there were the *Auditores* who had not yet taken the required vows.

Another emphasis in this description is the claim of the Good Men that they comprised the true church, in contrast to the false and wicked church represented by Rome. (3) The distinguishing difference between the two is in the character of those who compose it.

Closely related to this was a third feature of their position, namely, their strong censure of the Roman Church for the immorality and hypocrisy of its leadership.

The next emphasis is on their use of the Scriptures, at least of the New Testament. It is generally acknowledged that they regarded the Old Testament as the book of the evil principle. (4) In this they reflect their Manichaean background. But their use of the New Testament

.....

1. Holmes, p. 24, 27.

2. Lea, I, p. 94.

3. Döllinger, II, p. 322. "Item dicunt, quod sunt duae ecclesiae, sc. ecclesia justorum et malignantium, et ecclesiam justorum dicunt Patareni illorum qui faciunt poenitiam secundum doctrinam Christi et apostolorum, et salvantur per manuum impositionem, sicut dictum est supra. Ecclesiam vero malignantium dicunt omnium aliorum, qui non recipiunt praedictam manuum impositionem."

4. Ibid. p. 294

seems to have been a characteristic of the sect from their origin. At least, it was so among the Paulicians with whom they appear to have been originally connected. Neander holds that the right of every nation to have the word of God in its own language was a common principle of the Paulicians and Cathari. And he states in this connection that Sergius, of Tavia in Asia Minor, one of the ablest apostles of Paulicianism, was won over to the sect by a personal study of scriptures which he had been taught were to be read only by the clergy. (1) The point is mentioned as illustration of the fact that the Inquisitor Bernard not only spoke the truth but also named a deep-seated characteristic of these people.

In the fifth place, we should note as a phase of their "daily faith and practice" their rejection of the Catholic sacraments. In this is revealed their protest against the formal sacerdotalism which had been developing through the centuries. Bernard makes mention of the three major reasons which they gave for their objection to the sacraments. The first was the sacrilege which they felt was involved in the Catholic view of the host. (2) The second ground was the futility of receiving sacramental grace through

.....

1. Neander, Church History, Vol. V., p. 346f.

2. Döllinger, II, p. 5. "Item quod illa hostia nascitur de palea et quod transit per caudas equorum et equarum, videlicet quando farina purgatur per sedacium. Item quod mittitur in latrinam ventris et per turpissimum locum, quae non possent fieri, si esset ibi Deus."

sinful priests. In this they were kin to the Donatists who also held that validity of the sacraments was affected by the unworthiness of the minister. Finally, they perceived that the sacraments were the source of abuse for financial gain and so were a mere mockery.

Such were the outstanding characteristics of the Albigenses as an Inquisitor saw them. He might have made mention of their alleged renouncement of marriage, (1) of their rejection of all food which was the product of carnal intercourse, and of other practices which reflected their Manichaeian background. But he named those things which seemed to him most characteristic. Yet nothing that he recorded reflects on their claim to the title Puritan (in the narrow sense of the word) nor discounts the impression which the Albigenses made upon their contemporaries as essentially good. (2) Faber quotes Reinerius, one of the inquisitors, who, after flaying them as the worst and most profligate of mankind, goes on later to say of them:

"Heretics are known by their manners and their words.

.....

1. Döllinger, II. 30. "Et quod est ita magnum peccatum, jacere cum uxore sua, sicut cum meretrice."

2. Bayley in "New Light on the Renaissance Displayed in Contemporary Emblems" tells of two emblems which have come down from them and which reflect their religious views. One is the Ladder (Jacob's), representing a system of virtues and good works by the practice of which earth is brought into close touch with heaven. (p.18) The other is the scissors or snuffers which are a reminder that the flame of spiritual truth burns brighter when snuffed of the letter. "The letter killeth but the spirit giveth life." (p. 21) He also relates a tradition that the axiom "Work is prayer" had its origin among them and reflects the industry of their life. (p. 12)

In their manners, they are composed and modest. They admit no pride of dress, holding a just mean between the expensive and the squalid. In order that they may the better avoid lies and oaths and trickery, they dislike entering into trade; but by the labor of their hands, they live like ordinary hired workmen. Their very teachers are mere artisans. Riches they do not seek to multiply, but they are content with things necessary. In meat and drink they are temperate. They resort neither to taverns, nor to dances, nor to any other vanities. From anger they carefully restrain themselves." (Reiner. de haeret. c. vii. p. 307)(1)

Bernard of Clairvaux was whole-heartedly on the side of the inquisitors, yet he was constrained to exclaim concerning the Cathari:

"None can be more Christian than these heretics; as far as their conduct is concerned, nothing can be more blameless; and their deeds accord with their words. The Cathari deceives no one, oppresses none; his cheeks are pale from fasting; he eats not the bread of idleness, and supports himself with the labor of his hands." (2)

III. The Albigenses Interpreted by the Principle of Puritanism

We now come to the question which is the center of our study: how does the principle of Puritanism illuminate the life and beliefs of the Albigenses?

The answer to this query is to be found in the relation of their dominant characteristics to the religious life of their day. We are seeking to demonstrate in this study that it is not those external features which give rise to the name of Puritan or Catharist that make a movement truly Pu-

.....

1. Faber, An Inquiry into the History and Theology of the Ancient Vallenses and Albigenses, p. 71, 72.

2. Quoted by Beer, p. 135, and by Lea, p. 101. (Bernard, super. cantic. sermon. lxx. oper. p. 761.

ritan or Catharist that make a movement truly Puritan, but rather it is that principle which underlies and animates them as a protest against restraining and hindering influences in the fellowship of men with God. In what respect were the characteristic features of the Albigenses a protest in behalf of the spiritual freedom?

A. Inadequacy of Other Interpretations.

It should be recognized, first of all, that it is possible that the religious beliefs and practices peculiar to the Cathari arose originally from their Manichaeian antecedents. But that does not explain, as Schaff suggests, how the movement gained such rapid and widespread acceptance in the well-ordered and prosperous territory of Southern France, a territory in which Cluny had exercised its influence and was located. (1) There was nothing to Catharism to attract such a widespread following and one that was loyal even to the point of painful death. Nickerson in his work on the Inquisition suggests that it was their asceticism which challenged the interest and assent of men.

"If we ask why such a life as that of the Albigensian 'Perfect' ever attracted anyone, we must go back one step further and ask why asceticism, deprivation for its own sake, has always had such power over mankind. It is one of the unanswerable mysteries of the human soul why men have so often felt that their God, or Gods, would be pleased at seeing the worshipper voluntarily submit to deprivation, discomfort and pain. It has been argued that limitation in pleasure is necessary for the physical, mental and spir-

.....

1. Schaff, op. cit. p. 474.

itual well-being and that asceticism (itself a word derived from the training of Greek athletes) merely sets one free for undivided effort. But this does not always meet the case. For the fact is that there is always in man the tendency to condemn pleasure for its own sake, as evil in itself, as if there were something holy in the mere state of being deprived and uncomfortable. And this curious state of mind is as strong today as it ever was, witness the extraordinary savageness of the campaign waged by what an Englishman would call the "Dissenting" religious bodies in America today against any pleasure or amusement which strikes them as sinful. Finally, it is also the fact that many who would not dream of denying themselves a certain amount of physical satisfaction of different sorts will applaud ascetics. Accordingly, the Albigensian system addressed itself to a fundamental instinct of human nature. (1)

He entirely misses the point. There is an appeal in asceticism but it has never won a large following on its own merits alone.

B. A Protest Against Medieval Ecclesiasticism.

There can be only one explanation, and that is that this system of faith and discipline, imperfect as it was, sharing the superstition and darkness of its medieval background, voiced the protest of longing souls against the unsatisfying religious life of the day. "It was the spontaneous outburst of a profound discontent." It was a protest on the one hand against the immorality of the official clergy; on the other, against the hindering influence of a developing sacerdotalism. The one was voiced in the insistence of the Cathari on a ministry of pure men, and a membership of believers whose moral integrity matched their

.....

1. The Inquisition, a Political and Military Study of its Establishment, p. 45.

profession. The other was manifested in the development of a simple form of worship in which the reception of the Holy Spirit was the chief end desired.

1. A Stern Morality against Clerical Immorality.

That there was need of the first protest is found in the admissions of the best of the Catholic leaders of the day. Lea says of Bernard, one of the saintliest men of his age and a most trustworthy witness as to the condition of the Church, that "he is never weary of denouncing the pride, the wickedness, the ambition, and the lust that reigned everywhere.....The Church is left poor and bare and miserable, neglected and bloodless. Her children seek not to bedeck, but to bespoil her; not to guard her, but to destroy her; not to defend, but to expose; not to institute, but to prostitute; not to feed the flock, but to slay and devour it... 'Whom can you show me among the prelates who does not seek rather to empty the pockets of his flock than to subdue their vices?' " (1)

Bernard's contemporary, Potho of Pruhn, voices the same distress. "The church is rushing to ruin, and not a hand is raised to stay its downward progress; there is not a single priest fitted to rise up as a mediator between God and man and approach the divine throne with an appeal for mercy." (2)

.....

1. Lea, I, p. 52
2. Ibid. p. 52.

One could multiply quotations along this line. An interesting feature of them is the emphasis on avarice as the most outrageous characteristic of the clergy. For instance, St. Hildegarda complained:

"The prelates are ravished of the churches; their avarice consumes all that it can acquire. With their oppressions they make us paupers and contaminate us and themselves.Is it fitting that wearers of the tonsure should have greater store of soldiers and arms than we?" (1)

In view of this, the emphasis of the Catharism on Evangelical poverty and simplicity in daily living is all the more pertinent and understandable. It was a matter of action and reaction. It was the protest of Puritanism.

2. Simplicity in Worship against a Formal Sacerdotalism.

The ground for the reaction against the sacerdotalism of the church is just as evident. For one thing, worship was conducted in the Latin language, not the speech of the people. The result naturally was that "the hungry sheep looked up and were not fed." So serious was the situation that Charlemagne summoned five councils at different places and ordered the bishops to use the vulgar tongue in their services. Furthermore, it gave opportunity for grave abuses: Agobard, Bishop of Lyons, found there a service compiled by an assistant bishop so indecent that he could not read it without a blush. (2)

It is in the light of such conditions that the faith

.....

1. Lea, p. 53.
2. Warner, p. 27.

and practice of the Albigenses should be viewed. It will then be seen to express, in the words of Lea, "a profound conviction of the emptiness of sacerdotal Christianity." How much different in its conception of spiritual religion and of the possibility of communion with God is the ideal of worship set up by the Cathari. Its mode was simplicity in itself. God was omnipresent and might be worshipped anywhere and in any surroundings. Catharist services were held in castles, hovels, meadows and forests. There were no statues or ornaments as objects of faith. The altar was no carved statuary in marble, but just a table, covered with a white cloth on which rested a New Testament open at the first chapter of John. The service consisted of the reading of a Scripture lesson by a minister or one of the perfecti, with comments bringing out points on which the church of Rome disagreed with Scripture, then the benediction followed by the Lord's Prayer which they contended was the only prayer Christians were authorized to use either in private or public. When the Lord's Prayer had been recited the minister said, "Let us adore the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit," and the congregation replied, "The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with us all." (1) Such was the protest of Puritanism against a cold, formal, unscriptural and unspiritual sacerdotalism that failed to satisfy the craving of the heart for the realization of God. If the

.....

1. Holmes, p. 31.; Davison, p. 216.

form of the protest fell short of the highest and best, it was not because it arose from a wrong or false impulse.

IV. Conclusion: The Contribution of the Albigenses
to the Nature of Puritanism.

In bringing this chapter to a close, let us ask and answer the question as to what this particular Puritanist manifestation contributes to an understanding of the nature of Puritanism.

17049 First, it demonstrates that doctrinal orthodoxy is not a necessary accompaniment of Puritanism. Here was a people who had a very faulty conception of evangelical truth, but who nevertheless desired an evangelical experience and were able to voice the longing of their age in a determined protest against false and unsatisfying forms of religion. Where theology breaks down, Puritanism goes on in the search for spiritual life.

Secondly, here again we find that the Scriptures were an impelling force and a helpful guide in making vocal the protest of this movement.

Thirdly, the heroic quality of Puritanism is demonstrated in this movement. (1) It was not the last witness to the fact that the principle of Puritanism is not to be suppressed because of physical suffering. The desire of a hungry soul to know God does not easily surrender that which

.....

1. Lea, I, p. 104, gives a number of illustrations of this point.

has brought joy and satisfaction. Puritanism is armed with the armor of one of the deepest and most valid convictions of life.

Finally, (and this point is perhaps the most important) the failure of the Albigenses to survive the crusade against them, as did their neighbors, the Waldenses, and so maintain their testimony through the centuries, demonstrates again the fact that the permanence of a Puritanist movement depends upon its maintenance, along with its protesting witness, of those other central truths of evangelical religion the enduring values of which have been proved by the experience of the centuries. Christianity claims to be within the reach of all. This the Albigenses denied in practice by the compromises inherent in the system, namely, the distinction between the Perfect and the Believers, and the delay of the reception of Consolamentum until the end of life. Their protest against clerical abuses, repugnant to the moral conscience, their hatred of materialism and their goodness of life, were an attraction to millions. But their failure to maintain a balanced Christian testimony thwarted the possibility of their contributing a permanent influence to the life of the world.

CHAPTER FOUR

MYSTICISM: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM

AGAINST EXTERNAL AUTHORITY

CHAPTER FOUR
MYSTICISM: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST
EXTERNAL AUTHORITY

I. Introduction.

It is not usual to associate Mysticism and Puritanism as having a common basis of relationship. When a likeness between them is pointed out, it generally is on their common possession of the ecstatic element native to Mysticism. An example of this is found in Bigg's "Origins of Christianity" in which he states of Montanism that it was "one of those outbreaks of mysticism which from time to time have visited the church, giving it a new life, yet threatening it with destruction." (1) That there is a connection between Montanism and Mysticism we admit at once. That Montanism displayed mystical characteristics which would relate it to other manifestations of Mysticism is also evident. But we believe that there is a far deeper basis for their association by Bigg as related movements than the one he suggests. It is in their essential Puritanism that we find their common meeting ground chiefly, in the protest they both represent in behalf of those longings and aspirations of the soul which are at the heart of religion.

That this essential Puritanist characteristic of Mysticism may be more definitely established and that the new significance may be found in it as it is considered in the

.....

1. Bigg, p. 185.

light of Puritanism as a motivating and interpreting principle, it is proper to include this chapter in this study of Puritanism and the significance of its recurring manifestations.

It is not within the purpose of this investigation to survey the whole field of Mysticism or to discuss in detail even one manifestation. Our purpose rather is to show how in a movement not designated as Puritanist this principle may be found operating as an impelling, animating force. If this can be demonstrated it will but strengthen the claim that we have made, namely, that the principle of Puritanism is native to the soul of man and that its protest is heard whenever the forms of religion tend to hinder the spiritual freedom of the soul.

Mysticism covers too broad a field, however, both in respect to its time of manifestation and its type, for us to consider it in the large. We make the claim that wherever it has appeared it had voiced the protest of Puritanism. In Pietism it was a reaction against the tendency of the Lutheran Church to become a creed-bound and sacramentarian institution in which the spiritual freedom of the Reformation was missing. Quietism appeared as the protest of Puritanism against bureaucratic ecclesiasticism, always latent within the church of Rome. The Platonic Mysticism of Cambridge in the seventeenth century was a protest against the mechanical philosophy of Descartes, and its consequences in Spinoza. (1) But we have selected for this particular

.....
1. Excellent discussions of these movements may be found in the Ency. Brit. 13th Ed. Volumes 20, 21, 22.

discussion the German Mystics of the Later Middle Ages who represent a Puritanist protest against the growing sway of external authority which developed in the Catholic Church prior to the Reformation. We have chosen this particular manifestation because it specially reflects the pre-Reformation period and prepared the way for the greatest of all the manifestations of Puritanism, which we shall consider in the next chapter.

II. The Meaning of Mysticism.

As the importance of Mysticism in relation to the subject of this thesis cannot be exaggerated, it were well that we understand clearly the nature of Mysticism, especially those features with which we must deal in applying the principle of Puritanism to the German Mystics.

A. Its Essential Idea

John Morley once said that there were ten thousand definitions of religion, by which he meant that everyone has his own idea of what religion is. Practically the same thing may be said of Mysticism. Dean Inge avers that "no word in our language has been employed more loosely than Mysticism." (1) The wide range of meaning attached to it is illustrated by the fact that in his notable work, "Christian Mysticism," he devotes thirteen pages in the

.....

1. Christian Mysticism, p. 3.

appendix to a list of authoritative and comprehensive definitions of Christian Mysticism, together with criticism of them. (1)

Inge's own definition is: "Religious Mysticism may be defined as the attempt to realize the presence of the living God in the soul and in nature, or, more generally, as the attempt to realize, in thought and feeling, the imminence of the temporal in the eternal, and of the eternal in the temporal." (2)

One could quote at length from the host of definitions available. But their essential idea, when one has laid aside the metaphysical language in which they are often clothed and has made allowances for the particular viewpoint from which each is written, he finds at the center of them the claim that the mystic "Knows God through an inner certainty, independent of any proof, and rests his case on that testimony." (3) Rufus Jones presents a simple and illuminating explanation thus:

"Mysticism only means that the soul of man has dealings with realities of a different order than that with which the senses deal.....The mystic insists that his experience reveals the fact that the inner self has a spiritual environment in which it lives and moves and has its being." (4)

Mysticism, then, we understand to be this union of the soul with the Unseen and the Divine, whereby God becomes

.....

1. Ibid, pp. 335-58

2. Ibid. p. 5

3. Atkins, Making of the Christian Mind, p. 217.

4. Jones, New Studies in Mystical Religion, p. 25.

known to one directly apart from the rational elements in religion. And we would accept Jones' statement:

"I should call any experience mystical which succeeds in tapping interior reservoirs of spiritual energy and which brings first hand conviction that God is near at hand and directly operating." (1)

B. Its Prominent Characteristics.

The importance of Mysticism in Christian thought and in our present consideration is due to several qualities which have been well defined by Professor James. The first he calls Ineffability, by which he means that "no adequate report of its contents can be given in words." And he adds: "It follows from this that its quality must be directly experienced; it cannot be imparted or transferred to others.(2)

The second he designates as the Noetic Quality.

"Although similar to state of feeling, mystical states seem to those who experience them to be almost states of knowledge. They are states of insight into depths of truth unplumbed by the discursive intellect. They are illuminations, revelations, full of significance and importance, all inarticulate though they remain; and as a rule they carry with them a curious sense of authority for after-time." (3)

Finally, he suggests Passivity as a characteristic feature of Mysticism. It is that which makes the mystic "feel as if his own will were in abeyance, and indeed sometimes as if he were grasped and held by a superior power."(4)

.....

1. Fundamental End of Life, p. 25.
2. James, Varieties of Religious Experience, p. 379
3. James, Op. cit., p. 380.
4. Ibid. p. 381.

Further reference will be made later to these characteristics in connection with the German Mystics.

III. Historical Aspects of German Mysticism.

A brief statement is necessary with respect to the personnel and history of German Mysticism in the Later Middle Ages before the relation of that movement to Puritanism was discussed. (1)

A. Its Times.

No movement can be separated, if it is to be understood, from the times in which it appears. To date German Mysticism as a development of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries is to recall to the student of history a twilight period in the history of the Christian Church. It was the twilight between night and dawn for its dim but gradually brightening light revealed the workings of new and vibrant forces. Schaff describes it as follows:

At a time when the scholastic method was falling into disrepute and the scandals of the Avignon court and the papal schism were shaking men's faith in the foundations of the Church, a stream of pure pietism was watering the regions along the Rhine, from Basel to Cologne, and from Cologne to the North Sea." (2)

B. Its Leaders.

A number of notable names constitute the leadership of

.....

1. The sources are ample. The History and Life of John Tauler with Twenty-five of his Sermons, trans. by Winkworth and the Theologia Germanica, also trans. by Winkworth, have proved especially valuable here.

2. Schaff, Vol. V. Part 2, p, 236.

this movement. Because so many of its representatives belonged to the Dominican Order, it recently has been given the name, the Dominican Mysticism. But as Schaff points out, the older name, German Mysticism, is to be preferred, for not only was it born on German soil, and the German language was the vehicle for its expression, but it never extended in influence beyond Germany. (1)

The founder of the movement was Meister Eckhart, (1260-1327), Two of his students, John Tauler (---1361) and Henry Suso (1295-1366) were outstanding representatives of it. Among the Dutch, John of Ruysbroek (1298-1366) and Thomas a Kempis (1380-1471), author of *De Imitatione Christe*, and Gerrit Groote, founder of the Brethren of the Common Life, gave distinction and strength to the movement. Other members of the movement were loosely organized together in the Friends of God, (Gottsfreunde). (2) Their identity is not altogether clear nor are their doctrines. The author of the Historical Introduction to the *Germanica Theologia* states that they desired to keep free from anything that savored of heresy and were united on the basis of their common purpose to find a closer fellowship with God. (3)

C. Its Distinctive Features.

The limits of our study prevent any detailed discussion of the various characteristics of German Mysticism. Our

.....

1. Op. cit. p. 237.
2. Ibid. p.237. McGlothlin, p.179.
3. *Theologia Germanica*, Pfeiffer-Winkworth, p. xlv.

concern is to indicate its relation to that fundamental principle which unites it in its essential character to the Puritanist movements of history. For the purposes of this study we note two of its distinguishing characteristics.

1. The Immanence of God in the Soul.

Eckart exclaimed in one of his sermons: "I have a power in my soul which enables me to perceive God; I am as certain as that I live that nothing is so near me as God. He is nearer to me than I am to myself. It is a part of His very essence that He should be nigh and present to me." (1)

While this is true, as Workman suggests, that the immanence of God Himself is the fundamental truth with Eckart, it was the accepted basis of the mystical practice and philosophy of his contemporaries.

In their method of union with God, one finds the familiar three stages of the mystics. Tauler phrased them as first, purification; second, the enlightening; third, the union.

"The purification concerneth those who are beginning or repenting, and is brought to pass in a three-fold wise: by contrition and sorrow for sin, by full confession, by heart amendment. The enlightening belongeth to such as are growing; and also taketh place in three ways: by eschewing sin, by the practice of good works, and by the willing endurance of all manner of temptation and trials. The union belongeth to such as are perfect and also is brought to pass in three ways: to wit, by pureness and singleness of heart, by love, and by the contemplation of God, the creator of all things." (2)

That the method they followed brought to them the satisfaction and peace of religious experience is everywhere evidenced in their writings. This testimony of Tauler's on

.....

1. Enclosed with Tauler's sermons, p. 208.
2. Tauler, *Theologia Germanica*, p. 47.

the sure result of perfect love and obedience toward God is an example of the note repeatedly sounded.

"If a man loves God and has no will but to do God's will, the whole force of the River Rhine may run at him and will not disturb him or break his peace; if we find outward things a danger or disturbance, it comes from our appropriating to ourselves what is God's." (1)

The philosophic basis of Tauler's Mysticism--and he is typical--is well summarized by MacKinnon as follows:

"The great problem is the attainment of the divine life in God, which is necessarily conditioned in man by the limits of his creaturely existence, and has farther been impaired by the corrupting influence of sin. There is a divine element in the soul, and for Tauler, as for Eckart, this divine element is what he calls its "inner ground", its highest being or essence, which is higher than the rational and sensuous element in it, and in which the image of God consists.He will rise above the limits of reason, which he can only conceive and know God in terms of the finite, and will become conscious of Him as He is in Himself--the inconceivable, incomprehensible entity, of whom reason can predicate nothing that corresponds to what He is. This, simply stated, is the thesis which recurs again and again in his sermons in as far as they deal with the problem of the attainment of the divine life from the speculative-mystic standpoint." (2)

2. Practical Devotion.

The other characteristic to which reference should be made because it touches the question of our thesis is the emphasis placed by the German mystics on daily living. Theirs was not a vague reverie but a practical manner of life. We read in Tauler's life that "when the Black Death came to Strasburg, he devoted himself to administering the sacraments and carrying consolation to the sick and dying. The renewal of the ban (a Papal Interdict) had increased

.....

1. Theologia Germanica, lxv.

2. MacKinnon, Luther and the Reformation, Vol. I. p.222.

the general terror and distress, and at the same time opened a still larger field for Tauler's activity....The deeper was their gratitude to Tauler for his noble act of disobedience to the Church that denied them their only remaining consolation." (1)

Reference of this kind could be multiplied. But it is not necessary, for there is general agreement among all historians that the practical moral quality was a high characteristic of this group. As Schaff sums it up,

"There were moved by warm human sympathies, and looked with almost reverential regard upon the usual pursuits and toils of men. They approached close to the idea that in the faithful devotion to daily tasks man may realize the highest type of religious experience. By preaching, by writing and circulating devotional books, and especially by their own examples, they made known the secret and the peace of the inner life." (2)

IV. THE GERMAN MYSTICS AS PURITANS

We are now ready to indicate how the two features of German Mysticism which we have mentioned as characteristic of it reflect the principle of Puritanism and reveal the essential relationship of this movement with the various Puritanist manifestations.

In the introduction to this discussion attention was called to the outstanding qualities of Mysticism as William James defined them. Mention was made of them because it is the quality which they give to Mysticism that makes it important. And the emphasis of the German mystics on the immediate consciousness and knowledge of God in the soul brings into their experience the Noetic and Ineffable

.....

1. Winkworth, Tauler, p. 151.
2. Schaff, op. cit. p. 239.

qualities by which the protesting spirit of the movement may be understood.

A. Protesting Against the authority
of a dead rationalism.

Medieval mysticism arose at a time when all theological knowledge was being reduced by logical rules to various "summas", and when Aristotle was becoming the dominant figure in the thought of the church. But it was an intellectualism that was devoid of life and the inevitable result was the loss of spiritual reality. And so in the spirit of Puritanism, which will not permit the freedom of the soul's eager search for God to be hindered by dead forms of thought or of worship, Mysticism with its Noetic quality which claims states of knowledge independent of the mind, made its protest for Germany and Holland. Mysticism came with its claim that the soul has faculties, that there are states of its own for the discernment of spiritual truth, knowledge none the less true because they are reached by direct intuition.

Likewise, in the quality of Ineffability Mysticism offered the protest of the spiritual life against a religion which gave little place to experience in comparison with formal or sacramental religion. Ineffability stands for an experience of which "no adequate report can be given in words." Consequently, in such a system the individual was exalted to a high place of independence, the very thing which the church had consistently sought to suppress. It was the protest of Puritanism in behalf of

the truth that spiritual results can only be attained by inward spiritual processes, not by a salvation mediated by a graduated hierarchy.

B. Protesting against Formalism in Christian Life.

It can be concluded, we believe, that the practical goodness of these men was also in itself a protest--a revolt against an external authority that was devoid of moral goodness. These were the days of a scandalous court at Avignon and the corruption there was reflected throughout the church world. But the mystics did not make a militant protest by seeking to conduct a reformation or becoming a dissenting sect. They were loyal Catholics. Ruysbroeck tells in the last chapter of "The Book of Supreme Truth" how in all he understands or feels or has written, he has submitted his judgment to the saints of the Holy Church, "for," he says, "I wish to live and to die as a servant of Christ, in the Christian faith." (1) Tauler is more definite in his criticism of the church, although he too remains true to it. But throughout his sermons there abound references to the current externalism in religion. He constantly makes his protest against formal works as a substitute for a living faith and against the degeneracy of the clergy, high and low, secular and regular, and against formal Christians of any kind. (2) But his best protest is that of his own holy and consecrated life as day by day he lived in peace among his fellowmen.

.....

1. Ruysbroeck, p. 249.
2. See sermons, 21, 15, 38.

IV. CONCLUSION

German mysticism had its weakness at a Puritanist movement, the weakness of any system that depends over much on an inner, subjective experience for authority. It remained for the Reformation to make that balanced protest in which inner experience is guided and interpreted by the Word of God.

Yet we should be thankful for this manifestation of Puritanism because it came with sweetness and light, with peace and love. "Today," Maeterlink remarks, "you may pass through the infirmaries of the human soul, where all thoughts come day by day to die, and you will not find there a single mystic thought." (1) And Workman remarks, "There is nothing more remarkable in the wide range of the visible Church than the persistence across the centuries of the mystic sense, and of the spacious joy and expansive freedom which it brings. Mysticism, though at times it may sleep, is never dead." (2) And we would remark that its timelessness and permanence are due to the fact that it arises from the activity within men of the principle of Puritanism.

.....

1. Maeterlink, Ruysbroeck, p. 23.
2. Christian Thought to the Reformation, p. 193.

The Age of Boniface VIII (1294-1447)

(Decline in the Influence of the Papacy)

I The Decline Begun with Boniface VIII (1294-1303)

A Basic causes:

- The weakness of the pope.
- Growth of national consciousness and independence.

B. The Decline begins the unsuccessful attempt to enforce theory of unlimited papal supremacy over Philip the Fair of France.

1. Begun with publication of "Unam Sanctam" (1302)

2. Ended in papal humiliation at Anagni.

II The Decline in Influence Increased in the Babylonian Captivity (1309-1377)

- A. A Period characterized by
1. Servility of a succession of Popes to the French King as illustrated in suppression of Knights Templars at instigation of King.
 2. Moral decay and personnel of popes, papal extortion.
 3. Waning respect for papal office throughout Europe.

B. A situation combated by counter influences!

1. The Attacks of Library Men as
Dante, Petrarch, John of Paris
Peter Du Bois, Ockham.

2. The moral and spiritual reasons
and character of the German
mystics and of individuals as
Brecht of Sarnen & Eckhart of Trier.

III The Decline (Consummated) Accelerated

A In the Papal Schism which

1. Began with conclusion of
Avignon residence in terms of
two papal papas

Clement VII 13. Urban VI.

2. Reached a climax when at the
Council of Pisa, (1409) three popes
claim papal chair.

13. In the Supremacy of Lateran Reforming
Councils over authority of Papacy.

1. Pisa (1409) in which two rival popes
were deposed & a third appointed

2. Constance (1414-18) in which three popes
were deposed & a new one appointed
& the doctrine of authority of
council over papacy established.

3. Basel (1431-49) in which the schism was
healed but the conciliar supremacy
was reaffirmed.

IV

Last Papas of the Middle Ages (1447-1521)

or
"The Age of Moral Degeneracy in
Papacy"

I Manifested in personal immorality,
notably in Pius II, Sixtus IV,
Innocent VIII & Alexander VI

II Manifested in prevalence of
nepotism, without regard to
piety, age, or learning; notably
in Calixtus III, Pius II,
Sixtus IV, Innocent VIII, ^{Alexander VI} and
Leo X

III Manifested in prodigal expenditure
^{high sums} of money by Innocent VIII,
Alexander VI & Leo X

IV Alleviated by some bright lights

1. The glories of the Renaissance:
 - a. Patronage given by popes to development of arts and letters
 - b. Beautifying of Rome.
 - c. Invention of printing

2. Reformers Before the Reformation

4. Savonarola

6. Brethren of the Common Life.

CHAPTER FIVE

THE REFORMATION: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM

AGAINST ECCLESIASTICAL BONDAGE

CHAPTER V.

THE REFORMATION: THE PROTEST OF PURITANISM AGAINST ECCLESIASTICAL BONDAGE

I. Introduction.

For a fourth illustration of the principle of Puritanism we turn to the finest and highest manifestation it has received, namely the movement commonly known as the Reformation. The Puritanist character of the Reformation is frequently overlooked because it lacked some of those external features which have given rise to the term "Puritan." And on the other hand, its affinity with other Puritanist movements is missed because of the frequent emphasis placed on its doctrinal position which it does not share with such movements as Montanism and the Albigensian Heresy. Yet when one historian remarks that the Montanists were protestants of a sort though not in the sense in which we claim that name today, (1) he is expressing the more fundamental relation between these movements. It is that which Jones means when he states that Luther, the most outstanding figure of the Reformation, was the heir of the medieval heretics (the Cathari). (2) The relationship between them was neither one of doctrine nor manner of life. It lay in their common attitude toward religion. And it is because we are endeavoring in this thesis to make clear the

.....

1. Cunningham, The Churches of Asia, p. 217.
2. Jones, Church's Debt to Heretics, p. 222.

fact that the external features of Puritanist movements are incidental to them, that their real significance is to be found in that permanent and imperishable spirit of protest in behalf of the longings of the soul for fellowship with God, that we focus our attention upon the Reformation as a valid and representative Puritanist movement.

II. Historical Development of the Reformation.

It is not the purpose of this chapter to present a history of the Reformation. Our objective is the meaning of its history as it is revealed by the interpreting principle of Puritanism. But that its significance as a Puritanist manifestation may be established, it is necessary to summarize briefly the salient facts of its history.

A. Its Preparatory Background.

Great movements are not born de novo. There is a logic of history which cannot be neglected if one is to understand any age. The principle of evolution holds in history, whatever may be its relation to science. And as Workman suggests, the principle of development is not only an historic fact, but a part of the work of God. (1) The Reformation came into a world in the fulness of time. Its historic background may be summed up in three characteristics.

.....

1. Christian Thought to the Reformation, p. viii.

1. An Awakening Society.

Lindsay states that "the distinctive political characteristic of the times immediately preceding the movement was consolidation or coalescence." (1)

In these two words the new day is described. People were gaining a national consciousness while the poor, submerged peasant groups were realizing for the first time their inherent rights and dignity.

2. An Awakening Mind.

Our study of the Albigenses revealed the darkness, the ignorance and superstitions of the medieval mind. In our last study we were conscious that that mind was awakening under the fresh touch of what is known as the Renaissance. Its importance as background for the Reformation is twofold. It resulted through its recovery of the Hebrew and Greek languages in a new acquaintance with the Holy Scriptures, a knowledge of which had been vitally related to the previous Puritanist movements, as we have already seen. (2)

.....

1. Lindsay, A History of the Reformation, p. 19. Chapter II of this work gives a full discussion of the proposition.

2. In this connection, the work of the great humanist, Erasmus, should be noted. As one of his contemporaries said, "Erasmus laid the egg which Luther hatched." --P. Smith, Age of Reformation, p. 47.

Inge says that the connection of the Renaissance with the Reformation is a complicated subject. But he adds, "Though the candle of the Reformation was not kindled by Humanism, it was of decisive importance that the century which ushered in the Reformation saw the rise of a new type of cultivated layman." --Protestantism, p. 22, 23.

But just as important was the awakening of the mind of the masses which was forwarded in part by the invention of printing. Through this the Bible was given to the people as a preparation for the protest involved in the Reformation. (1)

3. The Awakening Heart.

But more fundamental to the Reformation than either an awakened society or an awakened mind was the quickened desire of men's hearts in things religious. Sohm aptly sums up the situation:

"That which the world of the Middle Ages desired in its innermost heart was not the Renaissance, but Reformation; not the regeneration of art and learning, but the regeneration of the Church in its head and all its members; not the glad tidings of the re-discovery of the ancient world, but the glad tidings which are preached to the poor, which can bring blessedness to sinners, and regenerate all mankind. Moral renaissance, through the renewal of the Church's life--this was the greatest and highest aim for which the forces of the fifteenth century were stirred again and again in one united movement.....The decay of the Church was a crying evil, felt most strongly wherever the longing after spiritual things was most widespread, as it was in Germany. Therefore, through all the joy of the Renaissance, through all the rejoicing which breaks forth from the renewing of the life of art and learning, ever and ever louder the great cry resounds all through the fifteenth century: 'Reformation of the Church in head and members!' Reformation, not merely of the scholarly and aesthetic life, but of that which is far harder--the religious life." (2)

.....

1. Vedder estimates that there were fully a hundred thousand copies of the German Bible in circulation in Germany at the beginning of the Reformation. -Reformation in Germany, p. xvi.

Lindsay states that the "Praise of Folly" by Erasmus, in which he assailed the clerical vice and superstition, passed through twenty-seven editions in as many years. I, p. 53.

2. Sohm, Outlines of Church History, p. 147.

Signs of an awakening religious life were to be found, however. One was in that divine discontent which is always a foregleam of better things. (1)

We have already seen in the preceding chapter, which surveyed German Mysticism as a Puritanist movement, an illustration of the common longing of men's hearts for better things. And as Fisher points out, "With these (the mystics) the religion of Luther and his great movement have a direct connection." (2)

Finally, there were the "Reformers before the Reformation" (3), who having found God for themselves made their protest in behalf of the religious development of the people whom they served.

B. Its Historical Landmarks.

Having recalled the influences and conditions that prepared the way for the Reformation, we may now outline its development.

Historians of the Reformation, whatever may be their

.....

1. This discontent was directed in part toward abuses in the church. Simony, nepotism, moral degeneracy were found everywhere among the official leaders. Vedder says, "It is not too much to say that at the opening of the sixteenth century, Germany was seething with discontent, and at the verge of outbreak against the papacy." Op. cit. xlvii.

2. Fisher, The Reformation, pp. 59-62.

3. They differ, Savonarola excepted, from the German Mystics in that they expressed open dissent from the Church's ritual and doctrinal teachings. But they and the Mystics alike, in their witness to the reality of fellowship with God, inaugurated movements that stimulated the religious aspirations and convictions of the people and so prepared the way for the Reformation.

view of it as a movement, are agreed that three or four crucial events indicate its historical unfolding. The first three center in the experience of Luther, who sums up and typifies in himself that which we hope to indicate--in the light of the principle of Puritanism--was the inner significance of the Reformation.

These events are:

a. The posting of the ninety-five theses, October 31, 1517, in which Luther invited a discussion of the whole matter of indulgences. That which on his part was but the inevitable expression of a heart at peace with God, protesting what he felt to be an error, was to the people of Germany the assurance of a new leader who, representing their discontent and their aspirations, should lead them into a new freedom. (1)

b. The burning by Luther, December 10th, 1520, of the papal bull of excommunication which had been issued against him. The significance of this in the development of the Reformation is suggested by Lindsay: (2)

"It is scarcely possible for us in the twentieth century to imagine the thrill that went through Germany, and indeed through all Europe, when the news sped that a poor monk had burned the Pope's Bull. Papal Bulls had been burnt before Luther's days, but the burners had been for the most part powerful monarchs. This time it was done by a monk, with nothing but his courageous faith to back him. It meant that the individual soul had discovered its true value. If eras can be dated, modern history began on December 10th, 1520."

.....

1. Bohmer calls this the birthday of the Reformation.
--Luther in the Light of Recent Research, p. 120.

2. Op. cit., Vol. I, p. 251.

c. The Diet of Worms, April 17, 1521, at which Luther's refusal to recant (1) was followed by an imperial edict against him, whereby his cause became national. (2)

d. The Augsburg Confession, the formulation of which at the Diet of Augsburg in 1530 gave to the Reformation its definite first/doctrinal statement, indicating thereby not only the success of the Reformation protest but also the tendency to that crystallization of thought which later was to characterize German Lutheranism and call for another Puritanist protest. (3)

III. The Reformation Viewed as a Puritanist

Protest

We come now to the heart of the matter, namely, the sense in which this historical development may be viewed as a manifestation of that which has been designated the principle of Puritanism.

The Reformation was concerned primarily with the problem: How may men find God? Or, as Lindsay phrased it, "how

.....

1. Luther said that his conscience being captive to the word of God, he could do no other since "it is neither right nor safe to act against conscience."

2. J. A. Froude calls "the appearance of Luther before the Diet of Worms was the most notable spectacle witnessed on the planet since Christ stood before Pilate." --P. Smith in Harvard Theological Review, April 1917, p. 147.

3. Schaff suggests that it required no little moral courage on the part of the signatories to sign the document in view of the immense political and ecclesiastical power of the Roman Catholic Church at that time. When warned of the possible effects of his signature, the Elector John of Saxony replied, "I will do what is right, unconcerned about my electoral dignity. I will confess my Lord, whose power I esteem more highly than all the power on earth." --Schaff, Creeds of Christendom, Vol. I, p. 226.

to span the chasm between the sinful man and the righteous God. (1) Our contention in this thesis is that the answering of that problem had as its motive, its animating idea, the principle of Puritanism; that is, that the answer of the Reformation was the protest of the soul against the bondage in which the prevailing ecclesiastical system of doctrine and practice held the religious life of Europe. If that is so, the term Protestant, while not originally denoting this meaning, actually represents the central idea of the Reformation. (2)

We have suggested that the Reformation voiced the protest of the soul against ecclesiastical bondage. Three distinct and specific emphases characterized this protest and these we shall illustrate through reference to the experience of Luther and to the Augsburg Confession. No apology or explanation need be made for centering our references in Luther especially. Harnack has said that "he (Luther) was the Reformation." (3) As another historian has said, "We may say without exaggeration that the Reformation was embodied in Martin Luther, that it lived in him as in no one else, and that its inner religious history may be best studied in the record of his spiritual experiences and the growth

.....

1. Op. cit., p. 209.

2. The name, Protestant, was first applied to the protesting princes by their Catholic opponents when the Diet of Spires in 1529 decreed that the status quo should be preserved. It soon came to be used indiscriminately of all the adherents of the reformed religion. --Ency. Brit. 13th Ed. Vol. 22, p. 472.

3. History of Dogma, Vol. vii., p. 170.

of his religious convictions. (1) However, it is not our purpose to go into any detail with respect to Luther's life but merely to make passing reference to those experiences which illustrate our thesis. Reference will be made to the Augsburg Confession because as the first credal symbol of the Reformation it represents the crystallized opinion of the Protestant mind.

A. Against Ecclesiastical Mediation in Religion.

This movement was first of all a protest against the substitution of ceremonies and rituals and sacraments for personal religious experience. This is the negative aspect of what Gwatkin states positively thus: "The first principle of the Reformation is the old belief that knowledge of God is direct personal experience. If the knowledge of God is direct and personal, it must in the end be a personal experience, depending on personal character, not on any action of other men." (2) Soper makes a somewhat similar statement as follows: "It declared clearly and unhesitatingly that the soul of man stood immediately in the presence of its maker and that it could have direct dealings with him without ceremonies or ritual or sacraments or priest. The church had its place but not as an essential mediation between men and God." (3)

.....

1. Lindsay, Op. cit., p. 193.
2. Gwatkin, Knowledge of God, p. 222.
3. Soper, Religions of Mankind.

1. Illustrated in Luther's Experience.

Luther had learned this great truth through his own bitter struggle after the peace of God within. It had come to him in a personal realization of the truth of the words, "The just shall live by faith." (1) Failing to find God as the possessor of his soul through the sacraments and ritual of the church, he came one day to realize that God waits to give Himself to any repentant, believing soul. (2) And so in protest against the bondage in which the church held men's souls through its insistence upon forms and ceremonies as the way to God, Luther proclaimed

.....

1. He is reported to have stated in his Conversations: "These words (Romans 1:16, 17) were ever running in my mind. for I had not been able to understand the phrase, 'the righteousness of God'; wherever it stands in the Scriptures otherwise than that God was both righteous himself and judgeth righteously. Sometimes I would ply myself too warmly with this text. I stood and knocked if haply there might be some one to open unto me, but there was no one to open. I did not know at all what it meant until I came in my reading to the words, 'The just shall live by faith.' This sentence is an explanation of the righteousness of God. When I discovered this I was filled with a joy passing all others. And thus the road was opened to me when I read in the Psalms, 'In thy justice make me free,' that is, 'In thy mercy make me free.' Prior to that I dreaded and hated the Psalms and other parts of Scripture whenever they mentioned the 'righteousness of God' by which I understood that he himself was righteousness and judged us according to our sins, not that he accepted and made us righteous. All scripture stood at a wall until I was enlightened by the words, 'The just shall live by faith.' From this I learned that the righteousness of God is that mercy of God by which he justifies us through grace." --P. Smith, Conversations, pp. 128, 129, 130.

2. It is the opinion of Kostlin that the "key to the entire theory of Luther is found in that which he presents in the very first thesis, i.e., his Biblical conception of repentance." --The Theology of Luther in its Historical Development and Inner Harmony, by Julius Kostlin, Vol. I, p. 226.

the priesthood to all believers: "It is faith that makes men priests; faith that unites them to Christ and gives them the indwelling of the Holy Spirit whereby they become filled with all holy and heavenly power." Here again we find that emphasis of other Puritanist movements on the right of every believer before God.

2. Confirmed in the Ninety-five Theses.

This experience of God, which Luther gained through faith in His mercy and grace, became a protest in the posting of the Ninety-five Theses. In the selling of Indulgences by Tetzel he saw a specific example of the bondage in which the church had enslaved her children. Having himself attained peace with God, he could do nothing else than attack the error which he felt was leading the souls of the people, who were his charge, into a false sense of assurance and into darkness. And the gist of the thesis which he posted was that no man, group of men, or church had the right to interpose its authority between the soul of man and its God.

B. Against an Ecclesiastical System of Works.

Closely related to this protest of the Reformation in behalf of direct, personal experience with God was its protest against false methods of finding Him. The positive aspect of this protest has already been suggested in the reference to Luther's discovery for the Reformation of the way to faith. Special attention is called, however, to the

protest against ascetic practices and good works as means of bridging the gap between the sinner and God, because such disciplinary practices were a feature of the several Puritanist movements which we have considered. And, indeed, so frequently has this been true, that in the mind of many it is this feature which identifies and distinguishes a Puritanist movement.

That the view we have been supporting, namely, that while ascetic practices arise out of a fundamental impulse to keep the channel of the life free for the movement of God's spirit, they nevertheless often become a legal principle and are not of the essence of Puritanism--that view is well confirmed by the witness of the Reformation.

1. Luther's Failure to Find Peace in Them.

This truth also was expressed in the experience of Luther. He lived in a day when the accepted method of spiritual attainment was the imposition of a rigorous asceticism. As Glover has remarked, "Luther was one of the real men who build on experience and not theory." (1) He tried to work it out in the approved fashion of the day, a life of penance. He went beyond the customary methods and imposed other severe punishments and activities upon himself. "I imposed on myself additional penances; I devised a special plan of discipline for myself."

He says of it all:

.....

1. Glover, *The Pilgrim*, p. 209.

"The truth is, I was a pious monk, and I held my rule so strongly that I can say, 'If ever monk reached heaven by monkery, I would have found my way there also.'" (1)

But of the failure of such a course to bring his desired peace with God, he states:

"For so long a time I labored and tortured myself into fasts, vigils, prayers, etc., that I thereby might attain the assurance. But for my whole life, my heart could not be assured that God was well pleased with the work I had done or had certainly heard my prayer. Even when I prayed most devoutly every day and confessed most fully, and said mass and did the very best, if any one had asked me, 'Are you sure you have the Holy Ghost?' I must have answered, 'God forbid that I should be so presumptuous. I am a poor sinner. I have done this and that, but I know not whether it has certainly pleased God.' For fifteen years I was just a pious monk and yet never advanced so far as to be able to say, 'Now I am sure that God is gracious to me,' or 'Now I have sought and experienced that my devotion to my order and my strict life have helped me towards heaven.'" (2)

Luther expressed the verdict of his experience in one sentence: "Works never bring peace to the conscience." (3) And his verdict became the protest of the Reformation. One has said:

"It is impossible to estimate the service which Luther has done to society, by opening men's minds to the truth that it is not only possible to enter the kingdom of God without either submitting to Rome or entering a monastery, but that Rome and monasticism may be hindrances rather than helps toward leading a truly Christian life." (4)

2. The Answer of the Augsburg Confession.

That this protest against the idea of ascetic practices and works as a means of attaining fellowship with God

.....

1. Luther's Works, Erlangen, 31, 273; Cf. McGiffert, Luther, p. 27.

2. Ibid. 17: 13ff.

3. P. Smith, *ibid.*, p. 126.

4. A. Plummer, *The Continental Reformation*, p. 86.

was recognized by the Reformation as a whole is evidenced at once when one examines its first credal symbol, the Augsburg Confession. It had been the experience of Luther and others that only through faith in Christ as the revelation of God's forgiving mercy and love is fellowship with God to be attained, not by words and the observing of ordinances. This experience the Confession formulates in the principle of justification by faith. One quotation from these articles will suffice to represent their tone. Article XX. deals specifically and at length with that which had been crucial in Luther's religious experience, the inadequacy of works, representing man's effort and self-righteousness, to bring peace and fellowship:

"Forasmuch, therefore, as the doctrine concerning faith, which ought to be the chief one in the church, has lain so long unknown, as all must needs grant that there was the deepest silence in their sermons concerning the righteousness of faith, while only the doctrine of works was treated in the churches, our teachers have instructed the churches concerning faith as follows:

"First, that our works cannot reconcile God or merit forgiveness of sins, grace and justification, but that we obtain this only by faith, when we believe we are received in favor for Christ's sake, who alone has been set forth the Mediator and Propitiation (I. Tim. 2:5) in order that the Father may be reconciled through Him.....

"But though this doctrine is despised by the inexperienced, nevertheless God-fearing and anxious consciences find by experience that it brings the greatest consolation, because consciences cannot be pacified through any works, but only by faith, when they are sure that, for Christ's sake, they have a gracious God. As Paul teaches (Rom. 5:1), 'Being justified by faith, we have peace with God.'

"Heretofore consciences were plagued with the doctrine of works, nor did they hear any consolation from the Gospel. Some persons were driven by conscience into desert, monasteries, hoping there to merit grace by a monastic life. Some also devised other works whereby to merit grace and make satisfaction for sins. There was a very great need to treat of and renew this doctrine of faith in Christ, to the

end that anxious consciences should not be without consolation, but that they might know that grace and forgiveness of sins and justification are apprehended by faith in Christ."

C. Against Ecclesiastical Authority.

A third element in the protest of the Reformation was its reaction against ecclesiastical authority. Luther's "Address to the German Nobility" enumerates some of the ways in which the ecclesiastical hierarchy arrogated to itself powers and rights not properly belonging to it. The Church claimed that the temporal powers had no jurisdiction over the spiritual, that no one may interpret the scriptures but the pope, that no one may call a church council but a pope. (1) They were all part of the one assumption by the church that its authority was supreme and final in all matters. The result was inevitably the binding of men's souls and the loss of Christian freedom. To this Puritanism as embodied in the Reformation made a two-fold answer.

1. A New Emphasis on the Laity.

Luther argued, "A Christian man is the most free lord of all, and subject to no man." (2) Carried to its logical conclusion that principle meant that the laity are on an equality with the clergy. It meant the recovery of the emphasis of other Puritanist movements on the priesthood

.....

1. Address to the German Nobility.
2. Luther's first proposition in his Address, "Concerning Christian Liberty."

of every individual. Luther argued:

"If a little company of pious Christian laymen were taken prisoners and carried away to a desert, and had not among them a priest consecrated by a bishop, and were they to agree to elect one of them, born in wedlock or not, and were to order him to baptise, to celebrate the mass, to absolve and to preach, this man would be as truly a priest, as if all the bishops and all the popes had consecrated him. That is why in cases of necessity every man can absolve and baptise, which would not be possible if we were not all priests."
(1)

What the Reformation sought was not mere correction of abuses. Its protest was directed against the principle from which they flowed--the Latin idea of the church. With the Montanists and the Albigenses, the Reformers declared that the Church does not consist in the episcopate.

2. A New Emphasis on the Scriptures.

If, as Luther argued, the laity were on an equality with the clergy, then it must be also admitted that they have the faith, the spirit, the mind of Christ, and are entitled to interpret the Scriptures for themselves. It was on this basis that Luther and his fellow Christians of the Reformation turned from the authority of the church to find the way and assurance of peace and fellowship in the word of God. It was not an uncharted journey upon which they set forth in the freedom of their religious experience. Rather they recovered the old guides found in the Holy Scriptures. "The reformers went back to the New Testament for doctrine and proof-text of doctrine; they went back to discover what a truly apostolic church was meant to be; they went behind bishops to presbyters, and behind presby-

.....
1. Address to the German Nobility.

ters to congregations. " (1) And in those Holy Writings they found a strong and ample foundation for their faith.

IV. Conclusion.

Considerable attention has been paid in the preceding pages to the experience of Luther because his protest voiced the attitude of an age. Inge remarks that Luther's "dominant position was due to the fact that he was singularly typical of his time." (2) He came into an age when, in the words of Rufus Jones, "there was abroad a deep yearning among serious people for a religion of inward experience, a religion based not on proof-texts nor on external authority but on the native capacity of the soul to seek, to find and to enjoy the living God who is the Root and Sap of every twig and branch of the great tree of life." (3) And Luther came, understanding his own times, feeling the silent yearnings and strivings of the dumb multitudes about him, anticipating in his thought what the rest were incipiently thinking. "He is the clear voice and oracle of the spirit of his age." (4) The protest which came out of his own soul against those conditions which had prevented his attainment of a fellowship with God became the protest of a nation and a world. It was another manifestation of the principle of Puritanism, never to be wholly suppressed, re-

.....

1. Atkins, Making of the Christian Mind, p. 274.
2. Protestantism, p. 23.
3. Spiritual Reformers of the 16th and 17th Centuries, p.4.
4. Ibid. p. 15.

appearing whenever needed.

Inasmuch as the next chapter will present such general conclusions regarding the principle of Puritanism as have been revealed by the manifestations considered in these pages, it will be necessary in concluding this survey of the Reformation as a Puritanist movement to point out only those features of the principle of Puritanism as were peculiar to this manifestation.

In common with the other movements studied, the Puritanism of the Reformation voiced a protest against the restraining and unsatisfying forms of religion belonging to its times, arose out of a longing for religious reality, based its form of manifestation on the Holy Scriptures, inspired heroic and noble living. But it added an element which lifts it up and makes it superior to all other manifestations, good and worthy as they may have been. Against the externality of dogma and worship to which the age was in bondage, the Reformation made no mere negative protest, but expressed, rather, as its protest the neglected truth that men do not become righteous by the works they do but by their faith in a forgiving Saviour, who is near at hand and may become the possession of any believing soul apart from the mediation of priest or church. In this great truth, the Reformation expressed the permanent contribution of Puritanism to religion, for it is in behalf of this central idea of religion that Puritanism in its truest form always appears.

CHAPTER VI.

CONCLUSION

Having reviewed four Puritanist movements, representing four periods of Christian history, it remains for us now to sum up the results obtained from our research. Our conclusion may well be considered with respect to the two phases of the subject of this thesis: namely, the principle of Puritanism, and the significance of its recurring manifestations.

A. The Principle of Puritanism.

Each manifestation of Puritanism considered in these pages--and each has been but representative of others--was born of a consuming passion for the attainment of spirituality reality. In each instance, it made its appearance at a time when the free expression and development of the religious life was in jeopardy because of certain attending conditions. In Montanism, the first manifestation considered, it was secularism in the church as expressed in an organizational solidarity and a growing tide of worldliness which challenged the protest of Puritanism. The Albigensian Heresy, the second movement considered, came at a time in the Middle Ages when an immoral clergy and a formal sacerdotalism were troubling the hearts of men dependent on the church for spiritual nourishment. German Mysticism, which was the Puritanist movement of the later Middle Ages, was born at a time when the inner life was being lost in the

supremacy of religious formalism and external authority. Finally, the Reformation arose as a protesting movement against ecclesiastic bondage. It is proper to conclude, then, that Puritanism is essentially the protest of the soul, endowed with a high capacity for a realization of divine fellowship, against those things which thwart its true goal.

It is of interest and value to note some of the characteristic features which have attended the appearances of Puritanism. In the first place, there is significance in its emphasis on a non-ecclesiastical authority. Montanism appealed to the authority of the Holy Spirit as manifested in prophecy; Mysticism, to the authority of the inner experience; the Reformation to the authority of the Bible, mediated directly to the believer by the Spirit of God. Perhaps the latter has been the authority most frequently resorted to throughout the entire history of Puritanism. The liberating influence of the Scriptures has been demonstrated repeatedly and ever remains to encourage the soul to the realization of its deepest longings. It is safe to say that Puritanism and the Scriptures go hand in hand. But at any rate, it is evident that Puritanism is essentially non-ecclesiastical, that it does not find in the church the inspiration which these other authorities give. It would seem, therefore, that the tendency of the church, that is, the human institution, toward solidarity, official organization,

and the exaltation of ecclesiastical authority is not favorable to the realization of that for which Puritanism stands.

Another feature of Puritanism which we have seen illustrated -one of its finest aspects- has been its emphasis on the priesthood of every believer and the rights of every soul before God. There is inherent in it an individualism that challenges priestly prerogatives and hierarchical authority. As McGiffert suggests, referring to Montanism, it is democracy in opposition to ecclesiastical aristocracy. It need not be argued that in these emphases Puritanism is near the heart of New Testament teaching and life.

It is interesting to note also that one aspect of this emphasis on the priesthood of the believer and the essential democracy of the Christian fellowship have been the freedom and privileges accorded women in Puritanist movements. The Montanists and Albigenses are a striking example of this. It has been observed in this connection that the modern schismatic groups, which are Puritanist in character, have been among the first to give women the right of official position and of ordination.

Other characteristics force themselves on one's attention and may be briefly noted in passing. There is its moral quality. Puritanism is eminently conscientious, if one may accept the witness of Montanism, the Albigenses and the other manifestations to which reference has been made. It is also essentially courageous. Those in whom it has found expression

have frequently been called on to endure tortures manifold, and a painful death. Yet its rolls are bright with the names of those who would not stain the protest of their soul for the love of their life. And it is also radically progressive in spirit and character. To be sure, it has at times, as in Montanism, appeared to be reactionary instead of progressive, clinging to a forgotten past, unmindful of an alluring present. Yet even in that it has been a reminder that true progress often means the cherishing and holding dear those possessions of the past which have eternal value. In the insistence of Puritanism on the recovery of New Testament faith and practice is ever found to be the surest guarantee of true progress.

Attention should be called to the fact that certain less commendable traits have characterized the manifestation of Puritanism as we have observed it in this thesis. For one thing, it has frequently tended to exaggeration and excess. It is perhaps inevitable, as Lindsay remarks, that a "conservative reaction can scarcely avoid exaggerating the phases of Church life and organization for which it contends and perhaps suffers." (1) Yet this tendency of Puritanism has been one of the reasons why it has frequently failed to commend itself to the approval of even good men. Enthusiasm untempered by a reasoned judgment may stir the heart but it does not lend itself to a permanent hold

.....

1. Lindsay, p. 239.

on a man's loyalty.

The bent to excess which we have observed in Puritanism is clearly related to another feature frequently occurring in its history; namely, the tendency to a new legalism differing from that against which it made protest yet finally as stultifying to religious life. For instance, ascetic practices, which rise from a valid conviction, not infrequently in protestant movements have become an end in themselves rather than a means to an end, and thus have become a denial of the first principle of Puritanism. We observed this tendency in Montanism (1) and it has been demonstrated repeatedly in subsequent movements. Even the Puritanism of the Reformation did not escape this danger, for the protest which it formed against medieval theology finally became itself so fixed in theological formula that it called forth in Pietism a new Protestant protest, which sought to recover the spiritual freedom and realization of the early days of the Reformation. Puritanism witnesses to the fact that a crystallized theology may be as great a barrier to the freedom of the soul as an official ecclesiasticism or a dead formalism.

B. The Significance of Recurring

Manifestations of Puritanism

It has been noted that every age has had its Puritanist manifestation. The four movements which have been con-

.....

1. Neander first called attention to this fact.

sidered in these researches have been but typical of similar movements in their own day or at other times. It is proper to ask, therefore, what significance is there in the frequent recrudescence of the principle which we have designated as Puritanism.

A conviction is immediately forced upon one that Puritanism is a principle native to the religious aspiration of man. When the same impulse is expressed, not once or twice, but repeatedly, and in every age, one can only conclude that it rises from a fundamental instinct of the soul.

It would also seem that Puritanism in some form or other is likely to be found in every age. Man being what he is, and human institutions what they are, the protest of Puritanism is inevitable. It has been seen that ecclesiastical institutions tend constantly toward a loss of the enthusiasm and vision which give them birth, toward the exalting of official organization, toward a relaxation in church discipline and toward secularism in daily living. Whenever these tendencies begin to constrain and interfere with the freedom of the soul, whenever devout men and women whose hearts are set on the attaining and maintaining of communion with God find that in the church as constituted is failing to minister to the realization of their personal yearning hearts, the protest of Puritanism will be made. The nature of that protest will be governed by the conditions against which it is experienced. But it is safe to say that in essence its manifestation will be an attempt to recover those phases in the New Testament faith and

practice which appeal to men's hearts as valid and necessary and from which a divergence has been found in the church. It would be of value as well as interest if someone would examine the many small, schismatic groups throughout America today in the light of the principle of Puritanism. It is altogether likely that the origin and nature of each would be found to be this spirit of protest in behalf of the realities of the religious life.

As we look back over these Puritanist movement one conclusion takes on importance beyond all the others which have been mentioned. It is that the history of these movements suggests that the enduring success of any Puritanist manifestation depends upon its conserving the best of that from which it has broken away, while at the same time remaining loyal to the principle of its protest. The failure of Puritanist movements has been due usually to either the loss of its original protesting enthusiasm or to a failure to conserve those values which have been received from the past. Montanism neglected the necessity for organizational unity in a day when it was needed if the church was to defend itself in the empire. At the same time it substituted for the constraint of official authority, against which it protested, as binding an authority in the prophetic word which it emphasized. Its protest was valid, but the form could not command permanence.

On the other hand, the Protestant Reformation, which was essentially Puritan in character, while breaking completely with Rome, nevertheless kept and expressed in its

own way the two things which had maintained the strength of the church through the conflicts of the centuries: an ecclesiastical organization and a theology.

But the Reformed Churches have not always maintained the freedom of spirit and the spirit of protest in behalf of spiritual liberty which brought them into being. Then men have failed to find in them that which they needed, and there have arisen within the church new Puritans, to recall it to its pristine ideal and testimony.

Dean Inge has given a definition of Protestantism which so exactly fits what we have discovered in this study to be the most characteristic features of Puritanism that we take the liberty to quote it, substituting for Protestantism the word Puritanism.

Puritanism "is the revolt of genuine religion against secularization. Almost always we find it advocating ethical purity against ceremonial rules, and individual freedom against ecclesiastical discipline. We find it claiming the right of immediate access to God without the intervention of a professional priesthood. We find it insisting on inward conviction in the place of unquestioning conviction, docile acceptance and surrender of private judgment."

That is the principle of Puritanism. And any movement which gives it expression will bear a permanent witness to the centuries which will

Correct the portrait by the living face,
Man's God by God's God, in the mind
of man.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Sources and Works which incorporate Sources.

Augsburg Confession, Philadelphia, 1913.

Ayer, J. C., Source Book for Ancient Church History, New York,
1926.

Bonwetsch, Die Geschichte des Montanismus, 1881. 2 Vol.

Conybeare, F. C., The Key of Truth, Oxford, 1898.

Dollinger, J., Beitrage zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters,
Munchen, 1890. 2 Vol.

Faber, G. S., An Inquiry into the History and Theology of the
Ancient Vallenses and Albigenses, London, 1838.

Gwatkin,^{H.M.} Selections from Early Church History, Edinburgh.

Kidd, Documents Illustrative of the History of the Church.

Lea, H. C., A History of the Inquisition of the Middle Ages,
New York, 1922. 2 Vol.

Luther's Works, Erlangen Ed. 67 vol., Frankfurt 1826-57.

McGiffert, A.C., Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers.

Perrin, J.P., History of the Waldenses and Albigenses, Geneva,
1619. Philadelphia, 1847.

Robinson, J. H., Readings in European History, Vol. I. New York,
1904.

Ruysbroech, John of, The Adornment of the Spiritual Marriage,
London, 1916.

Schaff, Philip, Creeds of Christendom, with History and Critical
notes, 3 Vol., New York, 1877.

Schmidt, Charles, Histoire et Doctrine de la Secte des Cathares
ou Albigeois, Paris, 1849.

Smith, P. S., Luther's Correspondence and other Contemporary Letters,
2 Vol. Philadelphia, 1913-18.

Smith, P. S. and Gallinger, H.P., Conversations with Luther,
Boston, 1915.

Winkworth, S., A History and Life of the Rev. Dr. John Tauler with
Twenty-five of his Sermons, New York, 1907.

Winkworth, S., A Translation of Pfeiffer's Edition of the
Theologia Germanica, London, 1907.

B. Secondary Sources.

Allen, A.V.G. The Continuity of Christian Thought: A Study of
modern Theology in the light of History, Boston, 1895.

Allen, A.V.G., Christian Institutions,

Atkins, G. G., The Making of the Christian Mind, New York, 1928.

Bayley, New Light on the Renaissance in Contemporary Emblems,
London, 1909.

Baur, F., The Church History of the First Three Centuries,
London, 1878.

Beer, M., Social Struggles of the Middle Ages, trans. by H. J.
Steinmetz, London, 1914.

Bigg, Charles, The Origins of Christianity, Oxford, 1909.

Bohmer, H., Luther in the Light of Recent Research, New York, 1916.

Cowan, Henry, Landmarks of Church History, New York.

Cunningham, W., The Churches of Asia, London, 1880.

Davison, Ellen S., Forerunners of St. Francis and Other Studies ,
Boston and New York, 1927,

Duchesne, Early History of the Christian Church.

Fisher, G. P., The Reformation, New York, 1906.

Foakes-Jackson, History of the Early Church to 461, New York, 1891.

Glover, T. R., The Pilgrim, New York , 1922.

Glover, T. R. The Christian Tradition and Its Verification, London, 1913.

Gwatkin, H.M. The Knowledge of God and Its Historical Development,
Edinburgh, 1908.

Gregory, Puritanism in the Old World and the New, New York, 1896.

Harnack, R., History of Christian Dogma, 7 vol. New York, 1900.

Hatch, Edwin, Organization of the Early Christian Churches, London,
1882.

Herman, E. The Meaning and Value of Mysticism, New York, 1915.

- Hyma, A., The Christian Renaissance, New York, 1925.
- Hocking, The Meaning of God in Human Experience, New Haven, 1921.
- Holmes, E. G. A. The Albigensian or Catharist Heresy, London, 1925.
- James, W., Varieties of Religious Experience, New York, 1919.
- Jones, Rufus M., The Church's Debt to Heretics, New York, 1924.
- Jones, R.M., Studies in Mystical Religion, London, 1909.
- Jones, R.M., Spiritual Reformers of the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries, London, 1914.
- Jones, R.M. Fundamental Ends of Life, New York, 1924.
- Kostlin, J., Theology of Luther in its Historical Development, Philadelphia
- Inge, W. Christian Mysticism, New York, 1899.
- Inge, W., Protestantism, London, 1927.
- Lindsay, T.M. The Church and the Ministry in the Early Centuries, New York, 1902.
- Lindsay, T.M. History of the Reformation, 2 Vo. New York, 1926.
- Lightfoot, J.B., Essay on Christian Ministry, with Comm. on Philippians, London, 1903.
- Morgan, James, The Importance of Tertullian in the Development of Christian Dogma, London, 1928.
- McGlothlin, W.J., A Guide to the Study of Church History, New York, 1914.
- MacKinnon, J. , Luther and the Reformation, London, 1925
- Neander, History of the Christian Church, Boston, 1872.
- Newman, A.H., Recent Researches concerning Medieval Sects Papers American Society of Church History, Vol. IV. First Series, 1892, pp. 167-214.
- Nickerson, H., The Inquisition. London, 1923.
- Plummer, A., The Continental Reformation, London, 1912.
- Schaff, P. History of the Christian Church, New York, 1924. 7 Vol.
- Schaff, P., A Symposiac, New York, 1883.
- Sheldon, Henry C., History of the Christian Church, New York, 1894.
- Sharenkoff, V.N. A Study in Manichaeism in Bulgaria with special Reference to the Bogomils, New York, 1927.
- Short, A., The Witness of the Spirit with our Spirit, (Bampton Lectures) London, 1846.
- Smith, P. Age of the Reformation, New York, 1920.

Soper, E., Religions of Mankind, New York, 1921.

Sohm, R. Outlines of Church History, London, 1904.

Swete, H. B. Essays on the Early History of the Church and the
ministry, London, 1921.

Swete, H. B. The Holy Spirit in the Ancient Church.

Turberville, A. S., Medieval Heresy and the Inquisition, London, 1920.

Vedder, H. C., The Reformation in Germany.

Warner, H. J. The Albigensian Heresy, London, 1922.

Workman, H.B., Christian Thought to the Reformation, New York, 1911.

THE MEDIEV

1049 A.D.

THE AGE OF HILDEBRAND 1049-1122

Most Important Dates & Period

1. Pontificate of Gregory VII (1073-85)
2. Concordat of Worms (1122)
3. Fall of Jerusalem: 1st Crusade (1099)
4. Canossa - (1077)

Most Outstanding Movements

1. Beginning of First Crusade 1096
Pope Urban II - Godfrey of Bouillon
2. Third great epoch of monasticism begun
a) is established most of Cluny 910 by
Saint William of Aquitaine
"No religious locality in Latin Church
a purer, purer than Cluny."
3. Benedictines - 1095
Bernard of Clairvaux - 1090-1153
Development of Scholasticism
a) Anselm of Canterbury (1033-1109)
b) Abelard - (1079-1142)

Custom-
mish of period.
1. Complutens
a. Best pope
gained thing
paying - right
of institution

II
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100

THE AGE OF INNOCENCE III 1122-1294

THE GOLDEN AGE OF THE PAPACY INNOCENT III (1198-1216)

- I. The Great Excommunication - Pope the spiritual sovereign in Latin Christendom without rival. Also pope uses rights of political decisions. Western frame converted to papal.
- II. Papacy Achieves its two notable conquests with the Empire.
a. With Henry John of England
b. In overthrow of Hohenstaufen "in which Empire was humbled into dust."
- III. The Age Featured by Great Movements, and Attainments
a) The Progress of its Conquests to their end.
b) The Development of Scholasticism to its greatest height.
c) The Rise of the Mendicant Orders
1. The Franciscans
2. The Dominicans
d) Eschylism and growth of the Augustinians - Bolognese, Paris, Oxford Cambridge
e) Fourth Lateran Council (1215) - "The Great of Papal Sovereignty."
f) Eschylism of the Inquisition to deal with heresy of Cathari & Waldens against papal authority & theology

2. next great power - monasteries began
 a) is established ment of Cluny 910 by
 Duke William of Aquitaine
 "No religious locality in Lat in Church
 as pious, pure than Cluny."

- 3) Bernard of Clairmont - 1090-1150
- 3. Development of Scholasticism
- 4) Anselm of Canterbury (1033-1109)
- 5) Abelard - (1079-1142)

Constantin-
 muni of papal.
 1. Complutens
 2. Best pope
 3. Guiding chief
 4. Praying - right
 5. Intellectual

Growth of Papal
 Supremacy after
 Emperor Frederick II

- 1. In Victorian Conflict
 of Hohenstaufen and
 Henry IV culminating
 in humbled and being
 at Canossa - 1077.

- 2. Notwithstanding the
 opposition of
 William of Langueuse
 to Law Thale
 & William Rufus to Anselm.

Rise initiated with
 Reforming influence of Hohenstaufen.
 1. In reorganizing spirit in rule of
 Hohenstaufen papal
 (1049-1073)
 ("He understood the art of ruling
 through others as seeking them
 far, that they ruled themselves" (Bald))

as was very power of very many
 B to overthrow of Hohenstaufen "in which
 Empire was humbled in its death."

III An Age Featured by Great Monasteries
and Attainments

- a) The progress of the Crusades to their end
- b) The Development of Scholasticism to
 its greatest height.
- c) The Rise of the Mendicant Orders
 1. The Franciscans
 2. The Dominicans
- d) Establishment and growth of the
 Great Universities - Bologna,
 Paris, Oxford Cambridge

- e) Fourth Lateran Council (1215) - "the Growth of Papal Supremacy."
- f) Establishment of the Inquisition to
 deal with heresy of Cathari in the south
 against papal authority in the 12th

Most Important Dates

- 1215 - Signing of the Magna Carta
- 1215 - Fourth Lateran Council

Notable Individuals

- Innocent III (1091-1216)
- The Crusades -
 - Knights - 2nd Crusade
 - Baron - 3rd
 - Frederick Barbarossa
 - Philip Augustus
 - Richard - Lionheart
 - St. Louis (Louis IX of France)
- Francis of Assisi (1182-1226)

of Hildebrand and Gregory VII culminating in Hildebrand's papacy at Canossa - 1077.

2. Notwithstanding the opposition of William the Conqueror to Pope Francis & William Rufus to Hildebrand.

(1073-85)

MEDIEVAL

THE RISE OF THE GREGORY VII

Pope initiated with Reforming influence of Hildebrand.

1. The Gregory spent in rule of the Hildebrandine papacy (1049-1073)

"He understood the art of ruling through others as Hildebrand saw that they ruled themselves" (Schuff)

2. As Gregory VII when he sought moral reform of church with respect to a) Simony!

b) Nepotism and political, ecclesiastical reform in the liberation of the church from secular subjugation.

1046 A.D. "The Papacy had reached its lowest stage of weakness and degeneracy in 1046."
- Schuff. (P. 9)

Most Important Dates

1215 - Signing of the Magna Carta
1215 - Fourth Lateran Council

Notable Individuals

Innocent III (1095-1216)
The Crusades - Richard I 2nd Crusade
Pope III
Pope IV
Frederick Barbarossa 3rd "
Philip Augustus "
Richard - Green & Latin "
St. Louis (Louis IX of France) 7th Crusade

Francis of Assisi (1182-1226)
St. Dominic (1170-1221)
Thomas Becket (1118-1170)
Peter the Hermit (1122-57 - Abbot of Cluny)
Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274)
Bonaventura (1221-1274)
Duns Scotus
Arnold of Brescia

The Thirteenth Century is frequently characterized as the Breakup of the 13th Century.

7AL PAPPY

1521 AD.

THE AGE OF BONIFACE VIII

1294-1447

I Decline Begun with Boniface

a. Papal Curia: - Ministers of Pope and
Growth of National Conscience
and independence.

b. The immediate cause - the unsuccessful
attempts to enforce Henry of England's papal
supremacy over Philip the Fair of France.

1) Begun with publication of the

"Unus Sanctus" (1302)

2. Ended with papal humiliation at

Anagni (1303)

DECLINE IN THE

II The Decline in the

influence of Boniface VIII (1294-1303)

is "Papal Curia" (1309-1377)

engaged by

succession of Popes to France

of Knight Templars

personal of Popes

popal exhorting

popery throughout Europe.

by

inferior men as

Pope, Du Bois, Dehane

specific reasons

Catholics of Secura,

and the

my story

THE

OF

DECLINE

LAST POPES OF THE MIDDLE AGES

1447-1521

Bright Lights of the Period

I. The glories of the Renaissance

a. Drawings given by Popes to develop

ment of arts and letters -

Nicholas II in particular

B. Beneficence of Rome - Vatican, St. Peter

where

Three far-reaching events

a. Growth of printing

b. Specimens of Michelangelo

c. Revival of Printing

e. The meeting of "The Divine Comedy

by Dante.

d. The work of the Italian Humanists

- Raphael, De Vinci, Michelangelo,

Andrea del Sarto, Titian.

II. The Development of Humanism in Germany

- of a moral and intellectual character.

A. The first - Albrecht Dürer (1472-1528)

B. In letters and scholarship

- John Pachelbel - 1455-1522 - Great

Hebrew Scholar

- Erasmus (1466-1536) Greek scholar

"Prince of Humanists"

III Pre-Reformation: Reformers

CONFIDENTIAL

1. requires new movement
2. Called w/ paper simulation at Anagni (1303)

IN THE

II The Decline in Authority increased "Bully" in 1309-1303

- A. A Period of a**
1. Sensibility of a
 2. Moral Decay in
 3. Having respect for
- B. A Condition, Confronted**
1. The Attacks of
 2. The Moral and

INFLUENCE

OF

THE

III Decline Accelerated in

- A. The Papal Schism which**
1. Began with conclusion of Avignon
 2. climaxed after Council of Pisa (1409)
- B. The Supremacy of the Papacy**
1. Pius 1409-2
 2. Council of Pisa (1409)
 3. Council of Constance (1414-18)

PAPACY

Most Important Dates

1. Pius 1409-18
2. Council of Pisa 1409
3. Council of Constance 1414-18

II Three far-reaching events

1. Decline of Papal Authority
2. Supremacy of Western World
3. Revival of Printing

III The Making of the German Canon

1. The work of the Italian Humanist
2. Raphael, De Siner, Michelangelo, Andrea del Sarto, Titian

IV The Development of Humanism in Germany

- A. The first - Albrecht Dürer (1472-1528)
- B. In Letters and Scholarship
- C. Erasmus (1466-1536) Greek Scholar

V Pre-Reformation Reformers

- A. Erasmus (1469-1536)
- B. Brothers of Common Life

VI Manifested in Personal Immortality

1. Luther (1483-1546)
2. Calvin (1509-1564)

THE AGE OF MOR

Manifested in prevalence of reputation

1. Pity, age, as learning
2. Pity, age, as learning

1. 1299 was concerned of "Papal" in claims of two rival popes.
 2. blimped of the Council of Pisa (1409) when 3 chairs.
 B. The Supremacy of these Reforming over Authority of Papacy.
 1. Pius. 1409-2 rival popes deposed - 3 supported
 2. Council (1414-18) - 3 popes deposed and a new one appointed esp. doctrine of authority of council
 3. Basel (1431-49) in which schism was healed but council's supremacy was reaffirmed

Most Important Dates

1. Publication of Boniface (1294-1303)
2. Magna Defect 1303
3. Babylonian Captivity 1309-17
4. Council of Constance 1414-18
5. Burning of Hus 1415 (July 6)
6. Beginning of the Renaissance 1400

Most Notable Individuals

- | | |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| Philip of Fair | |
| 2. Dante 1265-1321 | Brig'd 1302-73 |
| 3. Petrarcha - 1304-74 | |
| 4. Catherine of Siena - 1347-1380 | |
| 5. Martin Luther - 1483-1527 | } German Reformation |
| 6. John Calvin - 1509-64 | |
| 7. Henry VIII - 1491-1547 | |
| 8. Erasmus II | |
| 9. Thomas a Kempis 1380-1471 "Imitator of Christ" | |
| 10. Desiderius Erasmus - 1466-1536 | } Reformation Before the Reformation |
| 11. John Wyclif 1324-84 | |
| 12. John Huss 1369-1415 | |
| 13. Jerome of Prague | |

"Boniface found it (the papacy) at the height of its power. He died leaving it humbled"

1. newly "incentives" of "new" Brothers of Common Life.

I Manifested in Personal Immaturity -
 Authority in Pius II, Sixtus IV, Innocent VIII and Alexander VI (Rome)

II Manifested in prevalence of repetition
 regarded less of piety, age, or learning.
 - Notoriously by Sixtus IV, Pius II, Leo X, Innocent VIII, Alexander VI

III Manifested in Prudential Expediency
 - Notoriously by Sixtus IV, Innocent VIII, Alexander VI and Leo X

IV Manifested in Personal Immaturity -
 Authority in Pius II, Sixtus IV, Innocent VIII, Alexander VI and Leo X

THE AGE OF MORAL - The Renaissance

POPES the resulting in literature, art
 revival of paganism - in "the Renaissance"
 writers and public men produced so Thomas

DEGENERACY IN THE PAPACY

This period - not so well known -
 - clashes with the dawn of the Reformation.

- Paul C. Warren